Appendix 3. Results of the Structured Community Review

The Structured Community Review (SCR) was conducted on an earlier version of the present report, i.e., on versions of Chapters 1–13, c.f. Appendix 2. The advantage of undertaking a structured community review is, in short, that it offers an opportunity for 'critique from the field'. In other words, it provides the opportunity for a product—developed on the basis of academic literature, which we know to be limited—to be reviewed by practising TVET researchers as well as TVET practitioners. The results of this process have been incorporated into the present Chapters 1–13. However, in order to demonstrate the value of the SCR process—as well as to be transparent about our own reflective process—this Appendix describes the issues that were raised regarding the earlier versions of these chapters. Overall, the benefit of the SCR has been to make the report more insightful, accurate and valid.

The participants in the SCR pointed to a number of areas in which the report would need to be either strengthened or corrected. These changes ranged from minor grammatical and language corrections to a more substantial critique of the report. The major changes suggested included the addition of literature and organisational networks that we had missed during the initial literature review stage. Other suggested changes reflected the expertise of the SCR participants in governmental affairs and qualifications frameworks, as well as regarding the demographic and historical contexts of SSA. Such expertise led to an appreciation of how a lack of awareness on the part of the original authors — perhaps even bias — skewed the original text.

These aspects of the SCR participants' contributions are described below. Their contributions and suggested changes are summarised thematically. A suggested change may be referred to more than once if it falls under more than one of the following headings.

3.1. Added literature and research network references

Though we carried out an extensive online search of the TVET literature and landscape of SSA, our search was unable to capture every relevant piece of information. This is a methodological limitation of not just our report, but of much research in general: it is often not completely exhaustive. However, as we aimed to be as comprehensive as possible in our search for relevant information, it was crucial to have a larger number of researchers with appropriate TVET expertise review the report. That review — i.e., the SCR — brought to light additional publications that were subsequently added to

strengthen the report. These publications consisted of relevant literature that did not appear through our searches. However, another important area was references to research networks or other relevant TVET organisations that offered valuable additions to the report. A few examples of literature that was found via the SCR are provided in the next paragraph, with notes on the research networks highlighted by the SCR presented in the paragraph thereafter.

Amongst the literature that the SCR suggested that we add to our report was a study by ⇕Simiyu and Sambu (2012) that focused on an innovative strategy to increase enrolment in TVET institutions in Kenya using e-learning. It was also highlighted that the same authors published other research on the role of the public in the development of TVET in primary schools in Kenya (⇕ibid. 2014). Notably, all of these examples of added references were added by the authors of the respective papers. John Simiyu drew attention to the first two papers mentioned in this paragraph, alongside references to the work of Joy Kasandi Kelemba (⇕Kelemba, 2010; ⇕Mwinzi & Kelemba, 2010), and Kitainge and colleagues (⇕Tiony, et al., 2016; ⇕Kimaiyo, et al., 2016; ⇕Maina & Kitainge, 2018). Lesley Powell highlighted her relevant work on South African VET.

In addition to highlighting additional research publications, the SCR participants also made key contributions to our knowledge of existing TVET research networks and institutions in SSA. Our original searches did not find specific research networks between African and European countries or institutions. However, participants in the SCR noted that there are examples of such cooperation, including links between British and South African universities. Volker Wedekind reported that Nottingham University, for example, has strong links with the University of the Western Cape, Nelson Mandela University and Wits University. He also noted links between German and African institutions, such as between the University of Bremen, Germany and the Manufacturing, Engineering and Related Services Education and Training Authority (merSETA) in South Africa, and between Magdeburg University in Germany with conference organisers in Maputo Mozambique. Wedekind also highlighted additional research centres or networks doing work in TVET in South Africa. These included the Human Sciences Research Council, the REAL Centre at the University of Witwatersrand, the Nelson Mandela University and Rhodes University. These changes were incorporated into Chapter 15.

Additionally, John Simiyu noted that there were research institutions that we had failed to include in the earlier version of our report. These institutions included the University of Eldoret, Technical University of Mombasa, Technical and Vocational Education Authority and the Rift Valley Technical Training Institute: all active UNEVOC Centres in Kenya. He also noted that some TVET activities are coordinated by the Kenya National Commission for UNESCO. These contributions were likewise incorporated in Chapter 15.

While much of the SCR participants' commentary on TVET institutions and networks in SSA related to those we did not reference, the SCR also provided another insight into such institutions in SSA. In the version of the report that was reviewed by the SCR, we had stated that:

> *"In SSA, teacher colleges are typically not co-located with other tertiary institutions but may be in the same directorate as primary and secondary schools."*

This was flagged by the SCR as too broad a generalisation, as that situation is not true for all SSA countries. Though a single comment, it is an important one that led us to examine even more critically our discussion of institutions throughout the report, especially when broad generalisations were being made.

