Table 1. Soil-2018 replication specification using the template

Field	Value
Replication	Soil-2018 Internal replication based on Soil-2016 original
	experiment
Description	To evaluate the effect of a bio-surfactant on the assisted
of experiment	phytoremediation of contaminated soil
Site and Date	The base experiment was carried out in ETSIA-University of
	Seville in October 2015 and this replication, in ETSIA-University
	of Seville in March 2018
Purpose	Extend results
Change 1	Originally, the experiment was carried out in a cultivation
	chamber.
	In replication, was carried out in a greenhouse
	In order to simulate natural conditions
Modified Dimension	Population , specifically experimental objects
Threat to validity	The change increases the external validity
	since it allows to generalize the results carrying out the
	replication in conditions closer to the natural ones
Change 2	Originally , two types of plants were used: <i>Hordeum vulgare</i> L.
	and <i>Brassica juncea</i> L.
	In replication, only Brassica juncea L. was used
	$\mathbf{Because}$ in the original experiment it was demonstrated that
	only Brassica juncea L. was a metal accumulator plant
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically experimental material
Threat to validity	The change does not affect validity
Change 3	Originally , there were two types of soil: Coria $(pH=7.8)$ and
	Constantina (pH=5.5)
	In replication, only Constantina soil was used
	Because it was demonstrated that in the soil of Coria the metal
	was strongly adsorbed and the phytoextraction did not affect the
M. J.C. J.D	biomass production
	Protocol, specifically experimental material
Threat to validity	The change does not affect validity
Change 4	Originally , Copper (Cu) doses were 0, 500 and 1000 mg kg^{-1}
	In replication, Cu doses were adjusted to 0, 125, 250 and 500 mm h_{-1}^{-1}
	mg kg^{-1}
Madifical Dimension	Because of Cu doses of 1000 mg kg^{-1} was toxic to the plant
	Operationalization , specifically independent variable dosisCu
Threat to validity	The change increases internal validity
Change 5	because the Cu dose is adjusted to non-toxic levels for the plant Originally , Cu was applied as Copper Nitrate
Change 5	
	In replication, Cu was applied as Copper Sulfate
	Because of is more accessible and the concentrations applied do not effect the plant
Modified Dimension	do not affect the plant
	Protocol, specifically experimental material
Threat to validity	The change does not affect validity

