

Review

Source: *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*, Vol. 15, No. 344 (Oct. 1, 1871), p. 244

Published by: [Musical Times Publications Ltd.](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3355194>

Accessed: 09-01-2016 02:48 UTC

---

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



*Musical Times Publications Ltd.* is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

given out at the commencement, which is well contrasted by a very original theme in the relative minor. The re-appearance of the first subject, after an episode in the Dominant, is highly effective, and the manner in which it asserts its right to be heard in what may be considered as the coda of the composition shows an inventive power which is too rare to be disregarded. We recommend "A Little Story" with the utmost confidence both to teachers and performers as one of the best specimens of thoughtful little pieces that we have seen for some time.

CRAMER, WOOD AND CO.

*Mendelssohn's First Concerto, in G minor, Op. 25.* Arranged for the Pianoforte by J. Rummel.

Our readers will know that we have always steadily advocated the arrangements of classical works for the Pianoforte, whatever instrument they have first been written for; and this we have done with the full conviction that although such translations can be of no service to artists who are acquainted with the originals, they will spread a love for the best compositions amongst many who, but for their being presented in this form, would scarcely perhaps even have heard of them. But recent experience has convinced us that amateurs must exercise extreme caution in selecting these transcriptions, for title-pages are not always to be relied upon. The piece before us, for instance, is said to be Mendelssohn's Concerto, in G minor, arranged for the Pianoforte, an announcement which certainly would not prepare any purchaser for the discovery that every movement is cut and hacked about at the mercy of the arranger, not only without any thought about the composer, but without very much as to how the shreds and patches hang together. The first and slow movements remind us of the novels occasionally to be found at sea-side libraries, where two or three pages have been torn out, and the reader is called upon to exercise his ingenuity in guessing the contents of the lost leaves. Mendelssohn lovers will of course throw aside such a piece as worthless, but it is because ignorant pupils under ignorant teachers are apt to be led astray by these arrangements, as they are termed, that, in the interest of true art, we feel bound to enter our protest against them.

ROBERT COCKS AND CO.

*The Minstrel's Song.* Composed for the Pianoforte by Brinley Richards.

This piece is scarcely "composed for the Pianoforte," seeing that the theme is that of a song called "The Harp of Wales," by the same composer. Those who know the readiness with which Mr. Richards can throw off graceful passages all lying well under the hands of a pianist who has been carefully trained, will readily believe that, apart from the melodiousness of the subject which forms the groundwork of this composition, the skill with which the leading idea is treated will be certain to make the piece attractive for drawing-room performance. It may be said, too, that the title, "The Minstrel's Song," fully justifies the frequent use of the arpeggios and scales which are woven in with the air.

*Gavotte and Rondo*, from Bach's sixth Violin Sonata. *Bourrée*, from Bach's fourth Sonata for the Violoncello.

Transcribed by W. S. Rockstro.

BACH's works must be in the ascendant in the present day, if we may judge by the number of pianoforte transcriptions of movements from his solos for stringed instruments which constantly come before us. If we are not mistaken, Miss Agnes Zimmermann had the honour of setting the fashion both of transcribing and playing these pieces; and a very good fashion it is; one moreover which will always do infinite credit both to the arranger and performer. The Gavotte from the sixth Violin Sonata has been recently noticed by us in a transcription by Mr. Berthold Tours, and we need only say that Mr. Rockstro has performed his task with much skill, rather perhaps

favouring the desire to simplify the passages so as to make them available for the majority of amateurs. The Bourrée from the Violoncello Sonata is a movement which needs no eulogy from us to recommend it. Pianists will find it good, sterling music; and as the arranger has carefully fingered the most important portions of the piece in both hands, much of the difficulty inherent to this class of composition will be smoothed for pupils who are feeling their way without a master.

*My Mother's Voice.* Song. Poetry by G. Bennett. *Not a Sparrow falleth.* Sacred Song. Written by W. S. Passmore.

Composed by Franz Abt.

THE title of the first of these songs will sufficiently show that it is of that domestic character the specimens of which scarcely require to be multiplied. The subject, however, is melodious and vocal, and some little variety of treatment in the harmonies—as, for instance, where the opening two bars of the theme, on their repetition, are taken into G minor, instead of remaining in F—lifts the composition above the mere ordinary ballads of the day. We like the sacred song better. The subject is full of feeling, and the harmonies are appropriate and carefully written throughout. After the "Poco più animato," a good effect is gained by the return to the original melody, with the arpeggio accompaniment, the left hand being crossed over the right for the chords on the half bar. An expressive singer may make this song highly attractive.

LEWIS AND WILLIAMS, CARDIFF.

*The Masonic Ritual.* Composed by Fred. P. Atkins, Mus. Bac., Oxon.

MR. ATKINS cannot surely have looked over his proofs, otherwise the number of errors of all kinds must have been seen. There are several mistakes which as they stand would seem to affect the author's claim to the possession of an University degree. Many are clearly printer's errors, but even these should be corrected.

MASTERS.

*Two Hymns*, from the Lyra Devoniensis. Set to music by Emily P. Sheppard.

WITH a little experience Miss Sheppard would write a very good hymn tune. Previously, however, it would be necessary for her to go through a course of Thorough Bass and Counterpoint, for although her ideas are admirable, she has not yet acquired the art of correctly expressing them on paper. Judging from the present specimens, however, the suggestion is worthy her consideration.

WEEKES AND CO.

*The Wreathed Garland.* Bolero for Pianoforte. By J. Parry Cole.

A PLEASING and well written Bolero, in D minor, but why called "The Wreathed Garland" we are at a loss to comprehend. The subject is characteristic, but national dances are fatally easy to write, and Boleros, Mazurkas, and Tarantellas are thrown off by hundreds of writers who would find it a hard task to compose a simple movement where symmetry, constructive power and development of subject must be united. Mr. Cole's Bolero may fairly claim a right to be heard; for it is at least as good as the majority of dance pieces written for the drawing-room.

*Why, Colin, dost thou linger.* Song. By Arthur Skey.

THE construction of this song shows an immaturity which is scarcely redeemed by either the theme or its accompaniments, both of which give proof of musical feeling. It commences with an eight-bar melody, which, after a short symphony, comes all over again. Then we have a sort of second part, in the Dominant, and this is followed by the first subject, slightly altered, which ends the composition, one monotonous accompaniment being continued throughout. The words, which relate to the