3.2. Government institutions

The most significant set of institutions that were commented on in the SCR were government institutions. SCR commentary focused on detailing more accurately what government ministries are responsible for; raising various relevant policy documents that we had missed in our literature review; and updating outdated printed information through newer figures that have not yet been published. Kipkirui Langat, for example, added to our report by clarifying that as well as the Ministry of Labour and Social Protection being involved in Kenya's TVET provision, the Ministries of Health, Transport, Agriculture, Energy and Tourism (hospitality) also played a role in providing specialised TVET programmes. He also provided additional information on the Kenya National Qualifications Framework (KNQF) Act of 2014. Likewise on governmental TVET policy, Amina Idris mentioned the Federal Polytechnic Amendment Decree 5 of 1993 by the Federal Government of Nigeria, which updated the Federal Polytechnics Act of 1979. Idris also provided additional information on standards for accreditation and re-accreditation of Diploma Programmes in Polytechnics and similar post-secondary technical institutions in Nigeria.

3.3. Deeper consideration of demographic groups

A number of the comments made during the SCR also encouraged deeper consideration of different demographic groups – including their contexts and the challenges faced by them – and how this is represented in the previous versions of Chapters 1–13. Those comments could be grouped based on their reference to age (namely, youth) and gender.

3.3.1. Youth

The topic of youth was raised early on in the SCR, when Robert Jjuuko and Amina Idris questioned the assertion that

> *"Africa faces enormous challenges, one of which is a young population. The average age is now 18 years. By 2050, the population is expected to double to two billion people."*

Jjuuko challenged this assertion and Idris followed by responding that a youthful population should not be viewed as a challenge; instead that the challenge might relate to low productivity, or to a system that is unable to cater adequately to the needs of young

people. As a consequence of their commentary, we re-evaluated and rephrased discussion about young people in the report to focus on the challenges associated with population growth, as opposed to presenting population growth itself as a problem.

Idris raised a further issue regarding youth, noting that appropriate skills for getting good jobs or becoming entrepreneurs are lacking amongst young people. She made this comment in response to the report stating that sustainable economic growth and jobs are essential prerequisites for Africa's youth to fuel the economy and to develop the continent. The report was therefore changed to reflect her point, emphasising instead that economic growth and jobs are not the only essential prerequisites for young people to drive the economy: the acquisition of the skill sets needed to fill and create jobs is of equal importance.

3.3.2. Gender

Gender was another demographically-focused topic that the community addressed. The discussion centred mainly around our discussion of the 'role of women / gender issues within TVET' vs. the 'gender issues in TVET being representative of wider gender issues in society,' i.e. beyond the scope of TVET. Amina Idris, for example, critiqued the report's contrasting of women's under-representation in TVET with their under-representation in other specific education sectors. A similar question was raised on comparing TVET gender statistics with certain university statistics. On the one hand, the comparison does serve to highlight that gender-based challenges, and potential solutions, are not restricted to the TVET sphere alone. However, while a comprehensive gender analysis is clearly needed, the availability of data is poor. Further research on gender in TVET has been proposed in Chapter 16.

3.3.3. Historical considerations of colonialism

Another topic that arose during the SCR pertained to the consideration of historical colonialism in how the literature sourced for the report was written and researched. Amina Idris suggested that it is worth considering more deeply the period within which the literature was written. She noted that:

> *"Several TVET approaches are age-long in SSA but not appropriately taken into account in post-colonial education thereby rendering a large part of the informal workforce of little substance. For instance, there is no way you can mention apprenticeship in SSA without referring to the establishment practises in various places up till today; the neglect of which is one of the challenges the educational system has in SSA."*

We had already made attempts to take the colonial history of much of SSA into account when writing the report. However, Idris' comments helpfully prompted additional discussion and served as a reminder to consider broader historical perspectives.

Our literature review had specifically been limited to the past 20 years. This effectively means that the publications were written in post-colonial times. On the one hand, this

makes those publications more likely to report on post-colonial education. On the other hand, the effects of colonialism did not end with countries' independence. We therefore do acknowledge that the recency of the literature we sourced does not negate the potential impact of colonial histories on the literature that we cite. However, the time periods under examination in the literature we considered mean that post-colonial ideas and approaches were at least uppermost in the literature we considered.

3.4. Further items

Clearly further items can be added, particularly beyond the period covered by the report. There are a number of further items that were recommended in discussions (⇕Chelagat, et al., 2018; ⇕Kintu, 2019; ⇕Kitainge, 2009; ⇕Wanyeki, et al., 2018; ⇕Wang, 2009) as well as additional items being published beyond our search period (⇕Abdelkarim, 2019; ⇕Bonzet & Frick, 2019; ⇕Joseph & Leyaro, 2019; ⇕Zinn, et al., 2019).