Change 6Originally, the soil aging time (from the time Cu is applied until the plant is sown) is 45 days Because of time constraints and so that Cu is not so much retainedModified DimensionProtocol, specifically the guides Threat to validity The change does not affect validityChange 7Originally, there were 6 treatments corresponding to the 3 levels of Cu and with/without surfactant (to facilitate Cu extraction). There were 2 soils and 2 types of plants. This represents 24 experimental units ($3x2x2x2$). For each experimental unit, 3 pots were prepared. In total there are 72 pots ($3x2x2x2x3$) In replication, there were 8 treatments corresponding to 4 level of Cu and with/without surfactant. There were 10 and 1 type of plant. This represents 8 experimental units. For each experimental unit, 4 pots were prepared and placed on a tray. In total there were 32 pots ($4x2x4$) distributed in 8 trays with 4 pots each. The trays are distributed completely randomly. This is repeated 3 times. The experimental design Threat to validityModified DimensionProtocol, specifically experimental design Threat to validityThreat to validityThe change increases internal validity because more biomass is obtained for further analysisChange 8Originally, the plants are rinsed when the plants have between 2 and 3 true leavesModified DimensionProtocol, specifically the guides Threat to validity the change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysisChange 8Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type. Because agreater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass production Modified DimensionModified DimensionProtocol, specifically experimen	Field	Value
In replication, soil aging time is 15 days Because of time constraints and so that Cu is not so much retainedModified DimensionProtocol, specifically the guides Threat to validityChange 7Originally, there were 6 treatments corresponding to the 3 levels of Cu and with/without surfactant (to facilitate Cu extraction). There were 2 soils and 2 types of plants. This represents 24 experimental units (3x2x2x2). For each experimental unit, 3 pots were prepared. In total there are 72 pots (3x2x2x2x3) In replication, there were 8 treatments corresponding to 4 level of Cu and with/without surfactant. There were 1 soil and 1 type of plant. This represents 8 experimental units. For each experimental unit, 4 pots were prepared and placed on a tray. In total there were 32 pots (4x2x4) distributed in 8 trays with 4 pots each. The trays are distributed completely randomly. This is repeated 3 times. The experimental unit was the tray Because by cultivating 4 pots in each tray sufficient biomass can be obtainedModified DimensionProtocol, specifically experimental design Threat to validity the change increases internal validity because more biomass is obtained for further analysisChange 8Originally, the biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 rue leaves In replication, the plants are left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants reach the fructification stage In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomassModified DimensionProtocol, specifically the guidesThreat to validityThe change increases internal validity due to more biomass biog obtained for further analysisChange 9Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication,	Change 6	
Because of time constraints and so that Cu is not so much retainedModified DimensionProtocol, specifically the guidesThreat to validityThe change does not affect validityChange 7Originally, there were 6 treatments corresponding to the 3 levels of Cu and with/without surfactant (to facilitate Cu extraction). There were 2 soils and 2 types of plants. This represents 24 experimental units (3x2x2x2). For each experimental unit, 3 pots were prepared. In total there are 72 pots (3x2x2x2x3)In replication, there were 8 treatments corresponding to 4 level of Cu and with/without surfactant. There were 1 soil and 1 type of plant. This represents 8 experimental units. For each experimental unit, 4 pots were prepared and placed on a tray. In total there were 32 pots (4x2x4) distributed in 8 trays with 4 pots each. The trays are distributed completely randomly. This is repeated 3 times. The experimental unit was the tray Because by cultivating 4 pots in each tray sufficient biomass can be obtainedModified Dimension Threat to validityProtocol, specifically experimental design The change increases internal validity because more biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 true leavesChange 8Originally, the biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 real leaves and 4 plants are left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants are insed when they have between 2 and 3 real leaves internal validity due to more biomass biog obtained for further analysisChange 9Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication, the pots are 300 ml tube type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass production Modified DimensionModified DimensionP		
Modified DimensionProtocol, specifically the guides Threat to validityChange 7Originally, there were 6 treatments corresponding to the 3 levels of Cu and with/without surfactant (to facilitate Cu extraction). There were 2 soils and 2 types of plants. This represents 24 experimental units (3x2x2x2). For each experimental unit, 3 pots were prepared. In total there are 72 pots (3x2x2x2x3) In replication, there were 8 treatments corresponding to 4 level of Cu and with/without surfactant. There were 1 soil and 1 type of plant. This represents 8 experimental units. For each experimental unit, 4 pots were prepared and placed on a tray. In total there were 32 pots (4x2x4) distributed in 8 trays with 4 pots each. The trays are distributed completely randomly. This is repeated 3 times. The experimental unit was the tray Because by cultivating 4 pots in each tray sufficient biomass can be obtainedModified Dimension Threat to validityProtocol, specifically experimental design The change increases internal validity because more biomass is obtained for further analysisChange 8Originally, the biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 true leaves In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomass is collected when the plants see internal validity due to more biomass bieng obtained for further analysisModified Dimension Threat to validityOriginally, the pots are 300 ml tube type In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomass domass is collected when the plants acomplete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomass domass is obtained for further analysisChange 9Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube ty		
Threat to validityThe change does not affect validityChange 7Originally, there were 6 treatments corresponding to the 3 levels of Cu and with/without surfactant (to facilitate Cu extraction). There were 2 soils and 2 types of plants. This represents 24 experimental units (3x2x2x2). For each experimental unit, 3 pots were prepared. In total there are 72 pots (3x2x2x2x3) In replication, there were 8 treatments corresponding to 4 level of Cu and with/without surfactant. There were 1 soil and 1 type of plant. This represents 8 experimental units. For each experimental unit, 4 pots were prepared and placed on a tray. In total there were 32 pots (4x2x4) distributed in 8 trays with 4 pots each. The trays are distributed completely randomly. This is repeated 3 times. The experimental unit was the tray Because by cultivating 4 pots in each tray sufficient biomass can be obtainedModified Dimension Threat to validityProtocol, specifically experimental design The change increases internal validity because more biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 true leavesModified Dimension Threat to validityProtocol, specifically the guides Threat to validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysisModified Dimension Threat to validityProtocol, specifically the guides Threat to validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysisChange 9Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass production Modified DimensionModified Dimension Threat to validity tue to more biomass being obtained for further analysisChange 9Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type. Because a greater volume of soil allows		retained
Change 7 Originally, there were 6 treatments corresponding to the 3 levels of Cu and with/without surfactant (to facilitate Cu extraction). There were 2 soils and 2 types of plants. This represents 24 experimental units (3x2x2x2). For each experimental unit, 3 pots were prepared. In total there are 72 pots (3x2x2x23) In replication, there were 8 treatments corresponding to 4 level of Cu and with/without surfactant. There were 1 soil and 1 type of plant. This represents 8 experimental units. For each experimental unit, 4 pots were prepared and placed on a tray. In total there were 32 pots (4x2x4) distributed in 8 trays with 4 pots each. The trays are distributed completely randomly. This is repeated 3 times. The experimental unit was the tray Because by cultivating 4 pots in each tray sufficient biomass can be obtained Modified Dimension Protocol, specifically experimental design Threat to validity The change increases internal validity because more biomass is obtained for further analysis Change 8 Originally, the biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 true leaves and 4 plants are left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants reach the fructification stage In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomass Modified Dimension Protocol, specifically the guides Threat to validity The change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysis Chan	Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the guides
of Cu and with/without surfactant (to facilitate Cu extraction). There were 2 soils and 2 types of plants. This represents 24 experimental units (3x2x2x2). For each experimental unit, 3 pots were prepared. In total there are 72 pots (3x2x2x2x3) In replication, there were 8 treatments corresponding to 4 level of Cu and with/without surfactant. There were 1 soil and 1 type of plant. This represents 8 experimental units. For each experimental unit, 4 pots were prepared and placed on a tray. In total there were 32 pots (4x2x4) distributed in 8 trays with 4 pots each. The trays are distributed completely randomly. This is repeated 3 times. The experimental unit was the tray Because by cultivating 4 pots in each tray sufficient biomass can be obtainedModified Dimension Threat to validityProtocol, specifically experimental design The change increases internal validity because more biomass is obtained for further analysisChange 8Originally, the biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 true leaves In replication, the plants are rinsed when they have between 2 and 3 real leaves and 4 plants are left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants reach the fructification stage In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complet their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomassModified Dimension Protocol, specifically the guidesProtocol, specifically the guidesThreat to validityThe change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysisChange 9Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass productionModified DimensionProtocol, specifically experimental material Threat to validity </td <td>Threat to validity</td> <td>The change does not affect validity</td>	Threat to validity	The change does not affect validity
There were 2 soils and 2 types of plants. This represents 24 experimental units (3x2x2x2). For each experimental unit, 3 pots were prepared. In total there are 72 pots (3x2x2x2x3)In replication, there were 8 treatments corresponding to 4 level of Cu and with/without surfactant. There were 1 soil and 1 type of plant. This represents 8 experimental units. For each experimental unit, 4 pots were prepared and placed on a tray. In total there were 32 pots (4x2x4) distributed in 8 trays with 4 pots each. The trays are distributed completely randomly. This is repeated 3 times. The experimental unit was the tray Because by cultivating 4 pots in each tray sufficient biomass can be obtainedModified Dimension Threat to validityProtocol, specifically experimental design The change increases internal validity because more biomass is obtained for further analysisChange 8Originally, the biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 true leaves In replication, the plants are rinsed when they have between 2 and 3 real leaves and 4 plants are left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants, let the plants complet their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomass is complet their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomass is complet their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomass is complet their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomass is collected when the plats reach the fructification stage In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complet their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomassModified Dimension Threat to validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysisChange 9Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type. Because a greater volume of soil allows fo	Change 7	
 experimental units (3x2x2x2). For each experimental unit, 3 pots were prepared. In total there are 72 pots (3x2x2x2x3) In replication, there were 8 treatments corresponding to 4 level of Cu and with/without surfactant. There were 1 soil and 1 type of plant. This represents 8 experimental units. For each experimental unit, 4 pots were prepared and placed on a tray. In total there were 32 pots (4x2x4) distributed in 8 trays with 4 pots each. The trays are distributed completely randomly. This is repeated 3 times. The experimental unit was the tray Because by cultivating 4 pots in each tray sufficient biomass can be obtained Modified Dimension Protocol, specifically experimental design The change increases internal validity because more biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 true leaves In replication, the plants are rinsed when they have between 2 and 3 real leaves and 4 plants are left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants secomplete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomass Modified Dimension Protocol, specifically the guides Threat to validity The change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysis Change 9 Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type. Because 4 greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass production Modified Dimension 		
In replication, there were 8 treatments corresponding to 4 level of Cu and with/without surfactant. There were 1 soil and 1 type of plant. This represents 8 experimental units. For each experimental unit, 4 pots were prepared and placed on a tray. In total there were 32 pots (4x2x4) distributed in 8 trays with 4 pots each. The trays are distributed completely randomly. This is repeated 3 times. The experimental unit was the tray Because by cultivating 4 pots in each tray sufficient biomass can be obtainedModified Dimension Threat to validityProtocol, specifically experimental design The change increases internal validity because more biomass is obtained for further analysisChange 8Originally, the biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 true leaves In replication, the plants are rinsed when they have between 2 and 3 real leaves and 4 plants are left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants reach the fructification stage In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomassModified Dimension Threat to validityProtocol, specifically the guidesThreat to validityThe change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysisChange 9Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass productionModified DimensionProtocol, specifically experimental material Threat to validity		experimental units (3x2x2x2). For each experimental unit, 3 pots
