Is Flux Tube a Bosonic String? What Does Lattice Say?

Xmas Theoretical Physics Workshop @ Athens 2019

Andreas Athenodorou Marie Skłodowska-Curie Individual Fellow University of Pisa

Courtesy to D. Leinweber

Work in collaboration with Mike Teper, Based on arXiv:1103.5854, 1007.4720, 1702.03717, 1602.07634 and new upcoming results…

Question: Is Flux Tube a bosonic string?

In QCD quarks are confined in bound states by forming flux-tubes of chromo-magnetic and chromo-electric flux

 $E \approx \sigma r$ Long flux tubes behave pretty much like strings At some point they break (string breaking)

Let us think... there are $D - 2$ obvious massless modes

Goldstone modes arising from the broken translation invariance in the $D-2$ directions transverse to the flux tube

There should be a Low Energy Effective String Theory model describing the energy spectrum of the flux tube - In addition to string modes are there other kind of (massive) excitations?

Question: Is Flux Tube a bosonic string?

• Is there a theoretical description for the confining flux-tube in D=3+1 & D=2+1 ?

• Confining flux-tube:

- **• Pure gauge phenomena are also present...**
	- **• Glueball Flux-Tube mixing**
	- **• Flux-tube anti-Flux-Tube mixing**
- **• Possible low-energy e**ff**ective string theoretical description?**
	- **• Cannot capture pure gauge phenomena!**
	- **• Might be possible in the Large-***N* **limit!**
- **• Investigate Closed Flux tubes in the Large-***N* **limit**

Have a look at S. Coleman's (Aspects of Symmetry)

Effective String Theory for (long) strings

• Contributions by

M. Lüscher '81, J. Polchinski & A. Strominger '90, M. Lüscher & P. Weisz '04, O. Aharony et al '07 – 11, S. Dubovski et al '12 – 19

• Quantize the Bosonic String (Nambu-Goto String)

$$
S_{\rm NG} = -\ell_s^{-2} \int d^2 \sigma \sqrt{-\det \gamma} \qquad \gamma_{\alpha\beta} = \frac{\partial X^{\mu}}{\partial \sigma^{\alpha}} \frac{\partial X^{\nu}}{\partial \sigma^{\beta}} \eta_{\mu\nu}
$$

The spectrum of a closed bosonic string compactified around a torus is:

$$
E_{N_L,N_R,q,w}^2 = (\sigma l w)^2 + 8\pi \sigma \left(\frac{N_L + N_R}{2} - \frac{D-2}{24}\right) + \left(\frac{2\pi q}{l}\right)^2
$$

The spectrum is described by:

- 1. The winding number w $(w=1, 2, \ldots)$,
- **2.** The winding momentum $p_{\parallel} = 2\pi q/l$ with $q = 0, \pm 1, \pm 2, \ldots$
- **3.** The transverse momentum p_{\perp} ($p_{\perp} = 0$),
- 4. $N_L = \sum_{k>0} n_L(k)k$ and $N_R = \sum_{k'>0} n_R(k')k'$
- 5. Level-matching constrain: $N_L N_R = qw$.

$$
(\alpha_{-k_1}^{i_1})^{n_L(k_1)}\dots(\alpha_{-k_{m_L}}^{i_{m_L}})^{n_R(k_{m_L})}(\bar{\alpha}_{-k'_1}^{i'_1})^{n_R(k'_1)}\dots(\bar{\alpha}_{-k'_{m_R}}^{i'_{m_R}})^{n_R(k'_{m_R})}|0\rangle
$$

• Example: $\alpha_{-2}\alpha_{-1}\bar{\alpha}_{-1}|0\rangle$ $\star~N_L=3$ \star $N_R = 1$ \star $q=2$

Effective String Theory for (long) strings

- Nambu-Goto string is Lorentz invariance only in $D = 26$
- Gauge-Theory flux tubes must be described by a worldsheet theory that respects Lorentz in $D=4$

 $\sigma l^2 < 2\pi/3 \equiv (1.45)^2$.

