

# The Classical Review

<http://journals.cambridge.org/CAR>

Additional services for *The Classical Review*:

Email alerts: [Click here](#)

Subscriptions: [Click here](#)

Commercial reprints: [Click here](#)

Terms of use : [Click here](#)



---

**Two Books on Plato *Platan : sa philosophie : précédée d'un aperçu de sa vie et de ses écrits*, par Ch. Bénard, Ancien Professeur de Philosophie. (Paris : Alcan. 1892.) 10 frcs. *Platonstudien*, Dr. Ferdinand von Horn. (Wien : P. Tempsky. 1893.) 6 Mk.**

R. G. Bury

The Classical Review / Volume 8 / Issue 03 / March 1894, pp 119 - 120

DOI: 10.1017/S0009840X00187694, Published online: 27 October 2009

**Link to this article:** [http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract\\_S0009840X00187694](http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract_S0009840X00187694)

## How to cite this article:

R. G. Bury (1894). The Classical Review, 8, pp 119-120 doi:10.1017/S0009840X00187694

**Request Permissions :** [Click here](#)

The excellent introduction gives just what is necessary to put the reader into the right position for appreciating this, the greatest of Cicero's treatises, and not a little shrewd criticism. A few notes on special difficulties would have been welcome; but probably the

book is intended to be used not with a plain text, to which it would be an inadequate supplement, but along with some annotated edition.

A. S. WILKINS.

## TWO BOOKS ON PLATO.

*Platon : sa philosophie : précédée d'un aperçu de sa vie et de ses écrits*, par CH. BÉNARD, Ancien Professeur de Philosophie. (Paris : Alcan. 1892.) 10 frs.

*Platonstudien* von DR. FERDINAND HORN. (Wien : P. Tempsky. 1893.) 6 Mk.

M. BÉNARD has succeeded in producing an excellent book. His object is to give a comprehensive survey of the whole of Plato's philosophy, and thereby, as he states in his preface, to refute the opinion which is still only too prevalent in more countries than France that Plato's system is an enigma and Plato himself a Sphinx. Accordingly M. Bénard's attitude is on the whole conservative rather than critical, and the method of exposition he adopts synthetic. He treats the Platonic system under three heads, Dialectic, Physics, and Ethics, an arrangement, it will be seen, similar to Zeller's. But the book does not challenge comparison with Zeller's *Plato*—being intended, as the author is careful to explain, rather for the 'enlightened public' than for the professed student of philosophy. Consequently we miss in it the exhaustive fulness of detail which marks the great German authority, but we get in its place a lucidity and freshness of style and arrangement which will commend it to the attention of teachers and students of all classes.

But though the scope of his work precludes full discussion of vexed metaphysical questions, M. Bénard is careful to note the most important points at issue, and to indicate his opinion regarding them; and especially is he careful to point out where his more cautious judgment is unable to assent to the daring theories of M. Fouillée.

The main value of the book, however, will be found to lie rather in its treatment of the less knotty problems, where the method of the author is more adequate to the matter of discussion.

Dr. Horn's *Studies* have, as the name

implies, an entirely different aim. Instead of a comprehensive survey of the contents of the Platonic dialogues as a whole, and a synthesis of the results, we find here a series of separate essays on selected dialogues. These are arranged in three groups: the first contains the *Laches*, *Protagoras*, *Gorgias*; the second the *Lysis*, *Charmides*, *Euthydemus*; the third the *Phaedrus*, *Symposium*, *Phaedo*, with the *Meno* and *Philebus* as appendix. The argument of each of these dialogues is set forth in detail, followed by a general criticism of their philosophic contents and relations, in accordance with which, as the author explains, the grouping is determined. Hence the above order is not to be taken as necessarily identical with the historical order; on the contrary, the second group must as a whole precede the first in point of date.