of Cu and with/without surfactant. There were 1 soil and 1 type of plant. This represents 8 experimental units. For each experimental unit, 4 pots were prepared and placed on a tray. In total there were 32 pots (4x2x4) distributed in 8 trays with 4 pots each. The trays are distributed completely randomly. This is repeated 3 times. The experimental unit was the tray Because by cultivating 4 pots in each tray sufficient biomass can be obtainedModified Dimension Threat to validity Change 8Protocol, specifically experimental design The change increases internal validity because more biomass is obtained for further analysisChange 8Originally, the biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 true leaves In replication, the plants are rinsed when they have between 2 and 3 real leaves and 4 plants are left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants reach the fructification stage In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomassModified Dimension Threat to validity The change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysisChange 9Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass productionModified DimensionProtocol, specifically experimental material Threat to validity		
 type of plant. This represents 8 experimental units. For each experimental unit, 4 pots were prepared and placed on a tray. In total there were 32 pots (4x2x4) distributed in 8 trays with 4 pots each. The trays are distributed completely randomly. This is repeated 3 times. The experimental unit was the tray Because by cultivating 4 pots in each tray sufficient biomass can be obtained Modified Dimension Protocol, specifically experimental design Threat to validity The change increases internal validity because more biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 true leaves In replication, the plants are rinsed when they have between 2 and 3 real leaves and 4 plants are left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants size collected when the plants plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomass Modified Dimension Protocol, specifically the guides The change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysis Change 9 Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass production 		• • •
 experimental unit, 4 pots were prepared and placed on a tray. In total there were 32 pots (4x2x4) distributed in 8 trays with 4 pots each. The trays are distributed completely randomly. This is repeated 3 times. The experimental unit was the tray Because by cultivating 4 pots in each tray sufficient biomass can be obtained Modified Dimension Protocol, specifically experimental design The change increases internal validity because more biomass is obtained for further analysis Change 8 Originally, the biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 true leaves In replication, the plants are rinsed when they have between 2 and 3 real leaves and 4 plants are left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants reach the fructification stage In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomass Modified Dimension Protocol, specifically the guides Threat to validity The change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysis Change 9 Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass production Modified Dimension 		
In total there were 32 pots (4x2x4) distributed in 8 trays with 4 pots each. The trays are distributed completely randomly. This is repeated 3 times. The experimental unit was the tray Because by cultivating 4 pots in each tray sufficient biomass can be obtained Modified Dimension Protocol , specifically experimental design Threat to validity The change increases internal validity because more biomass is obtained for further analysis Change 8 Originally , the biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 true leaves In replication , the plants are rinsed when they have between 2 and 3 real leaves and 4 plants are left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants reach the fructification stage In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomass Modified Dimension Protocol , specifically the guides Threat to validity The change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysis Change 9 Originally , the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication , the pots are 500 ml bucket type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass production Modified Dimension Protocol , specifically experimental material Threat to validity The change increases internal validity		
pots each. The trays are distributed completely randomly. This is repeated 3 times. The experimental unit was the tray Because by cultivating 4 pots in each tray sufficient biomass can be obtainedModified Dimension Threat to validityProtocol, specifically experimental design The change increases internal validity because more biomass is obtained for further analysisChange 8Originally, the biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 true leaves In replication, the plants are rinsed when they have between 2 and 3 real leaves and 4 plants are left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants reach the fructification stage In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomassModified Dimension Threat to validityProtocol, specifically the guidesChange 9Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass productionModified Dimension Threat to validityProtocol, specifically experimental material The change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysis		
 is repeated 3 times. The experimental unit was the tray Because by cultivating 4 pots in each tray sufficient biomass can be obtained Modified Dimension Protocol, specifically experimental design Threat to validity The change increases internal validity because more biomass is obtained for further analysis Change 8 Originally, the biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 true leaves In replication, the plants are rinsed when they have between 2 and 3 real leaves and 4 plants are left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants reach the fructification stage In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomass Modified Dimension Protocol, specifically the guides The change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysis Change 9 Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass production Modified Dimension Threat to validity 		
Because by cultivating 4 pots in each tray sufficient biomass can be obtainedModified DimensionProtocol, specifically experimental designThreat to validityThe change increases internal validity because more biomass is obtained for further analysisChange 8Originally, the biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 true leavesIn replication, the plants are rinsed when they have between 2 and 3 real leaves and 4 plants are left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants reach the fructification stage In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomassModified DimensionProtocol, specifically the guidesThreat to validityThe change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysisChange 9Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass productionModified DimensionProtocol, specifically experimental material Threat to validity		
be obtainedModified Dimension Protocol , specifically experimental designThreat to validityThe change increases internal validity because more biomass is obtained for further analysisChange 8 Originally , the biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 true leavesIn replication, the plants are rinsed when they have between 2 and 3 real leaves and 4 plants are left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants reach the fructification stage In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomassModified Dimension Protocol , specifically the guidesThreat to validityThe change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysisChange 9 Originally , the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass productionModified Dimension Protocol , specifically experimental material The change increases internal validity		
Modified DimensionProtocol, specifically experimental designThreat to validityThe change increases internal validity because more biomass is obtained for further analysisChange 8Originally, the biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 true leavesIn replication, the plants are rinsed when they have between 2 and 3 real leaves and 4 plants are left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants reach the fructification stage In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomassModified DimensionProtocol, specifically the guidesThreat to validityThe change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysisChange 9Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass productionModified DimensionProtocol, specifically experimental material Threat to validity The change increases internal validity		
Threat to validityThe change increases internal validity because more biomass is obtained for further analysisChange 8Originally, the biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 true leavesIn replication, the plants are rinsed when they have between 2 and 3 real leaves and 4 plants are left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants reach the fructification stage In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomassModified DimensionProtocol, specifically the guidesThreat to validityThe change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysisOriginally, the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass productionModified DimensionProtocol, specifically experimental material Threat to validity	Modified Dimension	
because more biomass is obtained for further analysisChange 8Originally, the biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 true leavesIn replication, the plants are rinsed when they have between 2 and 3 real leaves and 4 plants are left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants reach the fructification stage In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomassModified DimensionProtocol, specifically the guidesThreat to validityThe change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysisChange 9Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass productionModified DimensionProtocol, specifically experimental material Threat to validity		
Change 8Originally, the biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 true leavesIn replication, the plants are rinsed when they have between 2 and 3 real leaves and 4 plants are left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants reach the fructification stage In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomassModified DimensionProtocol, specifically the guidesThreat to validityThe change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysisChange 9Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass productionModified DimensionProtocol, specifically experimental material Threat to validity	inication validity	
between 2 and 3 true leaves In replication, the plants are rinsed when they have between 2 and 3 real leaves and 4 plants are left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants reach the fructification stage In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomass Modified Dimension Protocol, specifically the guides Threat to validity Change 9 Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass production Modified Dimension Protocol, specifically experimental material Threat to validity The change increases internal validity	Change 8	
In replication, the plants are rinsed when they have between 2 and 3 real leaves and 4 plants are left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants reach the fructification stage In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomassModified DimensionProtocol, specifically the guidesThreat to validityThe change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysisChange 9Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type.Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass productionModified DimensionProtocol, specifically experimental material Threat to validity	enange e	
2 and 3 real leaves and 4 plants are left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants reach the fructification stage In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomassModified DimensionProtocol, specifically the guidesThreat to validityThe change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysisChange 9Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass productionModified DimensionProtocol, specifically experimental material Threat to validity		
collected when the plants reach the fructification stageIn order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomassModified DimensionProtocol, specifically the guidesThreat to validityThe change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysisChange 9Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type.Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass productionModified DimensionProtocol, specifically experimental material The change increases internal validity		
In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomassModified DimensionProtocol, specifically the guidesThreat to validityThe change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysisChange 9Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass productionModified DimensionProtocol, specifically experimental material The change increases internal validity		
complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomassModified DimensionProtocol, specifically the guidesThreat to validityThe change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysisChange 9Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass productionModified DimensionProtocol, specifically experimental material Threat to validity		
Modified Dimension Protocol, specifically the guides Threat to validity The change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysis Change 9 Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass production Modified Dimension Threat to validity		
Threat to validity The change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysis Change 9 Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass production Modified Dimension Threat to validity	Modified Dimension	
due to more biomass being obtained for further analysisChange 9Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube typeIn replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type.Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass productionModified DimensionProtocol, specifically experimental material Threat to validityThe change increases internal validity		
Change 9 Originally, the pots are 300 ml tube type In replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass production Modified Dimension Protocol, specifically experimental material Threat to validity	· ·	
In replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type. Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass production Modified Dimension Protocol , specifically experimental material Threat to validity The change increases internal validity	Change 9	
development and greater biomass production Modified Dimension Protocol , specifically experimental material Threat to validity The change increases internal validity		
Modified Dimension Protocol , specifically experimental material Threat to validity The change increases internal validity		Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root
Modified Dimension Protocol , specifically experimental material Threat to validity The change increases internal validity		
Threat to validity The change increases internal validity	Modified Dimension	
	·	due to more biomass being obtained for further analysis

