

Open letter to MR Mehra, SS Desai, F Ruschitzka, and AN Patel, authors of **“Hydroxychloroquine or chloroquine with or without a macrolide for treatment of COVID-19: a multinational registry analysis”**. *Lancet*. 2020 May 22:S0140-6736(20)31180-6. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(20)31180-6. PMID: 32450107

and to Richard Horton (editor of *The Lancet*).

## Concerns regarding the statistical analysis and data integrity

The retrospective, observational study of 96,032 hospitalized COVID-19 patients from six continents reported substantially increased mortality (~30% excess deaths) and occurrence of cardiac arrhythmias associated with the use of the 4-aminoquinoline drugs hydroxychloroquine and chloroquine. These results have had a considerable impact on public health practice and research.

The WHO has paused recruitment to the hydroxychloroquine arm in their SOLIDARITY trial. The UK regulatory body, MHRA, requested the temporary pausing of recruitment into all hydroxychloroquine trials in the UK (treatment and prevention), and France has changed its national recommendation for the use of hydroxychloroquine in COVID-19 treatment and also halted trials.

The subsequent media headlines have caused considerable concern to participants and patients enrolled in randomized controlled trials (RCTs) seeking to characterize the potential benefits and risks of these drugs in the treatment and prevention of COVID-19 infections. There is uniform agreement that well conducted RCTs are needed to inform policies and practices.

This impact has led many researchers around the world to scrutinize in detail the publication in question. This scrutiny has raised both methodological and data integrity concerns. The main concerns are listed as follows:

1. There was inadequate adjustment for known and measured confounders (disease severity, temporal effects, site effects, dose used).
2. The authors have not adhered to standard practices in the machine learning and statistics community. They have not released their code or data. There is no data/code sharing and availability statement in the paper. The *Lancet* was among the many signatories on the Wellcome [statement](#) on data sharing for COVID-19 studies.
3. There was no ethics review.
4. There was no mention of the countries or hospitals that contributed to the data source and no acknowledgments of their contributions. A request to the authors for information on the contributing centres was denied.
5. Data from Australia are not compatible with government reports (too many cases for just five hospitals, more in-hospital deaths than had occurred in the entire country during the study period). *Surgisphere* (the data company) have since stated this was an error of classification of one hospital from Asia. This indicates the need for further error checking throughout the database.
6. Data from Africa indicate that nearly 25% of all COVID-19 cases and 40% of all deaths in the continent occurred in *Surgisphere*-associated hospitals which had sophisticated electronic patient data recording, and patient monitoring able to detect and record “nonsustained [at least 6 secs] or sustained ventricular tachycardia or ventricular fibrillation”. Both the numbers of cases and deaths, and the details provided, seem unlikely.
7. Unusually small reported variation in baseline variables, interventions and outcomes between continents (Table S3).

8. Mean daily doses of hydroxychloroquine that are 100 mg higher than FDA recommendations, whereas 66% of the data are from North American hospitals.
9. Implausible ratios of chloroquine to hydroxychloroquine use in some continents. For example, in Australia 49 received chloroquine and 50 received hydroxychloroquine. However, chloroquine is not readily available in Australia and administration requires authorization from the Therapeutic Goods Administration.
10. The tight 95% confidence intervals reported for the hazard ratios appear inconsistent with the data. For instance, for the Australian data this would imply about double the numbers of recorded deaths as were reported in the paper.

The patient data were obtained through electronic health records, supply chain databases, and financial records. The data are held by the US company *Surgisphere*. In response to a request for the data Professor Mehra replied: **“Our data sharing agreements with the various governments, countries and hospitals do not allow us to share data unfortunately.”**

Given the enormous importance and influence of these results, we believe it is imperative that:

1. The company *Surgisphere* provides details on data provenance. At the very minimum, this means sharing the aggregated patient data at the hospital level (for all covariates and outcomes)
2. Independent validation of the analysis is performed by a group convened by the World Health Organization, or at least one other independent and respected institution. This would entail additional analyses (e.g. determining if there is a dose-effect) to assess the validity of the conclusions
3. There is open access to all the data sharing agreements cited above to ensure that, in each jurisdiction, any mined data was legally and ethically collected and patient privacy aspects respected

In the interests of transparency, we also ask The Lancet to make openly available the peer review comments that led to this manuscript being accepted for publication.