We can perturbatively calculate the spectrum of the flux-tube with Lorentz Invariance

linear confinement

Lüscher 1980, Polchinski&Strominger 1991

Lüscher&Weisz 2004, Drummond 2004

Aharony&Karzbrun 2009

The Nambu-Goto energy for $w = 1$ and $q = 0$, in dimensionless units is written as:

$$
\frac{E_n(l)}{\sqrt{\sigma}} = l\sqrt{\sigma} \left(1 + \frac{8\pi}{\sigma l^2} \left(n - \frac{1}{12}\right)\right)^{\frac{1}{2}} \quad \text{with} \quad n = \frac{N_L + N_R}{2}
$$

becomes tachyonic for

The above expression can be expanded in $1/l\sqrt{\sigma}$ for:

$$
l\sqrt{\sigma} > l_c^{N.G}\sqrt{\sigma} = \left\{8\pi \left(n - \frac{1}{12}\right)\right\}^{\frac{1}{2}}
$$

 $- \frac{8\pi^2}{\sigma l^3} \left(n - \frac{D-2}{24}\right)^2$

 $+\frac{32\pi^3}{\sigma^2 l^5}\left(n-\frac{D-2}{24}\right)^3$

Relation to Nambu-Goto:

 $E_n \stackrel{l \to \infty}{=} \frac{\sigma l}{l}$
 $+ \frac{4\pi}{l} \left(n - \frac{D-2}{24} \right)$

$$
\frac{E_n(l)}{\sqrt{\sigma}} l \stackrel{1\to\infty}{=} l\sqrt{\sigma} + \frac{c_1^{N.G}}{l\sqrt{\sigma}} + \frac{c_2^{N.G}}{(l\sqrt{\sigma})^3} + \frac{c_3^{N.G}}{(l\sqrt{\sigma})^5} + \mathcal{O}\left(\frac{1}{(l\sqrt{\sigma})^7}\right)
$$

$$
S_{eff} = \sigma r \tau + \int_0^{\tau} dt \int_0^r dx \frac{1}{2} \partial h \partial h + \sum_{n=2} c_n \int_0^{\tau} dt \int_0^r dx (\partial h)^{2n} + \dots
$$

The Lattice

- Lattice is a mathematical trick \bullet
	- We discretised the Space time to a Hyper Cubic Lattice
	- We obtain physics at lattice spacing $a \rightarrow 0$
	- \cdot a is the minimum length (cutoff)
- It defines Quantum Field Theory as a limiting process
- **Allows numerical calculations:** \bullet
	- In hadron scales $g^2/4\pi \sim O(10)$ while $e^2/4\pi \sim 1/137$
	- There is no small parameter for expansion

Lattice Calculation: Correlation Function

$$
C(t) = \langle \Phi^{\dagger}(t)\Phi(0) \rangle
$$

\n
$$
= \langle \Phi^{\dagger}(0)e^{-Ht}\Phi(0) \rangle
$$

\n
$$
= | \langle 0|\Phi(0) | vac \rangle |^{2} e^{-E_{0}t}
$$

\n
$$
+ \sum_{n=1} | \langle n|\Phi(0) | vac \rangle |^{2} e^{-E_{n}t}
$$

\n
$$
t \rightarrow \infty \quad |\langle 0|\Phi(0) | vac \rangle |^{2} e^{-E_{0}t}
$$

- Construct a large basis of Operators $\Phi_i:i=1,2,...$ RIGHT QUANTUM NUMBERS
- Calculate the correlation function (Matrix) $C_{ij}(t) = \langle \Phi_i^{\dagger}(t) \Phi_j(0) \rangle$
- Diagonalize the matrix $C^{-1}(t=0)C(t=a)$
- Extract the eigenvectors
- Extract the correlator for each state $(\sim e^{-E_n t})$
- By fitting the results, we extract the mass (energy) for each state

Operators Building

We build the path order product of links along the spatial direction → Polyakov Loop

Polyakov Loop

As N increases computational time increases as N^3

 $\begin{bmatrix} a_{11} & a_{12} & a_{13} \ a_{21} & a_{22} & a_{23} \ a_{31} & a_{32} & a_{33} \end{bmatrix} \times \begin{bmatrix} b_{11} & b_{12} & b_{13} \ b_{21} & b_{22} & b_{23} \ b_{31} & b_{32} & b_{33} \end{bmatrix}$ For $N = 3$, we have N^3