 Table 2. Soil-2019 replication specification using the template

Field	Value
Replication	Soil-2019 Internal replication based on Soil-2016 original
	experiment
Description	To evaluate the effect of a bio-surfactant on the assisted
of experiment	phytoremediation of contaminated soil
Site and Date	The base experiment was carried out in ETSIA-University of
	Seville in October 2015 and this replication, in ETSIA-University
	of Seville in March 2019
Purpose	Extend results
Change 1	Originally, the experiment was carried out in a cultivation
-	chamber
	In replication, was carried out in a greenhouse
	In order to simulate natural conditions
Modified Dimension	Population , specifically experimental objects
Threat to validity	The change increases the external validity
v	since it allows to generalize the results performing the replication
	in conditions closer to the natural ones
Change 2	Originally, two types of plants were used: Hordeum vulgare L.
0	and Brassica juncea L.
	In replication, only Brassica juncea L. was used
	Because in the original experiment it was demonstrated that
	only Brassica juncea L. was a metal accumulator plant
Modified Dimension	Protocol, specifically experimental material
Threat to validity	The change does not affect validity
Change 3	Originally, there were two types of soil: Coria (pH=7.8) and
0	Constantina (pH=5.5)
	In replication, there were three types of soil: Miraflores-1
	(pH=x, Pb=158 y Zn=125, Cu=36) and Miraflores-2 (pH=y,
	Pb=375 Zn=192 Cu=206) and Lebrija (not contaminated by
	metals)
	In order to experiment with naturally contaminated soils.
	Miraflores soils are urban gardens with natural contamination
	and Lebrija soil was used as control
Modified Dimension	Protocol, specifically experimental material
Threat to validity	The change increase external validity since it allows to generalize
U	the results in natural soils
Change 4	Originally. Copper (Cu) doses were 0, 500 and 1000 mg kq^{-1}
Change 4	Originally , Copper (Cu) doses were 0, 500 and 1000 mg kg^{-1} applied as Copper Nitrate
Change 4	applied as Copper Nitrate
Change 4	
Change 4	applied as Copper Nitrate In replication, the soils are not artificially contaminated with Cu
Change 4	applied as Copper Nitrate In replication, the soils are not artificially contaminated with Cu Because of these soils are urban orchard-gardens with natural
	applied as Copper Nitrate In replication, the soils are not artificially contaminated with Cu Because of these soils are urban orchard-gardens with natural pollution (Cu levels 36 and 206 mg kg^{-1})
	applied as Copper Nitrate In replication, the soils are not artificially contaminated with Cu Because of these soils are urban orchard-gardens with natural