This open letter is signed by clinicians, medical researchers, statisticians, and ethicists from across the world. The full list of signatories and affiliations can be found below.

## List of Signatories

### Africa

Dr Ambrose Agweyu (Medical researcher, KEMRI-Wellcome Trust Research Programme, Kenya)  
Dr Clifford George Banda (Clinician, University of Cape Town, South Africa)  
Dr Edwine Barasa (Health economist, KEMRI-Wellcome Trust Research Programme, Kenya)  
Professor Karen Barnes (Clinical Pharmacology, University of Cape Town, South Africa)  
Professor Philip Bejon (Medical researcher, Director of the KEMRI-Wellcome Trust Research Programme, Kenya)  
Prof. Linda-Gail Bekker (Clinician, University of Cape Town, South Africa)  
Dr Nomathemba Chandiwana (Research Clinician, University of the Witwatersrand, South Africa)  
Professor Keertan Dheda (Clinician/Researcher, University of Cape Town, & Groote Schuur Hospital, South Africa)  
Dr Anthony Etyang (Medical Researcher, KEMRI-Wellcome Trust Research Programme, Kenya)  
Professor Oumar Gaye (Clinical Researcher, University Cheikh Anta Diop, Senegal)  
Professor Freedom Gumedze (Statistician, University of Cape Town, South Africa)  
Dr Nsoby Samuel Lubwama (Researcher, Makerere University College of Health Sciences, Uganda)  
Professor Kathryn Maitland (Clinician, Imperial College London/KEMRI Wellcome Trust Programme, Kenya)  
Professor Gary Maartens (Clinician, University of Cape Town, South Africa)  
Dr Rephaim Mpofo (Clinician, University of Cape Town, South Africa)  
Professor Francine Ntoumi (Researcher, Universite M. Ngouabi, Republic of the Congo)  
Professor Marie Onyamboko (Clinical researcher, Kinshasa School of Public Health, DRC)  
Professor Catherine Orrell (Clinical Pharmacologist, University of Cape Town, South Africa)  
Professor Jean Bosco Ouedraogo (Medical Researcher, WWARN, Burkina Faso)  
Professor Thomas Williams (Clinician, KEMRI-Wellcome Trust Research Programme, Kenya)

