

Harvard Theological Review

<http://journals.cambridge.org/HTR>

Additional services for *Harvard Theological Review*:

Email alerts: [Click here](#)

Subscriptions: [Click here](#)

Commercial reprints: [Click here](#)

Terms of use : [Click here](#)



A History of the Church in Scotland. Vol. I. **Alex. R. MacEwen, D.D. Hodder & Stoughton. Pp. xviii, 487. \ \$3.00.**

John T. McNeill

Harvard Theological Review / Volume 9 / Issue 02 / April 1916, pp 229 - 230
DOI: 10.1017/S0017816000004491, Published online: 03 November 2011

Link to this article: http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract_S0017816000004491

How to cite this article:

John T. McNeill (1916). Harvard Theological Review, 9, pp 229-230
doi:10.1017/S0017816000004491

Request Permissions : [Click here](#)

A HISTORY OF THE CHURCH IN SCOTLAND. Vol. I. ALEX. R. MAC-
EWEN, D.D. Hodder & Stoughton. Pp. xviii, 487. \$3.00.

In this book the modern reader will welcome the first adequate account of the history of the Scottish Church before the Reformation. Dr. MacEwen's work comes more than half a century after that of his nearest predecessors writing in English. Cunningham's *Church History of Scotland* first appeared in 1859, and Grub's *Ecclesiastical History of Scotland* was published in 1861. Besides a slightly revised edition of Cunningham, the only important treatise since produced is Bellesheim's *Geschichte der Katholischen Kirche in Schottland* (1883), an accurate and exhaustive work from the Catholic point of view, which has been viciously translated in the interests of Catholicism by Father Hunter Blair. But while general treatises have been lacking, a large amount of research work has been done in various departments of the general subject, and the data thus accumulated form a not inconsiderable sum. In the period of the Celtic Church, for example, our author is able to speak with far greater assurance than was possible to the historian of half a century ago. It is time for a synthesis of the ascertained facts about the Celtic Church as a whole. This has been attempted by Zimmer (*Realencyclopädie*, Vol. 10); but owing to the obsession of this writer's mind with a fine-spun and highly improbable theory of the "Patrick-Legend," his essay is an unsafe guide. The Celtic Church of Ireland has been ably treated by G. F. Stokes and others, and that of Wales exhaustively by Hugh Williams (*Early Christianity in Britain*, 1912). Dr. MacEwen's discussion of the Celtic period in the Scottish Church leaves little to be desired; but his emphasis on the national character of that Church rather obscures the common elements of, and the reciprocal relations between, the British and the Scoto-Irish Christianity of the period.

The author keeps his readers constantly aware of the trend of events in the history of the Catholic Church. While the distinctive features of Celtic monasticism are set forth with minute attention to detail, not many students will fully concur in the generalization that "detachment from normal Church activities was a characteristic of early Latin and Greek monachism, whereas identification with the whole life of the Church was an essential of the monachism of the Scots." It was during the very period to which this statement refers (the Second Period of the *Catalogue of Irish Saints*, i.e., about 534-572) that the Irish Church produced such detached monastics as Columbanus and Brendan the Voyager. The main thesis developed here is that, at the particular stage at which the Church of Ireland branched into Scotland, "all the clergy

were monks," and that as a result the Scottish Church throughout the Celtic period was characterized by a purely monastic ministry. This view is consistently upheld in an interesting chapter on the period of the Culdees. Dr. MacEwen ably controverts Skene's theory of the foreign origin of the Culdees from the Rule of Chrodegang, Bishop of Metz, and argues that they were simply "the monastic clergy who were the only ministers of the *Ecclesia Scoticana*." The question "Were the Culdees celibate?" is replied to in a brief note, the answer given being an uncertain negative: "It is probable that they were allowed to marry with restrictions." No doubt the author here takes us as far as the historical materials warrant. But it would be interesting to know how he conceives of the transition from the strictly celibate monachism of the Church of Columba to this vastly different system. The transition is the more difficult to imagine in view of the fact that the tendency of Catholic Christianity was in the opposite direction.

For the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries Dr. MacEwen has availed himself of the recently published *Calendar of Papal Registers*, and from this source an interesting, though unfavorable, light is cast on the pre-Reformation Church in Scotland. There is evidence of a large measure of papal interference, particularly in appointments to church offices. Italian and French candidates frequently obtained remunerative charges, and these were usually held in absence. The country was despoiled by the exactions of selfish prelates, who gave no attention to the cure of souls.

Dr. MacEwen is a true Scot and a true Presbyterian. He has recently been elected to the Moderatorship of the General Assembly of the United Free Church. But his book bears few if any traces of his church allegiance; none, I believe, of national prejudice. Perhaps some will suspect him of partisanship in a few paragraphs, *e.g.*, in his remarks on the latter part of the career of St. Cuthbert; but such objections would be likely to be taken by some readers to any possible treatment of so difficult a subject as the history of the Scottish Church. The main impression made by the work is that of mature and able scholarship, faithful research, and clear judgment; and we may safely assume that these qualities will place it in a position of authority for some time to come. The footnotes refer the reader to a multitude and variety of authors and sources. It is to be hoped that in another edition the author will repent of his refusal to append a bibliographical list. More serious is the absence of an index, but we look for this with the second volume.

JOHN T. McNEILL.