

The Classical Review

<http://journals.cambridge.org/CAR>

Additional services for *The Classical Review*:

Email alerts: [Click here](#)

Subscriptions: [Click here](#)

Commercial reprints: [Click here](#)

Terms of use : [Click here](#)



Note on Plato *Republic* 566E

Paul Shorey

The Classical Review / Volume 19 / Issue 09 / December 1905, pp 438 - 439

DOI: 10.1017/S0009840X00992485, Published online: 27 October 2009

Link to this article: http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract_S0009840X00992485

How to cite this article:

Paul Shorey (1905). Note on Plato *Republic* 566E. The Classical Review, 19, pp 438-439
doi:10.1017/S0009840X00992485

Request Permissions : [Click here](#)

Roscius' property 'which all abutted on the Tiber' is an exact number. When however we have eliminated all such cases and made due allowance for doubtful ones, enough are still left to justify Mr. Elmore's contention that thirteen is used both in Greek and Latin (for *terdeciens* in Juv. 14. 28 is, as he says, an undoubted example) for an indefinite number.

But is this all? Have we here a complete account of Aristophanes *Pax* 990? I am inclined to think not; and that to the Greek fancy there was something about this numerical concept that the epithet in my title expresses. The unlucky or sinister associations which we, or some of us, attach to *thirteen* seem traceable in the folk lore precept of Hesiod

μηδὸς δ' ἰσταμένου τρισκαδεκάτην ἀλέασθαι
σπέρματος ἄρξασθαι, φυτὰ δ' ἐνθρέψασθαι
ἀρίστη. *op.* 780 *sq.*¹

The majority of the passages cited by Mr. Elmore or myself, in which this number is either loosely used or may be mythical, deal with incidents hurtful or unpleasant to man; and the inference seems warranted that thirteen was a Greek expression for an indefinite number with a sinister tinge.

With ordinary indefinite numbers the employment of the numeral is symbolic. It means a number covered by the numerical

¹ The sixteenth is the exact reverse in both respects; *ib.* 782 *sq.* μάλ' ἀσύμφορός ἐστι φυτοῖσιν, ἀνδρογόνος δ' ἀγαθή.

group. When Homer uses 'ten' as the number of the tongues that he should have to do justice to his theme, he chooses a 'round' number, or more strictly a familiar group of units, to show that he wants 'ten, more or less' or that ten will do. But the use in 'thirteen' appears to have a different origin. The numeral does not stand for a familiar group nor does 'thirteen' in this sense mean 'thirteen, more or less.' But both its use and its nuances appear explicable if we analyse it as a group *and* a unit, 12 + 1, and suppose that by the addition of the unit the number seemed to the popular fancy to break out into a new series and escape by the opening of a door, as it were, into the indefinite. It would thus belong to the same type as the popular expression 'a year and a day.' It is also possible to analyse it as 10 + 3, the sum of two numbers each used indefinitely. To this double indefiniteness it would then owe its peculiar character.

The subject of indefinite numbers is a fascinating study, but one which tempts to hasty generalisation. As a warning against considering an instance out of its environment I will add a striking contrast in actual usage. A little girl I know when between two and three years of age was looking at a crowd of boys in their playground. 'Look!' she cried 'two boys, mamma!' But her mother's favourite expression for an indefinite number is *fifty million*.

J. P. POSTGATE.

NOTE ON PLATO *REPUBLIC* 566E.

Όταν δέ γε, οἶμαι, πρὸς τοὺς ξέω ἐχθροὺς τοῖς μὲν καταλλαγῆ, τοὺς δὲ καὶ διαφθεῖρη, καὶ ἡσυχία ἐκείνων γένηται, πρῶτον μὲν πολέμους τινὰς ἀεὶ κινεῖ, ἵν' ἐν χρεΐα ἡγεμόνος ὁ δῆμος ᾗ.

Simple as this passage appears, its true meaning has apparently been missed by all the interpreters whom I have consulted. Jowett translates: 'But when he has disposed of foreign enemies by conquest or treaty, and there is nothing to fear from them, then he is always stirring up some war or other,' etc.

Stallbaum writes: 'Ubi quod attinet ad externos hostes,' etc. Adam renders: 'In his relations to foreign enemies,' etc. But nothing has been said of any foreign

enemies (hostes, πολέμοι), and it is surely a lame and illogical sequence to say that after Peisistratus or Napoleon has disposed of all foreign wars he proceeds to stir up foreign wars. The meaning required is rather: 'After he has disposed of his own (political) enemies abroad (who have gone into exile) by agreements with some and actual (καί) destruction of others,' etc. And this meaning is given by the almost technical sense of ξέω which seems to have been overlooked in this connection. In Greek political parlance οἱ ξέω are the party in exile. Cf. Thucyd. 4.66 οἱ δὲ φίλοι τῶν ξέω, and 8.64 καὶ γὰρ καὶ φυγῆ αὐτῶν ξέω ἦν.