### Asia

Professor Yaseen Arabi (Clinician and researcher, King Saud Bin Abdulaziz University for Health Sciences, Saudi Arabia)  
Dr Elizabeth Ashley (Clinician, Director of the Lao-Oxford-Mahosot Hospital-Wellcome Trust Research Unit, Laos)  
Professor Kevin Baird (Researcher, Head of the Eijkman-Oxford Clinical Research Unit, Indonesia)  
Professor Buddha Basnyat (Clinician, Head of the Oxford University Clinical Research Unit - Nepal, Nepal)  
Professor Mohammad Asim Beg (Clinician/Researcher, Aga Khan University, Pakistan)  
Dr James Callery (Clinician, Mahidol Oxford Tropical Medicine Research Unit, Thailand)  
Dr Arjun Chandna (Clinician, Cambodia Oxford Medical Research Unit, Cambodia)  
Professor Phaik Yeong Cheah (Ethicist/Pharmacist, Mahidol Oxford Tropical Medicine Research Unit, Thailand)  
Professor Kesinee Chotivanich (Researcher, Mahidol University, Thailand)  
Dr Cintia Cruz (Paediatrician Mahidol Oxford Tropical Medicine Research Unit, Thailand)  
Professor Jeremy Day (Clinician, Oxford University Clinical Research Unit, Vietnam)  
Professor Nicholas Day (Clinician, Director of the Mahidol Oxford Tropical Medicine Research Unit, Thailand)  
Professor Arjen Dondorp (Clinician, Mahidol Oxford Tropical Medicine Research Unit, Thailand)  
Dr Mehul Dhorda (Clinical Researcher, Mahidol Oxford Tropical Medicine Research Unit, Thailand)  
Dr Ronald Geskus (Head of Statistics at the Oxford University Clinical Research Unit, Vietnam)  
Dr Mellie Gilder (Clinician/Researcher, Chiang Mai University, Thailand)  
Dr Raph Hamers (Clinician/Triallist, Eijkman-Oxford Clinical Research Unit, Indonesia)  
Dr Rashan Haniffa (Clinician/Researcher, NICST, Sri Lanka)  
Dr Sharon Kaur (Ethicist, University of Malaya, Malaysia)  
Dr Evelynne Kestelyn (Head of Clinical Trials, Oxford University Clinical Research Unit, Vietnam)  
Dr Tan Le Van (Medical Researcher, Oxford University Clinical Research Unit, Vietnam)  
Professor Richard Maude (Clinician/Epidemiologist, Mahidol Oxford Tropical Medicine Research Unit, Thailand)  
Professor Mayfong Mayxay (Clinician/Researcher, Lao-Oxford-Mahosot Hospital-Wellcome Trust Research Unit, Laos)  
Professor Rose McGready (Clinician/Researcher, Shoklo Malaria Research Unit, Thailand)  
Dr Mavuto Mukaka (Statistician, Mahidol Oxford Tropical Medicine Research Unit, Thailand)  
Professor Francois Nosten (Clinician, Director of the Shoklo Malaria Research Unit, Thailand)  
Dr Kajaal Patel (Paediatrician, Cambodia Oxford Medical Research Unit, Cambodia)  
Professor Weerapong Phumratanaprapin (Deputy Dean of the Faculty of Tropical Medicine, Mahidol University, Thailand)  
Professor Sasithon Pukrittayakamee (Clinician, Mahidol University, Thailand)  
Dr Aung Pyae Phy (Clinician/Scientist, Myanmar Oxford Clinical Research Unit, Myanmar)  
Dr Makoto Saito (Clinician/Epidemiologist, University of Tokyo, Japan)  
Dr William Schilling (Clinician, Mahidol Oxford Tropical Medicine Research Unit, Thailand)  
Dr Anuraj Shankar (Clinician/Triallist, Eijkman-Oxford Clinical Research Unit, Indonesia)  
Professor Sanjib Kumar Sharma (Clinician, Koira Institute of Health Sciences, Nepal)  
Professor Frank Smithuis (Clinical researcher, Director of the Myanmar Oxford Tropical Research Unit, Myanmar)  
Dr Walter Taylor (Clinician, Mahidol Oxford Tropical Medicine Research Unit, Thailand)  
Professor Guy Thwaites (Clinician, Director of the Oxford University Clinical Research Unit, Vietnam)  
Professor Tran Tinh Hien (Clinician, Oxford Clinical Research Unit, Vietnam)  
Professor Paul Turner (Clinician/Researcher, Director of Cambodia Oxford Medical Research Unit, Cambodia)  
Professor Lorenz von Seidlein (Clinician, Mahidol Oxford Tropical Medicine Research Unit, Thailand)  
Naomi Waithira (Head of Data Management, Mahidol Oxford Tropical Medicine Research Unit, Thailand)

Dr James Watson (Statistician, Mahidol Oxford Tropical Medicine Research Unit, Thailand)<sup>1</sup>  
Professor Sir Nicholas White (Clinician, Mahidol Oxford Tropical Medicine Research Unit, Thailand)  
Dr Sophie Yacoub (Clinician, Oxford University Clinical Research Unit, Vietnam)

