

Experiments with facial recognition technologies in public spaces: in search of an EU governance framework

Chapter 11 in *'Handbook on the Politics and Governance of Big Data and Artificial Intelligence - Elgar Handbooks in Political Science series - edited by Andrej Zwitter & Oskar J. Gstrein, 2023.'*

Bibliographical list

By Catherine Jasserand*

* This research has received funding from the European Commission's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under the Marie Skłodowska-Curie grant agreement no. 895978.

References

AEPD (2021) <<https://www.aepd.es/sites/default/files/2019-09/guia-evaluaciones-de-impacto-rgpd.pdf?msclid=cb207782b58611ec8fc0d575e8250a57>>

AFP, 'Test de Reconnaissance Faciale à Nice: Précisions de la CNIL' (*Public Sénat*, 19 February 2019) <<https://www.publicsenat.fr/article/politique/test-de-reconnaissance-faciale-a-nice-precisions-de-la-cnil-138122>>

Allen H, 'Regulatory Sandboxes' (2019) 87 *The George Washington Law Review* 579

Allen H, 'Sandbox Boundaries' (2020) 22(2) *Vanderbilt Journal of Entertainment and Technology Law* 300

Art 29 WP 'Guidelines on Data Protection Impact Assessment (DPIA)' (2017) WP48 rev.01

Baichère D and others, 'Proposition de loi d'expérimentation créant un cadre d'analyse scientifique et une consultation citoyenne sur les dispositifs de reconnaissance faciale par l'intelligence artificielle' (no. 4127) <https://www.assemblee-nationale.fr/dyn/15/textes/l15b4127_proposition-loi>

Ball K and others 'A Report on the Surveillance Society: For the Information Commissioner by the Surveillance Studies Network' (September 2006) <https://www.personuvernd.is/media/frettir/surveillance_society_full_report_final.pdf>

BBC, 'How we are being watched' (*BBC*, 3 November 2006) <http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/uk_news/6110866.stm>

BBC News, 'Facial recognition plan "hammer blow to privacy" claim' (*BBC*, 22 March 2022) <<https://www.bbc.com/news/uk-wales-60831816>>

Big Brother Watch, 'Map: UK Facial Recognition in Detail' <<https://bigbrotherwatch.org.uk/campaigns/stop-facial-recognition/#facial-recognition-uk>>

Big Brother Watch 'Face Off: The Lawless Growth of Facial Recognition in UK Policing' (*Big Brother Watch*, May 2018).

Biometrics Commissioner, 'Automated Facial Recognition: Biometrics Commissioner Response to Court Judgment on South Wales Police's Use of Automated Facial Recognition Technology' (10 September 2019) <<https://www.gov.uk/government/news/automated-facial-recognition>>

Biometrics and Surveillance Camera Commissioner, 'Amended Surveillance Camera Code of Practice' <https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/1035067/Surveillance_Camera_CoP_Accessible_PDF.pdf>

Bischoff P, 'Surveillance Camera Statistics: Which Cities Have the Most CCTV Cameras?' (*Comparitech*, 17 May 2021) <<https://www.comparitech.com/vpn-privacy/the-worlds-most-surveilled-cities/>>

Bits of Freedom, 'Op Waarden Geschat, Living Lab Digitale Perimeter' (*Bits of Freedom*, 30 April 2021) <<https://www.bitsoffreedom.nl/wp-content/uploads/2021/05/2021-rapport-digitale-perimeter-bof.pdf>>

Bits of Freedom, 'Washed in blue: living lab Digital Perimeter in Amsterdam' (*Bits of Freedom*, 19 May 2021) <https://edri.org/our-work/washed-in-blue-living-lab-digital-perimeter-in-amsterdam/>

Booth R, 'Halt Public Use of Facial Recognition Tech, says Equality Watchdog' (*The Guardian*, 12 March 2020) <<https://www.theguardian.com/uk-news/2020/mar/12/halt-public-use-of-facial-recognition-tech-says-equality-watchdog>>