Field	Value
Change 5	Originally , there were 6 treatments corresponding to the 3 levels of Cu and with/without <i>surfactant</i> (to facilitate Cu extraction). There were 2 soils and 2 types of plants. This represents 24 experimental units (3x2x2x2). For each experimental unit, 3 pots were prepared. In total there are 72 pots (3x2x2x2x3) In replication , there were 2 treatments corresponding to with/without <i>surfactant</i> . There were 3 soils and 1 type of plant. This represents 6 experimental units. Each experimental unit was repeated 4 times (2x3x4 pots) forming a block. This is
	repeated 3 times to have 3 blocks. In total there are 72 pots
	(2x3x4x3). Within each block, pots are randomly distributed.
	The experimental unit is the pot.
	Because of
	Protocol, specifically experimental design
Threat to validity	The change does not affect validity
Change 6	Originally , the biomass is collected when the plants have between 2 and 3 true leaves
	In replication, the plants are rinsed when they have between 2 and 3 real leaves and only 1 plant is left by pot. The biomass is collected when the plants reach the fructification stage. In order to avoid competition between plants, let the plants complete their vegetative cycle and thus obtain more biomass
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the guides
Threat to validity	The change increases internal validity
Ū	due to more biomass being obtained for further analysis
Change 7	Originally , the pots are 300 ml tube type
0	In replication, the pots are 500 ml bucket type.
	Because a greater volume of soil allows for greater root development and greater biomass production
	Protocol , specifically experimental material
Threat to validity	The change increases internal validity due to more biomass being obtained for further analysis

Field	Value
Replication	VOO-2017V Internal replication based on $VOO-2016A$ original experiment
Description of experiment	To evaluate the effect of the olive variety on the quality of the virgin olive oil (VOO) obtained
Site and Date	The base experiment was carried out in <i>Instituto de la Grasa</i> (CSIC) Sevilla in October 2016 and this replication, in <i>Instituto</i> de la Grasa (CSIC) Sevilla in 2017
Purpose	Extend results
Change 1	Originally , the type of olive was <i>Arbequina</i>
	In replication, the type of olive was <i>Verdial</i>
	In order to study the difference in quality of oil from different varieties
Change 2	Originally , the weather conditions are those of 2016
	In replication, the climatic conditions are different as they correspond to 2017
	In order to analyze data corresponding to different campaigns

Table 3. VOO-2017V replication specification using the template

Table 4. VOO-2017P replication specification using the template

Field	Value
Replication	VOO-2017P Internal replication based on VOO-2016A original experiment
Description of experiment	To evaluate the effect of the olive variety on the quality of the virgin olive oil (VOO) obtained
Site and Date	The base experiment was carried out in <i>Instituto de la Grasa</i> (CSIC) Sevilla in October 2016 and this replication, in <i>Instituto</i> de la Grasa (CSIC) Sevilla in 2017
Purpose	Extend results
Change 1	Originally , the type of olive was <i>Arbequina</i>
	In replication, the type of olive was <i>Picual</i>
	In order to study the difference in quality of oil from different varieties
Change 2	Originally , the weather conditions are those of 2016
-	In replication, the climatic conditions are different as they correspond to 2017
	In order to analyze data corresponding to different campaigns

 ${\bf Table \ 5. \ Olive-Des \ replication \ specification \ using \ the \ template}$

Field	Value
Replication	Olive-Des Internal replication based on Olive-2015 original experiment
Description of experiment	Extraction phenolic compounds (EPC) from virgin olive oil with green solvents (Deep Eutectic Solvents DES)
Site and Date	The base experiment was carried out in <i>Instituto de la Grasa</i> (CSIC) Sevilla in 2015 and this replication, in <i>Instituto de la</i> Grasa (CSIC) Sevilla in 2015
Purpose	Extend results
Change 1	 Originally, the extraction is done with a solution 80% (v/v) methanol and water In replication, the extraction is done with a solution Choline chloride and Glycerol (1:2) In order to analyze non-toxic alternatives for the extraction of phenolic compounds
Change 2	Originally , the extraction is done with a solution 80% (v/v) methanol and water
	 In replication, the extraction is done with a solution Choline chloride and Lactic acid (1:2) In order to analyze non-toxic alternatives for the extraction of
	phenolic compounds
Change 3	 Originally, the extraction is done with a solution 80% (v/v) methanol and water In replication, the extraction is done with a solution Choline
	chloride and Urea (1:2) In order to analyze non-toxic alternatives for the extraction of phenolic compounds
Change 4	Originally , the extraction is done with a solution 80% (v/v) methanol and water In replication , the extraction is done with a solution Choline
	chloride and Sucrose (1:1) In order to analyze non-toxic alternatives for the extraction of phenolic compounds
Change 5	Originally , the extraction is done with a solution 80% (v/v) methanol and water
	 In replication, the extraction is done with a solution Choline chloride and Sucrose (4:1) In order to analyze non-toxic alternatives for the extraction of t
	phenolic compounds
Change 6	Originally , the extraction is done with a solution 80% (v/v) methanol and water
	In replication, the extraction is done with a solution Cholina chloride and 1,4-Butanediol (1:5)
	In order to analyze non-toxic alternatives for the extraction or phenolic compounds

Field	Value
Change 7	 Originally, the extraction is done with a solution 80% (v/v) methanol and water In replication, the extraction is done with a solution Choline chloride and Xylitol (2:1) In order to analyze non-toxic alternatives for the extraction of phenolic compounds
Change 8	 Originally, the extraction is done with a solution 80% (v/v) methanol and water In replication, the extraction is done with a solution Choline chloride and 1,2-Propanediol (1:1) In order to analyze non-toxic alternatives for the extraction of phenolic compounds
Change 9	 Originally, the extraction is done with a solution 80% (v/v) methanol and water In replication, the extraction is done with a solution Choline chloride and Malonic acid (1:1) In order to analyze non-toxic alternatives for the extraction of phenolic compounds
Change 10	 Originally, the extraction is done with a solution 80% (v/v) methanol and water In replication, the extraction is done with a solution Choline chloride, Urea and Glycerol (1:1:1) In order to analyze non-toxic alternatives for the extraction of phenolic compounds
Change 11	 Originally, the extraction is done with a solution 80% (v/v) methanol and water In replication, the extraction is done with a solution D-(-)-Fructose D-(+)-Glucose and Sucrose (1:1:1) In order to analyze non-toxic alternatives for the extraction of phenolic compounds

 Table 6. Diet-Hiper replication specification using the template

Field	Value
Replication	Diet-Hiper Internal replication based on Diet-Normo original experiment
Description of experiment	Effect of meal rich in oleic acid on hypertriglyceridemic subjects
Site and Date	The base experiment was carried out in <i>Instituto de la Grasa</i> (CSIC) Sevilla in 2006 and this replication, in <i>Instituto de la</i> Grasa (CSIC) Sevilla in 2006
Purpose	Extend results
Change 1	Originally , Subjects have blood pressure levels within the limits considered normal
	In replication, Subjects are hypertensive
	In order to study the effect of the diet rich in oleic acid on <i>hypertriglyceridemic</i> subjects who are also <i>hypertensive</i>

