

The Classical Review

<http://journals.cambridge.org/CAR>

Additional services for *The Classical Review*:

Email alerts: [Click here](#)

Subscriptions: [Click here](#)

Commercial reprints: [Click here](#)

Terms of use : [Click here](#)



The Cyropaedeia of Xenophon, Books VI. VII. VIII. With Notes by the Rev. Hubert A. Holden, M.A., LL.D. Edited for the Syndies of the University Press. Cambridge: at the University Press. 1890.

Edward G. Coy

The Classical Review / Volume 5 / Issue 10 / December 1891, pp 478 - 478

DOI: 10.1017/S0009840X00179715, Published online: 27 October 2009

Link to this article: http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract_S0009840X00179715

How to cite this article:

Edward G. Coy (1891). The Classical Review, 5, pp 478-478 doi:10.1017/S0009840X00179715

Request Permissions : [Click here](#)

which is helpful. The editor has been generally conservative as to the text, and has only altered when it was positively necessary, following for the most part the excellent text of W. Gilbert in the Teubner series. There are no critical notes indicating what changes he has made. I may notice that the mistake made by myself in a former article in the spelling of Dr. Hartman's name, and properly corrected by Dr. Holden, is also perpetrated both by Gilbert and Dr. Marshall.

E. S. SHUCKBURGH.

The Cyropaedia of Xenophon, Books VI. VII. VIII. With Notes by the Rev. HUBERT A. HOLDEN, M.A., LL.D. Edited for the Syndics of the University Press. Cambridge: at the University Press. 1890.

HOLDEN'S edition of the *Cyropaedia*, of which Books I.—II. were published in 1887 and Books III.—V. in 1888, is completed with the volume before us. The second instalment of the work was noticed in a former number of the *Classical Review* (Vol. iii. p. 403), and was received with hearty welcome and commendation; the concluding volume shows the same excellences that distinguish the other two. The Preface of the work reminded us that no complete edition of the *Cyropaedia* with English notes had appeared for more than thirty years; indeed the excellent, though antiquated, American edition of Dr. Owen was issued so long ago as 1846. Such long-continued neglect of what has been pronounced 'the most elegant production of Xenophon's genius' seems very strange; the more so, when one considers the 'needless frequency' with which more or less completely annotated editions of the 'Anabasis' of Xenophon have appeared within the same length of time.

The noticeable features of Holden's *Cyropaedia* are:—

(1) An approved text. Though Arnold Hug (Teubner 1883) has been the editor's chief dependence in this matter, the principal readings peculiar to both Dindorf and Sauppe have also been given in the critical Appendix.¹ Great care seems to have been exercised in the redaction also, and the student will often find that difficulties which are met in reading from other texts disappear in the judicious punctuation of Holden's edition. While, of course, the work may not be absolutely free from errors² or misprints, it is characterized by remarkable typographical accuracy and beauty.

(2) Explanation and illustration have been lavishly furnished; in accordance with a belief that unless a great deal be done in the editing of Greek authors, as well as in the method of instruction in the language, to facilitate the reading of Greek, 'the unconditioned use of "cribs" must deprive the study of Greek of its long-heralded value as a means of mental discipline.' The successive portions of the Greek text have been provided with indented titles, as it were; while at appropriate intervals in the notes admirable summaries of the subject-matter of the text involved precede the commentary on the same. Dr. Holden has anticipated that there may be those who will criticize unfavourably this feature of his work; and we are ourselves of the opinion that, so far as these summaries are concerned, he too

often robs the reader of the pleasurable satisfaction of discovering the sense of the original for himself.

The notes are, however, models of their kind. Besides elucidating obscure and difficult passages in the Greek, they offer the student examples of felicitous rendering into English which are in the highest degree worthy of his appreciation and imitation. The handling of Greek particles is especially skilful and noteworthy.

(3) The value of the commentary has been greatly enhanced by 'heavy contributions' from Duncker, Rawlinson and Mure; thus both the Greek itself and the subject-matter thereof have been illuminated with side-light from historical studies.

(4) This last volume, like those which preceded it, ends with two copious and elaborate indexes, the one embracing points of grammar, proper names, etc., the other a lexical index. The grammatical references of the entire work are to the grammars of Goodwin and Hadley—those most commonly used in the Schools and Colleges of England as well as of the United States.

Though Dr. Holden has issued his edition of the *Cyropaedia* in three sections, each section may be used independently. In fact, the writer can assure his fellow-teachers, on the basis of his own experience, that they will find Books VII.—VIII. an exceedingly enjoyable and serviceable relief from the dreary intellectual barrenness of Xenophon's 'Anabasis.'

EDWARD G. COY.

Phillips Academy, Mass.

Xenophon's Anabasis, Book IV. Edited for the use of Schools, by the Rev. E. D. STONE, M.A. Macmillan & Co. (Elementary Classics.)

MR. STONE has expanded a book of extracts from the fourth book of the *Anabasis* into an edition of the whole book. There is a serviceable map, an excellent vocabulary, and an appendix on the syntax of final and consecutive clauses, indirect statement and questions, and other rules, with some information as to the use of *εἰ*, *ὅτι*, *μή*, *δέ* and the like, the use of the prepositions, and a list of irregular verbs—altogether amounting to a short but clear syntax with examples from Xenophon. The notes are brief but give the sort of help boys want, of which no one is a better or more instructed judge than Mr. Stone. 'The Fourth book,' as he says, 'contains a greater variety of interesting matter than any of the others; it has also a dramatic unity,' and this is certainly a very useful edition of it for young boys. Perhaps some analysis with the text would have been acceptable.

E. S. SHUCKBURGH.

Xenophon's Hellenica, Book I. With Analysis, and Notes. By the Rev. LAUNCELOT D. DOWDALL. Cambridge, Deighton, Bell & Co. 1890.

THIS is a companion volume to the edition of the *Hellenica* Book II. already published by the same Editor. The 'Commentary' is mainly intended to meet the difficulties encountered by the junior student, though I trust the mature scholar may also find them (*sic*) helpful. The notes are full of illustrative matter, philological, historical, and geographical, and no difficulty appears to be passed over. It is a question, however, whether the junior student, for whom these notes are mainly intended, will not find them rather too concentrated, and filled with references to authorities about whom he knows nothing. What, for instance, is the junior student to make out of this note (VI. 1); 'Πύρα (MS. Πίσιος, Steph. Πιτύου; but cf. I. 1, 29; II. 1, 10; Ages. 8, 3 Καλλία), cf. II. 3, 10; the chronological data seem interpolated; cf. 2, 1; II. 1, 10; Breit. Einl. 42 (n.); Brückner de

¹ The more correct spelling *θηήσσω*, *μυμήσσω* is adopted in books VI.—VIII. for the traditional *θηήσσω*, etc., of books I.—VI.

² In the note on VII. v. 31 the oratio recta of *οὗς λαμβάνουσιν* is given as *εἰ τις ληφθήσεται* instead of *οὗς ἂν λαμβάνητε*.