Buolamwini J and Gebu T, 'Gender Shades: Intersectional Accuracy Disparities in Commercial Gender Classification' (2018) Proceedings of Machine Learning Research 81

Castellucia C and le Métayer D, 'Impact Analysis of Facial Recognition' (HAL, 2020) <<https://hal.inria.fr/hal-02480647/document>>

CCTV.co.uk, 'Number of CCTV Cameras in the UK reaches 5.2 million' (November 2020) <<https://www.cctv.co.uk/number-of-cctv-cameras-in-the-uk-reaches-5-2-million/>>

Christakis T, 'Facial recognition in the draft European AI Regulation: Final report on the high-level workshop held on 26 April 2021' <<https://ai-regulation.com/facial-recognition-in-the-draft-european-ai-regulation-final-report-on-the-high-level-workshop-held-on-april-26-2021/>>

CNIL, 'Expérimentation de la reconnaissance faciale dans deux lycées : la CNIL précise sa position' (*CNIL*, 29 October 2019) <<https://www.cnil.fr/fr/experimentation-de-la-reconnaissance-faciale-dans-deux-lycees-la-cnil-precise-sa-position>>

CNIL, 'Facial Recognition: For a Debate Living up to the Challenges' (2019) <<https://www.cnil.fr/sites/default/files/atoms/files/facial-recognition.pdf>>

CNIL, 'Vidéoprotection: Quelles sont les dispositions applicable ?' (December 2019) <<https://www.cnil.fr/fr/vidéoprotection-quelles-sont-les-dispositions-applicables>>

CNIL, 'Avis sur le décret vidéo-intelligente port du masque' (March 2021) <<https://www.cnil.fr/fr/avis-sur-le-decret-video-intelligente-port-du-masque>>

CNIL, Bac à sable (February 2021) <<https://www.cnil.fr/fr/bac-a-sable-2021>>

Code de la Sécurité Intérieure <<https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/codes/id/LEGITEXT000025503132/>>

College of Policing: 'Authorised Professional Practice Live Facial Recognition, Consultation: Guidance for the Overt Deployment of Live Facial Recognition Technology to Locate Persons on a Watchlist' <<https://paas-s3-broker-prod-lon-6453d964-1d1a-432a-9260-5e0ba7d2fc51.s3.eu-west-2.amazonaws.com/s3fs-public/2021-05/live-facial-recognition-app.pdf>>

College of Policing, 'Authorised Professional Practice' <<https://www.college.police.uk/app/live-facial-recognition>>

Conference of the Independent Data Protection Supervisory Authorities of the Federation and the Länder (April 2020) <https://www.datenschutzzentrum.de/uploads/sdm/SDM-Methodology_V2.0b.pdf>

Conseil d'Etat, 'Les Expérimentations : Comment Innover dans la Conduite des Politiques Publiques' (October 2019) <<https://www.vie-publique.fr/catalogue/270979-les-experimentations-comment-innover-dans-la-conduite-des-politiques-publiques>>

Council of Europe, Recommendation 'Unboxing Artificial Intelligence: 10 steps to protect Human Rights' (May 2019) <<https://rm.coe.int/unboxing-artificial-intelligence-10-steps-to-protect-human-rights-reco/1680946e64>>

Datatilsynet, 'Framework for the Regulatory Sandbox' (January 2021) <<https://www.datatilsynet.no/en/regulations-and-tools/sandbox-for-artificial-intelligence/framework-for-the-regulatory-sandbox/>>

Davies B and others, 'An Evaluation of South Wales Police's Use of Automated Facial Recognition' (2018) <<https://static1.squarespace.com/static/51b06364e4b02de2f57fd72e/t/5bfd4fbc21c67c2cdd692fa8/1543327693640/AFR+Report+%5BDigital%5D.pdf>>

De Autoriteit Persoonsgegevens, 'Formele waarschuwing AP aan supermarkt om gezichtskenning' (15 December 2020) <<https://autoriteitpersoonsgegevens.nl/nl/nieuws/formele-waarschuwing-ap-aan-supermarkt-om-gezichtsherkenning>>

