

ABSTRACT

For computer comparying ther, the cumensioninal endoting and aspecific variation and left to right asymmetry were presechial tree of both taxa but was particularly evident in the of alligators and the caudal aspect of the The avian lung is highly specialized and is both functionally and morphologically distinct from that of their closest extant relatives, the crocodilians. It is highly partitioned, with a unidirectionally ventilated and immobilized gas-exchanging lung, and functionally decoupled, compliant, poorly vascularized ventilatory air-sacs. To understand the evolutionary history of the archosaurian respiratory system, it is essential to determine which anatomical characteristics are shared between birds and crocodilians and the role these shared traits play in their respective respiratory biology. To begin to address this larger question, we examined the anatomy of the lung and bronchial tree of ten American alligators (*Alligator mississippiensis*) and eleven ostriches (*Struthio camelus*) across an ontogenetic series using 38 traditional and micro-computed tomography (μ CT), three-dimensional (3D) digital models, and morphometry. Intraspecific variation and left to right asymmetry were present in certain aspects of the bronchial tree of both taxa but was particularly evident in the cardiac (medial) region of the lungs of alligators and the caudal aspect of the bronchial tree in both species. The cross-sectional area of the primary bronchus at the level of the major secondary airways and cross-sectional area of ostia scaled either isometrically or negatively allometrically in alligators and isometrically or positively allometrically in ostriches with respect to body mass. Of fifteen lung metrics, five were significantly different between the alligator and ostrich, suggesting that these aspects of the lung are more interspecifically plastic in archosaurs. One metric, the distances between the carina and each of the major secondary airways, had minimal intraspecific or ontogenetic variation in both alligators and ostriches, and thus may be a conserved trait in both taxa. In contrast to previous descriptions, the 3D digital models and CT scan data demonstrate that the pulmonary diverticula pneumatize the axial skeleton of the ostrich directly from the gas-exchanging pulmonary tissues instead of the air sacs. Global and specific comparisons between the bronchial topography of the alligator and ostrich reveal multiple possible homologies, suggesting that certain structural aspects of the bronchial tree are likely conserved across Archosauria, and may have been present in the ancestral archosaurian lung.

KEY WORDS: Aves, Crocodylia, Lungs, Pulmonary, Computed Tomography, 3D modeling

 INTRODUCTION The lung has evolved a structural diversity (Fig. 1) that has confounded comparative biologists for centuries despite a common function as the primary site of gas exchange in the majority of vertebrates [\(Farmer, 2006](#page-15-0), [Farmer, 2010](#page-15-1), [Huxley, 1882](#page-16-0), [Maina, 2017,](#page-17-0) [Sappey,](#page-17-1) [1847](#page-17-1)). Particularly enigmatic is the origin of the highly specialized avian respiratory system, with its functionally decoupled, unidirectionally ventilated immobile gas-exchanging lung (i.e., air travels in the same direction through most of the bronchial tree during both inspiration and expiration), and flexible, poorly vascularized air sacs [\(Maina, 2017](#page-17-0)). The microscopic and macroscopic anatomy of the avian respiratory system has been well documented through gross dissection, latex casts, and scanning electron microscopy ([Duncker, 1971,](#page-15-2) [Duncker, 1972](#page-15-3), [King,](#page-16-1) [1966](#page-16-1), [Maina, 2007,](#page-16-2) [Maina, 1989](#page-16-3), [Maina, 2006a,](#page-16-4) [O'Connor, 2004\)](#page-17-2). However, the complete three-dimensional (3D) anatomy has been difficult to study *in situ* prior to the introduction of 71 computed tomographic (CT) and microCT (μ CT) methodologies. This has resulted in an incomplete understanding of many aspects of lung morphology, including the relationships between the bronchial tree and the air sac system, degree of intra- and interspecific variation

Page 3 of 127 **Journal of Anatomy**

and ontogenetic changes, and relationships between the respiratory system and the adjacent

- skeletal tissues. Additionally, despite over a century of study on airflow patterns in the avian
- lung, the mechanisms by which unidirectional flow is maintained within the bronchial tree
- remains elusive [\(Harvey and Ben-Tal, 2016](#page-16-5), [Maina, 2017,](#page-17-0) [Maina and Africa, 2000](#page-17-3), [Maina et al.,](#page-17-4) [2009](#page-17-4)).

men an sonces, zoor, schonaring (Cieri et al., 2013), and the green iguana (Cieri et al., 2013), and the green iguana (Cieri et al., 2013) or
and airflo[w](#page-16-7)predates the evolution of avian flight, and isl of birds and endothe To begin to disentangle the origins of the complex avian respiratory system, it is 80 essential to understand the respiratory system of their only extant archosaurian relatives, the crocodilians. The pulmonary anatomy and respiratory function of crocodilians has received considerably less attention than their avian counterparts; however, the recent discovery of unidirectional airflow patterns in the lungs of numerous species of crocodilians ([Farmer, 2010,](#page-15-1) [Farmer, 2015b,](#page-16-6) [Farmer and Sanders, 2010,](#page-16-7) [Schachner et al., 2013](#page-17-5)), a monitor lizard ([Cieri and](#page-15-4) [Farmer, 2019](#page-15-4), [Schachner et al., 2014](#page-17-6)), and the green iguana (Cieri et al., 2014), suggest that the origin of unidirectional airflow predates the evolution of avian flight, and is likely independent from the evolution of birds and endothermy (Cieri et al., 2014, [Cieri and Farmer, 2016,](#page-15-6) [Schachner et al., 2014](#page-17-6)). Recent work in gross anatomy, embryonic development, function, and in vascularization patterns has demonstrated potential homologies between the crocodilian and avian lung (Farmer and Sanders, 2010, Sanders and Farmer, 2012, [Schachner et al., 2013](#page-17-5), [Farmer, 2015b\)](#page-16-6). To investigate the functional biology and evolutionary history of the avian and crocodilian respiratory systems, we first determine which morphological traits are shared 94 between the extant members of both groups (i.e., phylogenetic bracketing following Witmer, [1995](#page-18-0)) through a series of qualitative and quantitative comparisons. We present the detailed gross anatomy and variation in the bronchial tree of the American alligator (*Alligator mississippiensis*; n = 10) and the ostrich (*S. camelus*; n = 11) using 3D digital models generated via traditional CT and μ CT across an ontogenetic series. In both taxa, comparative measurements were taken between anatomically relevant characteristics of the large primary and secondary branches of the bronchial tree that are hypothesized to be associated with unidirectional airflow based upon previously published studies [\(Brackenbury, 1972,](#page-15-7) [Butler et al.,](#page-15-8) [1988](#page-15-8), [Duncker, 1971,](#page-15-2) Farmer, 2015b, Farmer and Sanders, 2010, [Maina and Nathaniel, 2001](#page-16-8), [Maina, 2006a,](#page-16-4) Sanders and Farmer, 2012, Schachner et al., 2013), using hypotheses of homology derived from Broman (1939), Sanders and Farmer (2012), and Schachner et al. ([2013\)](#page-17-5). These data are used to (1) establish intra- and interspecific variation in archosaurian lung morphology, (2) assess hypotheses of homology between the avian and crocodilian respiratory systems, and (3) provide comparative data useful in reconstructing the ancestral archosaurian bronchial tree. This initial dataset will be critical for future comparisons with other

- avian taxa occupying different ecological and functional niches, and the other less well studied
- crocodilian taxa. These data will also be integral for the generation of hypothesis of homology
- for developmental studies on the pulmonary architecture in archosaurs.
-

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Computed tomography and specimens

 CT scans were obtained from ten specimens of American alligator (*A. mississippiensis*)*,* and eleven ostriches (*S. camelus*) (see Table 1 for the information on the specimens used in this 118 study). The alligators were obtained from the Louisiana Department of Wildlife and Fisheries at the Rockefeller Wildlife Refuge; deceased animals were collected for purposes unrelated to this

- study. Scans of the live *A. mississippiensis* were also conducted for an unrelated study, but
- followed the IACUC guidelines of the University of Utah. Five scans were performed on lungs
- 122 stained with potassium iodide (I₂KI) [\(Jeffery et al., 2011\)](#page-16-9) (four *A. mississippiensis* and one *S.*
- *camelus*). The *S. camelus* specimens were obtained from the OK Corral Ostrich Farm in
- Southern California and acquisitioned into the collections of the University of California
- Museum of Vertebrate Zoology (MVZ) and the Royal Veterinary College, London. The juvenile 126 ostriches died of natural causes and were donated to the MVZ for research purposes. With the
- exception of the alligator hatchling and the adult ostrich, all animals were scanned at either the
- University of Utah Medical Center, Research Park, or the South Jordan Medical Center on a 164
- slice dual energy Siemens SOMATOM Definition computed tomography unit. Image acquisition
- parameters included: slice thickness 0.6–1 mm, 120 kVp, 200–400 MA (Table 1). The data were
- filtered in soft tissue and lung algorithm and edge-enhanced with a high-resolution lung
- algorithm. The CT data from the alligators and ostriches are available via Data Dryad (DOI:
- [https://doi.org/10.5061/dryad.3xsj3txdh\)](https://doi.org/10.5061/dryad.3xsj3txdh).
-

Anatomical digital modeling, quantitative measures, and analysis

Example and superations of \sim 11min, μ is every, so \sim co[w](#page-15-11) one method of the and lung algorithm and edge-enhanced with a high-restant and form the alligators and ostriches are available via Dat 5061/dryad.3xsj3txdh The pulmonary bronchi, lung surface, and skeleton (Fig. 2) were segmented into a three- dimensional (3D) surface mesh model with the visualization software Avizo 7.1 (FEI Visualization Sciences Group). Measurements of airway dimensions were taken in OsiriX MD - OsiriX DICOM Viewer (www.osirix-viewer.com) and are included in the Supplemental Information (SI Table 1, 2). These measurements were chosen based upon hypothesized homologous structures in both taxa (Table 2) from previous anatomical [\(Sanders and Farmer,](#page-17-7) [2012](#page-17-7), [Schachner et al., 2013](#page-17-5)) and developmental studies (Broman, 1939, [Locy and Larsell,](#page-16-10) [1916a](#page-16-10), [Locy and Larsell, 1916b\)](#page-16-11). Qualitative anatomical similarities observed between the large secondary airways in the adult and embryonic crocodilian and avian bronchial trees, and 145 functional similarities in airflow patterns previously described through experimental work were used to inform metrics selected for the quantitative component of this analysis ([Brackenbury,](#page-15-10) [1979](#page-15-10), [Butler et al., 1988,](#page-15-8) Duncker, 1971, Farmer, 2015b, Farmer, 2015a, [Schachner et al., 2013](#page-17-5)). To assess the lungs quantitatively, the following metrics were collected and are illustrated in Fig. 3: (1) maximum diameter and area of the trachea proximal to the bifurcation (2) maximum diameter and area of the right extrapulmonary primary bronchus just distal to the bifurcation off of the trachea; (3) area of the primary bronchus just proximal to the opening of the ostium of the major secondary airways arising off of the primary bronchus: the cervical ventral bronchus (CVB) in the alligator and ventrobronchus (V) 1 in the ostrich, and the first four dorsobronchi in both taxa (D2-D5 in the alligator, D1-4 in the ostrich); (4) area of the ostium of each of the secondary airways in both taxa (the CVB and D2-5 in the alligator, V1 and D1-4 in the ostrich); (5) area of the ostium of the first two clearly observable laterobronchi in both taxa; and, (6) distance from the carina to the center point of each of the ostia for each of the major secondary airways: CVB, D2-5 (alligator); V1-4, D1-4 (ostrich). To measure the ostium of each bronchus as accurately as possible, the DICOMs were rotated and re-sliced in the OsiriX 160 3D MPR Viewer window so that each of the three windows was properly aligned with the ostium or bronchus being measured. Specifically: (1) one viewer was oriented to show the 162 opening of the ostium as close to the primary bronchus as possible; (2) the second viewer was rotated so that it sliced through, and aligned with the middle of the primary bronchus; and, (3) 164 the third viewer was oriented so that it aligned with the orientation of the bronchus itself. Since 165 all of the airways are organic structures, and thus curve and branch, each of the windows had

166 to be adjusted for the measures completed at each site listed above. All measures were

completed by E.R. Schachner to eliminate inter-observer error in the 3D MPR viewer of OsiriX.