 ${\bf Table \ 7. \ SPL-Pr\&Com \ replication \ specification \ using \ the \ template}$

SPL-Pr & Com Internal replication based on $SPL-Pr$ original
experiment
Comparison of test case prioritization criteria for Software
Product Lines (SPL)
The base experiment was carried out in ETSII-University of
Seville in 2014 and this replication, in ETSII-University of
Seville in 2014
Extend results
Originally, only a test suite was generated
In replication, for each model, 2-wise test suite was generated
In order to obtain a list of products covering all the possible
pairs of features on each model
Protocol , specifically the guides
the change does not affect validity
Originally, a test suite was randomly generated using SPLAR
tool
In replication, test suite was randomly generated using
SPLCAT tool
Because SPLCAT increase the fault detection rate and thus it is
considered as an extra prioritization approach in our comparison
Protocol, specifically the guides
the change does not affect validity
because because only the tool used changes

Field	Value
Replication	Test-NF Internal replication based on Test-F original experiment
Description	Prioritization of test case execution to accelerate the detection of
of experiment	faults in highly configurable systems
Site and Date	The base experiment was carried out in ETSII-University of
	Seville in 2015 and this replication, in ETSII-University of
	Seville in 2015
Purpose	Extend results
Change 1	Originally , <i>objective functions</i> are <i>functional</i>
	In replication, objective functions are non-functional
	In order to compare differences in favour of multi-objective prioritization over mono-objective prioritization using non-functional objectives
Modified Dimensio	n Operationalization , specifically dependent variable
Threat to validity	The change does not affect validity because dependent variables of the original are replaced by other dependent variables, however the validity is not affected

 $\label{eq:table 8. Test-NF replication specification using the template$

 Table 9. Test–F&NF replication specification using the template

Field	Value
Replication	$Test-F \ \mathcal{C}NF$ Internal replication based on $Test-F$ original experiment
Description of experiment	Prioritization of test case execution to accelerate the detection of faults in highly configurable systems
Site and Date	The base experiment was carried out in <i>ETSII-University</i> of Seville in 2015 and this replication, in <i>ETSII-University</i> of Seville in 2015
Purpose	Extend results
Change 1	Originally , objective functions are functional In replication , objective functions combine functional and non-functional
	In order to analyse whether <i>multi-objective</i> prioritization using <i>functional</i> and <i>non-functional</i> objectives outperform prioritization driven by a single objective, either functional or non-functional
	Operationalization , specifically dependent variable
Threat to validity	The change does not affect validity because dependent variables of the original are replaced by other dependent variables, however the validity is not affected

 ${\bf Table \ 10.} \ {\rm Test-FvsNF} \ {\rm replication} \ {\rm specification} \ {\rm using} \ {\rm the} \ {\rm template}$

Field	Value
Replication	Test-FvsNF Internal replication based on $Test-F$ original experiment
Description	Prioritization of test case execution to accelerate the detection of
of experiment	faults in highly configurable systems
Site and Date	The base experiment was carried out in ETSII-University of
	Seville in 2015 and this replication, in ETSII-University of
	Seville in 2015
Purpose	Extend results
Change 1	Originally , objective functions are functional
	In replication , <i>objective functions</i> combine <i>functional</i> and <i>non-functional</i>
	In order to analyze the domain of <i>non-functional objectives</i> over
	<i>functional objectives</i> , especially when these are combined in a <i>multi-objective</i> perspective
Modified Dimensio	n Operationalization , specifically dependent variable
Threat to validity	The change does not affect validity
	because dependent variables of the original are replaced by other
	dependent variables, however the validity is not affected

Table 11. Instantiation of the proposed template in $\mathsf{Mind}\#2$

Field	Value
Mind#2	Replication of experiment <i>Mind#1</i>
Type of replication	Internal
Purpose	Confirm results
Change 1	Originally , for 4 weeks Mindfulness was practiced 4 days a week in 10-minute sessions
	In replication In replication the sessions were 12 minutes long and for 6 weeks
	in order to make more evident the benefits of Mindfulness
Modified Dimension	Operationalization , specifically the independent variable <i>Training Workshop</i>
Threat to validity	The change increases the construct validity
Change $\#2$	Originally , the assignment of subjects to treatment was not randomized
	In replication it becomes random
	in order to remedy threats to the internal validity of
	quasi-experiments
Modified Dimension	Protocol, specifically experimental design
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change #3	Originally , an public speaking workshop was given to the control group as a placebo
	In replication the oratory workshop took place after the experiment
	in order to avoid a possible effect of such a workshop on the
	more to avoid a possible effect of such a workshop on the measurements of dependent variables
Modified Dimension	Operationalization , specifically the independent variable
modified Diffiension	Training Workshop
Threat to validity	The change increases the construct validity

Table 12. Instantiation of the proposed template in Mind#3 $\,$

Field	Value
Mind#3	Replication of experiment $Mind#2$
Type of replication	Internal
Purpose	Confirm results
Change 1	Originally, students make two exercises of concepual
	modeling, one before and one after treatment.
	In replication the order of the exercises is swapped
	in order to demonstrate that it does not affect the results
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the guides
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity

Field	Value
Q-2009	Replication of experiment Q-2007
Type of replication	Internal
Purpose	Confirm results
Change 1	Originally, analysts' effectiveness in interview sessions is
	analysed
	In replication effectiveness is not analysed
	because of the high cost of transcribing and analyzing all
	interviews
Modified Dimension	Operationalization , specifically the dependent variable
	effectiveness
Threat to validity	The change ***(<i>Threat</i>)
Change 2	Originally , the retention capacity is analyzed
	In replication retention capacity is not analysed
	because of the high cost of transcribing and analyzing all
	interviews
Modified Dimension	Operationalization , specifically the dependent variable
	retention capacity
Threat to validity	The change *** (<i>Threat</i>)
Change 3	Originally, no account is taken of development experience
	In replication experience in development is considered to
	calculate the independent variable experience
	because of ***(<i>Reason</i>)
Modified Dimension	Operationalization , specifically the dependent variable
	development experience
Threat to validity	The change increases the construct validity
Change 4	Originally , interviews are conducted in Spanish
	In replication interviews are conducted in English
	because of English was a requirement of the master to which
	the students belonged
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically experimental material
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 5	Originally , a person responds in interviews
	In replication the person who answers the interviews is
	changed
	because of $***(Reason)$
Modified Dimension	Stakeholder, specifically the monitor
Threat to validity	The change ***(<i>Threat</i>)