De Autoriteit Persoonsgegevens, 'Voorlichting - regels voor gezichtsherkenning in supermarkten (1 May 2020) <https://autoriteitpersoonsgegevens.nl/sites/default/files/atoms/files/brief_regels_voor_gezichtsherkenning_in_supermarkten.pdf>

Décret n. 2021-269 du 10 mars 2021 relatif au recours à la video intelligente pour mesurer le taux de port du masque dans les transports <<https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/jorf/id/JORFTEXT000043235679>>

den Ouden E and others, 'Exploring the future of Living Labs' (2016) Research Report <<https://www.tue-lighthouse.nl/Images/Livinglabs/20160210%20Exploring%20the%20future%20or%20Living%20Labs%20-%20LR%20ebook.pdf>>

Digitale Perimeter <<https://www.amsterdam.nl/innovatie/digitalisering-technologie/digitale-perimeter/>>

Dodd V, 'Met Police to Use Facial Recognition Software at Notting Hill Carnival' (*The Guardian*, 5 August 2017) <<https://www.theguardian.com/uk-news/2017/aug/05/met-police-facial-recognition-software-notting-hill-carnival>>

Dodd V, 'UK Police Use of Facial Recognition Technology a Failure, Says Report' (*The Guardian*, 15 May 2018) <<https://www.theguardian.com/uk-news/2018/may/15/uk-police-use-of-facial-recognition-technology-failure>>

EDPB, 'Guidelines 3/2019 on Processing of Personal Data through Video Devices' Version 2.0 (adopted on 29 January 2020)

EDPB, Response to Sophie in't Veld, MEP, regarding the use of Automatic Image Recognition Systems on migrants in Italy, 10 August 2021 <https://edpb.europa.eu/system/files/2021-08/edpb_letter_out_2021_00130_mepveld_facialrecognition_publication.pdf>

EDPB and EDPS, 'Joint Opinion 5/2021 on the proposal for a Regulation of the European Parliament and of the Council laying down harmonised rules on artificial intelligence (Artificial Intelligence Act)'

Equality and Human Rights Commission, 'Facial recognition technology and predictive policing algorithms out-pacing the law' (March 2020) <<https://www.equalityhumanrights.com/en/our-work/news/facial-recognition-technology-and-predictive-policing-algorithms-out-pacing-law>>

Euractiv, European Commission, leaked draft paper entitled 'Structure for the White Paper on Artificial Intelligence – a European Approach' (*Euractiv*, 2 February 2021) <<https://www.euractiv.com/wp-content/uploads/sites/2/2020/01/AI-white-paper-EURACTIV.pdf>>

European Commission, 'Proposal for a Regulation of the European Parliament and of the Council Laying Down Harmonised Rules on Artificial Intelligence (Artificial Intelligence Act) and Amending Certain Union Legislative Acts' COM (2021) 206 final

European Commission, 'White Paper – on Artificial Intelligence – A European Approach to Excellence and Trust', 19 February 2020, COM (2020) 65 final

European Court of Human Rights, Press Unit, Factsheet 'New Technologies' <https://www.echr.coe.int/Documents/FS_New_technologies_ENG.pdf>

European Digital Rights (EDRI), 'Ban Biometric Mass Surveillance: A set of fundamental rights demands for the European Commission and EU Member States' (*EDRI*, 13 May 2020) <<https://edri.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/05/Paper-Ban-Biometric-Mass-Surveillance.pdf>>

Gemeente Amsterdam, written question, <<https://amsterdam.raadsinformatie.nl/document/10131215/1/180%20sv%20Ijmkker%20onderzoek%20Digitaleo%20Perimeter>>

Galič M and Gellert R, 'Data protection law beyond identifiability? Atmospheric profiles, nudging and the Stratumseind Living Lab' (2021) 40 Computer Law & Security Review

France Bleu Saint-Etienne, 'Capteurs sonores à Saint-Etienne: la mise en garde de la CNIL' (*France Bleu*, 29 October 2019) <<https://www.francebleu.fr/infos/societe/capteurs-sonores-a-saint-etienne-la-mise-en-garde-de-la-cnil-1572343225>>