To minimize intra-observer error, each measurement was completed three times, and then

averaged. To validate the measurements completed in OsiriX, an object of known dimensions

was scanned with the hatchling alligator and was measured.

Body mass and interspecific comparisons

 Age at time of death was unknown for the majority of specimens. Therefore, scaling and comparisons between species were based on body masses only. It is well established that body mass can vary due to environmental factors aside from age, particularly in crocodilians (e.g., temperature or food consumption) ([Saalfeld et al., 2008\)](#page-17-8), so comparisons based on absolute 177 age are outside of the scope of this study. Body mass was not available for four of the ten alligators, so mass was estimated using the Multivariate Imputation by Chained Equations (MICE) package (van Buuren and Groothuis-Oudshoorn, 2011) in R (R Core Development Team, 2018, version 3.5.2), which imputes missing data points based on a value drawn from a

- distribution created from other variables from the dataset. We identified two measures that
- strongly and significantly correlated with the known masses in all six alligators: right primary
- bronchus maximum diameter and right primary bronchus area (Fig. 4). These measures and the
- mass (if known) were input and a series of 100 iterations were completed to estimate missing

masses (SI Table 3). The final mass for each specimen for analysis was the mean of the 100

- imputed values for that individual. These include: *A. mississippiensis* 54 mass: mean 10kg (95%
- Confidence Interval (CI) of +1.563); *A. mississippiensis* "Stumpy" mass: mean 13.4kg (95% CI of
- 188 +2.427); A. mississippiensis 64 mass: mean 14.5kg (95% CI of \pm 1.987); and A. mississippiensis 81
- mass: mean 31.5kg (95% CI of +6.628).

[or](#page-17-9) comparison (youted curr, 2007), so comparisons or
the scope of this study. Body mass was not available for for
twas estimated using the Multivariate Imputation by Chair
n Buuren and Groothuis-Oudshoorn, 2011) in R (R Co 190 Prior to the analyses, all values were log10 transformed. Fifteen model II standard major axis (SMA) regressions were run between lung metrics and body mass using the lmodel2 package in R (Legendre, 2018) to assess allometric intraspecific trends. SMA regressions are preferred over ordinary least squares regressions when both variables (lung variables and body 194 mass) are subject to measurement error (Sokal and Rohlf, 2012). Confidence intervals (α = 0.05) were calculated around slopes to evaluate deviations from isometry. Differences between the alligator and ostrich trajectories were then statistically compared using SMA confidence intervals of the slopes and y-intercepts. Additionally, relative differences in distances from the carina to the secondary bronchi (CVB, D2, D3, D4, D5) were visualized as percentages of total distance (from the carina to D5) in each *A. mississippiensis* and *S.camelus* specimen to assess

200 relative variation in distances both intra- and interspecifically.

Caveats

203 The lungs of one ostrich and four of the alligators were stained with I_2 KI to make the 204 parenchyma more visible in these specimens. It has been well established that this methodology causes some shrinkage in the tissues [\(Gignac et al., 2016](#page-16-12)), and can cause dramatic 206 shrinkage when specimens are stained for substantial lengths of time, e.g., weeks (Hedrick et [al., 2018\)](#page-16-13). None of these specimens were fixed prior to staining or stained for longer than 24 hours which are significant contributors to tissue deformation [\(Gignac et al., 2016](#page-16-12), [Hedrick et](#page-16-13) [al., 2018\)](#page-16-13). Additionally, the majority of the quantitative metrics obtained from the bronchial tree in the alligators were collected from the proximal portion which is cartilaginous in nature

 (CVB, L, D2–3 and associated PB measures) and the avian bronchial tree is immobilized and thus less flexible than other pulmonary tissues (e.g., [Maina, 2006b](#page-16-14), [Maina, 2017\)](#page-17-0).

-
- **RESULTS**
-

Anatomy of the bronchial tree in *Alligator mississippiensis*

 We examined *Alligator* lung morphology ([Sanders and Farmer, 2012](#page-17-7)) based on a large intraspecific sample including various ontogenetic stages (Figs. 5-8) to build on previous work done by Sanders and Farmer [\(2012](#page-17-7)) and Schachner et al. ([2013\)](#page-17-5) (Table 2). Terminology for the bronchi was based on that used for the developing lung [\(Broman, 1939](#page-15-9)).

 Primary bronchus Just distal to the carina, the cartilaginous portion of the primary 222 bronchi extends caudally just past the cone-shaped ostium of the cervical ventral bronchus. Distal to the end of the cartilaginous portion, the primary bronchus expands into a hook-shaped 224 bronchus (round to sub-elliptical in cross section) that curves medially, terminating in a small tapered point (Figs. 5-8). A variable number of small to medium-sized balloon-shaped bronchi emerge off of the caudal margin of the primary bronchus (Figs. 6; 8A, D, J). There is a considerable amount of bilateral asymmetry in the overall morphology of the caudal portion of the primary bronchi in *A. mississippiensis*, and a grossly visible differential distribution of the 229 respiratory parenchyma, with the majority of the parenchyma occupying the dorsal region of the lung (Fig. 7G, H).

Solution and the community and the community and solution of the excelution and solution is detailly just past the cone-shaped ostium of the cervical ve it the cartilaginous portion, the primary bronchus expands sub-ellipt **Cervical ventral bronchus (CVB)** In *A. mississippiensis*, the first bronchus to branch off of 232 the intrapulmonary primary bronchus is the CVB. It originates from a robust cartilaginous cone that makes a hairpin turn immediately after branching off of the primary bronchus so that the orientation of the long axis of the bronchus lies almost parallel with the trachea (Figs. 5A-D; 6). There is significant variability in the appearance of the CVB between different alligators (Fig. 8). This appears to be due to intraspecific variation in overall structure, as well as other 237 parameters, including the level of lung inflation, how full the stomach of the animal is, and whether or not the lung was inflated inside or outside of the body. In all alligators, the CVB is 239 accompanied by multiple tertiary bronchi that run ventrally and then cranially in tandem with 240 the main CVB bronchus (Figs. 6A, 8). The majority of these tertiary bronchi arise from either the 241 cartilaginous CVB cone, or the proximal two thirds of the CVB itself. The number, size, and 242 morphology of the tertiary bronchi are one of the most variable characters in the alligator lung 243 but tend to be similar between the left and right lungs (with the exception of one individual 244 where the CVB forked distally on one side).

 Dorsobronchi (D2–5) The dorsobronchi arise sequentially along the dorsal surface of the 246 primary bronchus caudal to the cone-shaped ostium of the CVB (Figs. 5A-D; 6A; 7). These bronchi diminish in size (overall length and bronchial diameter) as they continue caudally. There are typically four on either lung, but a small fifth dorsobronchus has been identified on the right 249 lung of one individual (alligator 9). The dorsobronchi arise from large oval-shaped ostia (Fig. 6A), arch dorsally, and then travel cranially, tapering out to a small pointed tip (Fig. 8A, C, D, F, 251 G, I, J, L). The first dorsobronchus (D2) travels to the apex of the lung usually connecting with 252 the distal tip of the CVB via a parabronchus (Fig. 7B). There are multiple tube-like connections (i.e., structures hypothesized to be homologous with the avian parabronchi [\(Schachner et al.,](#page-17-5) [2013](#page-17-5)) linking the dorsobronchi with both the CVB, and one another, along their length (Fig. 7B). The caudal-most dorsobronchus (D5) tends to be very small, often not extending cranially at all.

Tertiary bronchi predominantly arise from the base of each dorsobronchus with the exception

of some larger tube-shaped bronchi that originate on the lateral surface of D2 (Fig. 5D).

 Medial bronchi (M1–5) There is considerable variation in the morphology and number of medial bronchi, with the degree of morphological variation increasing caudally. All alligators examined possessed paired M1 bronchi that were consistently the second branch to arise off of the primary bronchus and serve as the source for the first (or cranial-most) bronchus of the 262 cardiac lobe. M1 arises medially, arches slightly dorsally and then runs cranially for its entire length often in unison with D2 (Figs. 5E; 6). Only M1 is bilaterally symmetric. M2 and M3 on the 264 left lung arise medially and tend to rise dorsally often giving off both cranial and caudal branches (Figs. 5E; 6). In the right lung, these same bronchi frequently extend medially and 266 caudally. In most of the individuals examined, there were more medial bronchi on the right lung than the left; however, in one specimen (alligator 64), there were 5 medial bronchi on the left lung, and three on the right. The more caudal medial bronchi give rise to the second and third branches (if present) of the cardiac lobes. In a few specimens, the caudal bronchi of the cardiac 270 lobes branch directly off of the medial surface of the primary bronchus.

 Laterobronchi (L) The laterobronchi are sac-like, poorly vascularized bronchi that originate from small ostia along the lateral and ventral surfaces of the primary bronchus beginning slightly distal to the cartilaginous cone of the CVB (Figs. 5F; 6). The anatomy of the laterobronchi varies between both right and left lungs and between individuals. However, there 275 is an overall morphological trend in that these bronchi conform to a narrow, constricted origin 276 that balloons out into a multi-fingered, sac-like distal end, which expands in all directions. 277 These bronchi occupy the distensible caudoventral floor of the lung and come in contact with the liver when *in situ* .

For the montatual canning, the twe methem the the methem that the right. The methem and the right. The more caudal medial bronchi give rise to the right. The more caudal medial bronchi give rise to the right. The more caud **Caudal group bronchi (CGB)** There are numerous tube-shaped bronchi that arise predominantly from the ventral surface of the primary bronchus caudal to the laterobronchi (although some small CGB arise from the dorsal surface of the primary bronchus) (Figs. 5F; 7). Like the laterobronchi, these secondary branches occupy the flexible caudoventral floor of the lung and are in contact with both the cranial surface of the liver and stomach. The ostia of the CGB are much larger than those of the laterobronchi, and the transition between the two types of bronchi is evident by both gross dissection and CT. These bronchi can also be differentiated 286 from the laterobronchi in their honeycomb shape versus the finger-like sac shape of the 287 laterobronchi. They are, however, similar in that they are grossly dead-end structures - although there may be small inter-bronchial perforations that are not visible via dissection or medical grade CT. There is some individual variation in the overall morphology of the CGB. In 290 some specimens, they are small, or sparse (alligators 81 and 11); however, in others, they are much larger in size (alligator 64 and hatchling alligator AM041315-1) (Figs. 5, 7). No obvious 292 relationship was evident between the number and size of the CGB and the state of the lungs, or specimen size.