The larger proportion of the book is naturally occupied with the *Phaedrus*, *Symposium*, and *Phaedo*, which Dr. Horn appears to think are to be placed in this order, since they express respectively the romanticism of philosophic youth, the maturity and power of middle age, and the other-worldliness of life's declining years. If this determination is meant to indicate a corresponding divergence in the dates of composition, the author must expect to find many dissentients from his opinion. But though such results must be regarded as at least very questionable, there is much valuable criticism in the discussions which precede.

The most interesting part of the book, however, in the eyes of many Platonic students will be the concluding fifty pages, which are devoted to a vigorous attack against the Platonic authorship of the *Philebus*.

Dr. Horn is evidently a critic of the most radical type, who outdoes even Schaarschmidt in his 'chorizontic' fervour. He finds in the *Philebus* quite a score of inconsis-

tencies with the doctrine of the *Gorgias* and *Republic*, whence he deduces the conclusion 'mit aller Bestimmtheit' that this dialogue is not merely not Plato's but actually a polemic against Platonism. But the major

premiss in this remarkable enthymeme is one, I imagine, that many Platonists will refuse to grant.

R. G. BURY.

#### GWATKIN'S EARLY CHRISTIAN WRITERS.

*Selections from Early Writers*, illustrative of Church History to the time of Constantine, by H. M. GWATKIN, M.A. Macmillan & Co. 1893. Pp. ix. 167: price 4s. net.

WITHIN the brief compass of 170 pages, Professor Gwatkin has produced a book which is likely to be most helpful to those who are commencing the study of sub-Apostolic literature, and desire to acquaint themselves with the actual words of the greatest of the Early Christian writers. Only those who have abundant leisure can afford the time to wade through Clark's *Ante-Nicene Fathers*, or the well-known *Library of Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers* published by Messrs. Parker; and still fewer have the time or knowledge to read these books in their original tongues. A vast deal of labour and trouble is spent by the learned in editing and re-editing *ad nauseam* the Greek and Latin 'classics'; it would be well if some of our scholars would set themselves to work, and produce, say, a worthy edition of the *Stromateis*, of Augustine's *City of God*, and of the whole of Tertullian, to say nothing of the works of the two Gregoryses. It is to be hoped that we are waking up to the fact that the works of the Alexandrine Fathers, at least, have been too long neglected; Prof. Armitage Robinson's recently-published text of Origen's *Philocalia*, with critical

apparatus is a great step in the right direction. It would surprise many modern writers, and even some professed students of philosophy, to find how many of the problems, intellectual and moral, which harass our age, were thought over and discussed, and (at least in some cases) solved by the great Alexandrian writers. They, of all the Early Fathers, have stated these questions, and put forward their solution to these problems, in terms of the modern consciousness. Prof. Gwatkin's book is thus most opportune. The selected passages number, in all, seventy-two; of these seventeen are from Eusebius, and twelve from Tertullian. I venture to think this selection disproportionately large. Why are not Clement of Alexandria, Justin, Irenaeus, and above all Origen, more fully represented? Opposite the Greek text there is an English translation,—a very great convenience to such as cannot read Greek with ease. Several of these translations are borrowed from the Clark *Library*, and other sources. Unfortunately everything in the way of notes has been omitted, which is rather trying for the solitary student, who needs help if he is adequately to take in the meaning of the extracts. If Prof. Gwatkin could see his way to produce a companion volume of notes and introductions, he would be conferring a further boon upon every one who is interested in Early Church History.

EDWARD HENRY BLAKENEY.

#### GUTSCHMID'S KLEINE SCHRIFTEN.

*Kleine Schriften* von ALFRED VON GUTSCHMID. Herausgegeben von FRANZ RÜHL. Vierter Band. Schriften zur griechischen Geschichte und Literatur. Leipzig: Teubner. 1893. 20 Mk.

THE editing of posthumous works is always an unsatisfactory task, and this book forms

no exception to the rule. It contains a series of dissertations on various subjects of which a few have been published before; but the greater part are now, for the first time, published from the author's lecture notes. The two longest are connected with the History of the Jews: we have a full analysis of the Sibylline Books, and