

WILEY



Mr. Carruther's Maps of Mongolia and Dzungaria

Author(s): W. W. Obrucheff and Douglas Carruthers

Source: *The Geographical Journal*, Vol. 43, No. 6 (Jun., 1914), pp. 708-709

Published by: geographicalj

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/1779175>

Accessed: 24-06-2016 02:22 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at
<http://about.jstor.org/terms>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Wiley, The Royal Geographical Society (with the Institute of British Geographers) are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to The Geographical Journal

of the erroneous and widespread conception that the Earth is in a period of refrigeration, desiccation and decay; and establishes the conclusion that it is in the spring-time of a new climatic control during which the areas fitted for man's uses are being extended and the moss of polar wastes will be replaced by rye and wheat.

MARSDEN MANSON.

Mr. Carruther's Maps of Mongolia and Dzungaria.

I have lately found in vol. 41, No. 4 (April, 1913), of the *Geographical Journal* the article "Notes on the Maps illustrating the Exploration in Mongola and Dzungaria," by Mr. Douglas W. Carruthers. Speaking of the great map added to Prof. Sapoznikoff's book, 'The Mongolian Altai,' he says about the part of the map relating to the Syansk range, "I found great difficulty in working in the new map of Kemchik with the old Russian survey of 1887, and in joining up the headwaters of this river and its tributaries with the mapping of them as shown by Prof. Sapoznikoff in his volume 'The Mongolian Altai,' published in 1912. There may be large errors here which will be shown up by more detailed work in the future" (p. 348).

I must make some remarks, because I compiled this map and shared in the exploration of Mongolia by Prof. Sapoznikoff in 1908 and 1909. This part of the map was compiled on (1) my own route surveys, (2) the map of the 'Southern Frontier Regions of Asiatic Russia,' (3) P. N. Krilloff's map, and (4) the map added to W. A. Oshurkoff's book, 'An Account of a Journey in the Summer 1902 to the West Syansk and west part of the chain Tannu-ola' (Records of Krasnyarsk's sub-section of the East Siberian Section of the Imperial Russian Geographical Society, vol. 1, sect. 1, St. Petersburg, 1909). This book is unknown to Mr. Carruthers, as one can see in the "Bibliography" of his 'Unknown Mongolia,' pp. 635-639. In fact, Mr. Oshurkoff was in 1902 at the sources of Kemchik, Alash, Aksuk, and of others, and compiled his map on the basis of his surveys and of the map compiled by the Academician Shwarz. He remarks on pp. 28-72, "I thought this map was the best for that country, and better than the 'Old Russian Survey,' which was (and is) full of errors." This book was not mentioned by Mr. Sapoznikoff in his work because he did not know of its existence, and was not very much interested himself in the materials of which I had compiled the great map.

Mr. Carruthers has made use of some of my surveys, but others he has completely altered, though these, my own surveys, related to countries which he has not visited. "There may be large errors here," and Mr. Carruthers by his careless dealings with another person's maps has without doubt enlarged their number.

W. W. OBRUCHEFF.

11th April, 1914.

Moscow, Arbat, Kaloshin per. 4, lodg. 18.

I do not know why Prof. Obrucheff implies that my words "there may be large errors here," viz. in the Kemchik section of my map of the upper Yenisei basin, referred to *his* work. On the contrary, it was really a confession on my part that my work of compiling a general map of that region was full of difficulty and consequently imperfect. If Prof. Sapoznikoff did not know of the existence of the book and map quoted by Prof. Obrucheff, there is some excuse for my omission of them in the Bibliography at the end of my volumes.

Geography—necessarily international—would be aided by the publication of Russian achievements, instead of being hindered by the secrecy which usually surrounds their work. Does Prof. Obrucheff know of the map I refer to as “a new map of the Kemchik, which I came by in Siberia”? If he does, he will realize why I had considerable difficulty in making Sapoznikoff's representation of the upper portions of the Kemchik valley (which Prof. Obrucheff owns to being responsible for) work in with it.

It remains to be proved whether I have “completely altered” any of Prof. Obrucheff's surveys, except where, placing reliance on my own surveys, I naturally used them in preference to his.

DOUGLAS CARRUTHERS.

MEETINGS OF THE ROYAL GEOGRAPHICAL SOCIETY, SESSION 1913-1914.

Thirteenth Meeting, April 27, 1914.—Colonel Sir THOMAS H. HOLDICH,
K.C.M.G., K.C.I.E., C.B., Vice-President, in the Chair.

ELECTIONS.—*Captain Basil Bell Bathurst (late The Sherwood Foresters and Derby Regt.); Charles Victor Buchan; Francis Cornwall Crawford; Captain A. W. Dix, R.N.R.; Ernest Hynes Ferris; Sydney H. Hollamby; J. Castell Hopkins; Hugh T. Ker, M.Inst.C.E.; John Hubert Roberts; John Henry Stanford; Mrs. Gustav Sachs; The Rev. Canon Thornton.*

The paper read was:—

“The Land of the Ibibios (Southern Nigeria).” By P. Amaury Talbot.

Fourteenth Meeting, May 11, 1914.—DOUGLAS W. FRESHFIELD, Esq.,
Vice-President, in the Chair.

ELECTIONS.—*Reginald H. Blake; Walter Bonn; Bertram Brotherton; Lieut. Gerald Burrard, R.F.A.; John T. Cooldige, jun.; Martin Walter Craig; G. L. Findlay, M.D.; Hubert Earle Girdlestone; Miss Dora Keen; William Ferdinand Kirton; Gustav Kohn; Deodoro Moegle; Captain George Frederick Thomas Oakes (Royal Engineers); Christopher Ogle, M.A.; J. H. Orpen; Captain B. H. S. Romilly (Scots Guards); Captain Charles Stuart Wilkie.*

The paper read was:—

“The Conditions and Prospects of the Panama Canal.” By D. Vaughan Cornish.

Afternoon Meeting, May 21, 1914.—Colonel Sir DUNCAN A. JOHNSTON,
K.C.M.G., C.B., in the Chair.

The paper read was:—

“The Gulf Stream.” By Commander Campbell Hepworth, C.B.