 Cardiac lobes (C1–4) There are a collection of secondary and tertiary bronchi that, due 295 to their arrangement and position, make up the cardiac lobes. These bronchi branch off of the medial bronchi, or medial aspect of the primary bronchus in a variable manner. The lobes, 297 which contain expanded individual bronchi, arise asymmetrically off of both lungs with the 298 primary lobe (the lobe with the largest cranial-most bronchus that occupied the space in between the primary bronchi and the carina) emerging from the right lung in all examined individuals (Figs. 5F; 6B; 7E, F; 8B, E, H, K). The number of bronchi that contribute to the cardiac lobes and actual size of each lobe was variable (Table 3). For example, there was one bronchus

in the left lung and two in the right in one individual (*A. mississippiensis* 11), three on each side

- in three individuals (alligators 739, 15, 12), and four bronchi contributing to the left lobe and
- two to the right in another (alligator 64). There was no clear relationship between number of
- bronchi in the cardiac lobes, size of the animal, level of lung inflation, or state of the lungs (i.e., in a live animal or excised).
-

Anatomy of the bronchial tree in *Struthio camelus*

 Recent work has made substantial strides in addressing the confusion surrounding the anatomy of the bronchial tree in *S. camelus* using digital models ([Maina and Nathaniel, 2001,](#page-16-8) [Maina et al., 2009\)](#page-17-4), but these models do not show the entire bronchial tree and air sacs in detail, or as an intact organ system *in situ*. Therefore, we present a complete and detailed model of the lower respiratory system of *S. camelus* (Figs. 9-16) and explore the relationship between the respiratory system and the post-cranial skeleton (Figs. 13, 15).

 Primary bronchi The cartilaginous primary bronchi are short and slightly constricted just distal to the carina. Distal to the hilus, the primary bronchi are round to sub-elliptical in cross section and increase in diameter, until approximately the origin of the third dorsobronchus (Figs. 10D, 11). They then taper caudally (approximately 1/3 the maximum diameter) continuing to, and beyond the caudal margin of the gas-exchanging region of the lung, where they expand and balloon into the abdominal air sac. In lateral view, the primary bronchi have a low horizontal arc (Figs. 10D, 11).

Every respiratory system of S. camelus (Figs. 9-16) and explore

respiratory system of S. camelus (Figs. 9-16) and explore

atory system and the post-cranial skeleton (Figs. 13, 15).
 Donchi The cartilaginous primary bro **Ventrobronchi (V1–4/5)** There are variably four to five ventrobronchi in the ostrich, which arise sequentially off of the dorsomedial surface of the primary bronchus immediately distal to the hilus (Figs. 10C; 11A, C). The ventrobronchi arise in close proximity with only a thin (0.32–0.88 mm) septum of the primary bronchus separating them. The first ventrobronchus (V1) is the largest and most well developed, sending large tertiary branches cranioventrally, which loop around the cranial aspect of the primary bronchus, and caudomedially, which give off smaller quaternary branches that run medially (Figs. 10C; 11A, C; 12E). At its distal tip, the craniomedial branch of V1 enlarges into the cervical air sac. The more dorsomedially oriented bronchi emanating from V1 unite with their equivalent from the other lung and expand into the cervical air sac. V1 has the highest number of large tertiary and quaternary branches relative to the more caudal ventrobronchi. The second ventrobronchus (V2) arises just caudally to V1 from a slightly more medially oriented ostium (Figs. 10C; 11A, C). V2 immediately bifurcates, sending a single branch laterally over the primary bronchus to run ventrally, expanding distally into the cranial thoracic air sac. The medial branch of V2 runs caudomedially along the ventral surface of the gas-exchanging lung, sending off variably sized smaller bronchi. The third ventrobronchus (V3) originates just caudal to the ostium of V2 and mirrors the caudomedial aspect of V2 (Fig. 10C). V3 has a slightly larger diameter throughout its length relative to V2 in all of the ostriches examined; it also sends off a variable number of smaller branches that all project caudally. The fourth (and usually last) ventrobronchus (V4) emerges from the primary bronchus just caudal to the ostium of V3. It is approximately half the length of V3 and is much smaller in diameter. There are generally few or zero visible large-diameter tertiary bronchi arising from V4 (Fig. 10C). In two of the eleven ostriches examined, there is a fifth ventrobronchus (V5), which morphologically resembles V4, but is much smaller in length and diameter. **Dorsobronchi** There are a variable number of dorsobronchi in *S. camelus,* ranging from 8–11 that are visible via CT (Figs. 10D; 11A, C; 12E). There is some bilateral asymmetry in the

dorsobronchi, but this may be due to associated problems derived from tissue decay rather

than true biological asymmetry. In light of this, only the first four dorsobronchi will be described

in detail, with the remaining branches described as a unit. All of the dorsobronchi arise

sequentially (like the ventrobronchi) with minimal space between ostia (Figs. 10D; 11A, C). The

ostia are slightly offset dorsally relative to the more medial origins of the ventrobronchi, and in

most of the individuals examined, there is a small diastema (cranial to caudal) between the last

ventrobronchus and the first dorsobronchus (Fig. 11A, C). Dorsobronchus 1 (D1) has an elliptical

 shaped ostium, and arcs craniodorsally, giving off a variable number of tertiary bronchi that run cranially and ventrally (Fig. 10E). The second dorsobronchus (D2) is the largest (both in

bronchial width and the development of the tertiary and quaternary branches; Fig. 10D). It is

fan-shaped and runs dorsally at its base, with its tertiary branches radiating out both cranially

and caudally. The third dorsobronchus (D3) runs caudodorsally (Fig. 10D) with more large-

diameter tertiary bronchi arising from this bronchus in the older ostriches (Fig. 16H). The fourth

dorsobronchus (D4) generally mimics D3 anatomically with increased tertiary branching in the

 larger and older individuals. The more caudal dorsobronchi (D5-11) decrease in overall size, length, and complexity, acquiring more horizontal positions within the gas-exchanging lung

(Figs. 10D; 16B, D, F, H).

mumation and the based of the causar and the cast of the castroletical peer carriches (F) generally mimics D3 anatomicially with increased tertiar dividuals. The more caudal dorsobronchi (D5-11) decreases wity, acquiring **Laterobronchi** There are a varying number of laterobronchi in the gas-exchanging lung of *S. camelus*; however, there is one large laterobronchus that is markedly larger than the rest (Fig. 10D; 16B, D, F, H). Many of the accessory laterobronchi are so small in diameter that their origins remain unclear. The large laterobronchus emerges from the ventral surface of the 368 primary bronchus, approximately 180° opposite either the 3rd or 4th dorsobronchus. The ostium diameter is more than twice that of its opposing dorsobronchus (SI Table 1) and larger even than the ostium of V1. In all individuals examined, the large laterobronchus is subcircular in cross-section and runs caudoventrally, enlarging into the caudal thoracic air sac. The accessory laterobronchi vary in size and shape, all emerge from the ventral and ventrolateral surfaces of the primary bronchus and are angled caudoventrally towards the ventral surface of the gas-exchanging lung.

 Primary, secondary, and tertiary expansions (air sacs) The anatomy of the air sacs in the ostrich have been described elsewhere (Bezuidenhout et al., 1999); however, there are specific aspects of the air sacs worth noting that have not yet been described. Developmental studies of chicks indicate that the air sacs are dilations of the bronchial tree that extend past the margin of the respiratory parenchyma, or "gas-exchanging" lung ([Locy and Larsell, 1916a](#page-16-10)). The abdominal air sac is a caudally projecting expansion of the caudal aspect of the intrapulmonary primary bronchus as it reaches the caudal aspect of the gas-exchanging lung (Fig. 9; 12). Our imaging data demonstrate that the caudal thoracic sacs are the expanded distal aspects of the large laterobronchus. The cranial thoracic and cervical sacs are expansions of the first two ventrobronchi, and in some individuals were merged into one large sac (ostrich 6; Fig. 9C). The interclavicular sac, which completely envelops the ventral and lateral surfaces of the syrinx, is an expansion of the medial branches of the cranial ventrobronchi (ostrich 7; Fig. 12E). **Pulmonary diverticula** Müller [\(Müller, 1908](#page-17-10)) described and named numerous diverticula

 that extended from the air sacs and the gas-exchanging lung of the pigeon, which variably pneumatize adjacent skeletal tissues. These have also been observed and described in many other avian taxa including the turkey (*Meleagris gallopavo*), the blackheaded gull (*Larus ridibundus*), anseriform birds, and the Trochilidae [\(Cover, 1953,](#page-15-13) [King, 1966](#page-16-1), [King and McLelland,](#page-16-15) [1975](#page-16-15), [McLelland, 1989](#page-17-11), [O'Connor, 2004](#page-17-2)). These diverticula are large and clearly present in the

ostrich; however, they diverge from the descriptions published for other taxa in a few ways. In

 other birds, there are diverticula cranial to the immobilized gas-exchanging lung that are described as emerging from the cervical air sacs and traveling cranially up the cervical vertebrae, often pneumatizing the adjacent skeletal tissues ([King, 1966,](#page-16-1) [McLelland, 1989,](#page-17-11) [O'Connor, 2004](#page-17-2)). King [\(1966](#page-16-1)) illustrated these diverticula in *Gallus domesticus* as projecting from the dorsal surface of the cervical sac, with no connection to the gas-exchanging lung. In

- the ostrich, the vertebral diverticula emerge directly from the cranial margin of the gas-
- exchanging lung and are situated dorsally to what appear to be the true cervical sacs (Figs. 12A,
- B; 13; 14). It is highly likely that there are interconnections between the cervical sacs and these diverticula, but a clear origin of the vertebral diverticula directly from the cervical sacs is not supported by these CT-based data. It is important to note that Bezuidenhout et al. ([1999](#page-15-12)) and Fowler ([1991](#page-16-16)) describe the ostrich as being apneumatic aside from the femur alone (citing older literature); however, our data are in agreement with O'Connor and Claessens [\(2005](#page-17-12)) and demonstrate that the entire vertebral column, ilia, and femora are pneumatized in the larger
- ostriches and adult specimen (Fig. 15; see the full set of DICOM data available via Data Dryad to evaluate the extent of the pneumaticity in *S. camelus*). Addressing this requires use of latex injection and a better understanding of embryonic development so that boundaries and origins between specific sacs and diverticula can be confidently identified.
- Hote we continuous about a final met that is a find the term with currely our data are in agreement with O'Connor and Claessen
he entire vertebral column, ilia, and femora are pneumat
specimen (Fig. 15; see the full set of With respect to the abdominal region in the pigeon, Müller (1908) found that there are numerous diverticula, termed 'diverticula pelvica' and 'inguinalia', that emerge directly from the abdominal sac itself. The diverticula pelvica is described as surrounding the kidneys, and sending multiple processes cranially and caudally, with a few entering and pneumatizing the
- ilium and sacrum. The diverticula inguinalia are also described as emerging from the abdominal
- 416 sac, surrounding the femoral head and sending extensions between the muscles of the thigh
- ([Müller, 1908\)](#page-17-10). According to Müller, Gadow (1891) describes numerous openings of the
- secondary bronchi emerging from the surface of the lung that form into sacs, but Müller
- discounts this as an aberrant specimen. The pelvic diverticula described for Anseriformes also appear to follow this pattern (O'Connor, 2004), as do numerous other avian taxa ([McLelland,](#page-17-11)
- [1989](#page-17-11)). In the ostrich, the pelvic diverticula appear to emerge directly from the caudal aspect of
- 422 the gas-exchanging lung, and do not demonstrate any clear large connections to the abdominal
- sacs (ostrich 7; Figs. 13; 14). These pelvic diverticula seemingly directly pneumatize the adjacent
- pelvic and femoral skeletal elements, not the abdominal air sac as described for most birds
- ([O'Connor, 2004](#page-17-2)). However, this observation requires validation via latex injection to ensure
- preservation of the thin septa of avian air sacs.
-

Pulmonary measures

- The majority of lung metrics (primary bronchus area, ostium area, distance from the carina to the secondary bronchi) grew isometrically with respect to body size in both *A. mississippiensis* and *S. camelus* (Figs. 17 – 21, Tables 5 and 6). However, the area of the primary bronchus (Fig. 17A) at the CVB, the area of the ostium of the CVB (Fig. 17B), and the area of the primary bronchus at D3 (Fig. 19A) were negatively allometric in *A. mississippiensis*. The area of the ostium of V1 (Fig. 17B), area of the primary bronchus and ostium of D1 (Fig. 18A), area of the ostium of D2 (Fig. 19B), and the area of the ostium of L1 (Fig. 21B) were positively allometric in *S. camelus*. The area of the ostium of CVB/V1 (Fig. 17B), the area of the primary bronchus and ostium of D2/D1 (Fig. 18A, B), the area of the primary bronchus of D3/D2 (Fig.
- 19A), and the area of the ostium of L1 (Fig. 21B) were significantly different between *A.*
- *mississippiensis* and *S. camelus*. Linear metrics (e.g., distance to carina) have isometric slopes of

440 0.33 when compared with body mass, while area metrics (e.g., ostium area) have isometric

441 slopes of 0.66 when compared with body mass (Tables $5 - 7$).

