

# THE Musical Times

ESTABLISHED IN 1844

---

Fair and False. Song by B. S. Montgomery; J. L. Hatton

*The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*, Vol. 16, No. 370 (Dec. 1, 1873), pp. 325-326

Published by: [Musical Times Publications Ltd.](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3354446>

Accessed: 06/01/2015 10:41

---

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at  
<http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



*Musical Times Publications Ltd.* is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

of 5ths, if not worse. True it is that no ancient canon exists against consecutive 4ths; but this is easily accountable. When those old highly respectable laws were enacted against the succession of 5ths and 8ths, the fourth from the bass was only admitted as a discord needing preparation; under this dispensation, it was of course impossible that two following 4ths could occur, and it would have been wanton therefore to legislate against them. Now that the 4th is employed as the inversion of the 5th, and thus proved to be available as a concord, the possibility has arisen of writing two in succession, but the desirability has not come therewith; on the contrary, the bad effect must be obvious to anyone who listens dispassionately to the progression—anyone, that is, but the composer, who can never be dispassionate about his own productions, and who, in many cases, thinks a passage over and over again which he has written, until his sense may be numbed to an impropriety that he would perceive in the music of another. One more subject calls for remark in these tunes, which evidently is not easy of comprehension, and all the more requires to be carefully considered by those who write. This is the division of the bars, which should be so arranged that a rhythmical period close on the strong accent of the first note; whereas, in several of these tunes—all, for instance, set to verses with eight syllables in each line—the close is deferred to the third of the bar, and the strong accent thrown thus upon the antepenultimate syllable. It should be no justification of this error, that elder and best reputed musicians have strayed in the same direction; there must be a right and a wrong; it behoves all artists to aim at their discrimination, and every independent thinker will write rather according to precept than example, according to conviction of propriety rather than to precedent of its infraction. The G sharp, taken by leap over a chord of A, in the third bar from the end of No. 10, "Bread of the world," (Eucharistica) is, we presume, an engraver's error for A; every writer of merit deserves the benefit of such a doubt as this, when an inexplicable harmony appears in his music. That too great prominence may not be given to these theoretical strictures, let us repeat that there is great merit in the "Original Hymn Tunes," and that if folks must have novelty in this most extensive class of music, they are fortunate in the musician who can supply specimens by the three dozen, and give interest to each. The tunes were written for the choir of Trinity Church, Weston-super-Mare, of which church and choir the author is organist.

*Jesu pastor bone* (Offertorium, or for Benediction); Duet for Soprano and Tenor. By Rosario Aspa.

THIS sacred duet has a smooth and tranquil subject well adapted to the words, and is moreover so carefully and appropriately harmonised as to justify us in recommending it to the attention of vocalists desirous of increasing their store of modern religious music. We scarcely like the scale passages at the conclusion on the word "Jesu," especially as they are not in character with the preceding portion of the composition; but singers, perhaps, will hardly agree with us, the high-A flat being a climax too effective to be objected to.

*The morning stars sang together.* Anthem for Christmas, composed by John Stainer, Mus. Doc., M.A.

It is at once difficult and unnecessary to enter upon a lengthy criticism of a work after it has already gained the suffrages of many. But the appearance of a new and cheap edition of Dr. Stainer's anthem would seem to afford an excuse for addressing a few words to those who are as yet unacquainted with it, and especially to such as complain of the scarcity of anthems for Christmas and other Church Festivals. After an examination of this work the principal impression left by it is that of a thorough embodiment of the joys of Christmas—bright, jubilant and heart-stirring. In the first movement the choirs appear to emulate each other in recounting in antiphonal strains how "all the sons of God shouted for joy," and unite in setting forth the great central fact of Christmas teaching, viz., the Incarnation of our Blessed Lord. Such, broadly, is the first movement. The second, a quintet, "Rejoice ye with Jeru-

salem," is to some extent in admirable contrast with it and may be fairly characterised as one of the most effective specimens of smooth vocal writing to be found in any modern anthem. An episode in this movement, "I will extend peace to her like a river," should not pass without particular mention, as it adds considerably to the charm of this graceful movement. The chorus which follows is founded upon the subject of the first movement, but with some difference of treatment—the reminiscence being by no means unwelcome. A commendable instance of careful thought is shown in a repetition in the concluding bars of the phrase embodying the doctrine of the Incarnation, as though with a view to keep the fact well in the minds of the hearers that to them was born, as on that day, "A Saviour which is Christ the Lord." It is possible that technically this anthem is not altogether equal to some of Dr. Stainer's subsequent compositions, for there are not wanting indications of its having been a comparatively early work. But whatever constructional shortcomings there may be, they are more than counterbalanced by the spontaneity and freshness which have been largely instrumental in earning for it its present popularity. In short, Dr. Stainer may fairly be credited with having in this anthem produced a work which though it is essentially modern, yet embodies the best traditions of the old school; and while it is not too difficult for average church choirs, is not unworthy of the best efforts of our cathedral singers.