## Australasia

Professor Nicholas Anstey (Clinician, Menzies School of Health Research, Australia)  
Dr Sabine Braat (Statistician, University of Melbourne, Australia)  
Professor John Carlin (Statistician, University of Melbourne & Murdoch Children's Research Institute, Australia)  
Professor Allen Cheng (Clinician, Monash University, Australia)  
Professor Leonid Churilov (Statistician, University of Melbourne, Australia)  
Professor Bart Currie (Director, HOT NORTH, Menzies School of Health Research, Australia)  
Professor Joshua Davis (Clinician, President of the Australasian Society for Infectious Diseases, Australia)  
Professor Justin Denholm (Clinician, Researcher, Ethicist, Doherty Institute, Australia)  
Dr Joseph Doyle (Clinician, Monash University and Burnet Institute, Australia)  
Professor Andrew Forbes (Statistician, Monash University, Melbourne, Australia)  
Professor Stephane Heritier (Statistician, Monash University, Australia)  
Dr Karen Lamb (Biostatistician, University of Melbourne, Australia)  
Professor Katherine Lee (Statistician, University of Melbourne, Australia)  
Dr Julie Marsh (Statistician, Telethon Kids Institute, Australia)  
Dr Colin McArthur (Clinician/Triallist, Auckland City Hospital and Monash University, Australia)  
Professor Alistair Nichol (Clinician Researcher, University College Dublin, Ireland, & Monash University, Australia)  
Dr Matthew O'Sullivan (Clinician, Westmead Hospital & University of Sydney, Australia)  
Elaine Pascoe (Statistician, University of Queensland, Australia)  
Professor David Paterson (Clinician, Director, UQ Centre for Clinical Research, Australia)  
Dr David Price (Statistician, Doherty Institute & University of Melbourne, Australia)  
Professor Richard Price (Clinician, Menzies School of Health Research, Australia)  
Professor Jason Roberts (Pharmacist/Clinician, The University of Queensland, Australia)  
Professor Stephen Rogerson (Clinician, University of Melbourne, Australia)  
Professor Fiona Russell (Paediatrician, The University of Melbourne, Australia)  
Dr Sam Saidi (Clinician, University of Sydney, Australia)  
Professor Julie Simpson (Statistician, University of Melbourne, Australia)  
Professor Steven Tong (Clinician, University of Melbourne, Australia)

## Europe

Professor Amanda Adler (Triallist & Clinician, Director of the Diabetes Trials Unit, University of Oxford, UK)  
Professor Dani Prieto-Alhambra (Epidemiologist, University of Oxford, UK)  
Professor Francois Balloux (Researcher, Director of the UCL Genetics Institute, UK)  
Professor Leïla Belkhir (Clinician, Université Catholique de Louvain, Belgium)  
Mr Mostapha Benhenda (Data scientist, Melwy and COVIND Covid-19 Individual Patient Data Consortium, France)  
Dr Anne-Lise Bienvenu (Pharmacist, Lyon University Hospital, France)  
Professor Marc Bonten (Clinician/Researcher, University Medical Center Utrecht, The Netherlands)  
Professor Emmanuel Bottieau (Clinician, Institute of Tropical Medicine, Antwerp, Belgium)  
Professor Anders Björkman (Clinician, Karolinska Institutet, Sweden)  
Professor Frank Brunkhorst (Clinician & Director of the Center of Clinical Studies, Jena University Hospital, Germany)  
Professor Ben Cooper (Epidemiologist, University of Oxford, UK)  
Dr Hakim-Moulay Dehbi (Statistician, University College London, UK)  
Dr Lennie Derde (Intensivist/Researcher, University Medical Center Utrecht, The Netherlands)  
Professor Annane Djillali (Dean of the School of Medicine, Simone Veil Université, France)  
Professor Emeritus Jean Dupouy-Camet (Former president of the European Federation of Parasitologists, Paris University, France)  
Dr Caterina Fanello (Epidemiologist, University of Oxford, UK)  
Professor Neil Ferguson (Epidemiologist, Imperial College London, UK)  
Dr Ricard Ferrer (Head of Department of Intensive Care, Hospital Universitari Vall d'Hebron, Spain)  
Dr Dominique Fourer (Mathematician, University of Evry/Paris-Saclay, France)  
Professor Emeritus Richard Gill (Mathematician/Statistician, Former President of Dutch Statistical Society, The Netherlands)  
Professor Azra Ghani (Epidemiologist, Imperial College London, UK)  
Prof Philippe Guerin (Medical researcher, University of Oxford, UK)  
Dr Thomas Hiemstra (Triallist, University of Cambridge, UK)  
Professor Peter Horby (Clinical Researcher, Centre for Tropical Medicine and Global Health, University of Oxford, UK)  
Dr Jens-Ulrik Jensen (Clinician/Triallist, University of Copenhagen, Denmark)  
Dr Hilary Johnstone (Clinical Research Physician, Independent)  
Professor Laurence Lovat (Clinical Director of Wellcome EPSRC Centre for Interventional & Surgical Sciences, UCL, UK)  
DR Ignacio Martin-Loeches (Clinician, Trinity College Dublin, Ireland)  
Dr Alistair McLean (Medical researcher, University of Oxford, UK)  
Laura Merson (Clinical researcher, University of Oxford, UK)  
Professor Clara Menendez (Clinical Researcher, Barcelona University, Spain)  
Professor Ramani Moonesinghe (Clinician researcher, University College London, UK)  
Dr Kerryn Moore (Epidemiologist, London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, UK)

