

# WILEY



---

## Journeys in the Chinese Shan States: Discussion

Author(s): W. J. L. Wharton, Lord Lamington, A. C. Yate and Warrington Smyth

Source: *The Geographical Journal*, Vol. 15, No. 5 (May, 1900), pp. 515-517

Published by: geographicalj

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/1774264>

Accessed: 25-06-2016 08:19 UTC

---

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at  
<http://about.jstor.org/terms>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).



*Wiley, The Royal Geographical Society (with the Institute of British Geographers) are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to The Geographical Journal*

have mentioned, we met with no trouble or sickness *en route*. The trip was an enjoyable one, and the results will most probably be on view to visitors to the Chinese Court of the Paris Exhibition, 1900.

---

Before the reading of the paper, Admiral Sir W. J. L. WHARTON (Vice-President) said: I will call upon Mr. Warrington Smyth to read the paper we are going to hear this evening. Mr. Carey is unfortunately not here, being still in China, and we are very much obliged to Mr. Smyth for reading his paper. Mr. Smyth has been in the southern parts of the Shan States, and will therefore be able to read the paper with sympathy. Mr. Carey is an officer in the Chinese Customs, stationed in the western part of Yunnan amongst the Shans; and the paper describes expeditions made from his centre at Semao to the westward, over the Mekong, and into British territory over the Burmese frontier.

After the reading of the paper, the following discussion took place:—

Lord LAMINGTON: I think I may safely say that the paper gives a very close and succinct description of the northern portion of the Shan States. Many of the scenes depicted remind me very forcibly of my own experiences when I once went through the southern portion of the Shan States. Of course the chief interest at that time was political, as to the possible destination of the states, to which of the great Powers they would belong, but that is not a point to be touched on here. From the density of the population, it is to be supposed that they are very fertile, and could be rendered more so under different conditions; the time is coming when we shall see some European power in control of that portion of Yunnan. Travel is certainly at times very trying, and I remember well, after the rains, how excessively difficult it was to surmount the continual hills that lie in the way; they become so greasy as to be impracticable, until the sun comes out strong enough to dry up this greasy mud. I also remember the instrument used to thrash out the paddy which was described in the paper; it is rather ingenious and very simple. The water falls into a hollow log, and as it empties, the pestle falls on to the grain, removing the husk. I have no other remarks to make on the paper. I am very glad to hear again of these regions, for I was able to spend a very happy portion of my life travelling there, and I think we all owe a debt of gratitude to Mr. Carey for his having compiled his experiences for our benefit.

Major A. C. YATE: In the autumn of 1887 I was serving in Burma, and was instructed to proceed to Mandalay, and report myself there to the Intelligence division. On arrival I was told I should either have to go to Bangkok and travel northwards to explore the country, or join one of two Shan expeditions about to annex the territory between the Mandalay and Salween rivers. Ultimately, I went with the northern Shan expedition under Major (now Colonel) Yates, R.A. The southern column was under Colonel Swetenham. We took, more or less, the route now followed by that railway to the Kunlon ferry on the Salween that many people think will end on the Yangtse Kiang. We crossed the great Gokteik defile, one of the most difficult points on the projected line, several hundred feet deep, and very difficult for engineers to negotiate. They have, however, negotiated it, and are now putting a bridge over it. Thence we went to Thibaw, where we were entertained by the well-known Tsawbwa. In his own territory he had been accustomed to regard the life of his subjects as of little importance. During a visit to Rangoon some twenty to thirty years ago, he had two or three of his men put to death, thereby bringing himself within the reach of British law. However, he received timely warning to clear out, which he did; and I

have understood that his gratitude to the British Government for not interfering with his prerogative is one reason for the friendly attitude which he has always adopted.

Some of the tribes through whose territory we marched gave us trouble, but as we had strict injunctions not to fight if we could avoid it—we had 150 men and two guns—we tried the pacific policy as far as possible, although at Theinni the Tsawbwa, who had approached the Chinese with a view to obtaining their aid in checking us, only sent in his submission when we were within a few miles of his chief town. From Theinni we went about 150 miles to the Kunlon ferry on the Salween. The road had fallen into complete disuse. The pictures which I have just seen on the screen reminded me of many things I saw and heard of there. As intelligence officer I had to find out what I could, and any one who has been amongst Shans will understand the difficulty of getting intelligence out of them. I made careful note of the Salwin suspension bridges, however, from their descriptions, and I now see that what they told me was correct.