 To generalize lung proportions across a range of body sizes, the distances from the 443 carina to the bronchi were converted into ratios of total length of the primary bronchus (carina to D5 in *A. mississippiensis* and D4 in *S. camelus*) (Fig. 22). The mean distance from the carina to the CVB/V1 is 45.02% (SD = 2.67) total length in *A*. *mississippiensis* and 48.06% (SD = 2.87) total length in *S. camelus* (Fig. 22). The mean distance of the CVB/V1 to D2/D1 is 12.44% (SD = 1.76) total length in *A. mississippiensis* and 31.12% (SD = 1.69) total length in *S. camelus*. The mean distance of D2/D1 to D3/D2 is 13.91% (SD = 1.89) total length in *A. mississippiensis* and 7.51% (SD = 0.83) total length in *S. camelus.* The mean distance of D3/D2 to D4/D3 is 13.65% (SD = 2.26) total length in *A. mississippiensis* and 6.65% (SD = 0.68) total length in *S. camelus*. The mean distance of D4/D3 to D5/D4 is 14.97% (SD = 2.49) total length in *A. mississippiensis* and 6.65% (SD = 0.65) total length in *Struthio.*

DISCUSSION

Intra- and interspecific variation

Fristian and the state of the aligators with the animal mume of the state of the peer Review (50 and the peer CHA) and D3 to D5/D4 is 14.97% (SD = 2.49) total length in A. misted length in Struthio.

Cific variation

cifi All of the alligators demonstrated some bilateral asymmetry in their bronchial tree, particularly in the overall morphology of the tertiary bronchi, caudal group bronchi (CGB), and caudal medial bronchi (Fig. 8). The number of dorsobronchi remained relatively constant with seven of the ten individuals having four dorsobronchi on both sides (Table 2). All of the alligators had paired M1 branches that were anatomically similar; however, M2 and the more caudal medial bronchi varied from left to right in all of the individuals. In all of the alligators examined, the primary cardiac lobe (i.e., the more cranial lobe that occupied the space between the carina and hila) emerged from the right lung. However, the number of bronchi that contributed to each cardiac lobe was highly variable, ranging from one on the left and two on the right in *A. mississippiensis* 11 to up to four in the left lung in *A. mississippiensis* (Table 2). The overall size of the right and left lungs relative to one another was approximately equal in the majority of individuals examined, with three animals exhibiting a slightly larger left lung. Considering that two of the three alligators with unequal lungs were inflated outside of the body, it is difficult to determine whether or not this difference was artifactual.

 Like the alligators, all of the ostriches demonstrated some bilateral bronchial asymmetry. The number and size of the accessory laterobronchi (i.e., the small diameter laterobronchi) varied from individual to individual (Fig. 16). The number of dorsobronchi also varied and estimates for the minimal number of branches indicated both intraspecific variation as well as some left to right asymmetry (Table 3). One *S. camelus* even appeared to have an extra dorsobronchus cranial to what was identified as the first dorsobronchus (based upon its 476 position on the primary bronchus and extreme bilateral asymmetry). The number and 477 morphology of the ventrobronchi was more consistent in the ostriches with the majority of individuals displaying four paired ventrobronchi (8/11 individuals); however, two *S. camelus* possessed five ventrobronchi in both lungs, and one *S. camelus* had five ventrobronchi in the right lung and four in the left (Table 3).

 Variation was evident in the bronchial tree of both *A. mississippiensis* and *S. camelus* with the most variation arising in the caudal and ventral regions of the lung in both taxa. Based on the presence of variation in the structure and number of the secondary airways, it is likely that the total number of dorsobronchi in birds and crocodilians does not have an impact on the direction of airflow. The ventrobronchi appeared to be more tightly constrained in number; one

and the binder of the binder of the binder what the gasted tubes
(as in all other birds) "extrapulmonary" extensions of immobilized gas-exchanging lung, forming the compliant
are visually evident in the developing chicken bronchus (functionally, with respect to flow) in the alligators ([Farmer and Sanders, 2010\)](#page-16-7) and either four or five in ostriches (Table 3). This difference is not surprising considering that ventrobronchi have been hypothesized to play a significant role in the inspiratory valve of the avian bronchial tree ([Butler et al., 1988](#page-15-8), [Harvey and Ben-Tal, 2016,](#page-16-5) [Maina and Africa, 2000,](#page-17-3) [Maina et al., 2009,](#page-17-4) [Wang et al., 1988\)](#page-17-13). The distance between the carina and each of the major secondary bronchi in both taxa showed minimal intraspecific variation (Fig. 22), suggesting that 492 the spacing between the secondary bronchi may be functionally constrained. These distances may also be ancestrally constrained for Archosauria, and thus could be reconstructed in the ancestral lung, if present in a broad range of extant avian and crocodilian taxa. The most unambiguous differences between the bronchial tree of alligators and ostriches is that in alligators, all of the bronchi are contained within the gas-exchanging lung. However, in ostriches (as in all other birds) "extrapulmonary" extensions of the bronchial tree extend beyond the immobilized gas-exchanging lung, forming the compliant ventilatory air sacs. Distinct similarities are visually evident in the developing chicken lung (*Gallus gallus*) before the air sacs extend beyond the margin of the gas-exchanging lung (Fig. 23). Depending upon the hypotheses of homology used (see below), the general pattern exhibited by our data and that of previous studies (Farmer and Sanders, 2010, Sanders and Farmer, 2012, [Schachner et al.,](#page-17-5) [2013](#page-17-5)), is that *A. mississippiensis* exhibited only one ventrobronchus (CVB), whereas the ostrich had four to five. The alligators also possessed fewer dorsobronchi (three or four) compared to the seven to eleven identified in the ostriches. One of the clear differences between alligator and ostrich lungs in general, aside from the number of large secondary bronchi, is in the path and morphology of the primary bronchus. In all of the ostriches examined, the intrapulmonary primary bronchus begins with a large area, and tapers caudally until it eventually leaves the gas-exchanging lung, ballooning into the abdominal air sac (Figs. 9D; 12E). In alligators, the

intrapulmonary primary bronchus is constricted proximally, and expands within the lung (Fig. 7)

caudal to the ostium of D3 (the second dorsobronchus), looping medially to form a hook-like

structure with secondary sac-like bronchi emerging off of its caudal margin. It has been

 proposed that the balloon-like expansion emerging from the caudalmost aspect of this hook, which is also present in the Nile crocodile (*Crocodylus niloticus*), is homologous to the

abdominal air sac in birds (Schachner et al., 2013). Additionally, ventrobronchi 2–4 (or 5) in the

ostrich travel medially and caudally in all of the birds examined. In one of the alligators, there

- was a small secondary tube-shaped branch emerging from the base of the CVB, and in many
- alligators the secondary bronchi emerging from the CVB varied dramatically in morphology, ranging from elongated tubes to voluminous sacs (Fig. 8C, F, I, L), suggesting that there may be
- some plasticity in the development of the number of CVB/ventrobronchi in both taxa.

 The interspecific comparison is between an ontogenetic series, but no age data were 522 available for these specimens, so it is not possible to make direct comparisons of growth relative to age across the two taxa, only size. Of fifteen lung metrics, five were significantly different between the alligator and ostrich (Table 7). The area of the primary bronchus and ostia increased isometrically or negatively allometrically in alligators and isometrically or positively allometrically in ostriches with respect to body mass (Figs. 17A-B; 18 A-B; 19 A-B; 20 A-B; 21; Tables 5, 6). In both taxa, the distances from the carina to the secondary bronchi increased isometrically with mass (Fig. 22), suggesting either phylogenetic or functional constraints. No metrics were positively allometric in *A. mississippiensis* and no metrics were negatively allometric in *S. camelus* suggesting different pulmonary growth trajectories in the bronchial trees in these two taxa.

 In all of the alligators, the cross sectional area of the intrapulmonary primary bronchus caudal to the hilus increases as the bronchus courses caudally, as reported by others (Sanders and Farmer 2012, Farmer 2015) (Fig. 6), whereas in the ostrich, a different pattern occurs: the area of the primary bronchus appears to decrease caudal to the first few dorsobronchi (Fig. 11); however, metrics were not collected on this region of the primary bronchus. It is unclear what these bronchial metrics mean biologically or physiologically, but these data provide an infrastructure to begin intra- and interspecific quantitative and qualitative comparisons across Archosauria.

Pulmonary heterogeneity and hypotheses of homology in the archosaurian lung

rectroguency of the contrivespinatory system to controlline and the controlline of the controlline and the non-gas exchanging regions of the lung. Historical salways been termed the "lung," while the non-gas-exchors." The The extreme heterogeneity of the avian respiratory system has been well documented 543 since the late 19th century (Duncker, 1971, Huxley, 1882). However, there is confusion within the literature in the nomenclature surrounding the separation between the gas-exchanging portion of the lung and the non-gas exchanging regions of the lung. Historically, the gas- exchanging lung has always been termed the "lung," while the non-gas-exchanging regions are identified as "air sacs." The functional difference between the gas-exchanging portion of the lung and the air sacs necessitates this distinction; however, it is important to note that the entire post-tracheal respiratory apparatus is indeed, the lung. It is clear from work on avian lung development (Locy and Larsell, 1916a, Locy and Larsell, 1916b) that the avian air sacs are secondary and tertiary expansions of the bronchial tree and thus are a part of the lung proper, as in other vertebrates. This has been demonstrated developmentally in the chicken (*Gallus gallus domesticus*) when the air sacs first emerge off of the bronchial tree at day four of incubation before they extend beyond the boundary of the gas-exchanging lung (Fig. 23A). In *S. camelus*, some of the secondary bronchi emerge beyond the boundaries of the gas-exchanging lung to connect with the air sacs but are not themselves considered part of the air sacs (Fig. 10A). This is particularly evident in the ventrolaterally projecting aspect of the first ventrobronchus as it travels down the craniolateral surface of the gas-exchanging lung to expand into the cranial thoracic air sacs (Fig. 10A). This region of V1 is less vascularized than the "lung" proper and would not remain attached to the gas-exchanging lung if it were excised. Thus, it is important to note that the air sacs are just massive expansions of the bronchial tree and should always be considered part of the lung. Despite the structural and functional differentiation of the avian bronchial tree into gas-exchanging and ventilatory regions, distinct similarities to the crocodilian respiratory system become apparent when the lungs are assessed using a comparative approach. Hypotheses of homology between crocodilian and avian lungs were first proposed in

 1882, when Thomas Henry Huxley made comparisons between the respiratory system of *Apteryx,* an unnamed duck, and crocodiles, even giving a brief mention to the respiratory organs of their dinosaurian ancestors ([Huxley, 1882\)](#page-16-0). Global possibilities of homologies between the lung and bronchial tree of the alligator and the avian lung appear particularly clear when alligators are compared with the developing chick respiratory tract at day eight of incubation, prior to when the air sacs emerge beyond the margin of the gas-exchanging portion of the lung (Fig. 23).