 $a_{11}b_{11} + a_{12}b_{21} + a_{13}b_{31}$ $a_{11}b_{12} + a_{12}b_{22} + a_{13}b_{32}$ $a_{11}b_{13} + a_{12}b_{23} + a_{13}b_{33}$ $a_{21}b_{11} + a_{22}b_{21} + a_{23}b_{31}$ $a_{21}b_{12} + a_{22}b_{22} + a_{23}b_{32}$ $a_{21}b_{13} + a_{22}b_{23} + a_{23}b_{33}$ \equiv $a_{31}b_{11} + a_{32}b_{21} + a_{33}b_{31}$ $a_{31}b_{12} + a_{32}b_{22} + a_{33}b_{32}$ $a_{31}b_{13} + a_{32}b_{23} + a_{33}b_{33}$ **What** Quantum Numbers Can we give to this Object???

Parity

Translation to Strings (phonons) in $D=2+1$

$P_{\mathcal{P}}$ Parity:

• Under $P_{\mathcal{P}}$ parity $(x_{||}, x_{\perp}) \rightarrow (x_{||}, -x_{\perp})$ and, therefore,

 $\alpha_{-k} \longleftrightarrow -\alpha_{-k}$ and $\bar{\alpha}_{-k} \longleftrightarrow -\bar{\alpha}_{-k}$.

• The parity of a state is given:

 $P_{\mathcal{P}} = (-1)^{number \ of \ phonons}$

\bullet For instance:

- Even number of phonons, for example $\alpha_{-2}\bar{\alpha}_{-1}|0\rangle$, transforms as $P_{\mathcal{P}} = +$. - Odd number of phonons, for example $\alpha_{-1} |0\rangle$, transforms as $P_{\mathcal{P}} = -$.

$P_{\mathcal{R}}$ Parity:

- $\bullet\,$ Under $P_{\mathcal{R}}$ Parity: $\alpha_{-k}\longleftrightarrow \bar{\alpha}_{-k}$
- Only useful in the $q=0$ sector
- The only non-null pair of states with $P_{\mathcal{R}} = \pm$ is for $P_{\mathcal{P}} = -$:
	- $\{\alpha_{-2}\bar{\alpha}_{-1}\bar{\alpha}_{-1}\pm\alpha_{-1}\alpha_{-1}\bar{\alpha}_{-2}\} |0\rangle$
- This is quite heavy!
- In practice this Quantum Number is of minor utility.

Spin – Intrinsic Angular Momentum

- \rightarrow Lattice Symmetry of Rotations about the string axis.
- \rightarrow $C_{4\nu} \otimes Z(\mathcal{R})$ for zero longitudinal momentum.
	- Rotations of $\pi/2 \rightarrow$ angular momentum J
	- Reflections in orthogonal plane $(\mathcal{P}$ -Parity)
	- Reflections about the mid-point on the principal axis (\mathcal{R} -Parity)
	- \rightarrow 10 irreducible representations \equiv 10 correlation matrices
- \rightarrow $C_{4\nu}$ for non-zero longitudinal momentum.
	- Rotations of $\pi/2 \rightarrow \text{angular momentum } J$
	- Reflections in orthogonal plane $(\mathcal{P}$ -Parity)

 \rightarrow 5 irreducible representations \equiv 5 correlation matrices $\rightarrow A_1 \equiv (J = 0, 4, ..., 4N, P_{\mathcal{P}} = 1), A_2 \equiv (J = 0, 4, ..., 4N, P_{\mathcal{P}} = -1)$ $\rightarrow E \equiv (J = 1, 3, ..., 2N + 1)$ $\rightarrow B_1 \equiv (J = 2, 6, ..., 4N + 2, P_{\mathcal{P}} = 1), B_2 \equiv (J = 2, 6, ..., 4N + 2, P_{\mathcal{P}} = -1)$

On the Lattice things are a bit different….
Imposing Spin in an operator i.e $\frac{1}{v_n^b(x)}$