Table 13. Instantiation of the proposed template in Q-2009 $\,$

Table 14. Instantiation of the proposed template in Q-2011 $\,$

Field	Value
Q-2011	Replication of experiment Q-2009
Type of replication	Internal
Purpose	Extend results
Change 1	Originally, interviews between subjects (analysts) and
	experimenter are individual
	In replication interviews are in groups
	because of the cost and effort involved in conducting
	individual interviews and the experimenter's fatigue
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the guides
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 2	Originally, experience in requirements analysis is considered
	In replication experience is determined by years of
	experience and the skill the subject claims to have
	because of ***(Reason)
Modified Dimension	Operationalization, specifically the independent variable
-	skill in requirements and skill in interviews
Threat to validity	The change ***(<i>Threat</i>)
Change 3	Originally , the duration of the interviews is 30 min.
	In replication the duration of the interviews is 60 min
	because of the interview is in group
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the guides
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 4	Originally , The subject (analyst) has 7 days to present in writing the information gathered in the interview.
	In replication the written presentation is immediately after
	the interview.
	in order to avoid loss of information
Modified Dimension	Protocol, specifically the guides
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 5	Originally , the time elapsed between the interview and
enange e	the written presentation of the information collected is not
	measured
	In replication the time elapsed between the interview and
	the written presentation of the information is set at 120 min.
	because of the written presentation is immediately after the
	interview
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the guides
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 6	Originally, a person responds in interviews
	In replication the person who answers the interviews is
	changed
	because of ***(<i>Reason</i>)
Modified Dimension	Stakeholder, specifically the monitor
Threat to validity	The change ***(<i>Threat</i>)

Field	Value
Q-2012	Replication of experiment Q-2011
Type of replication	External
Purpose	Confirm results
Change 1	Originally , the subjects are Master's students
	In replication the subjects are professionals
	because of replication is performed at the International
	Working Conference on Requirements Engineering
Modified Dimension	Population , specifically the experimental subjects
Threat to validity	The change increases the external validity
Change 2	Originally, subjects have little or no development experience
	In replication the subjects are professionals with experience
	in development
	because of replication is performed at the International
	Working Conference on Requirements Engineering
Modified Dimension	Operationalization , specifically the independent variable
	development skill
Threat to validity	The change increases the construct validity
Change 3	Originally , the duration of the interviews is 120 min.
	In replication the duration of the interviews is 30 min
•	because of time constraints
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the guides
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 4	Originally, the experiment is carried out at the end of the
	course, i.e. after the training period
	In replication no training period
	because of replication is performed at the International
	Working Conference on Requirements Engineering
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the guides
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity

 Table 15. Instantiation of the proposed template in Q-2012

 Table 16. Instantiation of the proposed template in E-2012A

Field	Value
E-2012A	Replication of experiment Q-2012
Type of replication	Internal
Purpose	Extend results
Change 1	Originally, knowledge is defined as familiarity through
0	subjective assessment
	In replication knowledge is defined as an independent
	variable with two levels: known and unknown problem
	because of in the experimental population (post-graduate
	students) it is possible to know whether or not they know a
	certain domain of the problem
Modified Dimension	Operationalization , specifically the independent variable
	knowledge
Threat to validity	The change ***(<i>Threat</i>)
Change 2	Originally, the interviews to know the requirements are
	carried out on two different days, to avoid fatigue in the
	experimenter
	In replication the design is changed to a design of repeated
	measurements (within-subjects)
	because of this design does not require a large number of
	subjects
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the experimental design
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 3	Originally, interviews between subjects (analysts) and
	experimenters are in groups
	In replication interviews are individual
•	because of there are two experimenters (responders) with
	two languages
Modified Dimension	Protocol, specifically the guides
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 4	Originally, there are no blocking variables
	In replication there is a blocking variable per language
	because of subjects who use their mother tongue will be
	more effective than subjects who use a second language
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the experimental design
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 5	Originally , there are no blocking variables In replication there is one blocking variable per
	In replication there is one blocking variable per experimenter (respondent)
	because experimental subjects conduct the interview in their
	own language.
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the experimental design
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change δ	Originally, there is a experimenter (respondent)
Change o	In replication there are two experimenters (respondents)
	In order to alleviate the effects of fatigue and learning of the
	experimenter (respondents)
Modified Dimension	Protocol, specifically the guides
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
incas to validity	The shange mercases one mornar variancy

Field	Value
Change 7	Originally , there is the same problem (experimental object)
	for all subjects
	In replication there are two problems
	because of groups are made due to blocking variables
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the experimental material
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 8	Originally , the duration of the interviews is 60 min.
	In replication the duration of the interviews is 30 min.
	because the interview is individual
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the guides
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 9	Originally, the time elapsed between the interview and the
	written presentation is 30 min.
	In replication the time elapsed between the interview and
	the written presentation is 90 min.
	because the recommended duration of 90 minutes
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the guides
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 10	Originally , the difficulty of the problem is not measured
	In replication the difficulty variable indicates the difficulty
	of the problem
	because there are two problems
Modified Dimension	Operationalization , specifically the independent variable
	difficulty
Threat to validity	The change increases the construct validity

 Table 17. Instantiation of the proposed template in E-2012B

Field	Value
E-2012B	Replication of experiment <i>E-2012A</i>
Type of replication	Internal
Purpose	Confirm results
Change 1	Originally, two problem domains are used in the experiment,
	one known domain (DC) and the other unknown domain (DD)
	In replication the problem domains used in the experiment
	have been modified, but one is still a known domain (DC) and
	the other is an unknown domain (DD)
	because of ***(<i>Reason</i>)
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the experimental material
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 2	Originally, first the known domain problem is performed and
	then the unknown domain problem.
	In replication the order of the problems is swapped
	because of ***(<i>Reason</i>)
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the guides
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 3	Originally, the experiment was carried out at the beginning
	of the course;
	In replication the experiment is carried out after the
	subjects have received training in Requirements Engineering
	because of ***(Reason)
Modified Dimension	Operationalization, $***(Context)$
Threat to validity	The change increases the construct validity

Table 18. Instantiation of the proposed template in E-2013 $\,$

Field	Value
E-2013	Replication of experiment $E-2012B$
Type of replication	Internal
Purpose	Extend results
Change 1	Originally , the design is of repeated measurements
-	In replication the design is between-subjects
	In order to avoid the learning effect
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically experimental design
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 2	Originally , no short training (warming up) before the course
	In replication the brief training (warming up) is 1 week
	Because of ***(Reason)
Modified Dimension	Operationalization , $***(Name)$
Threat to validity	The change increases the construct validity