Similarly in Sophocles, Oedipus at Colonus 426, the expression οἷξεληλυθῶς exactly

corresponds to the *fuor usciti* of Florentine and Italian party strife. Now we are told in 566A that the tyrant himself is an exiled demagogue who has returned βία τῶν ἐχθρῶν. These ἐχθροί will naturally go into exile in turn with the wealthy μισόδημος who, Plato tells us, φεύγει, οὐδὲ μένει. It is this φυγή ἔξω to borrow the Thucydidean phrase, composed of his personal and political enemies against which the new tyrant first secures himself by bargaining with them or destroying them. Then he is ready πολέμους τινὰς ἀεὶ κινεῖν.

This interpretation, it may be observed, deprives of all basis Prof. Butcher's con-

jecture (Demosthenes, p. 68, n. 1) that this passage is imitated by Demosthenes in *Olynthiac* 2. 20. 21: 'So too with States and sovereigns; so long as they carry on war abroad, their defects escape the general eye; but once they come to grapple with a frontier war, everything is revealed.' The two passages have nothing in common except the word ἔξω, which in Demosthenes goes with the verb and denotes a war waged at a distance from the frontier (of Attica) as opposed to one on the frontier; but both are foreign.

PAUL SHOREY.

University of Chicago.

A MARVELLOUS POOL.

AMONG the wonders of the world, there is a tiny pool in Sicily near Gela which objects to being bathed in: Aristot. *Mirabil.* p. 38 Westermann 'according to Polycritus, λιμνίον τι ἔχον ἀσπίδος ὅσον τὸ περίμετρον . . . εἰς τοῦτ' ὄν ἐάν τις εἰσβῆ λούσασθαι χρεῖαν ἔχων, αὐξέσθαι εἰς εὖρος, and will continue widening enough to take 50 men: ἐπειδὴν δὲ τοῦτον τὸν ἀριθμὸν λάβῃ, ἐκ βάθους πάλιν ἀνοῖδου ἐκβάλλειν μετέωρα τὰ σώματα τῶν λουομένων ἔξω ἐπὶ τὸ ἔδαφος. . . .' Sotion *id.* p. 188 περὶ Γέλαν τῆς Σικελίας ἐστὶ λιμνη ἢ Σίλλα καλουμένη, ἐλαχίστη τὸ μέγεθος, ἥτις τοὺς ἐν αὐτῇ λουομένους εἰς τὸ ξηρὸν ἐκρίπτει ὡς ἀπ' ὀργάνου τινός, ὡς φησιν Ἀριστοτέλης. Tzetzes *Chil.* vii. 670 preserves verses on the same: καὶ Φιλοστέφανός φησιν ἕτερα μὲν μυρία | καὶ Σικελῆ γῆ ῥίπτουσαν λιμνην τοὺς λουομένους:

γαίῃ δ' ἐν Σικελῶν Τρινακρίδι χεῦμα λέλειπται
αἰνότατον, λίμνη, καὶ εἰ οὐκ ὀλίγη,
ἔχερον δίνης τῆσιν, ὁ πρὶν ποσὶ παυρὰ τινάξας
ἢ δ' ἰδίως ξηρὴν ἤλασεν ἐς ψάμαθον.

Westermann l.c. p. 180 and Cougny *Anthol.* p. 598 give this in Hermann's version of it:

χεῦμα δέδεικται
αἰνότατον, λίμνη καίπερ εὐοῦ' ὀλίγη,
ἰσχυρὸν δινῆσιν ὁ πρὶν ποσὶ παῦρα τινάξας,
αἰφνιδίως ξηρὴν σ' ἤλασεν ἐς ψάμαθον.

This is likely to be right in part at least, but the phrase ἰσχυρὸν δινῆσιν sounded odd and caused me to enquire into the readings. Kiessling p. 265 gives a woodcut to represent what he read as ἔχερον: it is accented oxytone, and the ending looks like χορὸν. I suggest that it was ἐχθρὸν, 'hostile to bathers': what would be the dative? δινητῆσιν does not occur, and could hardly bear the sense: but this would be even closer to the MS.

ΕΧΟΡΟΝΔΙΝΗΚΤΗΙΝ
ΕΧΟΡΟΝΑΙΝΗΚΤΗΙΝ

ἐχθρὸν ἀεὶ νήκτησιν 'ever hostile to swimmers.'

W. HEADLAM.

THE PERFECT SUBJUNCTIVE, OPTATIVE, AND IMPERATIVE IN GREEK.—A REPLY.

WHY Professor Harry of Cincinnati singled my *Greek Grammar* out for special criticism in the paper which he read at St. Louis last year,¹ and which, though I was present on the spot, I had not an oppor-

¹ Printed in the *Classical Review* of October.

tunity of hearing, I do not know. For if I have sinned, I have sinned in company with the whole tribe of Greek grammarians, according to his own showing. However I am grateful to him for calling attention to the omission of the word 'rare' over the