 \rightarrow We can then form an operator of spin J:

Continuum :
$$
\phi(J) = \int d\theta e^{iJ\theta} \phi_{\theta}
$$

Lattice:
$$
\phi_L(J) = \sum_n e^{iJn\frac{\pi}{2}} \phi_n \frac{\pi}{2}
$$

 \rightarrow Example $J=1$:

$$
\phi_L(J=1) = i\phi_{\frac{\pi}{2}} - \phi_{\pi} - i\phi_{\frac{3\pi}{2}} + \phi_{2\pi}
$$

$$
\Rightarrow \text{ If } \phi_{\theta=0} \equiv \text{Tr}\left\{-\begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} \right\}
$$

$$
\phi_L(J=1) = \text{Tr}\left\{-\begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} + i \right\} \left\{-\begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ -1 \end{bmatrix} - i \right\}
$$

Parity & Spin

- Translation to Strings (phonons) in $D=3+1$ We have two transverse directions
- \rightarrow Define α_{-k}^{+} and α_{-k}^{-} as $(x, y$ are the transverse directions): $-\alpha_{-k}^{+} = \alpha_{-k}^{x} + i \alpha_{-k}^{y}$ $-\alpha_{-k}^{-} = \alpha_{-k}^{x} - i \alpha_{-k}^{y}$ \rightarrow Spin J. $- J = \nvert \#(+) - \#(-) \mid$ $\rightarrow \mathcal{P}\text{-Parity}$ - Under P-Parity: $\alpha^+_{-k} \stackrel{P_{\mathcal{P}}}{\longleftrightarrow} \alpha^-_{-k} \& \bar{\alpha}^+_{-k} \stackrel{P_{\mathcal{P}}}{\longleftrightarrow} \bar{\alpha}^-_{-k}$ $\rightarrow \mathcal{R}$ -Parity - Under *R*-Parity: $\alpha_{-k}^{\pm} \stackrel{P_{\mathcal{R}}}{\longleftrightarrow} \bar{\alpha}_{-k}^{\pm}$ • Example: $(\alpha^+_{-1}\bar{\alpha}^+_{-1} \pm \alpha^-_{-1}\bar{\alpha}^-_{-1}) | 0 \rangle$ $-J=2$ $P_{\mathcal{P}} = \pm$ $- P_{\mathcal{R}} = +$

Parity & Spin Example of Operators

Example $J = 0$, $P_{\mathcal{P}} = +$, $P_{\mathcal{R}} = +$

 $-1172 + 2147 + 1147 + -777$ $+[-1]$ 141 ^Z + 22 ₁ + -11 $+$ |- $+[-741 + 742 + 777 + 7772]$

Example $J = 0$, $P_{\mathcal{P}} = +$, $P_{\mathcal{R}} = -$

 $-1172 + 2147 + 777 + -177$ $+$ $\frac{1}{4}$ $+$ $+|141|^{2}+221+177+177+177$ $-741 - 742 - 776 + 777$

Example $J = 0$, $P_{\mathcal{P}} = -$, $P_{\mathcal{R}} = +$

$$
-272 + 214 - 174 - 774
$$

+
$$
[-77] + -214 - 774 - 774
$$

-
$$
[-141] + 774 - 774
$$

-
$$
[-741] + 747 - 774
$$

Example $J=0$, $P_{\mathcal{P}}=-$, $P_{\mathcal{R}}=-$

 $J_x + Z_1 + I_y + I_z + -I_z + -I_z$ $741 (7 + 2) + (-1)^{10} - (-7)^{10} - (-7)^{11}$ $\overline{}$ $+741 + 742 + 772 + 1772$

Parity & Spin Example of Operators

$$
C_{ij}(t) = \langle \Phi_i^{\dagger}(t) \Phi_j(0) \rangle =
$$

Examples of transverse deformations in 2 & 3 spatial dimensions:

Lattice Channels:

Lattice Channels:

Lattice Channels:

Lattice Channels:

Results for SU(6)

Negative Parity, $q=1$ **Positive Parity,** $q=1$

Results for SU(6)

Negative Parity, =2 Positive Parity, =2

Results for SU(3) and ground states for several values of *q*

Absolute Ground State $J = 0$, $P_{\mathcal{P}} = +$, $P_{\mathcal{R}} = +$, $q = 0$.

