

Irish Church Quarterly

Democracy and Christian Doctrine: An Essay in Reinterpretation by W. H. Carnegie

Review by: W. N. Harvey

The Irish Church Quarterly, Vol. 9, No. 34 (Apr., 1916), pp. 162-164

Published by: [Irish Church Quarterly](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/30026453>

Accessed: 12/06/2014 16:23

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at

<http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Irish Church Quarterly is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Irish Church Quarterly*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

Western Text of the N.T. to represent these readings as Western. Here are a few of the most interesting: the numbers correspond to those interpolated by us in the above citation from Mr. Buchanan's Preface.

1. St. Mark xii. 37, "David therefore himself calleth him *God*; and how is He then his Son?"
St. John x. 24, "How long dost Thou keep us in suspense? If Thou art *God*, tell us plainly."
2. St. Luke xv. 30, "But as soon as *this son of the devil* came, who hath devoured thy living," etc.
St. John xii. 19, "Behold all the world is gone after *one that hath the devil*."
4. St. Mark i. 4, "John did baptize in the wilderness, and preach repentance for the remission of sins."
St. John iii. 5, "Except a man be born of the Spirit, he cannot enter into the kingdom of God."
5. St. Luke iv. 32, "And they were astonished at the teaching of the Holy Spirit, for the word of the Lord Jesus was powerful."
6. St. John xx. 23, "Whosoever sins ye remit, it is the Holy Spirit That shall remit them; and whosesoever sins ye retain, it is the Holy Spirit That shall retain them."

This MS. does not seem to present any example of the supposed Western characteristic which we have numbered 3.

It is to be noted that none of the above extraordinary or absurd readings has any support from any other MS. or Version.

One cannot but recognize with thankfulness the reverent and devout spirit in which Mr. Buchanan does his work; but one cannot but regret it when reverence becomes wrong-headed, and raises a prejudice against a sacred cause. The reverence that welcomes such readings as those numbered 1 and 5, is the reverence of Dogberry: "Write down that they hope they serve God; and write God first; for God defend but God should go before such villains."

N. J. D. WHITE.

DEMOCRACY AND CHRISTIAN DOCTRINE: An Essay in Reinterpretation. By W. H. Carnegie, M.A., Canon of Westminster, and Rector of St. Margaret's, Westminster. (Macmillan.) 4s. 6d. net.

There are few more marked signs of the times than the desire of the Christian clergyman to get into sympathetic touch with spheres and aspects of life which the clergy of twenty or thirty years ago were apt to regard as indifferent if not as profane. To our fathers a clergyman was not as such interested in the amusements of his parishioners, nor in their economic circumstances except very indirectly. They would have been shocked to learn that a modern London curate has had sparring contests

with members of the fancy, which contests the wandering sheep who did not value his regular ministrations were invited to attend. But in our time we cannot but observe a growing tendency towards the type of clergyman who in the well worn quotation "is a man and therefore thinks nothing human alien from him."

Canon Carnegie's book is a very good illustration of the strength and the weakness of this new conception. His preface—full as it is of current politics—we must freely confess irritates us a little. The Canon does not love Protestantism, and at present German Protestantism is deservedly under a moral cloud in England. But when we are told that the scandalous manifesto signed by the German Theologians is an instance of the fact that Protestantism naturally leads to a failure of Christian ethics, we feel that the Canon is almost on the same mental level with those members of the British Israelite Society who have pointed out that three British warships were lost almost immediately after the Government's diplomatic negotiations with the Pope. Why should Canon Carnegie speak of "the proved incapacity of the German form of Protestantism to withstand a movement subversive of the fundamental ethical position of the Christian Religion"? Scandalous as the manifesto was it is almost exactly paralleled by the attitude of the Roman Church towards Louis Napoleon's infamous coup d'état. In fact all history shows that the institutional form of Christianity—Romanism—has been far more liable than the individualistic forms to be elastic in its treatment of organized evil. Nor are we better pleased with the Canon's appeal to conciliate the leaders of modern democracy. It is quite true that there is a Socialistic aspect in the Gospels, that the democratic temper and the Christian temper are fundamentally one; but a good deal of the gregarious greediness which marks the speeches of some modern labour leaders is utterly foreign to the Christian spirit as we know it in the New Testament. Whatever else the New Testament teaches it seems on the surface to teach carelessness about material comfort, and the Canon hardly recognizes this. The more purely theological parts of the book are less open to question. In fact we have only one fault to find—Canon Carnegie raises an expectation of originality which we do not find fulfilled. The opening chapters of the book lead us to expect some "restatement" which will bring Christian dogma into more living touch with modern science or with the working class needs. Interesting as his chapters on the Trinity and on the Resurrection are we do not find anything which fulfils any promise of this kind. They are frank, simple, and with a note of personal conviction and personal experience which we venture to predict will make the work more appreciated by the individual

istic evangelicals, whom the author seems to despise, than by the democratic working man for whose spirit it professedly caters.

W. N. HARVEY.

PARISH REGISTER SOCIETY OF DUBLIN. Vol. XII. Marriage entries from the Registers of the Parishes of S. Marie, S. Luke, S. Catherine, and S. Werburgh (1627-1800).

In this volume the Society has continued the plan of only giving marriage entries from the registers. Those of St. Mary and St. Luke date from the formation of those parishes, with reference to which events interesting notices will be found on pages 3 and 53. Those of St. Catherine are continued from Vol. V. In the earlier entries of St. Werburgh's (from a volume in T.C.D. Library) occurs the notice of the marriage of Henry Jones, Bishop of Clogher. The volume is carefully edited and well indexed.

ST. J. D. SEYMOUR.

MARY BIRD IN PERSIA. By Clara C. Rice. (C.M.S.) 3s. 6d.
CHURCH MISSIONARY HOUSE. By Irene H. Barnes.
(C.M.S.) 1s. WHEN GOD CAME. (C.M.S.) 6d.
THE WAY OF THE GOOD PHYSICIAN. By Henry T.
Hodgkin. (C.M.S.) 1s. net. PIONEERS OF HEALING.
By C. E. Padwick. (C.M.S.) 4d. net. CONVERTS
THROUGH MEDICAL WORK. By S. W. W. Witty.
(C.M.S.) 6d. net.

Mrs. Rice's account of Miss Mary Bird is extremely interesting. Miss Bird was a woman of a striking character, with a great power of winning confidence and affection. She worked faithfully and with a large measure of success in the Kingdom of Persia, which to-day is being brought more than ever to our notice. Mrs. Rice is to be congratulated on giving such an admirable record of a noble and inspiring life. The book is beautifully turned out, and deserves to have many readers.

Miss Barnes, in describing the C.M.S. House in Salisbury square, contrives at the same time to give many details of the extent and scope of the mission work of the Society.

The Rev. Cyril Bardsley, in a short preface, recommends the three lectures which are included in *When God Came*. They deal with the Franciscan movement, the Spiritual movement in Germany in the 14th Century, and the Evangelical movement