*Arise! for the day is passing.* Song. Words by Adelaide Procter. Music by Roland Rogers.

THIS song is a proof how difficult it is to be simple. Mr. Rogers has written a remarkably quiet melody, but has twisted his *arpeggio* accompaniment about (especially in the symphony) so as to render it really awkward to play. Then the somewhat unsatisfactory change from D to F major and back again gives a patchiness to the composition which cannot be overlooked, supposing that crudities are to be pointed out rather than passed over in reviews. If the composer will accept of counsel really well meant, we should recommend him to study attentively the works of the standard authors before he again attempts to write himself.

*I waited patiently for the Lord.* Sacred Song. Words from Psalm xl., verses 1, 2, 3 and 11. Composed by Miles Bennett.

THERE is a vagueness of design in this song which will detract much from its effect. It commences with a flowing theme, carefully harmonised; but the Recitative which succeeds it, ending upon the chord of D major, and followed by two bars stopping upon the dominant seventh in B flat, is to us particularly displeasing. The best part of the composition is the phrase to the words, "Withhold not Thou Thy tender mercies," which is appropriate and eloquent; but the accompaniments are generally restless, and will somewhat distress the singer. We must protest, too, against the musical treatment of the line, "And He hath put a new song," the accents in which should certainly not be upon the words which we have placed in italics.

*Fair and False.* Song. Written by B. S. Montgomery. Music by J. L. Hatton.

IN spite of the many songs especially written to suit the requirements of vocalists who do not aspire to do more than sing a pure melody with feeling, there can be no question that a really good English ballad is a rare composition. The sickly, sentimental phrases usually set to morbid lines, expressing either suffering or death, have nothing in common with the flowing melodies constantly written by Bishop, Horn, and many others we could mention, who, had they lived at a time when songs, instead of being dragged into comedies, farces and melodramas, were kept for their true place in English Opera, might have founded a style which could not fail to develop into a school of which we might now be proud. Mr. Hatton, however, in our own day, is one who has fully earned a right to take his place amongst the best of our native song writers, for not only has he proved in his innumerable compositions that he has the rare gift of melody, but he is such an accomplished musician that an artistic skill

is always apparent in the treatment of his vocal works which ensures for them as cordial a welcome from the educated as from the uneducated listener. To say nothing of his part-songs, which have now a world-wide celebrity, the many solos he has written are thoroughly English and never fail, if tolerably well sung, to receive, as such, a general and hearty recognition. The ballad which has given rise to these remarks may be warmly commended to all who are searching for such a composition as we have described. The poetry, re-published from *Once a Week*, is faithfully reflected in the music; and the accompaniments throughout lend an additional colour to, without disturbing, the melody. A modulation from A flat to D flat gives a depth of expression to the final phrase of the song which, although only one of its many beauties, we cannot refrain from mentioning.

*Day Dreams.*

An Indian Lullaby.

Composed for the Pianoforte by George B. Allen.

THE construction of the first of these pieces proves that Mr. Allen's "Dreams" run in the conventional groove. A brief Introduction leads to a somewhat commonplace theme, the *arpeggio* ornaments to which are first ascending, then descending, and finally running an octave above those at the commencement, the subject on its third appearance being played in octaves, and the passage marked "Grandioso." Surely it is time that some newer pattern than this for "Drawing-room music" should be sought for. The "Indian Lullaby" has a characteristic melody, and there is some novelty in the treatment of the piece. We like very much the effect of the three-bar rhythm in the principal phrase, and can commend the care and attention which has evidently been bestowed in preserving the feeling of the subject when surrounded by embellishments. This little sketch is the best we have seen signed by a composer whose name is somewhat more familiar to us through his vocal than his instrumental works.

*Long ago.* Musical Sketch, for the Pianoforte, by Virginia Gabriel.

AN unassuming little sketch, which may be recommended to young players who desire to cultivate the art of singing with the fingers. The theme is attractive, but extremely simple, and the piece contains sufficient modulation to prevent monotony. Nothing is attempted in the way of ornaments, a merit which lovers of pure music will at least be thankful for.

DUFF AND STEWART.

*Le Rêve d'Arcadie* (Scene à la Watteau); Morceau de Salon, pour Piano, par Frederic Archer.