P_t P_l N_L, N_R $|J|$ **String State** $N_L = N_R = 0$ $|0\rangle$ $\overline{0}$ $+$ $+$ $N_L = 1, N_R = 0$ $\left(a_1^+ \pm a_1^-\right)|0\rangle$ \pm 10 $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{-1}^{-}+a_{1}^{-}a_{-1}^{+}\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = N_R = 1$ Ω $^{+}$ $+$ $\left(a_1^+ a_{-1}^- - a_1^- a_{-1}^+\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = N_R = 1$ $\overline{0}$ $\overline{}$ $\overline{}$ 8 $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{-1}^{+}+a_{1}^{-}a_{-1}^{-}\right)\left|0\right\rangle$ $N_L = N_R = 1$ $\overline{2}$ $^{+}$ $^{+}$ $\left(a_1^+ a_{-1}^+ - a_1^- a_{-1}^- \right) |0\rangle$ $N_L = N_R = 1$ $\overline{2}$ $^{+}$ 6 $N_L = 2, N_R = 0$ $\overline{0}$ $a_1^+ a_1^- |0\rangle$ $+$ $E/\sqrt{\sigma_f}$ $\left(a_2^+ \pm a_2^-\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 0$ $\mathbf{1}$ \pm $\overline{4}$ $\left(a_1^+ a_1^+ + a_1^- a_1^-\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 0$ $\overline{2}$ $^{+}$ $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{1}^{+}-a_{1}^{-}a_{1}^{-}\right)\left|0\right\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 0$ 2 $\left(a_{2}^{+}a_{-1}^{-}+a_{2}^{-}a_{-1}^{+}\right) \left\vert 0\right\rangle$ $\,2$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ $\overline{0}$ $^{+}$ $\left(a_{2}^{+}a_{-1}^{-}-a_{2}^{-}a_{-1}^{+}\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ $\overline{0}$ $\overline{}$ $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{1}^{+}a_{-1}^{-} \pm a_{1}^{-}a_{1}^{-}a_{-1}^{+}\right)\left|0\right\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ \pm $\mathbf{1}$ $\overline{0}$ $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{1}^{-}a_{-1}^{-} \pm a_{1}^{-}a_{1}^{+}a_{-1}^{+}\right)\left|0\right\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ \pm $\overline{1}$ $\left(a_2^+a_{-1}^+ + a_2^-a_{-1}^-\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ 2 $^{+}$ $\left(a_2^+ a_{-1}^+ - a_2^- a_{-1}^-\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ 2 $\overline{}$ $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{1}^{+}a_{-1}^{+}\pm a_{1}^{-}a_{1}^{-}a_{-1}^{-}\right)\left|0\right\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ 3 \pm

String States & Quantum Numbers Results for SU(3) and ground states for several values of *q*