3.4. Appendix bibliography

This bibliography can be accessed from the ⬆entry for this document in our evidence library.

Abdelkarim, A. (2019). TVET in Sudan: government negligence, employers' response and challenges of reform under cluttered socio-economic conditions. *INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF TRAINING RESEARCH*. https://doi.org/10.1080/14480220.2019.1690 737 (⬆record)

Bonzet, R., & Frick, B. L. (2019). Gender Transformation Experiences among Women Leaders in the Western Cape TVET Sector: A Narrative Response. *EDUCATION AS CHANGE*. https://doi.org/10.25159/1947-9417/3521 (⬆record)

Chelagat, A., Kitainge, K., & Were, G. (2018). School Policies as a Determinant for Selection of Home Science Subject: The Belvedere of the Kenyan Secondary School. *African Journal of Education,Science and Technology*, *4*(2). http://www.ajest.info/index.php/ajest/article/view/10 (⬆record)

Joseph, C., & Leyaro, V. (2019). *Gender differential effects of technical and vocational training: Empirical evidence for Tanzania* (Working Paper No. 19/04). CREDIT Research Paper. https://www.econstor.eu/handle/10419/210855 (⬆record)

Kelemba, J. K. (2010). *Case study for integrating education for sustainable development in model youth polytechnics in Kenya*. https://www.skillsforemployment.org/edmsp1/groups/skills/documents/skpcontent/mwdf/mdaz/~edisp/fm11g_003013.pdf (⬆record)

Kimaiyo, L. C., Kitainge, K. M., & Too, J. (2016). Influence of Trainee Teacher Philosophy about Teaching and Learning on Integration of Computer Technology into Future Teaching Practices. *American Journal of Applied Psychology*, *4*. (⬆record)

Kintu, D. (2019). An Exploration of Strategies for Facilitating Graduates' Transition to the World of Work: A Case of Technical, Vocational Education and Training Graduates in Uganda. *International Journal of Vocational Education and Training Research*, *5*(1). https://doi.org/10/ggjxxv (⬆record)

Kitainge, K. M. (Ed.). (2009). Challenges of Training Motor Vehicle Mechanics for Changing World Contexts and Emergent Working Conditions: Cases of Kenya and Australia. In *Handbook of Research on E-Learning Applications for Career and Technical Education: Technologies for Vocational Training*. IGI Global. https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1-60566-739-3 (⬆record)

Maina, R., & Kitainge, K. (2018). Improving Home Economics Education: A Review of Factors Militating Inclusion of Home Economics Studies in Kenyan Secondary Schools. *Arts and Social Sciences Journal*, *09*(02). https://doi.org/10/ggjxxt (⬆record)

Mwinzi, D. C., & Kelemba, J. K. (2010). Access to and Retention of Early School Leavers in Basic Technical Education in Kenya. *The Burden of Educational Exclusion*, 241–256. https://doi.org/10/ggjxxs (⇡record)

Simiyu, J. W., & Sambu, L. (2014). The Role of General Public in the Development of Technical and Vocational Education in Primary Schools in Eldoret Municipality, Kenya. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, *4*(1). https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/The-Role-of-General-Public-in-the-Development-of-in-Simiyu-Sambu/0315238763d72aa57634a059744f80fff44d938f (⇡record)

Simiyu, J., & Sambu, L. (2012). Nature and type of government and NGO interventions in curbing unemployment and underemployment of urban youth in Kenya. *Journal of Emerging Trends in Educational Research and Policy Studies*, *3*(5), 730–736. https://journals.co.za/content/sl_jeteraps/3/5/EJC127683 (⇡record)

Tiony, A., Ferej, A., & Kitainge, K. (2016). *Factors Influencing The Adoption Of Flexible Teaching Approaches In Technical Training Institutions In Kenya*. Pan-Commonwealth Forum 8 (PCF8), 2016. http://oasis.col.org/handle/11599/2620 (⇡record)

Wang, V. X. (Ed.). (2009). *Handbook of Research on E-Learning Applications for Career and Technical Education: Technologies for Vocational Training*. IGI Global. https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1-60566-739-3 (⇡record)

Wanyeki, P., Kitainge, K., & Ferej, A. (2018). Can the Kenyan Jua Kali Mechanic be Trusted in Servicing the New Technology Rich Vehicles? | African Journal of Education,-Science and Technology. *African Journal of Education,Science and Technology*, *3*(4). http://ajest.info/index.php/ajest/article/view/83 (⇡record)

Zinn, B., Raisch, K., & Reimann, J. (2019). Analysing training needs of TVET teachers in South Africa. An empirical study. *International Journal for Research in Vocational Education and Training*. https://doi.org/10.13152/IJRVET.6.2.4 (⇡record)