Friedewald M and others, 'Data Protection Impact Assessments in Practice' (2022) Lecture Notes in Computer Science, Conference Paper (13106)

Fussey P, 'Beyond Liberty, Beyond Security: The Politics of Public Surveillance' (2008) 3(1) *British Politics* 120

Fussey P and Murray D, 'Policing Uses of Live Facial Recognition in the United Kingdom' in A Kak, *Regulating Biometrics: Global Approaches and Urgent Questions*, AI Now Institute (September 2020) <<https://ainowinstitute.org/regulatingbiometrics.pdf>>

Fussey P and others, 'Assisted' Facial Recognition and the Reinvention and Discretion in Digital Policing' (2021) *Brit. J. Criminol.* 61

Galič M, 'Surveillance and Privacy in Smart Cities and Living Labs: Conceptualising Privacy for Public Space' (PhD thesis, Tilburg University 2019)

Ghosh I, 'Mapped: The State of Facial Recognition Around the World', 22 May 2020, *Visual Capitalist*, <<https://www.visualcapitalist.com/facial-recognition-world-map/>>

Handbook on Human Rights Impact Assessment (2019) <https://www.humanrights.dk/sites/humanrights.dk/files/media/dokumenter/business/hria_toolbox/hria_guidance_and_toolbox_final_feb2016.pdf>

Home Office, 'Fact Sheet on Live Facial Recognition Used by the Police' (September 2019) <<https://homeofficemedia.blog.gov.uk/2019/09/04/fact-sheet-on-live-facial-recognition-used-by-police/>>

Home Office, 'Biometrics Strategy: Better Public Services Maintaining Public Trust' (June 2018) <https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/720850/Home_Office_Biometrics_Strategy_-_2018-06-28.pdf>

Hooyman P, 'Het ware gezicht van gezichtsherkenningstechnologie' (*Bits of Freedom*, 30 October 2019) <<https://www.bitsoffreedom.nl/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/het-ware-gezicht-van-gezichtsherkenningstechnologie.pdf>>

House of Commons Science and Technology Committee, Oral Evidence, 'Work of the Biometrics Commissioner and the Forensic Science Regulator' HC 1970 (*Parliament*, 19 March 2019) <<http://data.parliament.uk/writtenevidence/committeeevidence.svc/evidencedocument/science-and-technology-committee/the-work-of-the-biometrics-commissioner-and-the-forensic-science-regulator/oral/98556.html>>

House of Commons Science and Technology Committee, 'The Work of the Biometrics Commissioner and the Forensic Science Regulator, Nineteenth Report of Session 2017-19' (*Parliament*, 17 July 2019) <<https://publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm201719/cmselect/cmsctech/1970/1970.pdf>>

Hussain D, 'Met Police Make First Arrest Using Facial Recognition Technology as They Hold Woman, 35, Over Alleged Serious Assault on Emergency Service Worker' (*Daily Mail Online*, 28 February 2020) <<https://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-8055001/Met-Police-make-arrest-using-facial-recognition-technology.html>>

ICO, 'Sandbox beta phase, discussion paper' (January 2019) <<https://ico.org.uk/media/about-the-ico/documents/2614219/sandbox-discussion-paper-20190130.pdf>>

ICO, 'The Guide to the Sandbox' <<https://ico.org.uk/for-organisations/regulatory-sandbox/the-guide-to-the-sandbox/>>

ICO, 'Information Commissioner's Opinion: The Use of Live Facial Recognition Technology by Law Enforcement in Public' (October 2019) <<https://ico.org.uk/media/about-the-ico/documents/2616184/live-frt-law-enforcement-opinion-20191031.pdf>>

ICO, 'Blog: Information Commissioner's Opinion addresses privacy concerns on the use of live facial recognition technology in public places' (*ICO*, 18 June 2021) <<https://ico.org.uk/about-the-ico/media-centre/information-commissioner-s-opinion-addresses-privacy-concerns-on-the-use-of-live-facial-recognition-technology-in-public-places/>>

