

REPORT OF ARCHÆOLOGICAL SURVEY WORK IN THE NORTH-WEST FRONTIER PROVINCE AND BALUCHISTAN for the period from January 2nd, 1904, to March 31st, 1905. By M. A. STEIN, Ph.D., Inspector-General of Education and Archæological Surveyor, North-West Frontier Province and Baluchistan. (Peshawar: Government Press, 1905. Sold by the Agents for the sale of Government publications.)

Dr. Stein, who is now on his way to seek fresh triumphs as an explorer of the sand-buried cities of Khotan, held for a year and a quarter the combined offices of Inspector-General of Education and Archæological Surveyor for the newly-formed North-West Frontier Province and Baluchistan. This anomalous arrangement will not continue. We are pleased to learn from a recent Gazette that the Indian Government has decided to maintain the Archæological Survey as a permanent institution, and has readjusted the jurisdictions of the Surveyors, who will be known henceforth as Superintendents. Notwithstanding the anomalous nature of his position and the practical difficulties involved in combining antiquarian research with the administrative business of the head of the Education Department, Dr. Stein, animated by his habitual energy, managed to overcome all obstacles and to effect notable work on his archæological side, which is adequately reported and illustrated in the publication which lies before us. The hurried scamper through parts of Baluchistan, described in the concluding pages, did not produce results of much value, although it sufficed to show that the country offers a good field for detailed archæological research. The Government of India still clings to the delusion that in a few years more all interesting sites will have been explored, and that the archæological department will then be free to devote its energies solely to the work of conservation and repair. It is really comical to see how the expression of this belief crops up from time to time in official resolutions, but facts

will prove too strong for Simla theories. Baluchistan still offers virgin ground, although the department need not go so far afield to find ample scope and verge enough for research. As yet the Panjāb and Rājputāna hardly have been touched, and there is not a province in the Indian Empire in which there is not room for practically unlimited enquiry. Dr. Stein, luckily, was not hampered by 'mosque-mending,' and was able to devote the short time at his disposal to original research.

He performed a useful service in collecting at Peshāwar for deposit in the new museum there a collection of about 250 sculptures of the Gandhāra school. It is satisfactory to learn that he is fully satisfied with the correctness of certain current identifications important for understanding the ancient geography of the north-western frontier. He declares (p. 5) that "General Cunningham's identification of Hiuen Tsang's *Fa-la-na* with the territory of which Bannū was the natural and political centre must appear convincing to any student who is familiar with the actual geography of this part of the North-West Frontier," and that *Ho-si-na* "has been identified with certainty as the present Ghazni." On the next page he shows that the territory called *Ki-kiang-na* by Hiuen Tsang (Watters, ii, 262; Beal, ii, 282), and known to Arab writers as *Kīkan*, must correspond roughly with Wazīristān. Dr. Stein gives an interesting account, illustrated by good photographs, of the ruins at Ādhi-Samūdh near Kohāt, Akra, seven miles S.S.W. from Bannū, and Kāfirkoṭ on the Kurram river.

The position of the Mansehra copy in the Kharoṣṭhi script of the rock-edicts of Asoka is puzzling at first, because the immediate surroundings could never have been occupied by habitations, and no important commercial or military route passes near. But the apparent puzzle is explained by the fact that the inscribed rock commands the passage to a popular place of pilgrimage now known as the 'Tīrtha of Brērī' (Sanskrit *Bhaṭṭārikā*), so that the emperor's commands were well placed to secure the attention of numerous readers (p. 17). The copies of the edicts at

Junāgarh (Girnār) in Kāthiāwār and at Rūpnāth in the Central Provinces similarly were located on pilgrim routes.

The most important part of Dr. Stein's work was his exploration of the Mahāban mountain on the Indus, about seventy miles E.N.E. from Peshāwar. When the *Early History of India* was published in November, 1904, the evidence then available seemed sufficient to warrant amply the conclusion that Mahāban must be the long-sought Aornos of Alexander; and, if the late General Abbott's account had been thoroughly trustworthy, that conclusion was inevitable. But Dr. Stein's personal investigations prove that Abbott was misinformed on important points, and that the topography of Mahāban cannot be made to agree with that of Aornos, as described by the Greek and Roman historians. The identification therefore must be given up, and the problem can be solved only in one of two ways, either by holding that the historians were romancing, or that the true site lies higher up the Indus. Dr. Stein inclines to the former alternative (p. 31), and is disposed to push back the formation of the 'Alexander legend' to the contemporary writers. But this solution does not commend itself to me, and I believe that, when opportunity offers, a mountain, agreeing in most respects with the Greek descriptions, will be found higher up the river, and not very far from Mahāban. When the identity of Aornos and Mahāban seemed to be demonstrated, I was always conscious of a difficulty in understanding the statement of Curtius that the army, when leaving Aornos, did not reach Hephaistion's encampment on the Indus at Ohind until the "sixteenth encampment" (*E. Hist.*, p. 52). That statement requires some forcing to make it agree with the Mahāban site, but if the true site is an appreciable distance higher up the river, there is no difficulty in understanding it. I cannot believe that the companions of Alexander, from whom Arrian drew his information, were mere liars, and invented the whole celebrated story of the siege. It is important to note that Dr. Stein (p. 47) is prepared to admit as "highly probable" the identification of Asgrām with the Asigramma of Ptolemy. The geographer

places Embolima, the dépôt below Aornos, in long. 124° , lat. 31° , and Asigramma in long. 123° , lat. $29^{\circ} 30'$. If, then, the equation $\text{Asgrām} = \text{Asigramma}$ be admitted, although reliance cannot be placed on the exactness of the latitude and longitude, it is clear that Embolima was believed to be about a degree and a half farther north than Asigramma, and that Aornos cannot have been far from Embolima (Deane, *J.R.A.S.*, 1896, p. 674). My impression, therefore, is that, although the summit known as Mahāban is not Aornos, the true site will yet be found on another summit close to the Indus, and not many miles distant.

I have not left myself space to discuss in detail Dr. Stein's interesting attempt to fix the site of the famous *stūpa* supposed to commemorate the offering by Buddha of his body to the tiger. Everybody now is agreed that Cunningham was mistaken in supposing Mānikyāla to be the place, and Dr. Stein shows strong, if not absolutely conclusive, reason for believing that the buildings on Mount Banj, a spur of Mahāban, represent the scene of the 'body-offering,' as pointed out to Hiuen Tsang. The guides of Fa-hien, the earlier pilgrim (ch. xi of his *Travels*), located the famous legend at another place, only two marches to the east of Taxila. Dr. Stein (p. 45) claims no more than "great probability" for his own identification, and so much may be conceded, although it involves an awkward correction of a bearing given by the pilgrim from 'south-east' to 'north-east' (p. 41), and such 'corrections' always arouse suspicion.

VINCENT A. SMITH.

A VOCABULARY OF THE TROMOWA DIALECT OF TIBETAN
SPOKEN IN THE CHUMBI VALLEY. Compiled by E. H. C.
WALSH. (Calcutta, 1905.)

The Tromowa dialect of Tibetan is that used in the Chumbi Valley, which, while it is Tibetan in the main features of grammar and vocabulary, is affected in both