 Sanders and Farmer [\(Sanders and Farmer, 2012\)](#page-17-7) generated a clear map of potential homologous bronchi shared between *A. mississippiensis* and the chicken (*G. g. domesticus*) based on previous developmental work ([Locy and Larsell, 1916a](#page-16-10), [Broman, 1939\)](#page-15-9), which is what we have followed here (Table 2). In this hypothesis (termed bronchial homology hypothesis 1),

box a possible costinual characteric rigional policials (24). In h[y](#page-15-15)pothesis 2, the CVB of alligators remains homolo
hesis 1; however, the medial bronchi of alligators are put
bronchi 2–4 due to their similar medial alignm the alligator CVB is homologous to all of the avian ventrobronchi collectively, the alligator dorsobronchi (D2–5) are putatively homologous with the avian dorsobronchi (D1–4), and the medial bronchi of the alligator have been lost in the bird or were never shared pulmonary traits (Fig. 24). In the ostrich, all of the ventrobronchi are offset medially from the dorsobronchi in a distinct row, and V2–4 are distinct from V1 in that they do not project far cranially, and predominantly occupy space along caudomedial aspect of the gas-exchanging lung. In all of the alligators, and in *Crocodylus niloticus* (Schachner et al., 2013), there are multiple secondary medial bronchi arising off of the intrapulmonary primary bronchus that are usually left out of homology comparisons or coupled with the dorsobronchi due to similarities in function. After examining the alignment of the dorso- and medial bronchi in the *A. mississippiensis* relative to the ostrich, we propose a possible second alternative hypothesis (bronchial homology hypothesis 2) (Fig. 24). In hypothesis 2, the CVB of alligators remains homologous to V1 of the ostrich, as in hypothesis 1; however, the medial bronchi of alligators are putatively homologous to the avian ventrobronchi 2–4 due to their similar medial alignment along the intrapulmonary primary bronchus (Fig. 24I, K). Functionally, the ventrobronchi of birds operate as the return circuit, taking oxygen-poor air from the parabronchi and delivering it to the trachea for expiration ([Brackenbury, 1979](#page-15-10), Fedde, 1980, Scheid et al., 1972). Based upon morphological similarities with the adjacent caudal to cranially ventilated dorsobronchi [\(Farmer and Sanders,](#page-16-7) [2010](#page-16-7)), airflow in the crocodilian medial bronchi is also likely caudal to cranial, indicating that if "bronchial hypothesis 2" is correct (Fig. 24C, F), there would have been a change in function from delivery-bronchus to return-bronchus in either crocodilians or the avian line. Additional hypotheses associated with the identity and homology of the secondary bronchi and regions of the lung are possible; however, a much broader phylogenetic range of taxa are required to begin to test these hypotheses. Most importantly, developmental experimental research is required to investigate the genetic underpinnings of the branching patterns of the archosaurian bronchial trees.

The evolution of the archosaurian respiratory system

 Due to the presence of unidirectional airflow in extant crocodilians ([Farmer, 2015b](#page-16-6), [Farmer and Sanders, 2010,](#page-16-7) Schachner et al., 2013), varanids ([Schachner et al., 2014](#page-17-6)), and iguanas ([Cieri et al., 2014\)](#page-15-5), it has become clear that there is no causal relationship between unidirectional airflow patterns and the presence of extra-pulmonary air sacs. This was originally demonstrated by experimental occlusion of the cranial and caudal thoracic sacs, and abdominal sacs of the chicken (Brackenbury and Amaku, 1990, Brackenbury et al., 1989). The presence of aerodynamic valves in birds [\(Butler et al., 1988\)](#page-15-8), crocodilians ([Farmer and Sanders, 2010,](#page-16-7) [Schachner et al., 2013](#page-17-5)), and varanids [\(Cieri and Farmer, 2019](#page-15-4), [Schachner et al., 2014\)](#page-17-6), suggests that this trait is ubiquitous in archosaurs, both extinct and extant, and is likely ancestral for Diapsida [\(Cieri et al., 2014](#page-15-5), [Cieri and Farmer, 2016,](#page-15-6) [Farmer, 2015b](#page-16-6), [Farmer, 2015a,](#page-15-11) [Farmer,](#page-16-19) [2015c](#page-16-19), [Schachner et al., 2014\)](#page-17-6). The majority of these taxa were not active flyers, demonstrating that unidirectional airflow did not evolve to support the metabolic demands of flight, or of endothermy ([Cieri and Farmer, 2016,](#page-15-6) [Farmer, 2015a](#page-15-11), [Farmer, 2015c](#page-16-19)). Farmer [\(2010\)](#page-15-1) proposed the hypothesis that unidirectional flow evolved in basal archosaurs (and perhaps in earlier sauropsids) to facilitate gas exchange during apnea by coupling flow patterns with the beating heart. Farmer ([2010\)](#page-15-1) measured unidirectional pulses in airflow that corresponded with individual heartbeats via an ECG in *A. mississippiensis*. Unlike extant mammals, all "reptiles" are known to have long periods of apnea, during which unidirectional airflow would be distinctly

 advantageous for oxygen extraction, particularly when coupled with cardiogenic airflow patterns ([Farmer, 2010\)](#page-15-1).

- The radiation of Mesozoic archosaurs is one of the most extensively studied (e.g.,
- [Benton and King, 1989](#page-15-16), [Foth et al., 2016](#page-16-20), [Benson et al., 2014,](#page-14-0) [Butler et al., 2014](#page-15-17)), and yet poorly
- understood diversification events in geologic history. After the Permo-Triassic extinction event,
- archosaurs were able to diversify and occupy every large-bodied ecological niche,
- outcompeting mammals until the end of the Mesozoic Era. Reconstruction of the ancestral
- archosaurian lung necessitates careful analysis of the osteological correlates of relevant extinct
- taxa. As these correlates only provide information on the external surfaces of the anatomy of
- the respiratory system that directly contact the adjacent skeletal tissues, the internal
- pulmonary anatomy can only be inferred from shared characteristics found in the lungs of
- extant archosaurs. This will provide a starting point for qualitative and quantitative
- comparisons and evolutionary reconstructions. Certain structural and regional similarities
- between the bronchial tree of *S. camelus* and *A. mississippiensis* demonstrate that some traits
- were likely plesiomorphic for Archosauria and may have provided a competitive advantage
- experienced by archosaurs during the Late Triassic period over the bronchoalveolar lung of
- mammals, particularly when atmospheric oxygen levels are modeled to have been lower than present conditions and fluctuated during the Mesozoic (see e.g., Berner et al., 2007, [Schachat](#page-17-15)
- [et al., 2019](#page-17-15)).
-

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The University control and control and control and control of This will provide a starting point for qualitative and quantivolutionary reconstructions. Certain structural and region hial tree of *S. camelus* and *A. missis* This work was supported by an American Association of Anatomists Postdoctoral Fellowship and an American Philosophical Society Franklin Research Grant to ERS, a donation from Sharon Meyer, and National Science Foundation grants to CGF (IOS -1055080 and IOS-0818973). We are grateful to D. Osborn and J. Atterholt for providing the ostriches for this study, and R. Elsey, P. Gignac, and A. Watanabe for providing the alligators. Thanks to M. McNulty for access to the microCT scanner at Louisiana State University and technical expertise. We would also like to acknowledge D. Katz for his expertise in writing the R-script for the imputed masses. JRH was supported by funding from the European Research Council (ERC) under the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme (grant agreement no. 695517). The authors declare no conflict of interest.

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

 ERS and CGF initially designed the project with input from JRH. ERS and CGF collected the scan data. The 2D metrics and 3D models were collected/segmented by ERS. Data analysis was completed by ERS, BPH, HAR, and CGF. Statistical analyses were completed by BPH, with the exception of body mass reconstructions which were done by HAR. All authors contributed to

- the final synthesis of the data and writing of the manuscript.
- **Literature cited**
-
- Benson RJB, Campione NE, Carrano MT, et al. (2014) Rates of dinosaur body mass evolution indicate 170 million years of sustained ecological innovation on the avian stem lineage. *PLoS Biology,* **12(5),** e1001853.

Sor Per Review Only

816 **Table 1.** Data and CT information for the *Struthio camelus* and *Alligator mississippiensis* specimens included in the analysis. *S.* camelus 817 specimens are accessioned at the Museum of Vertebrate Zoology at Berkeley (MVZ).

- 820 **Table 2.** Proposed homologies in the bronchial trees of *Alligator mississippiensis* and *Struthio*
- 821 *camelus* utilized for qualitative and quantitative comparisons following previous hypotheses of
- 822 homology [\(Sanders and Farmer, 2012,](#page-17-7) [Schachner et al., 2013\)](#page-17-5).
- 823

826 **Table 3.** Left to right symmetry in the bronchial tree of *Alligator mississippiensis.* Asterisk

827 indicates the lung from which the dominant, and cranially position cardiac lobe arises. The

828 animals are ranked by body mass (smallest at the top).

829

830

831 **Table 4.** Left to right symmetry in the bronchial tree of *Struthio camelus*. The number of

832 dorsobronchi is a minimum estimate due to the small size of the caudalmost dorsobronchi and

833 the resolution of the CT scanner. Specimens are ranked by body mass (with the smallest at the 834 top).

835

836

837 **Table 5.** The SMA regression results for the CVB, D2-D5, and L1-2 with respect to body mass of

838 *Alligator mississippiensis*. Slope, confidence intervals around the slope, and the expectation for

839 isometry are reported for each metric. Primary bronchus (PB) area and ostium area are

840 isometric at a slope of 0.66 while distances are isometric at a slope of 0.33.

842

843 Table 6. The SMA regression results for the CVB, D2-D5, and L1-2 with respect to body mass of

844 *Struthio camelus*. Slope, confidence intervals around the slope, and the expectation for

845 isometry are reported for each metric. Primary bronchus (PB) area and ostium area are

846 isometric at a slope of 0.66 while distances are isometric at a slope of 0.33.

847

- 850 **Table 7.** Comparisons between slopes for *A. mississippiensis* and *S. camelus*. Significant
- 851 differences determined based on non-overlapping 95% confidence intervals of SMA
- 852 regressions.
- 853

855 **Supplemental Information Table Captions**

856

- 857 **SI Table 1** Raw metrics obtained from the lungs of *Struthio camelus* specimens. Colors
- 858 correspond to hypothesis of homology with the American alligator (*A. mississippiensis*).
- 859
- 860 **SI Table 2** Raw metrics obtained from the lungs of the *A. mississippiensis* specimens. Colors
- 861 correspond to hypothesis of homology with *S. camelus*.
- 862
- 863 **SI Table 3** Imputed mass values for each of the four *A. mississippiensis* that had an unknown 864 mass.

Figure captions

Figure 1. Phylogeny for Tetrapoda demonstrating the structural diversity of the tetrapod lung.

A) Amniota; B) Sauropsida; C) Archosauria. Volume rendered skeleton and surface model of the

- bronchial tree of: D) *Xenopus sp.*; E) *Saguinus sp.*, (with a diagrammatic illustration of a
- standardized primate bronchial tree); F) *Iguana iguana* (modified from [\(Cieri et al., 2014](#page-15-5)); G)
- *Varanus exanthematicus* (modified from [\(Schachner et al., 2014\)](#page-17-6); H) *Chelydra serpentina*
- (modified from Schachner et al., [\(Schachner et al., 2017\)](#page-17-16); I) *Alligator mississipiensis*; and, J)
- *Struthio camelus.* Images not to scale.
-

Figure 2. Segmented 3D surface model of the thorax, lung, and bronchial tree of *A.*

 mississippiensis. A. mississippiensis 11 (live) during a natural apnea in dorsal (A, C, E), and left lateral (B, D, F) views. Parabronchi (i.e., connections between the primary, secondary and tertiary bronchi) are not shown.