ICO, 'Information Commissioner's Opinion: The Use of Live Facial Recognition Technology in Public Places' (June 2021) <<https://ico.org.uk/media/about-the-ico/documents/2619985/ico-opinion-the-use-of-lfr-in-public-places-20210618.pdf>>

ICO, 'ICO Investigation into how the Police Use Facial Recognition Technology in Public Places' (October 2021)

ICO, 'Data Protection Impact Assessment' <<https://ico.org.uk/for-organisations/guide-to-data-protection/guide-to-the-general-data-protection-regulation-gdpr/accountability-and-governance/data-protection-impact-assessments/?msclkid=3b86403fb58611ec9ce9f3a413668fd9>>

Jain and others, 'Introduction to Biometrics' (Springer 2011)

Janssen HL, 'An Approach for a Fundamental Rights Impact Assessment to Automated Decision-Making' (2020) 10(1) *International Data Privacy Law* 77

Keymolen E, 'Dutch Experiment with Facial Recognition: Privacy Risks Require Legislative Choices' <<https://www.tilburguniversity.edu/current/press-releases/privacy-risks-facial-recognition-technology>>

Koops BJ and Galič M, 'Conceptualising Space and Place. Lessons from Geography for the Debate on Privacy in Public' in T Timan and others, *Privacy in Public Space: Conceptual and Regulatory Challenges* (Edward Elgar 2017)

Lawless CJ, 'The Evolution, Devolution and Distribution of UK Biometric Imaginaries' (2022) 17 *BioSocieties* 506.

Lequesne Roth C and others 'La Reconnaissance Faciale dans l'Espace Public : Une Cartographie Juridique Européenne', Fablex DL4T Report (April 2020) <<https://droit.univ-cotedazur.fr/dl4t/la-reconnaissance-faciale-dans-lespace---une-cartographie-juridique-europeenne>>

MacNaughton G, 'Human Rights Impact Assessment: A Method for Healthy Policymaking' (2015) *Health and Human Rights* 17/1

Mantelero A, 'AI and Big Data: A Blueprint for a Human Rights, Social and Ethical Impact Assessment' (2018) 34(3) *Computer Law & Security Review* 754

Martin A, 'Cops Turn Download Festival into an Orwellian Spy Paradise' (*The Register*, 11 June 2015) <https://www.theregister.com/2015/06/11/download_festival_big_brother_playground_leicestershire_police?page=1>

Martinez A, 'Face Recognition, Overview' in SZ Li and A Jain, *Encyclopedia of Biometrics* (Springer 2009).

Mathewson J, 'MET facial recognition to face legal challenge' (*City Matters*, 30 January 2020) <<https://www.citymatters.london/met-facial-recognition-face-legal-challenge/>>

Ministère de l'Intérieur, 'Livre Blanc de la Sécurité Intérieure' (2020) <<https://www.interieur.gouv.fr/sites/minint/files/medias/documents/2021-06//livre-blanc-de-la-securite-interieure.pdf>>

Mis JM, 'Pour un usage responsable et acceptable par la société des technologies de sécurité' vol. 1 and 2 (September 2021) <<https://www.vie-publique.fr/rapport/281424-pour-un-usage-responsable-et-acceptable-par-la-societe-des-technologies>>

Moeckli D, 'Exclusion from the Public Space: A Comparative Constitutional Analysis' (Cambridge 2016)

Naafs S, 'Living Laboratories: The Dutch Cities Amassing Data on Oblivious Residents' (*The Guardian*, 1 March 2018) <<https://www.theguardian.com/cities/2018/mar/01/smart-cities-data-privacy-eindhoven-utrecht>>

National Physical Laboratory and Metropolitan Police, 'Metropolitan Police Service Live Facial Recognition Trials' (February 2020).