Field	Value
E-2014	Replication of experiment <i>E-2013</i>
Type of replication	Internal
Purpose	Extend results
Change 1	Originally, in the interviews, there are two respondents
	In replication there is only one responder
	because of the unavailability of one of the respondents
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the guides
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 2	Originally , the brief training (warming up) is 1 week
	In replication the brief training (warming up) is 6 week
	In order to explore the warming up effect
Modified Dimension	Operationalization , ***(Name)
Threat to validity	The change increases the construct validity

Table 19. Instantiation of the proposed template in E-2014 $\,$

Field	Value
E-2015	Replication of experiment <i>E-2013</i>
Type of replication	Internal
Purpose	Extend results
Change 1	Originally , the brief training (warming up) is 1 week
	In replication the brief training (warming up) is 2 week
	In order to explore the warming up effect
Modified Dimension	Operationalization, ***(Name)
Threat to validity	The change increases the construct validity

Table 20. Instantiation of the proposed template in E-2015 $\,$

Table 21. Instantiation of the proposed template in VV-UPM1 $\,$

Field	Value
VV-UPM1	Replication of experiment VV-UPM
Type of replication	Internal
Purpose	Extend results
Change 1	Originally , the visibility of the fault is not analysed
	In replication the influence of the visibility of the fault is analysed
	in order to draw new conclusions
Modified Dimension	${f Operationalization,}\ ^{***}(Name)$
Threat to validity	The change ***(<i>Threat</i>)
Comments	Laboratory package developed by Kamsties and Lott is used
Change 2	Originally, the influence of the programme is not analysed
	In replication two versions of each program are implemented
	and is a new factor
	because the programs are not very long and therefore the
	errors are masked from each other
Modified Dimension	Operationalization , specifically the independent variable
	version
Threat to validity	The change increases the construct validity
Change 3	Originally, three of the fault types appear only once while
	the other three types appear twice
	In replication all types of faults are duplicated
	because there are two versions of each program
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the experimental material
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 4	Originally , subjects generate their test cases to detect code failures
	In replication first, the subjects apply the technique to
	generate the test cases and then execute the test cases
	provided to them to detect program failures
	in order to check whether the visibility of faults influences
	their detection
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the experimental material
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 5	Originally , four programs are used
	In replication three programs are used, one is discarded
	in order to balance the design
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the experimental material
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 6	Originally , each subject applies a technique
	In replication each subject applies the three techniques
	because the design is changed
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the experimental design
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity

 Table 22. Instantiation of the proposed template in VV-UPV

Field	Value
VV-UPV	Replication of experiment VV-UPM
Site	Polytechnic University of Valencia
Type of replication	External
Purpose	Extend results
Change 1	Originally , the three verification and validation techniques are used: code reading, equivalence partitioning and branch testing In replication the code reading technique is omitted baseques of time constraints
Modified Dimension	because of time constraints Operationalization , specifically the independent variable <i>technique</i>
Threat to validity	The change increases the construct validity
Comment	The baseline experiment are UPM replications treated as one
Change 2	Originally , the duration of the 3 sessions is 4h. each, i.e. the time is unlimited
	In replication the duration of each of the 3 sessions is 2h.
	because of time constraints
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the guides
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 3	Originally, subjects receive three four-hour training sessions
	to learn how to apply the techniques
	In replication the training consists of two two-hour tutorials
	because he subjects are already familiar with the techniques
Modified Dimension	Operationalization, specifically the independent variable
	training
Threat to validity	The change increases the construct validity
Change 4	Originally, the training in the use of the techniques is before
	the experiment is executed
	In replication Each tutorial is carried out before the
	application of the technique, in the first 2 sessions; i. e., the
	training is interspersed with the operation of the experiment
	because he subjects are already familiar with the techniques
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the guides
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 5	Originally, subjects apply a technique to a program in each
0	session
	In replication subjects apply the same technique to different
	programs in each session
	because of time constraints
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the guides
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 6	Originally, The subjects execute test cases with the
	application of the technique; that is to say in each session
	In replication Subjects run test cases for one of the programs
	they have tested in a separate session, i.e. in session 3
	because of time constraints
Modified Dimension	because of time constraints Protocol , specifically the guides

Field	Value
VV-Uds	Replication of experiment VV-UPM
Type of replication	External
Purpose	Extend results
Change 1	Originally, the duration of the 3 sessions is 4h. each, i.e. the
0	time is unlimited
	In replication the duration of each of the 3 sessions is 2h.
	because of time constraints
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the guides
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 2	Originally, the subjects execute test cases with the
0	application of the technique; i. e. in each session
	In replication the subjects execute test cases for one of the
	programs they have tested in a later session, i.e. in session 4
	because of time constraints
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the guides
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 3	Originally , subjects work individually
	In replication subjects work in pairs
	because there are not enough computers
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the guides
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 4	Originally, subjects receive three four-hour training sessions
	to learn how to apply the techniques
	In replication the training consists of two two-hour tutorials
	because he subjects are already familiar with the techniques
Modified Dimension	Operationalization , specifically the independent variable
	training
Threat to validity	The change increases the construct validity
Change 5	Originally, the training in the use of the techniques is before
	the experiment is executed
	In replication each tutorial is conducted before the
	application of the technique in each of the three sessions
	in which each technique is examined; i.e., the training is
	interspersed with the operation of the experiment
	because he subjects are already familiar with the techniques
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the guides
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity

Table 23. Instantiation of the proposed template in VV-Uds $% \mathcal{T}_{\mathrm{T}}$

Field	Value
VV-ORT	Replication of experiment VV-UPM
Type of replication	External
Purpose	Extend results
Change 1	Originally , the three techniques of verification and validation are used: code reading, equivalence partitioning and branch testing
	In replication the code reading technique is omitted because of time constraints
Modified Dimension	Operationalization , specifically the independent variable <i>technique</i>
Threat to validity	The change ***(<i>Threat</i>)
Change 2	Originally, three program codes are used
0	In replication one of the programs is discarded
	because of time constraints
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically experimental material
Threat to validity	The change ***(<i>Threat</i>)
Change 3	Originally , the experiment is carried out in three sessions each of four hours
	In replication the experiment is executed in a single session
	because of time constraints
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically the guides
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity
Change 4	Originally, subjects apply a different technique to evaluate
<u>-</u>	a program in each of the three sessions
	In replication the subjects apply the two techniques to the
	two programs in a single session
	because of time constraints
Modified Dimension	Protocol , specifically experimental design
Threat to validity	The change increases the internal validity

Table 24. Instantiation of the proposed template in VV-ORT $\,$