

Review

Source: *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*, Vol. 16, No. 361 (Mar. 1, 1873), p. 20

Published by: [Musical Times Publications Ltd.](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3352116>

Accessed: 23-03-2015 20:30 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at
<http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Musical Times Publications Ltd. is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

but this is not as certainly the case when the roots ascend by the same interval, and the progression is not rendered more natural by the retention of the bass through the changing harmonies. Somewhat of the same idea of harmonic relationship is here indicated that is shown in the treatment of the 7th above noticed, and to us the idea is not perspicuous. This work of fault-finding is thankless, and may well be discontinued, so far as single notes are concerned, giving the engraver credit for some inaccuracies, such as the G², bass, page 10, bar 9, which is a grave one. Mr. Rogers proves too keen a sense of harmonic beauty to be contented with his present experience, and as his knowledge expands, there can be no doubt that he will feel the impurity of such things as have been named, or if not, he will acquire as great a right to justify as we can have to object to them. Of more serious consequence is his deficiency in constructive power. We can trace no definite design in either piece, and we regret to observe some decided faults of plan; for instance, the anticipation of the key of F², so as to take all freshness from the phrase to the words "Show yourselves joyful," which it would have if it started newly in this tonic, after a preparatory half-close on its dominant. It is well, on the other hand, to connect the two pieces by the employment, in both of the same setting of the "Glory," a device which has many a precedent; and it is still better to appropriate the same musical idea to the rendering of "Let the people praise Thee" and to repeat this on the recurrence of the verse, since to praise is to give glory, and to identify the two expressions of the same thought is to enforce them both. The music is totally modern in character from first to last, counterpoint is not one of its elements, and imitation has no place in its part-writing; what then may be the reason for encumbering the whole with the antiquated notation of three minims in a bar in some portions, and four minims in a bar in others, the author may be able to explain, but we vainly strive to comprehend. As points for commendation, let us distinguish all the opening of the second Canticle, the beginning of the "Glory," the setting of the words "Shew yourselves," and still more the phrase to "Praise the Lord upon the harp." We recognize merit in the composer of this work, and shall be disappointed if he give not far stronger proof than is here shown of the power within him.

Guillaume Tell (William Tell); an Opera, in four Acts. Composed by Gioacchino Rossini. Edited by Berthold Tours, and translated into English by Natalia Macfarren.

WHATEVER may be the fate of Rossini's other Operas, there can be little doubt that "*Guillaume Tell*" will not only permanently retain the stage, but be accepted as a standard work of art for study and reference. The faults so observable in many of the other Operas of this composer have here no place; instead of frivolous and trifling airs, we have in "*Guillaume Tell*" earnest and noble thought throughout; and that "local colouring," which, with all its beauty of melody, we so sadly miss in "*La Donna del Lago*," is so charming a feature in this work, that as a tone-picture of Swiss life, although often imitated, it still stands unrivalled. In the excellent edition now before us, it is quite refreshing to have the French words (so identified with the airs) beneath the English translation; and in carefully going through the various pieces, we can conscientiously say that, as a musical rendering of the original text, we can scarcely imagine anything more absolutely perfect. We could cite many instances in proof of this, but may mention, as one example, the great trio for Arnold, Tell and Walter, in the second Act, the words of which burn with all the fervour of the French version. The careful editing of Mr Berthold Tours is an important feature in the edition; and the evidence of his study of, and reverence for, the score, is shown by the judicious and profuse indications of the instrumentation throughout; indeed, in this respect this is one of the most satisfactory works yet issued in this valuable series.

Die Spinnerin. Characterstück, für das Pianoforte; von Gustav Satter.