Having reached Kunlon, we had done our duty, and having annexed from 10,000 to 15,000 square miles of territory, we returned to Mandalay. As we marched in, Sir George White came out to meet us. The British part of the escort consisted of fifty Munster Fusiliers, and never did men look fitter than they did, after their three months' hard work. That, very briefly, is how we annexed the territory between Burma and the Salween. It was done almost unnoticed.

Mr. WARINGTON SMYTH: I feel that one duty I have to do is to explain shortly the nature of these innumerable tribes. Mr. Carey, in his most interesting paper, mentions a great many names, which must have left you in a mixed condition as regards the tribes mentioned; for practical purposes there are two main divisions—the first the Ka, who call themselves Woni, such as the Akka people and several other very primitive tribes, who are practically the aborigines of the country; and, secondly, the Shans, who are called by the Chinese Pa I, and who call themselves Tai. They are found all over Indo-China from 7° to 28° N. lat., even to the headwaters of the Irrawaddy valley. Many of these have been described by Mr. McCarthy, the late General Woodthorpe, who is missed so much all round the Indian frontier, Mr. J. G. Scott, and other travellers who are mostly unfortunately unable to be present this evening, or we might have heard more of this, to my mind, most fascinating country.

Mr. Carey remarks on the extraordinary credulity of these people with regard to talismans. I obtained one once from the head of a monastery, a very valuable little piece of wood, which defends me from falling trees and sword-cuts. I tried to get one to protect me from motors and bicycles, but he was unable to supply the want. I will not detain you longer, but will give you on the Lao mouth-organ a short piece of music played by the Siamese Shans in the valley of the Me Kong.

Sir W. J. L. WHARTON: I am sure we shall all agree that, whatever else the Shans may not have done, they have obtained a certain proficiency in musical instruments. For savage instruments, the tune just played us by Mr. Warington Smyth had a most pleasant tone.

The paper we have just heard is a little difficult to follow with the maps we have here, because to look at the map you would think this a plain country, whereas it is a mountainous one, the mountains running down in long ridges parallel to the valleys. It is necessary to realize that what we have gone through is very mountainous country, interspersed with valleys and fertile areas of tea cultivation. It is an interesting country that created some stir a little time ago, when Major Yate told us it was doubtful where the boundary would be drawn, and it may still possibly come to the front some day. This will be a very valuable

record in the Society's *Journal*, as it contains very many points of interest; and I am sure the meeting will agree with me in communicating to Mr. Carey our obligations for his having written and sent this paper to us.

---

### COLONEL DURAND'S 'THE MAKING OF A FRONTIER.'\*

IN this book Colonel "Algy" Durand has given a most charming account of his stewardship as warden of the Gilgit frontier for about five years subsequent to the establishment of the Gilgit agency in March, 1889.

No stranger country exists in all Asia than this borderland of mingled magnificence and horror—a land of magnificent mountains seamed with unmeasured glaciers, overshadowing valleys as beautiful as any in Kashmir; valleys whose sweet loveliness warms the author to enthusiastic description, and which are well illustrated by some admirable photographs in the pages of his book. Colonel Durand traversed the country with the eye of an artist, no less than that of a soldier; and as he possesses the gift of an attractive style in writing and a power of vivid description, his book is interesting from beginning to end.

But his administrative duties demanded much more of him than devotion to the picturesque aspects of nature, or to the interests of sport, and his story of the ghastly nature of those political revolutions which occur periodically in the ungoverned wilderness which lies beyond the Gilgit border, is a revelation of the extraordinary mixture of bloodthirsty ferocity and inconsequent light heartedness which still animates the unredeemed portion of Asiatic humanity.

"Half monkey and half tiger" is Durand's estimate of Chitráli character. A Chitráli, or Kanjuti, chief will sell his own people into slavery; he will murder all his nearest relations with ruthless ferocity; he will face death (when he must) with dignity and pluck; and he will (at least the Chitráli will) charm a European visitor by his frank, cordial good nature, and his fascinating manners. The "monkey" is usually predominant; but no tiger that ever lived can equal his deliberate, murderous bloodthirstiness when he has accounts to square with his own familiar friends and family.

Opinions may possibly differ as to the practical political or military gain of such advanced positions as Chitrál, but there can be little doubt about the moral responsibility of a government that might extend its hand, and yet would leave such a country to stew in its own seething cauldron of misrule.

In 1888 there were already gathered together thousands of Kashmir

---

\* 'The Making of a Frontier.' By A. G. Durand. London: Murray. 1899.  
No. V.—MAY, 1900.]