Németh J and Schmid S, 'Publicly Accessible Space and Quality of Life: A Tool for Measuring the Openness of Urban Spaces' in M Budruk and R Philipps, *Quality-of-Life Community Indicators for Parks, Recreation and Tourism Management* (Springer 2011)

Oosterhoff R, 'Amsterdam is watching you, naar hoe zorgvuldig gebeurt dat?' (*AT5*, 18 February 2021) <<https://www.at5.nl/artikelen/207283/amsterdam-is-watching-you-maar-hoe-zorgvuldig-gebeurt-dat>>

Philipsen S and others, 'Legal Enclaves as a Test Environment for Innovative Products: Toward Legally Resilient Experimentation Policies' (2021) 15 *Regulation and Governance* 1128

Piquet C, 'Reconnaissance faciale : Cédric O n'est « pas certain » qu'Alicem soit un jour déployée' (*Le Parisien*, 24 December 2019) <<https://www.leparisien.fr/high-tech/reconnaissance-faciale-cedric-o-n-est-pas-certain-qu-alicem-soit-un-jour-deployee-24-12-2019-8223705.php>>

Press Association, 'Welsh Police Wrongly Identify Thousands as Potential Criminals' (*The Guardian*, 5 May 2018) <<https://www.theguardian.com/uk-news/2018/may/05/welsh-police-wrongly-identify-thousands-as-potential-criminals>>

Provence-Alpes-Côte d'Azur Région, Décision 13-893 (14 December 2018) <<https://www.laquadrature.net/wp-content/uploads/sites/8/2019/02/4.-D%C3%A9lib%C3%A9ration-attaqu%C3%A9e.pdf>>

Ranchordás S, 'The Whys and Woes of Experimental Legislation' (2013) 1 Theory and Practice of Legislation 415

R(Bridges) v the Chief Constable of South Wales Police, [2019] EWHC 2341 (Admin)

R(on the application of Edward Bridges) v the Chief Constable of South Wales Police, Appeal [2020] EWCQ Civ 1058

'Reclaim Your Face' <<https://reclaimyourface.eu>>

RTLnieuws, 'Tientallen camera's houden klanten van filiaal Jumbo in de gaten: willen we dit?' (*RTLnieuws*, 3 December 2019) <<https://www.rtlnieuws.nl/nieuws/nederland/artikel/4941596/gezichtsherkenning-biometrie-alphen-jumbo-privacy>>

Sénat, Science and Technology Briefings, Parliamentary Office for Scientific and Technological Assessment, Briefing 14, 'Facial Recognition' (July 2019) <<https://www2.assemblee-nationale.fr/content/download/179314/1794787/version/2/file/Note%20Reconnaissance%20Faciale%20-%20EN.pdf>>

Sénat, Rapport d'information fait au nom de la commission des lois constitutionnelles, de législation, du suffrage universel, du Règlement et d'administration générale sur la reconnaissance faciale et ses risques au regard de la protection des libertés individuelles, no 627, 10 May 2022 <<https://www.senat.fr/rap/r21-627/r21-6271.pdf>>

South Wales Police, Smarter Recognition, Safer Community, Deployments <<https://afr.south-wales.police.uk/wp-content/uploads/2021/04/All-Deployments.pdf>>

South Wales Police, 'Live Facial Recognition Technology Results' <<https://www.south-wales.police.uk/news/south-wales/news/2022/maw-mar/results-of-live-facial-recognition-technology-on-190322/>>

Surveillance Camera Commissioner, 'Facing the Camera, Good Practice and Guidance for the Police Use of Overt Surveillance Camera Systems Incorporating Facial Recognition Technology to Locate Persons on a Watchlist, in Public Places in England and Wales' (November 2020) <https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/940386/6.7024_SCC_Facial_recognition_report_v3_WEB.pdf>

Tribunal Administratif (TA) Marseille, no. 1901249 (27 February 2020) <<http://marseille.tribunal-administratif.fr/content/download/178764/1756210/version/1/file/1901249.pdf>>

TADA <<https://tada.city/en/home-en/>>

Tesquet O, 'Des micros dans la rue :la CNIL tire les oreilles (intelligentes) de Saint-Etienne (*Télérama*, 29 October 2019) <<https://www.telerama.fr/medias/la-cnil-tire-les-oreilles-intelligentes-de-saint-etienne,n6492439.php>>