"CHARACTER music" and "Programme music," is the most deceptive species of writing that composers can attempt, for, although the title very often lifts indifferent works into a temporary prominence, it scarcely ever happens that any but pieces of the highest class become of any permanent value. Amongst the immense number of "spinning songs," however, the one before us may claim a place, although perhaps not a very high one. Commencing with a well-marked theme, in A minor, accompanied with the usual restless group of six semiquavers, we have a subject in the tonic major, which certainly serves excellently as a

contrast, but is too much broken up for effect. The return to the opening melody, in the minor, is well contrived; and the conclusion of the piece is in good keeping with the general design. Herr Satter appears to indicate, by the freedom with which he writes, that he is capable of something more than he has here given us; and if so, we shall be glad again to welcome him. The composition is dedicated to that excellent young pianist, Fräulein Mary Krebs.

Ave Maria, for the Pianoforte. By A. Jungmann.

WHEN we say that "Op. 222" appears on the title-page of this piece, there can be no question that we are fully justified in expecting to find, if not original thought, at least experienced workmanship. In the latter we are not disappointed; but there is little freshness in the theme. A smooth melody, in D flat major, is first given out, with an accompaniment in chords, and afterwards appears floating over *arpeggio* triplets in the approved modern fashion, the conclusion, with a *forte* accompaniment for both hands (the subject in octaves) making an effective termination to the piece. There is certainly nothing in this composition that has not been done hundreds of times before; but the theme is at least melodious; and, as the passages lie well under the hands, many pianists and listeners may like Herr Jungmann's "*Ave Maria*" better than music of a higher class.

Tendresse. Morceau melodieux, pour Piano, par J. A. Pacher.

AMONGST the heterogeneous collection of pieces, good, bad and indifferent, which a reviewer's sad destiny compels him to bestow his attention upon, it sometimes happens (but, alas, far too seldom) that a little gem suddenly reveals itself, as if to compensate him for the hours of fruitless search he has been condemned to. As a rule, too, it usually occurs that a composition of this kind is signed by a name, if not entirely unknown, at least so rarely appearing as to make us wonder how it can be that a man who can write so well should write so seldom. Such a piece as we have described is the one before us. Its composer, although a stranger to us may have published many works, for aught we know; but we are certain that not one exceeds—even, indeed, if it equal—the grace and tenderness of the unpretending "*Morceau*" which M. Pacher sends us as his letter of introduction. The principal subject, in F major, is extremely melodious, and coloured with a charming accompaniment. To this succeeds a theme in D flat major, with sweeping extended *arpeggios*, for the left hand, every alternate bar. The original subject then returns, and a few gracefully written bars bring the piece to a termination. When we affirm that "*Tendresse*" fully justifies its title (considering how seldom we can award such praise), we hope our good word may be of some service both to the piece and its composer.

Les Chants du Peuple. Mélodies autrichiennes, pour Piano; par Jules Egghard.

THESE melodies are bold and characteristic; and the skill of M. Jules Egghard has been bestowed upon them with good effect. The piece has small pretension—for not even the well-worn device of surrounding the subjects with *arpeggios* is resorted to, but a continuity is preserved sufficiently to prevent the themes from appearing patched together, and that is all perhaps that is intended.

Valse Héroïque; pour le Piano. Par H. A. Wollenhaupt. AN heroic waltz is a novelty; but Herr Wollenhaupt is too experienced a writer to fail in anything he undertakes. The subjects are vigorous and varied in character, and the harmonies most musicianlike throughout. In the second theme a good effect is gained by the contrast of the left hand passage against the *legato* melody, accompanied with chords in the right hand. The piece does not present any formidable difficulties; but it will require careful and intelligent practice.

W. CZERNY.

Guide to Young Pianoforte Teachers and Students. By Wentworth Phillipson.

THE proportion which those professors who can teach bear to those who can play is so exceedingly small, that persons who do not know how the better judgment of pupils and parents can be blinded by what is termed "brilliant execution," might reasonably wonder how it happens that, without any diploma guaranteeing their fitness for so responsible a duty, every pianist should be enabled to live by giving lessons. That this subject (although a delicate one to touch) must shortly come prominently before the public there can be little doubt; meanwhile we are glad to