Let the mistrice mote the content of the mississippiens is 11 (live) during a natural apnea in dorsal
 mississippiensis 11 (live) during a natural apnea in dorsal

sys. Parabronchi (i.e., connections between the primary, **Figure 3. Diagrammatic models demonstrating the quantitative metrics.** Simplified and reduced digital model of the bronchial tree of the right lung of *Alligator mississippiensis* in medial (A), craniomedial (B), and ventral (C, D) views, with the tertiary, medial, caudal and lateral bronchi all removed. Simplified and reduced digital model of the bronchial tree of the right lung of *Struthio camelus* in (E, F), dorsomedial (G), and ventral (H, I) views. These models are 3D representations and indications of the 2D quantitative metrics obtained from the DICOM images in OsiriX. A) Gold rings represent the metrics obtained at the trachea (metric 1) and 887 primary bronchus (metric 2) in the alligator. Pink oblique rings demonstrate the sites where metrics were taken for the area of the primary bronchus, perpendicular to the origin of the secondary bronchus (metric 3). B) Red oblique rings represent the site where the metrics were 890 taken for the area of the ostium for each secondary bronchus as it branched from the primary bronchus (metric 4). C-D) Diagram of where metrics were taken for the distances from the carina to each of the large secondary bronchial ostia (metric 6) (C) with the bronchi labeled (D) (metrics 1 and 2 are also labeled in this view). E) Pink oblique circles demonstrating the position 894 of metric 3 in the ostrich. Blue oblique circle demonstrates metric 5 as measured around the large laterobronchus on *S. camelus*. F-G) Red rings demonstrate metric 4 in *S. camelus* for the ventrobronchi and dorsobronchi. H-I) Diagram of where metrics were taken for the distances from the carina to each of the large secondary bronchial ostia (metric 6) in *S. camelus* with the measurement diagram (H) and the labeled ostia (I). Abbreviations: CA, carina; CVB, cervical ventral bronchus; D2-D5, dorsobronchi 2-5; L, laterobronchus; PB, primary bronchus; V1-4, ventrobronchi 1-4. Numbers indicate specific metrics described in methods. Images not to scale.

 Figure 4. Measured and imputed body masses of *A. mississippiensis* **scaled to pulmonary measures across a growth series.** (A) Measured/imputed body mass scaled to the maximum 905 diameter of the right primary bronchus just distal to the bifurcation from the trachea; (B) measured/imputed body mass scaled to the area of the right primary bronchus at the same location as (A).

Figure 5. Segmented 3D surface model of the primary, secondary, and large tertiary airways

of *A. mississippiensis* **64.** Specimen is deceased, artificially inflated, and all images in left

- craniolateral view (except for D). A) The primary, secondary, and large tertiary bronchi; B) the
- 912 primary and secondary bronchi (the tertiary bronchi have been removed); C) the primary
- bronchi, the cervical ventral bronchus, and the dorsobronchi; D) image (C) in left lateral view; E)
- 914 the primary and medial (M) bronchi; F) the primary bronchi, the laterobronchi, the cardiac
- **lobes, and the caudal group bronchi. Parabronchi (i.e., connections between the primary,**
- secondary and tertiary bronchi) are not shown. Abbreviations = C, cardiac lobes; CGB, caudal
- group bronchi; CVB, cervical ventral bronchus; D2-5, dorsobronchi 2-5; L, laterobronchi; M1-5, medial bronchi; Pb, primary bronchus.
-

Figure 6. Segmented 3D surface model of the bronchial tree of *A. mississippiensis* **64.**

- 921 Bronchial tree in dorsal (A) and ventral (B) views, with the ostia of the major secondary and a
- 922 few tertiary branches represented as stumps to visually demonstrate clear branching pattern.
- Abbreviations: C1-4, cardiac lobes 1-4; CVB, cervical ventral bronchus; CVB2, secondary
- braat (μ_1 and venture) (pyiews), where used one the mayor
thes represented as stumps to visually demonstrate clear b
4, cardiac lobes 1-4; CVB, cervical ventral bronchus; CVB2,
cervical ventral bronchus; D2-5, dorsobr branches off of the cervical ventral bronchus; D2-5, dorsobronchi 2-5; LB, laterobronchi; M1-5,
- medial bronchi 1-5.
-

Figure 7. Segmented 3D surface model of the dorsal vertebrae and ribs, lung surface, and

- **bronchial tree of a hatchling** *A. mississippiensis* **(AM041315-1) and CT images of a live adult**
- **("Stumpy").** Hatchling thorax model in left craniolateral (A-C) and ventral (D-F) views generated
- 930 from µCT data. Lung surface and axial skeleton are shown in (A), (D), and (E). Surface of the
- 931 lungs and the tertiary bronchi of the left lung are made semi-translucent in (B-C) and (E-F) to
- 932 demonstrate the position of the major primary and secondary airways within the lung and 933 relative to the smaller interconnecting branches (=parabronchi). Lung surface and tertiary
- bronchi are removed from the left lung, and the tertiary are made semi-translucent in (C) and
- 935 (F) to further demonstrate these relationships. Axial (G) and parasagittal (H) CT images of a live
- adult *A. mississippiensis* (scanned in a supine position) demonstrating the pulmonary
- heterogeneity and regional distribution of the parenchyma within the lung. Abbreviations: CVB,
- cervical ventral bronchus; P, parenchyma.
-

Figure 8. Intraspecific and methodological variation in the bronchial tree of *Alligator*

- **mississippiensis.** Segmented 3D surface models of the bronchial tree of four different
- individuals. Top row: The lungs of alligator 81 (deceased), shown in dorsal (A), ventral (B), and
- left lateral (C) views, were completely dissected out of the thorax, and inflated via a syringe
- 944 prior to scanning. Second row: alligator 64 (deceased), shown in dorsal (D), ventral (E), and left
- lateral (F) views, was inflated via a syringe, and scanned *in situ* in the torso. Third row:
- 946 "Stumpy," shown in dorsal (G), ventral (H), and left lateral (I) views, was scanned live,
- unsedated, and in an upside down (supine) position. Bottom row: alligator 15, shown in dorsal
- 948 (J), ventral (K), and left lateral (L) views, was scanned live, unsedated, and prone position. Images not to scale.
-

Figure 9. Segmented 3D surface model of the postcranial skeleton and respiratory system of

Struthio camelus **6 (deceased, artificially inflated).** *S. camelus* model in left lateral (A), dorsal

(B), and left craniolateral (C-D) views. No secondary pulmonary diverticula are shown. C) Lung

- surface and air sacs. D) Lung surface has been removed showing a solid representation of the
- bronchial tree and the direct connections to the extrapulmonary air sacs. Note that the
- parabronchi are not shown (connections between the dorsobronchi and ventrobronchi) as they
- are too small to be segmented from the CT data due to resolution of a medical grade scanner.
- Additionally, the interclavicular and cervical air sacs have been segmented as a single unit due
- to the inability to differentiate between the boundaries due to the resolution of the scan.
- Abbreviations: AAS, abdominal air sac; CRTS, cranial thoracic air sac; CS, cervical air sac; CTS,
- cranial thoracic air sac; GL, gas exchanging lung; IAS, interclavicular air sac.
-

Figure 10. Segmented 3D surface model of the gas exchanging lung and bronchial tree of *S.*

- **Example 12**

Sultion of a medical grade scanner. Abbreviations: CRTS, c

Sultion of a medical grade scanner. Abbreviations: CRTS, c

Sunchi 1-8; LB, laterobronchi; LS, lung surface; PB, primary

rrobronchi 1-4.
 Led 3D s *camelus* **6.** Model is shown in left craniolateral (A-C) and left lateral (D) views. The surface of 965 the gas exchanging lung is represented as semi-translucent blue and the negative space within the bronchial tree is shown as solid. Note that the parabronchi are not shown (connections 967 between the dorsobronchi and ventrobronchi) as they are too small to be segmented from the CT data due to resolution of a medical grade scanner. Abbreviations: CRTS, cranial thoracic air sac; D1-8, dorsobronchi 1-8; LB, laterobronchi; LS, lung surface; PB, primary bronchus; TR, trachea; V1-4, ventrobronchi 1-4.
-

 Figure 11. Segmented 3D surface model of the bronchial tree of *S. camelus* **6.** Model is shown in dorsal (A), ventral (B), and left dorsolateral (C) views, with the ostia of the major secondary

branches represented as stumps to visually demonstrate clear branching patterns.

- Abbreviations: CR, carina; D1-7, dorsobronchi 1-7; LB, laterobronchi; PB, primary bronchus; T,
- trachea; V1-4, ventrobronchi 1-4.
-

Figure 12. Segmented 3D surface model of the entire respiratory system of *S. camelus* **7.**

- Model is shown in left craniolateral (A, C, D) and lateral views (B, E). The pulmonary diverticula
- are visible in (A) and (B) and can be clearly seen extending cranially and caudally to the gas-
- exchanging lung, as well as positioned dorsally to the ventilatory air sacs. The pulmonary
- diverticula are removed in (C-E) and demonstrate the lack of continuity with the air sacs.
- Abbreviations: AAS, abdominal air sac; CS, cervical air sac; CRTS, cranial thoracic air sac; CTS,
- caudal thoracic air sac; D1-2, dorsobronchi 1-2; IAS, interclavicular air sac; L, laterobronchus; PB, primary bronchus; TR, trachea; V1, ventrobronchus 1. Images not to scale.
-

Figure 13. Segmented 3D surface model of the skeleton and respiratory system of *S. camelus*

- **7.** Model is shown in left craniolateral (A), left lateral (B), right lateral (C), and left dorsolateral views with the left ilium removed (D). The pulmonary diverticula are visualized as a solid in (D) to clarify the relationships between these structures and the adjacent skeletal tissues.
-

Figure 14. Segmented 3D surface model of the gas-exchanging lung, bronchial tree, and

pulmonary diverticula of *S. camelus* **7.** Model is shown in left lateral view, demonstrating the

origin of the majority of the diverticula from the secondary airways, and directly from the

- surface of the lung, but distinct from the caudal extent of the primary bronchus as it extends
- beyond the gas-exchanging lung to balloon into the abdominal air sac. Abbreviations: GL, gas
- exchanging lung; L, laterobronchus; PB, primary bronchus; TR, trachea; V1-2, ventrobronchi 1-2.
- **Figure 15. Volume rendered model and coronal CT slices of** *S. camelus* **10 demonstrating**

extensive axial and appendicular postcranial pneumaticity. (A) Volume rendered 3D model of

- a juvenile *S. camelus* in left lateral view with lines demonstrating the location of the two
- coronal DICOM slices shown at positions (B) and (C), and two axial slices shown at positions (D)