The Ryder Review (June 2022) <<https://www.adalovelaceinstitute.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/06/The-Ryder-Review-Independent-legal-review-of-the-governance-of-biometric-data-in-England-and-Wales-Ada-Lovelace-Institute-June-2022.pdf>>

Tijhaar L, 'Vroeg of laat moet de politie gezichtsherkenning gaan gebruiken' (*Kennislink*, 6 January 2021) <<https://www.nemokennislink.nl/publicaties/vroeg-of-laet-moet-de-politie-gezichtsherkenning-gaan-gebruiken/>>

TNO's report 'Privacy bescherming bij niet-coöperatieve gezichtsherkenning', Appendix E describing the possible use cases with FRT (21 January 2021) <<https://www.tno.nl/nl/newsroom/2021/02/nieuwe-mijlpaal-waarborgen-privacy/>>

Townsend M, 'Police to Use Facial Recognition Cameras at Cenotaph Service' (*The Guardian*, 12 November 2017) <<https://www.theguardian.com/technology/2017/nov/12/metropolitan-police-to-use-facial-recognition-technology-remembrance-sunday-cenotaph>>

UK Government, Response to the Committee's Nineteenth Report of Session 2017-19 (*Parliament*, 19 March 2021) <<https://publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm5801/cmselect/cmsctech/1319/131902.htm>>

UK Government, News, 'The Biometrics and Surveillance Camera Commissioner's response to the College of Policing APP on Live Facial Recognition' (*Gov.uk*, 6 April 2022) <<https://www.gov.uk/government/news/the-biometrics-and-surveillance-camera-commissioners-response-to-the-college-of-policing-app-on-live-facial-recognition>>

Untersinger M, 'Reconnaissance Faciale: la CNIL Toque sur le Bilan de l'Expérience Niçoise' (*Le Monde*, 29 August 2019) <https://www.lemonde.fr/pixels/article/2019/08/28/reconnaissance-faciale-la-cnil-tique-sur-le-bilan-de-l-experience-nicoise_5503769_4408996.html>

Untersinger M, 'Cédric O : « Expérimenter la reconnaissance faciale est nécessaire pour que nos industriels progressent »' (*Le Monde*, 14 October 2019) <https://www.lemonde.fr/economie/article/2019/10/14/cedric-o-experimenter-la-reconnaissance-faciale-est-necessaire-pour-que-nos-industriels-progressent_6015395_3234.html>

UN Habitat, 'Global Public Space Toolkit: From Global Principles to Local Policies and Practice' (*United Nations*, 2015).

van der Sloot B and Lanzing M, 'The Continued Transformation of the Public Sphere: On the Road to Smart Cities, Living Labs and a New Understanding of Society' in M Nagenborg and others, *Technology and the City: Towards a Philosophy of Urban Technologies* (Springer 2021)

Ville de Nice, 'Rapport : Expérimentation Reconnaissance Faciale' (20 June 2019) <<https://data.technopolice.fr/api/files/1568560839337an2i6yk04kp.pdf>>

Violaine III, 'Un logiciel pour décoder les émotions des usagers du tramway de Nice' (*FranceBleu.fr*, 4 January 2019) <<https://www.francebleu.fr/infos/societe/un-logiciel-pour-decoder-les-emotions-des-usagers-du-tramway-de-nice-1546621455>>

Waarlo N and Verhagen L 'De stand van gezichtsherkenning in Nederland' (*De Volkskrant*, 27 March 2020) <<https://www.volkskrant.nl/kijkverder/v/2020/de-stand-van-gezichtsherkenning-in-nederland~v91028/>>

Williams C, 'Police Surveillance and the Emergence of CCTV in the 1960s' (2003) 5(3) *Crime Prevention and Community Safety* 27

Young J 'A History of CCTV Surveillance in Britain' (*QSwns*, 22 January 2018) <<https://stories.swns.com/news/history-cctv-surveillance-britain-93449/>>