

formation as to sources and later works which makes the book an unusually significant one for our history.

W. J. MCGLOTHLIN.

Primitive Christianity and Its Non-Jewish Sources. By Carl Clemen, Ph.D., D.D., Professor in the University of Bonn. Translated by R. G. Nisbet, Lecturer in Latin in the University of Glasgow. Chas. Scribner's Sons, New York. 1912. 430 pages.

It was time that a serious effort should have been made to test the large claims made by some that Christianity in its extra-Jewish ideas is mere heathen philosophy and mysticism from the "Mystery Religions." On the flimsiest pretexts the whole structure of Christianity has been torn down as of no more value than Gnosticism and Mithraism. The conflict of Paul with incipient Gnosticism is manifest in Colossians, Ephesians, and the Pastoral Epistles. It appears also in the Gospel and Epistles of John. Clemen does not admit the genuineness of Ephesians and II. Timothy. It is still a disputed question whether Paul was personally acquainted with Mithraism and was influenced by it in his view of baptism and the Lord's Supper. It has not yet been shown to be true, but it is clear that Paul did not live in seclusion. He knew Gnosticism, Stoicism, Epicurianism, and possibly Mithraism, and combated them all.

Clemen's book is one of very great importance and value.

A. T. ROBERTSON.

Bible Reading in the Early Church. By Adolph Harnack; translated by J. R. Wilkinson, M.A. Putnam's, N. Y. 1912. 159 pages. Price \$1.50.

Harnack's authorship is sufficient guarantee of the thoroughness and value of this little work. No important material bearing on the subject has been overlooked or neglected. The work deals with the private reading of the Scriptures in the homes by the laity and women rather than the public reading by the clergy in the church services, which has often been treated. For American and English readers a long introductory disquisition on the controversy between Lessing, Goeze and Walch might have been omitted without loss to the value of the book.