P_t P_l N_L, N_R $|J|$ **String State** $N_L = N_R = 0$ $|0\rangle$ $\overline{0}$ $+$ $+$ $N_L = 1, N_R = 0$ $\left(a_1^+ \pm a_1^-\right)|0\rangle$ \pm $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{-1}^{-}+a_{1}^{-}a_{-1}^{+}\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = N_R = 1$ Ω $^{+}$ $+$ $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{-1}^{-}-a_{1}^{-}a_{-1}^{+}\right)\left|0\right\rangle$ $N_L = N_R = 1$ $\overline{0}$ $\overline{}$ $\overline{}$ $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{-1}^{+}+a_{1}^{-}a_{-1}^{-}\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = N_R = 1$ $\overline{2}$ $^{+}$ $^{+}$ $\left(a_1^+ a_{-1}^+ - a_1^- a_{-1}^- \right) |0\rangle$ $N_L = N_R = 1$ $\overline{2}$ $^{+}$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 0$ $\overline{0}$ $a_1^+ a_1^- |0\rangle$ $+$ $\left(a_2^+ \pm a_2^-\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 0$ 士 $\mathbf{1}$ $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{1}^{+}+a_{1}^{-}a_{1}^{-}\right)\left|0\right\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 0$ $\overline{2}$ $+$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 0$ $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{1}^{+}-a_{1}^{-}a_{1}^{-}\right)\left|0\right\rangle$ $\overline{2}$ $\left(a_{2}^{+}a_{-1}^{-}+a_{2}^{-}a_{-1}^{+}\right) \left\vert 0\right\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ $\overline{0}$ $^{+}$ $\left(a_{2}^{+}a_{-1}^{-}-a_{2}^{-}a_{-1}^{+}\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ $\overline{0}$ $\overline{}$ $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{1}^{+}a_{-1}^{-} \pm a_{1}^{-}a_{1}^{-}a_{-1}^{+}\right)\left|0\right\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ \pm $\mathbf{1}$ $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{1}^{-}a_{-1}^{-} \pm a_{1}^{-}a_{1}^{+}a_{-1}^{+}\right)\left|0\right\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ \pm $\overline{1}$ $\left(a_2^+ a_{-1}^+ + a_2^- a_{-1}^-\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ $^{+}$ 2 $\left(a_2^+ a_{-1}^+ - a_2^- a_{-1}^-\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ 2 $\overline{}$ $\left(a_1^+ a_1^+ a_{-1}^+ \pm a_1^- a_1^- a_{-1}^-\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ 3 \pm

String States & Quantum Numbers Results for SU(3) and ground states for several values of *q*

P_t P_l N_L, N_R $|J|$ **String State** $N_L = N_R = 0$ $|0\rangle$ $\overline{0}$ $+$ $+$ $N_L = 1, N_R = 0$ $\left(a_1^+ \pm a_1^-\right)|0\rangle$ \pm $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{-1}^{-}+a_{1}^{-}a_{-1}^{+}\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = N_R = 1$ Ω $^{+}$ $^{+}$ $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{-1}^{-}-a_{1}^{-}a_{-1}^{+}\right)\left|0\right\rangle$ $N_L = N_R = 1$ $\overline{0}$ $\overline{}$ $\overline{}$ $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{-1}^{+}+a_{1}^{-}a_{-1}^{-}\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = N_R = 1$ $\overline{2}$ $^{+}$ $^{+}$ $\left(a_1^+ a_{-1}^+ - a_1^- a_{-1}^-\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = N_R = 1$ $\overline{2}$ $^{+}$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 0$ $\overline{0}$ $a_1^+ a_1^- |0\rangle$ $+$ $\left(a_2^+ \pm a_2^-\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 0$ 士 $\mathbf{1}$ $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{1}^{+}+a_{1}^{-}a_{1}^{-}\right)\left|0\right\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 0$ $\overline{2}$ $+$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 0$ $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{1}^{+}-a_{1}^{-}a_{1}^{-}\right)\left|0\right\rangle$ 2 $\left(a_{2}^{+}a_{-1}^{-}+a_{2}^{-}a_{-1}^{+}\right) \left\vert 0\right\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ $\overline{0}$ $^{+}$ $\left(a_{2}^{+}a_{-1}^{-}-a_{2}^{-}a_{-1}^{+}\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ $\overline{0}$ $\overline{}$ $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{1}^{+}a_{-1}^{-} \pm a_{1}^{-}a_{1}^{-}a_{-1}^{+}\right)\left|0\right\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ \pm $\mathbf{1}$ $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{1}^{-}a_{-1}^{-} \pm a_{1}^{-}a_{1}^{+}a_{-1}^{+}\right)\left|0\right\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ \pm $\overline{1}$ $\left(a_2^+ a_{-1}^+ + a_2^- a_{-1}^-\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ 2 $^{+}$ $\left(a_2^+ a_{-1}^+ - a_2^- a_{-1}^-\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ 2 $\overline{}$ $\left(a_1^+ a_1^+ a_{-1}^+ \pm a_1^- a_1^- a_{-1}^-\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ 3 \pm

String States & Quantum Numbers Results for SU(3) and ground states for several values of *q*

