

Review

Source: *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*, Vol. 15, No. 350 (Apr. 1, 1872), p. 445

Published by: [Musical Times Publications Ltd.](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3355356>

Accessed: 13-03-2015 10:13 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at
<http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Musical Times Publications Ltd. is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

a musician. We should only take exception to the chord of C major being followed by the chord of B major, between the 6th and 7th bars of the song, the effect of the similar motion in the accompaniment being to us somewhat unpleasant; but it is a small fault in a very pretty song.

O trill again, sweet Nightingale. Words by Walter Egerton. Music by W. F. Taylor.

We like Mr. Taylor's melody better than his harmony. When songs are sent for review composers must bear to hear facts; and one which we should impress upon the author of this song is that when the melody falls from C to F (as it does between the 11th and 12th bars) the bass must not be F, B7. Other inaccuracies may be pointed out—such as the doubling of the leading-note in the 6th bar of the symphony between the verses—but enough has been said unless we overstep those limits of kindly criticism within which we desire to remain.

WEEKES AND CO.

Songs for Children. Words written by Rev. Charles Kingsley, George Macdonald, Adelaide Procter, and Rev. Dr. Neale. The music composed by William Boyd.

BOTH words and music in this collection are as simple as juvenile songs should be; and we are glad to find that the authors of the verses have not thought it necessary to manufacture pathos by writing about "tiny graves" and "empty cradles," after the pattern set in the majority of "moral" books for the young. We cannot understand why the names of those who have contributed the words are only placed before some of the songs, especially as many which are anonymous are amongst the best in the book. The melodies are all pleasing; and the accompaniments throughout are those which small hands can readily grasp.

Lovely Flowers. Song. The words by G. Washington Moon, Esq., F.R.S.L. The music composed by Horton C. Allison.

MR. ALLISON has wedded an appropriate melody to some verses far above the average of most of the modern "words for music." The effect of the four crotchets in a bar, moving almost throughout with the voice is somewhat heavy; but as the song is evidently carefully written in every part, it is obvious that the composer does not agree with us. With this passing expression, therefore, of the impression produced upon ourselves, we commend "Lovely Flowers" as a fair specimen of unpretentious vocal music.

LAMBORN COCK AND CO.

There's nae luck about the house. Morceau de Concert, pour Piano; par Arthur O'Leary.

A showy and effective concert-piece which will well repay the trouble of the practice it inevitably demands. The passages require agile fingers and a perfect command of the instrument; but they lie well under the hand, and present no eccentric difficulties which are likely to deter good pianists from attempting to master them. In the second variation, the rapid arpeggios played with the right hand, whilst the melody is carried on with the left, have an excellent effect; and although all the embroidery used in this and other portions of the piece have been common property for many years, the materials are handled with an artistic feeling which cannot fail to recommend the composition both to performers and listeners.

The Cuckoo. Chamber Trio. Words by Felix Mansfield. Composed by Dr. Ferdinand Hiller.

THIS Trio, written for three equal voices, is a highly favourable example of Dr. Hiller's refined vocal compositions. Although simple in structure, it is thoroughly artistic in treatment, the passages of imitation giving a vitality to the part-writing which cannot fail to make it interesting to a mixed audience. The vexed question of the Cuckoo's song has been decided by Dr. Hiller in favour of a minor third. Why will this tiresome bird continue thus to cause a diversity of opinion amongst musical composers?

My Heart and Lute. Song. Words by Thomas Moore. *My dearest, thou hast bound me.* Song. The English version by Miss J. E. Lewin.

Composed by Halfdan Kjerulf.

THERE is a decided character about both these songs (by a composer who is new to us) which should attract vocalists who are weary of the conventional melodies and harmonies of the day. There is a considerable difficulty in throwing off all recollection of a tune which we have for many years connected with words; and perhaps the reception of "My

heart and lute" may not be so cordial on this account as the worth of the setting before us should entitle it to; but the expression of the words is so exceedingly good (a remarkable fact, considering that the composer is evidently a foreigner), the melody is so purely vocal, and the accompaniments are so musician-like throughout, that it is fairly entitled to an impartial examination of its merits by all who are really seeking for good music. The second song, "My dearest, thou hast bound me," we like even better than the first one. The principal theme is extremely melodious, and the conversational bits between the voice and pianoforte evince an artistic feeling which cannot but make us look forward with interest to future works by so accomplished a writer.

Original Correspondence.

TO THE EDITOR OF THE MUSICAL TIMES.

SIR,—I must apologise for having allowed a number of your journal to have been published without answering Mr. Archer's strictures on the "additional final bar" theory of Chant-form. On reading his letter I was very much disappointed to find that, after demolishing the theory broached in my article to his own satisfaction, all he had to suggest in its place, was the adoption of a system suggested by me but discarded at once. He says, Why not add a bar at the beginning? and, that such an addition will practically carry out Dr. Elvey's system. But as a matter of fact, the addition of a bar at the commencement of a chant, so far from "practically carrying out" Dr. Elvey's system, practically destroys it, as the preface to his Psalter will prove. The sentence from the "Elijah," which I gave in my article as being analogous to the form of a chant, *if the second reciting note belongs to the first half*, Mr. Archer gives with the accents placed where he considers they occur in a chant, and as the effect is absurd, believes he has proved me wrong, or in other words, because *his* conclusion cannot logically be deduced from *my* premises I am wrong. Reasoning in such form as this, is playful but not edifying.

Again, Mr. Archer converts a fragment of Mendelssohn into a jumble (or as he calls it "a curious plagiarism"! What does he mean?) and then kindly says he has done it on my principles. I think I may safely relieve Mr. Archer from the self-imposed duty of attempting to enunciate or illustrate my principles.

Mr. Archer defines a phrase as "an incomplete idea," but I find the following in Dr. Marx: "A melody which is constituted *into a whole*, by having a determined beginning and end, is called a Phrase." Upon weighing Mr. Archer and Dr. Marx as rival authorities, I am inclined to adopt the definition of Bernhard Marx, and shall continue to use the word *phrase* as I have hitherto done.

Allow me also to say that the word *arsis* is just as intelligible if written in italics as in Greek letters, especially as Mr. Archer ignores the Greek accents, and that the word *desis* is altogether unintelligible to me as a musical term. This word can only signify a *bind*, a musical sign unknown to the Greeks. If Mr. Archer intended *thesis* by *desis*, he should have written to you, and have pointed out the misprint in your last number. It surely does not take him a month to distinguish between δ and θ . But the word occurs twice in his letter in the form *desis* (without accents). I do not see how he could intend *thesis*, because, as every tyro at music knows, *arsis* signifies accent; *thesis*, non-accent; and yet Mr. Archer speaks more than once of the strong-marked *desis* (?) or accent which he believes falls on the reciting-note.

I consider it my duty to apologise to your readers for here stating that there is no *cross-rhythm* in the scherzo of the choral symphony. The case is simply this—when the theme is of four bars in length, thus:



it is said to be in "Ritmo di quattro battute." But when it is used with one bar lopped off, making it of three bars, thus:



it is said to be in "Ritmo di tre battute."

The former is practically in compound common time, the latter, in compound triple; the former consisting of four