

The Classical Review

<http://journals.cambridge.org/CAR>

Additional services for *The Classical Review*:

Email alerts: [Click here](#)

Subscriptions: [Click here](#)

Commercial reprints: [Click here](#)

Terms of use : [Click here](#)



Murray on Parody and Paratragedia in Aristophanes
On Parody and Paratragedia in Aristophanes, with
especial Reference to his Scenes and Situations, by
Augustus T. Murray, PH. D. Based upon a Dissertation
presented to the Board of University Studies of the
Johns Hopkins University for the degree of Doctor of
Philosophy. Berlin, Mayer & Müller, 1891. 1 Mk. 50.

H. W. Hayley

The Classical Review / Volume 7 / Issue 1-2 / February 1893, pp 33 - 33
DOI: 10.1017/S0009840X0019674X, Published online: 27 October 2009

Link to this article: http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract_S0009840X0019674X

How to cite this article:

H. W. Hayley (1893). Review of S. M. Ervin-Tripp 'Language acquisition and communicative choice' The Classical Review, 7, pp 33-33 doi:10.1017/S0009840X0019674X

Request Permissions : [Click here](#)

chien aboie en Grèce *άβ άβ*, ou *βάβ, βάβ*, there is no knowing what a domestic animal will not do for the sake of patriotism, if properly trained. Though we may think the battle to have been long decided in favour of the 'partisans d'Erasmus'; still a review of the whole existing evidence, or the accumulation of fresh matter, cannot but be interesting, and more or less valuable. The pity of it is that a discussion between scholars should degenerate into vituperation. No good purpose is served by writing, 'le langage (*sic*) pompeux de Blass disant que la phalange des partisans d'Erasmus, toujours très nombreuse, s'est accrue au delà de toute mesure dans ces

derniers temps, ne nous déconcerte pas le moins du monde, parceque nous croyons à la force de la vérité, et l'histoire nous apprend par de magnifiques exemples, que l'erreur, quelle que soit son étendue et son empire, doit enfin céder à la vérité; nous vivons heureusement dans un siècle où toutes les erreurs nées et ayant fleuries dans le temps d'ignorance, disparaissent successivement devant la lumière de la vérité et de la science.' The large self-complacence of the above may well match any 'langage pompeux' of Dr. Blass: and would not Aristophanes have put it in the mouth of οὐπὶ τῆς κρεμάθρας ἀνὴρ?

W. W. MERRY.

MURRAY ON PARODY AND PARATRAGOEDIA IN ARISTOPHANES.

On Parody and Paratragedia in Aristophanes, with especial Reference to his Scenes and Situations, by AUGUSTUS T. MURRAY, PH. D. Based upon a Dissertation presented to the Board of University Studies of the Johns Hopkins University for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. Berlin, Mayer & Müller, 1891. 1 Mk. 50.

THE literature which treats of parody and paratragedia in Aristophanes is already an extensive one. After the careful work done by Täuber, Bakhuyzen, Lessing and others it would at first sight seem as though a new survey of the field were unnecessary. But a careful reading of Murray's Dissertation shows that this is by no means the case. After some very judicious introductory observations the author discusses successively 'Parodic Scenes and Motifs,' 'Scenic Paratragedia' and 'Verbal Parody and

Paratragedia.' His treatment of each of these subjects is clear and concise, and he calls attention to numerous parallelisms which have been neglected by previous workers in the same field. Especially worthy of notice is his discussion of the plot of the *Telephus* (pp. 8 ff.), and the use which he makes of a fragment of Ennius (*Tel. fr.* viii. Ribbeck) to prove that *Acharn.* 110 ff. is parodied from that play is extremely ingenious. Sometimes he appears to go too far, e.g. it may well be doubted whether *Thesm.* 1211 ff. is a parody on *Cycl.* 675 ff. (p. 27), though the resemblance in language and situation is certainly striking. But for the most part the work is sound and careful, and the Dissertation forms a useful supplement to the admirable treatise of Bakhuyzen.

H. W. HAYLEY.

Harvard University.

APELT'S PSEUDO-ARISTOTELIAN TREATISES.

(Continued from Vol. VI. page 446.)

191, 14. 980^a 9. εἰ μὲν οὖν οὐδὲν τὰς ἀποδείξεις λέγειν ἅπαντα. δεῖ (δεῖν Lps.) γὰρ τὰ φρονούμενα εἶναι καὶ τὸ μὴ ὄν, εἴπερ μὴ ἔστι, μηδὲ φρονεῖσθαι. εἰ δ' οὕτως οὐδὲν ἂν εἶναι ψεύδος οὐδεὶς φησιν οὐδ' εἰ ἐν τῷ πελάγει φαίη ἀμιλλᾶσθαι ἄρματα. πάντα γὰρ ταύτῃ (Apelet, ταῦτα Lps., ταῦτα cett.) εἴη. Foss conjectures NO. LVII. VOL. VII.

εἰ μὲν οὖν οὐδὲν, τὰς ἀποδείξεις λέγει <εἶναι ἄγνωστα> ἅπαντα. δεῖν γὰρ κ.τ.λ.

Apelet, εἰ ἵνα ἰ οὖν οὐδὲν τὰς ἀποδείξεις <λέγει ταύτας> εἰ δ' ἔστιν, ὅτι ἄγνωστόν ἐστι μετὰ ταῦτα τὰς ἀποδείξεις > λέγει. ἅπαντα δεῖν γὰρ κ.τ.λ.

Apelet seems to have at least recovered the sense of the original. εἶναι seems right, but