Erainte from the carina to the ostium, i or events, in the crisinate from the carina to the ostium of the CVB and V1. (D) *L. mississippiensis* bronchial tree with the cervical ventral in. (E) Diagrammatic illustration of and (E). Abbreviations: D, diverticula; DP, diverticula pelvica; F(p), femur (pneumatized); GL, gas-exchanging lung; R(p), rib (pneumatized); V(p), vertebra (pneumatized). **Figure 16. Intraspecific variation in the bronchial tree of** *Struthio camelus***.** Segmented 3D surface models of *S. camelus 7* in dorsal (A) and left lateral (B) views, *S. camelus* 8 in dorsal (C) and left lateral (D) views, *S. camelus* 10 in dorsal (E) and left lateral (F) views, and *S. camelus* 11 1009 in dorsal (G) and left lateral (H) views. Images not to scale. **Figure 17. Standard major axis regressions of the log of body mass and the log of the following anatomical measurements:** (A) Cross sectional area of intrapulmonary primary bronchus at the level of CVB (alligator) and V1 (ostrich), (B) cross sectional area of ostium of CVB and V1 (C) distance from the carina to the ostium of the CVB and V1. (D) Diagrammatic illustration of the *A. mississippiensis* bronchial tree with the cervical ventral bronchus highlighted in green. (E) Diagrammatic illustration of the bronchial tree of *S. camelus* with the cervical ventral bronchus highlighted in green. Abbreviations: CVB, cervical ventral bronchus; PB, primary bronchus; V1, ventrobronchus. Ostriches = magenta circles. Alligators = blue triangles. **Figure 18. Standard major axis regressions of the log of body mass and the log of the following anatomical measurements:** (A) Cross sectional area of intrapulmonary primary bronchus at the level of D2 (*Alligator*) and D1 (*Struthio*) and body mass (B) cross sectional area of ostium of the D2 and D1 (C) distance from the carina to the ostium of D2 and D1 (D) Diagrammatic illustration of the *A. mississippiensis* bronchial tree with dorsobronchus 2 (the first dorsobronchus) highlighted in lime. (E) Diagrammatic illustration of the bronchial tree of *S. camelus* with dorsobronchus 1 highlighted in lime. Ostriches = magenta circles. Alligators = blue triangles. **Figure 19. Standard major axis regressions of the log of body mass and the log of the following anatomical measurements:** (A) Cross sectional area of intrapulmonary primary bronchus at the level of D3 (*Alligator*) and D2 (*Struthio*) and body mass (B) cross sectional area of ostium of the D3 and D2 (C) distance from the carina to the ostium of D3 and D2 (D) Diagrammatic illustration of the *A. mississippiensis* bronchial tree with dorsobronchus 3 (the second dorsobronchus) highlighted in neon green. (E) Diagrammatic illustration of the bronchial tree of *S. camelus* with dorsobronchus 2 highlighted in neon green. Ostriches = magenta circles. Alligators = blue triangles. **Figure 20. Standard major axis regressions of the log of body mass and the log of the following anatomical measurements:** (A) Cross sectional area of intrapulmonary primary bronchus at the level of D4 (*Alligator*) and D3 (*Struthio*) and body mass (B) cross sectional area of ostium of the D4 and D3 (C) distance from the carina to the ostium of D4 and D3 (D) Diagrammatic illustration of the *A. mississippiensis* bronchial tree with dorsobronchus 4 (the third dorsobronchus) highlighted in aqua. (E) Diagrammatic illustration of the bronchial tree of *S. camelus* with dorsobronchus 3 highlighted in aqua. Ostriches = magenta circles. Alligators = 1046 blue triangles.

Fraction to th[e](#page-17-17) current current current of the may be current of the current of the matric carrina to the cervical ventral bronchus and then to each of s) in *A. mississippiensis*. Bottom: The relative distances from a sig **Figure 21. Standard major axis regressions of the log of body mass and the log of the following anatomical measurements:** (A) Cross sectional area of intrapulmonary primary bronchus at the level of D5 (*Alligator*) and D4 (*Struthio*) and body mass (B) cross sectional area of the ostium of laterobronchus 1 (C) cross sectional area of the ostium of laterobronchus 2 (D) Diagrammatic illustration of the *A. mississippiensis* bronchial tree with dorsobronchus 5 (the fourth dorsobronchus) highlighted in blue, and the laterobronchi highlighted in magenta. (E) Diagrammatic illustration of the bronchial tree of *S. camelus* with dorsobronchus 4 highlighted in blue, and the laterobronchi highlighted in magenta. Ostriches = magenta circles. Alligators = blue triangles. **Figure 22. Ratio of the distances from the carina to the major secondary bronchi and total distance from the carina to D5 in** *A. mississippiensis* **and D4 in** *S. camelus***.** Top: The relative distances from the carina to the cervical ventral bronchus and then to each consecutive dorsobronchus (2-5) in *A. mississippiensis*. Bottom: The relative distances from the carina to the first ventrobronchus and then each consecutive dorsobronchus (1-4) in *S. camelus*. The colors 1063 follow the hypotheses of homology. There is limited intraspecific variation in all measures 1064 suggesting that the relative distances of secondary bronchi from the carina are strongly ontogenetically conserved. Further, the only substantial difference between the two taxa is the 1066 distance from the carina to D2/D1 suggesting the other distances may be conserved within Archosauria. **Figure 23. Schematic of hypotheses of pulmonary homology shared between the developing chick lung (A) and the adult alligator lung (B).** A) Diagrammatic image of the embryonic chick respiratory track at day 8 of development showing the initial emergence of the air sacs from the bronchial tree, prior to their massive expansion beyond the boundary of the gas exchanging lung; image redrawn and modified from Sakiyama et al. (Sakiyama et al., 2000). B) Diagrammatic simplified illustration of the bronchial tree and lung of an adult alligator lung in left lateral view. Colors denote hypothesized homologous regions. Abbreviations: AAS, abdominal air sac; CGB, caudal group bronchi; CLS, clavicular air sac; CRTS, cranial thoracic air sac; CS, cervical air sac; CVB, cervical ventral bronchus; D2, dorsobronchus 2; LB, laterobronchi. Images not to scale. **Figure 24. Homology hypotheses for the archosaurian bronchial trees.** Segmented solid surface models of the bronchial tree of *A. mississippiensis* (A, D, G, I), and *S. camelus* (B, C, E, F, 1082 H, K), all in dorsal view. Colors represent hypothesized homologous primary and secondary bronchi for the two taxa with the "bronchial homology hypothesis 1" (B, E, H): the ostrich ventrobronchi are homologous to the alligator cervical ventral bronchus. "Bronchial homology

- hypothesis 2" (C, F, K): the avian ventrobronchi are homologous to the alligator medial bronchi,
- and ventrobronchi 2-4 are homologous to the alligator medial bronchi; (K) demonstrates the
- 1087 angle of orientation of the secondary bronchi in both taxa on the dorsal surface of the primary
- bronchus. Abbreviations: CVB, cervical ventral bronchus; D, dorsobronchi; M, medial bronchi; V,
- ventrobronchi; H1, hypothesis 1; H2, hypothesis 2.

Figure 1. Phylogeny for Tetrapoda demonstrating the structural diversity of the tetrapod lung. A) Amniota; B) Sauropsida; C) Archosauria. Volume rendered skeleton and surface model of the bronchial tree of: D) *Xenopus* sp.; E) *Saguinus* sp., (with a diagrammatic illustration of a standardized primate bronchial tree); F) *Iguana iguana* (modified from Cieri et al., 2014); G) *Varanus exanthematicus* (modified from Schachner et al., 2014); H) *Chelydra serpentina* (modified from Schachner et al., 2017); I) *Alligator mississipiensis*; and, J) *Struthio camelus*. Images not to scale.

Figure 2. Segmented 3D surface model of the thorax, lung, and bronchial tree of *A. mississippiensis*. *A. mississippiensis* 11 (live) during a natural apnea in dorsal (A, C, E), and left lateral (B, D, F) views. Parabronchi (i.e., connections between the primary, secondary and tertiary bronchi) are not shown.

Figure 3. Diagrammatic models demonstrating the quantitative metrics. Simplified and reduced digital model of the bronchial tree of the right lung of *Alligator mississippiensis* in medial (A), craniomedial (B), and ventral (C, D) views, with the tertiary, medial, caudal and lateral bronchi all removed. Simplified and reduced digital model of the bronchial tree of the right lung of *Struthio camelus* in (E, F), dorsomedial (G), and ventral (H, I) views. These models are 3D representations and indications of the 2D quantitative metrics obtained from the DICOM images in OsiriX. A) Gold rings represent the metrics obtained at the trachea (metric 1) and primary bronchus (metric 2) in the alligator. Pink oblique rings demonstrate the sites where metrics were taken for the area of the primary bronchus, perpendicular to the origin of the secondary bronchus (metric 3). B) Red oblique rings represent the site where the metrics were taken for the area of the ostium for each secondary bronchus as it branched from the primary bronchus (metric 4). C-D) Diagram of where metrics were taken for the distances from the carina to each of the large secondary bronchial ostia (metric 6) (C) with the bronchi labeled (D) (metrics 1 and 2 are also labeled in this view). E) Pink oblique circles demonstrating the position of metric 3 in the ostrich. Blue oblique circle demonstrates metric 5 as measured around the large laterobronchus on *S. camelus*. F-G) Red rings demonstrate metric 4 in *S.*

Journal of Anatomy **Page 34 of 127**

camelus for the ventrobronchi and dorsobronchi. H-I) Diagram of where metrics were taken for the distances from the carina to each of the large secondary bronchial ostia (metric 6) in *S. camelus* with the measurement diagram (H) and the labeled ostia (I). Abbreviations: CA, carina; CVB, cervical ventral bronchus; D2-D5, dorsobronchi 2-5; L, laterobronchus; PB, primary bronchus; V1-4, ventrobronchi 1-4. Numbers indicate specific metrics described in methods. Images not to scale.

Figure 4. Measured and imputed body masses of *A. mississippiensis* scaled to pulmonary measures across ontogeny. (A) measured/imputed body mass scaled to the maximum diameter of the right primary bronchus just distal to the bifurcation from the trachea; (B) measured/imputed body mass scaled to the area of the right primary bronchus at the same location as (A).

Figure 5. Segmented 3D surface model of the primary, secondary, and large tertiary airways of *A. mississippiensis* 64. Specimen is deceased, artificially inflated, and all images in left craniolateral view (except for D). A) The primary, secondary, and large tertiary bronchi; B) the primary and secondary bronchi (the tertiary bronchi have been removed); C) the primary bronchi, the cervical ventral bronchus, and the dorsobronchi; D) image (C) in left lateral view; E) the primary and medial (M) bronchi; F) the primary bronchi, the laterobronchi, the cardiac lobes, and the caudal group bronchi. Parabronchi (i.e., connections between the primary, secondary and tertiary bronchi) are not shown. Abbreviations = C, cardiac lobes; CGB, caudal group bronchi; CVB, cervical ventral bronchus; D2-5, dorsobronchi 2-5; L, laterobronchi; M1-5, medial bronchi; Pb, primary bronchus.

Figure 6. Segmented 3D surface model of the bronchial tree of *A. mississippiensis* 64. Bronchial tree in dorsal (A) and ventral (B) views, with the ostia of the major secondary and a few tertiary branches represented as stumps to visually demonstrate clear branching pattern. Abbreviations: C1-4, cardiac lobes 1-4; CVB, cervical ventral bronchus; CVB2, secondary branches off of the cervical ventral bronchus; D2-5, dorsobronchi 2-5; LB, laterobronchi; M1-5, medial bronchi 1-5.

Figure 7. Segmented 3D surface model of the dorsal vertebrae and ribs, lung surface, and bronchial tree of a hatchling *A. mississippiensis* (AM041315-1) and CT images of a live adult ("Stumpy"). Hatchling thorax model in left craniolateral (A-C) and ventral (D-F) views generated from µCT data. Lung surface and axial skeleton are shown in (A), (D), and (E). Surface of the lungs and the tertiary bronchi of the left lung are made semi-translucent in (B-C) and (E-F) to demonstrate the position of the major primary and secondary airways within the lung and relative to the smaller interconnecting branches (=parabronchi). Lung surface and tertiary bronchi are removed from the left lung, and the tertiary are made semi-translucent in (C) and (F) to further demonstrate these relationships. Axial (G) and parasagittal (H) CT images of a live adult *A. mississippiensis* (scanned in a supine position) demonstrating the pulmonary heterogeneity and regional distribution of the parenchyma within the lung. Abbreviations: CVB, cervical ventral bronchus; P, parenchyma.