---

<sup>1</sup> For correspondence: james@tropmedres.ac

Professor Kim Mulholland (Clinician, London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine, UK)  
Professor Paul Newton (Clinician, University Oxford, UK)  
Professor Piero Olliaro (Clinical Researcher, University of Oxford, UK)  
Dr Marcin Osuchowski (Medical researcher, Ludwig Boltzmann Institute, Austria)  
Dr Georgios Pappas (Physician, Institute of Continuing Medical Education of Ioannina, Greece)  
Professor Michael Parker (Director of The Wellcome Centre for Ethics and Humanities, The Ethox Centre, University of Oxford, UK)  
Tom Parke (Statistician, Berry Consultants, UK)  
Professor Stephane Picot (Clinician Researcher, Lyon University Hospital, France)  
Dr Christophe Pouzat (Mathematician, CNRS, France)  
Dr Ben Saville (Statistician, Berry Consultants & Vanderbilt University, The Netherlands)  
Professor Kathy Rowan (Researcher, Director of the ICNARC Clinical Trials Unit, UK)  
Professor Ignacio Rubio (Researcher, University Hospital Jena, Germany)  
Professor André Scherag (Statistician, Jena University Hospital, Germany)  
Professor Sir David Spiegelhalter (Statistician, Winton Professor of the Public Understanding of Risk, University of Cambridge, UK)  
Dr Tim Spelman (Statistician, Karolinska Institute, Sweden)  
Dr Kasia Stepniewska (Statistician, University of Oxford, UK)  
Dr Nathalie Strub Wourgaft (Clinician, Drugs for Neglected Diseases initiative, Switzerland)  
Professor Christoph Thiemermann (Head of Centre for Translational Medicine & Therapeutics, Queen Mary University, UK)  
Professor Antoni Torres (Clinician, University of Barcelona, Spain)  
Professor Rogier van Doorn (Clinical Microbiologist, University of Oxford, UK)  
Professor Robert Wilkinson (Researcher, Francis Crick Institute, UK)  
Dr Martin Sebastian Winkler (Clinician, University Medical Center Gottingen, Germany)  
Dr Charlie Woodrow (Clinician, Oxford University Hospitals NHS Trust, UK)