CONSIDERING that even the dedication of this piece ("A son Ami, T. Riseley, Esq.") is in French, it appears a pity that this language should not have been preserved throughout the title-page. The words, "London: Duff and Stewart, 147, Oxford Street," and "Ent. Sta. Hall," quite vulgarise it, and we fear may prevent the circulation of the composition in the "salons" for which it is intended: this should be looked to, should it reach a second edition. Musically speaking, we have much praise for this little sketch. The leading subject, in D major, is extremely melodious and graceful; and the second theme, in the subdominant, with an effective pedal bass, is perhaps even more attractive. The passages, although well written, are not difficult, and the pastoral character of the piece, apart from its tunefulness, will be certain to ensure for it a cordial welcome.

*A little Cloud.* Song, for Contralto or Bass. Words by F. E. Weatherley, B.A. Music by Ciro Pinsuti.

THE success of Signor Pinsuti's song, "The Raft," has no doubt incited him to turn his attention more to the setting of dramatic subjects; and the composition before us, although not affording him much scope for the exercise of his ability in that direction, evidences the possession of a power which should not be frittered away upon the commonplace songs of the day. Mr. Weatherley has here provided the composer with some verses admirably suited for music, and in their illustration every advantage has been

taken of the varied character of the poetry. The change from the placid subject in C major to the tonic minor, and the return to the major, with the agitated demisemiquaver accompaniment, is in excellent sympathy with the words, the alteration of rhythm from triple to duple, also materially aiding the effect. To contraltos or basses in search of good music we conscientiously recommend this song as one of the best of its kind.

*The dreamy land of flowers.* Song. Words by Charles Hall. Music by King Hall.

WITH every allowance for the "dreamy" character of the poetry of this song, we presume that the words mean something; and yet we have in vain attempted to understand the line, "Breath spells by radiant night." Few amateur vocalists, however, as a rule, let their audience know what language they are singing in; so that listeners to Mr. Hall's song will probably not be puzzled as we are, but will have their attention directed to the music, which is really very good. The composer has written a vocal and melodious theme, and accompanied it like an artist, the modulations being especially well written and effective.

*Sweetheart.* Song. Written by J. Levey. Composed by W. F. Glover.

WE have no fault to find either with the melody or accompaniments of this song: it is easy to sing and easy to play; but as effusions of this character keep better music from our drawing-rooms, we can scarcely recommend it. Moreover, we cannot but wonder by whom these songs are interpreted: if by male singers, such maudlin love-verses as those before us would scarcely, we think, advance the intellectual appreciation of a youth out of his "teens," and if by ladies, they cannot but become positive nonsense.

AUGENER AND CO.

"In the beginning was the word." Sacred Cantata by Leo Kerbusch, Mus. Doc.

A WORK, this, of some pretension, and of at least equal fulfilment. It is a setting of the first fourteen verses of St. John's Gospel, for solo voices, chorus, and orchestra, the orchestral parts being arranged for the pianoforte, and the arrangement having indications of the chief features of the instrumentation; and it will occupy about half an hour in performance. It is dedicated to Sir R. P. Stewart, in his official capacity of Musical Professor in Dublin University, and it bears tokens of having been written as an exercise for the Doctor's degree—but this last is an assumption. It is printed with the Lutheran as well as the English version of the text; and there seems reason to guess that the music was originally written to the former. The first piece is a Chorus, in which are some simple and effective imitations. A bass solo with Chorus, "In Him was light," is a piece of steady writing, modelled more or less on some of the Mass music by South German writers of from fifty to a hundred years ago. No. 3 comprises a Recitative for tenor, "There was a man sent from God," leading into an Air for the same voice, "He was not that light," which, being in the key of G minor, is continued as a Chorus when the key changes to major at the words "That was the true light," the plaintive expression of the beginning is agreeably relieved by the comparative brightness of the close, and the whole piece has considerable interest. The most attractive number is that which next follows, "He was in the world," a Duet for soprano and contralto, which is highly melodious and has some successful vocal combinations; it suffers somewhat from being in the same measure—and that a conspicuous one,  $\frac{3}{4}$ —as the preceding movement, and from being also in very nearly the same tempo; admiring it as we must, we cannot pass without a protest its exceptional plan, which consists of a contralto solo in the key of B flat, then a soprano solo in the little analogous key of F minor, and lastly an *ensemble* in F major, closing thus a 5th higher than it opens. We admit the desirability of recurring to the opening strain, admit the impossibility of the higher voice singing it in the same key in which it has been given by the lower, and further admit the difficulty in design thus introduced; the ingenuity of the artist would have been shown in this