P_t P_l N_L, N_R $|J|$ **String State** $N_L = N_R = 0$ $|0\rangle$ $\overline{0}$ $+$ $+$ $\left(a_1^+ \pm a_1^-\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = 1, N_R = 0$ \pm $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{-1}^{-}+a_{1}^{-}a_{-1}^{+}\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = N_R = 1$ Ω $^{+}$ $^{+}$ $\left(a_1^+ a_{-1}^- - a_1^- a_{-1}^+\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = N_R = 1$ $\overline{0}$ $\overline{}$ $\overline{}$ $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{-1}^{+}+a_{1}^{-}a_{-1}^{-}\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = N_R = 1$ $\overline{2}$ $+$ $^{+}$ $\left(a_1^+ a_{-1}^+ - a_1^- a_{-1}^-\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = N_R = 1$ 2 $^{+}$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 0$ $\overline{0}$ $a_1^+ a_1^- |0\rangle$ $+$ $\left(a_2^+ \pm a_2^-\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 0$ 士 $\mathbf{1}$ $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{1}^{+}+a_{1}^{-}a_{1}^{-}\right)\left|0\right\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 0$ $\overline{2}$ $+$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 0$ $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{1}^{+}-a_{1}^{-}a_{1}^{-}\right)\left|0\right\rangle$ $\overline{2}$ $\left(a_{2}^{+}a_{-1}^{-}+a_{2}^{-}a_{-1}^{+}\right) \left\vert 0\right\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ $\overline{0}$ $+$ $\begin{pmatrix} 2 & 1 \\ a_2^+ a_{-1}^- - a_2^- a_{-1}^+ \end{pmatrix} |0\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ $\overline{0}$ $\overline{}$ $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{1}^{+}a_{-1}^{-} \pm a_{1}^{-}a_{1}^{-}a_{-1}^{+}\right)\left|0\right\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ \pm $\mathbf{1}$ $\left(a_{1}^{+}a_{1}^{-}a_{-1}^{-} \pm a_{1}^{-}a_{1}^{+}a_{-1}^{+}\right)\left|0\right\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ \pm $\overline{1}$ $\left(a_2^+ a_{-1}^+ + a_2^- a_{-1}^-\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ 2 $^{+}$ $\left(a_2^+ a_{-1}^+ - a_2^- a_{-1}^-\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ 2 $\overline{}$ $\left(a_1^+ a_1^+ a_{-1}^+ \pm a_1^- a_1^- a_{-1}^-\right)|0\rangle$ $N_L = 2, N_R = 1$ 3 士

String States & Quantum Numbers Results for SU(3) and ground states for several values of *q*

String States & Quantum Numbers Results for SU(3) and q=0

String States & Quantum Numbers Results for SU(3) and q=0

String States & Quantum Numbers Results for SU(3) and q=0

String States & Quantum Numbers Results for SU(3) and q=0

String States & Quantum Numbers Results for SU(3) and q=0

String States & Quantum Numbers Results for SU(3) and q=0

S. Dubovsky, R. Flauger, V. Gorbenko '13

- *• Calculating the energy shifts from the S matrix of colliding winding phonons*
- *• Using approximate integrability as well as the Thermodynamic Bethe Ansatz*
- *• Test what happens when we have both left and right movers – energy levels cannot explain the anomalous state*
- *• the most straightforward way to explain this level is the introduction of a massive pseudoscalar particle φ on the worldsheet*

$$
S_{int}=\frac{\alpha}{8\pi}\int d^2\sigma \phi K^i_{\alpha\gamma}K^{j\gamma}_\beta\epsilon^{\alpha\beta}\epsilon_{ij}
$$

- *• field φ as the worldsheet axion*
- *• By fitting the two free parameters:*

$$
m\ell_s = 1.85^{+0.02}_{-0.03} \quad \alpha = 9.6 \pm 0.1
$$

Results for SU(3) and q=0

Outline

- The flux tube looks pretty much like a bosonic string even for short flux tubes
- Looks like there is a massive "axion" particle on the worldsheet of the flux tube in D=3+1
- However we would like to know what happens for higher excitations in D=3+1
- How does the "axion" behaves in the existence of a θ-vacuum?
- What happens for long flux tubes (level crossing)?