195x208mm (300 x 300 DPI)

Figure 8. Intraspecific and methodological variation in the bronchial tree of *Alligator mississippiensis*. Segmented 3D surface models of the bronchial tree of four different individuals. Top row: The lungs of alligator 81 (deceased), shown in dorsal (A), ventral (B), and left lateral (C) views, were completely dissected out of the thorax, and inflated via a syringe prior to scanning. Second row: alligator 64 (deceased), shown in dorsal (D), ventral (E), and left lateral (F) views, was inflated via a syringe, and scanned in situ in the torso. Third row: "Stumpy," shown in dorsal (G), ventral (H), and left lateral (I) views, was scanned live, unsedated, and in an upside down (supine) position. Bottom row: alligator 15, shown in dorsal (J), ventral (K), and left lateral (L) views, was scanned live, unsedated, and prone position. Images not to scale.

Figure 9. Segmented 3D surface model of the postcranial skeleton and respiratory system of *Struthio camelus* 6 (deceased, artificially inflated). *S. camelus* model in left lateral (A), dorsal (B), and left craniolateral (C-D) views. No secondary pulmonary diverticula are shown. C) Lung surface and air sacs. D) Lung surface has been removed showing a solid representation of the bronchial tree and the direct connections to the extrapulmonary air sacs. Note that the parabronchi are not shown (connections between the dorsobronchi and ventrobronchi) as they are too small to be segmented from the CT data due to resolution of a medical grade scanner. Additionally, the interclavicular and cervical air sacs have been segmented as a single unit due to the inability to differentiate between the boundaries due to the resolution of the scan. Abbreviations: AAS, abdominal air sac; CRTS, cranial thoracic air sac; CS, cervical air sac; CTS, cranial thoracic air sac; GL, gas exchanging lung; IAS, interclavicular air sac.

Figure 10. Segmented 3D surface model of the gas exchanging lung and bronchial tree of *S. camelus* 6. Model is shown in left craniolateral (A-C) and left lateral (D) views. The surface of the gas exchanging lung is represented as semi-translucent blue and the negative space within the bronchial tree is shown as solid. Note that the parabronchi are not shown (connections between the dorsobronchi and ventrobronchi) as they are too small to be segmented from the CT data due to resolution of a medical grade scanner. Abbreviations: CRTS, cranial thoracic air sac; D1-8, dorsobronchi 1-8; LB, laterobronchi; LS, lung surface; PB, primary bronchus; TR, trachea; V1-4, ventrobronchi 1-4.

d 3D surface model of the bronchial tree of *S. camelus* 6. Model idorsolateral (C) views, with the ostia of the major secondary branconstrate clear branching patterns. Abbreviations: CR, carina; D is exercibronchi; PB, pr Figure 11. Segmented 3D surface model of the bronchial tree of *S. camelus* 6. Model is shown in dorsal (A), ventral (B), and left dorsolateral (C) views, with the ostia of the major secondary branches represented as stumps to visually demonstrate clear branching patterns. Abbreviations: CR, carina; D1-7, dorsobronchi 1-7; LB, laterobronchi; PB, primary bronchus; T, trachea; V1-4, ventrobronchi 1-4.

Figure 12. Segmented 3D surface model of the entire respiratory system of *S. camelus* 7. Model is shown in left craniolateral (A, C, D) and lateral views (B, E). The pulmonary diverticula are visible in (A) and (B) and can be clearly seen extending cranially and caudally to the gas-exchanging lung, as well as positioned dorsally to the ventilatory air sacs. The pulmonary diverticula are removed in (C-E) and demonstrate the lack of continuity with the air sacs. Abbreviations: AAS, abdominal air sac; CS, cervical air sac; CRTS, cranial thoracic air sac; CTS, caudal thoracic air sac; D1-2, dorsobronchi 1-2; IAS, interclavicular air sac; L, laterobronchus; PB, primary bronchus; TR, trachea; V1, ventrobronchus 1. Images not to scale.

Figure 13. Segmented 3D surface model of the skeleton and respiratory system of *S. camelus* 7. Model is shown in left craniolateral (A), left lateral (B), right lateral (C), and left dorsolateral views with the left ilium removed (D). The pulmonary diverticula are visualized as a solid in (D) to clarify the relationships between these structures and the adjacent skeletal tissues.

Figure 14. Segmented 3D surface model of the gas-exchanging lung, bronchial tree, and pulmonary diverticula of *S. camelus* 7. Model is shown in left lateral view, demonstrating the origin of the majority of the diverticula from the secondary airways, and directly from the surface of the lung, but distinct from the caudal extent of the primary bronchus as it extends beyond the gas-exchanging lung to balloon into the abdominal air sac. Abbreviations: GL, gas exchanging lung; L, laterobronchus; PB, primary bronchus; TR, trachea; V1-2, ventrobronchi 1-2.

Figure 15. Volume rendered model and coronal CT slices of *S. camelus* 10 demonstrating extensive axial and appendicular postcranial pneumaticity. (A) Volume rendered 3D model of a juvenile S. camelus in left lateral view with lines demonstrating the location of the two coronal DICOM slices shown at positions (B) and (C), and two axial slices shown at positions (D) and (E). Abbreviations: D, diverticula; DP, diverticula pelvica; F(p), femur (pneumatized); GL, gas-exchanging lung; R(p), rib (pneumatized); V(p), vertebra (pneumatized).

137x219mm (300 x 300 DPI)

Figure 16. Intraspecific variation in the bronchial tree of *Struthio camelus*. Segmented 3D surface models of *S. camelus* 7 in dorsal (A) and left lateral (B) views, *S. camelus* 8 in dorsal (C) and left lateral (D) views, *S. camelus* 10 in dorsal (E) and left lateral (F) views, and *S. camelus* 11 in dorsal (G) and left lateral (H) views. Images not to scale.

Figure 17. Standard major axis regressions of the log of body mass and the log of the following anatomical measurements: (A) Cross sectional area of intrapulmonary primary bronchus at the level of CVB (alligator) and V1 (ostrich), (B) cross sectional area of ostium of CVB and V1 (C) distance from the carina to the ostium of the CVB and V1. (D) Diagrammatic illustration of the *A. mississippiensis* bronchial tree with the cervical ventral bronchus highlighted in green. (E) Diagrammatic illustration of the bronchial tree of *S. camelus* with the cervical ventral bronchus highlighted in green. Abbreviations: CVB, cervical ventral bronchus; PB, primary bronchus; V1, ventrobronchus. Ostriches = magenta circles. Alligators = blue triangles.

Figure 18. Standard major axis regressions of the log of body mass and the log of the following anatomical measurements. (A) Cross sectional area of intrapulmonary primary bronchus at the level of D2 (*Alligator*) and D1 (*Struthio*) and body mass (B) cross sectional area of ostium of the D2 and D1 (C) distance from the carina to the ostium of D2 and D1 (D) Diagrammatic illustration of the *A. mississippiensis* bronchial tree with dorsobronchus 2 (the first dorsobronchus) highlighted in lime. (E) Diagrammatic illustration of the bronchial tree of *S. camelus* with dorsobronchus 1 highlighted in lime. Ostriches = magenta circles. Alligators = blue triangles.

Figure 19. Standard major axis regressions of the log of body mass and the log of the following anatomical measurements: (A) Cross sectional area of intrapulmonary primary bronchus at the level of D3 (*Alligator*) and D2 (*Struthio*) and body mass (B) cross sectional area of ostium of the D3 and D2 (C) distance from the carina to the ostium of D3 and D2 (D) Diagrammatic illustration of the *A. mississippiensis* bronchial tree with dorsobronchus 3 (the second dorsobronchus) highlighted in neon green. (E) Diagrammatic illustration of the bronchial tree of *S. camelus* with dorsobronchus 2 highlighted in neon green. Ostriches = magenta circles. Alligators = blue triangles.

Figure 20. Standard major axis regressions of the log of body mass and the log of the following anatomical measurements: (A) Cross sectional area of intrapulmonary primary bronchus at the level of D4 (*Alligator*) and D3 (*Struthio*) and body mass (B) cross sectional area of ostium of the D4 and D3 (C) distance from the carina to the ostium of D4 and D3 (D) Diagrammatic illustration of the *A. mississippiensis* bronchial tree with dorsobronchus 4 (the third dorsobronchus) highlighted in aqua. (E) Diagrammatic illustration of the bronchial tree of *S. camelus* with dorsobronchus 3 highlighted in aqua. Ostriches = magenta circles. Alligators = blue triangles.

Figure 21. Standard major axis regressions of the log of body mass and the log of the following anatomical measurements: (A) Cross sectional area of intrapulmonary primary bronchus at the level of D5 (*Alligator*) and D4 (*Struthio*) and body mass (B) cross sectional area of the ostium of laterobronchus 1 (C) cross sectional area of the ostium of laterobronchus 2 (D) Diagrammatic illustration of the *A. mississippiensis* bronchial tree with dorsobronchus 5 (the fourth dorsobronchus) highlighted in blue, and the laterobronchi highlighted in magenta. (E) Diagrammatic illustration of the bronchial tree of *S. camelus* with dorsobronchus 4 highlighted in blue, and the laterobronchi highlighted in magenta. Ostriches = magenta circles. Alligators = blue triangles.

Figure 22. Ratio of the distances from the carina to the major secondary bronchi and total distance from the carina to D5 in *A. mississippiensis* and D4 in *S. camelus*. Top: The relative distances from the carina to the cervical ventral bronchus and then to each consecutive dorsobronchus (2-5) in *A. mississippiensis*. Bottom: The relative distances from the carina to the first ventrobronchus and then each consecutive dorsobronchus (1-4) in *S. camelus*. The colors follow the hypotheses of homology. There is limited intraspecific variation in all measures suggesting that the relative distances of secondary bronchi from the carina are strongly ontogenetically conserved. Further, the only substantial difference between the two taxa is the distance from the carina to D2/D1 suggesting the other distances may be conserved within Archosauria.

Figure 23. Schematic of hypotheses of pulmonary homology shared between the developing chick lung (A) and the adult alligator lung (B). A) Diagrammatic image of the embryonic chick respiratory track at day 8 of development showing the initial emergence of the air sacs from the bronchial tree, prior to their massive expansion beyond the boundary of the gas exchanging lung; image redrawn and modified from Sakiyama et al. (2000). B) Diagrammatic simplified illustration of the bronchial tree and lung of an adult alligator lung in left lateral view. Colors denote hypothesized homologous regions. Abbreviations: AAS, abdominal air sac; CGB, caudal group bronchi; CLS, clavicular air sac; CRTS, cranial thoracic air sac; CS, cervical air sac; CVB, cervical ventral bronchus; D2, dorsobronchus 2; LB, laterobronchi. Images not to scale.

Figure 24. Homology hypotheses for the archosaurian bronchial trees. Segmented solid surface models of the bronchial tree of *A. mississippiensis* (A, D, G, I), and *S. camelus* (B, C, E, F, H, K), all in dorsal view. Colors represent hypothesized homologous primary and secondary bronchi for the two taxa with the "bronchial homology hypothesis 1" (B, E, H): the ostrich ventrobronchi are homologous to the alligator cervical ventral bronchus. "Bronchial homology hypothesis 2" (C, F, K): the avian ventrobronchi are homologous to the alligator medial bronchi, and ventrobronchi 2-4 are homologous to the alligator medial bronchi; (K) demonstrates the angle of orientation of the secondary bronchi in both taxa on the dorsal surface of the primary bronchus. Abbreviations: CVB, cervical ventral bronchus; D, dorsobronchi; M, medial bronchi; V, ventrobronchi; H1, hypothesis 1; H2, hypothesis 2.

187x198mm (300 x 300 DPI)