## North America

Dr Ravi Amaravadi (Researcher, University of Pennsylvania, USA)  
Professor Michael Avidan (Clinician, Washington University in St Louis, USA)  
Dr Ruanne Barnabas (Physician Scientist, University of Washington, USA)  
Professor Enrico Bucci (Systems Biologist, Temple University, USA)  
Professor Bjug Borgundvaag (Clinician, Director of the Schwartz/Reisman Emergency Medicine Institute, Canada)  
Professor David Boulware (Researcher & Triallist, University of Minnesota, USA)  
Professor James Brophy (Clinician/Epidemiologist, McGill University, Canada)  
Professor Caroline Buckee (Epidemiologist, Harvard TH Chan School of Public Health, USA)  
Dr Todd Campbell Lee (Researcher, McGill University, Canada)  
Professor Adrienne Chan, MD MPH FRCPC (Researcher, University of Toronto, Canada)  
Professor Ivy Cheng (Clinician/Researcher, University of Toronto, Canada)  
Professor Dave Glidden (Biostatistics, University of California, USA)  
Dr Adrian Hernandez (Vice Dean and Executive Director of the Duke Clinical Research Institute, Duke University, USA)  
Dr. Risa Hoffman (Clinician/Clinical Researcher, University of California, USA)  
Dr Sybil Hosek (Clinical Researcher, Cook County Health, USA)  
Professor Christine Johnston (Clinical Researcher, University of Washington School of Medicine, USA)  
Professor Peter Jüni (Director of the Applied Health Research Centre, University of Toronto, Canada)  
Professor Kevin Kain (Clinical Researcher, University of Toronto, Canada)  
Dr Patricia Kissinger (Clinical Researcher, Tulane University, USA)  
Professor Megan Landes (Clinician/Researcher, University of Toronto, Canada)  
Professor John Marshall (Clinician/Researcher, University of Toronto, Canada)  
Dr Emily McDonald (Clinician/Researcher, McGill University Health Center, Canada)  
Professor Zoe McLaren (Health Policy Researcher, University of Maryland, USA)  
Professor Shelley McLeod (Clinical Epidemiologist, University of Toronto, Canada)  
Dr John McKinnon (Clinician/Researcher, Henry Ford Health System, USA)  
Dr Bryan McVerry (Medical researcher, University of Pittsburgh, USA)  
Professor William Meurer (Clinician/Medical researcher, University of Michigan, USA)  
Dr Srinivas Murthy (Clinical Researcher, University of British Columbia, Canada)  
Professor Daniel Neafsey (Researcher, Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, USA)  
Dr William O'Neill (Clinician/Researcher, Henry Ford Health System, USA)  
Dr Temitope Oyedele (Clinician, Cook County Health, USA)  
Dr Michael Paasche-Orlow (Clinical Researcher, Boston University, USA)  
Professor William Powderly (Director, Institute of Clinical and Translational Research, Washington University in St. Louis, USA)  
Professor Stuart Ray (Clinician/Data Scientist, Johns Hopkins University, USA)  
Professor Frank Rockhold (Biostatistics/Bioinformatics, Duke University, USA)  
Professor Philip Rosenthal (Clinician, University of California, USA)  
Professor Ilan Schwartz (Clinician/Researcher, University of Alberta, Canada)  
Professor Darrell Tan (Clinician-Scientist, University of Toronto, Canada)  
Dr Aimee Taylor (Statistician, Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, USA)  
Professor George Tomlinson (Biostatistician, Mt Sinai Hospital, Canada)  
Professor Ross Upshur (Head of Division of Clinical Public Health, University of Toronto, Canada)  
Dr Dee Dee Wang (Clinician/Researcher, Henry Ford Health System, USA)  
Dr Yohannes Woldeamanuel (Physician Scientist, Stanford University, USA)  
Professor Chris Woods (Researcher, Duke University, USA)  
Professor Marcus Zervos (Researcher, Henry Ford Health System, USA)

## **South America**

Professor Juan-Manuel Anaya (Clinician, Universidad del Rosario, Colombia)

Dr José Moreira (Medical researcher, Fundação Oswaldo Cruz, Brazil)

Professor Pedro Politi (Oncologist, University of Buenos Aires, Argentina)

Dr Andre Siqueira (Clinician/Researcher, Fundação Oswaldo Cruz, Brazil)

Professor Rodrigo Stabeli (Researcher, Fiocruz, Brazil)

Professor Enrique Teran (Researcher, Universidad San Francisco de Quito, Ecuador)