

Review

Source: *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*, Vol. 16, No. 384 (Feb. 1, 1875), p. 785

Published by: [Musical Times Publications Ltd.](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3355167>

Accessed: 24-01-2016 03:26 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Musical Times Publications Ltd. is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

has been cultivated by art rather than fashion. The melody is exceedingly attractive, the harmonies those of a refined musician, and the figure, obstinately preserved, even in the intervening symphonies, gives much character to the composition. The song was sung by Miss Antoinette Sterling at the Royal Albert Hall Concerts.

The Shipwright. Song. Words by F. E. Weatherley. Composed by J. L. Molloy.

MR. WHITNEY gave the above song at the concerts of the Royal Albert Hall, and with a success which might be anticipated both from the composition and the vocalist. Mr. Molloy always writes catching melodies, and has judgment enough not to distress the voice by over elaborating his accompaniments. "The Shipwright" is a good specimen of his style, and should become a favourite with baritone singers, a class perhaps too much neglected by the composers of the day.

O, Brignall Banks are wild and fair. Song. Words by Sir Walter Scott. Music by J. Knapp.

THE fault of this song is its monotony. The melody is extremely well adapted to the words, and the harmonies are unexceptionable throughout, but the incessant quaver accompaniment becomes tiresome in so long a composition. The plan of harmonising every note is a dangerous one for so simple a song; a few passing notes would be a real relief, both to the vocalist and the listener. The suggestion that the fourth verse should be omitted in performance (which we find at the bottom of page 6) although rather an attempt to cover the defect we complain of, is at least a proof that the author believes with us that such a defect exists.

LAMBORN COCK.

Time and Tune in the Elementary School. A new Method of teaching Vocal Music. By John Hullah.

CONSIDERING that Mr. Hullah adapted Wilhem's Method of teaching Singing for English use in the year 1840, and that since that time he has been incessantly engaged in class teaching, it may fairly be said that he has well earned his right to a patient hearing on the subject, especially when the rage for the "moveable *Do*" has almost blinded people to the real merits of either the absolute or relative methods of notation. It would be a wonder indeed if so experienced a master as the author of this work were utterly to desert the system by the promulgation of which he gained his fame; but it would be equally a matter of surprise if so intelligent a thinker were to ignore the fact of public opinion on the subject of the fixed *Do* having in the last few years completely changed. The result is of course a compromise: Mr. Hullah adheres to his former conviction that a note has no right to be called solely according to its place in the scale, but admits that when it is sharpened or flattened, the name should be altered accordingly. As he truly says, the "proposal to modify the *sol-fa* syllables is, of course, no new thing, either in respect to the moveable or immoveable *Do*," but their alteration by a rule based on the natural sequence of the vowel sounds, propounded in this work, *is*, we believe, new; and, supposing such a system to be at all satisfactory, there can be little doubt that this would be the most rational application of it. But the great question is whether the method of teaching students the scale of C until the intervals are firmly fixed in the mind, and then building up other scales in every one of which the relative character of these intervals is changed (involving, of course, the apparent absurdity of sharpening and flattening notes, not to *go out* of the scale, but to *keep in* it) will ever permanently obtain. Mr. Hullah says, speaking of the moveable *Do*, "Now if the note G, on the treble staff, is one minute to be called *Sol*, another *Fa*, another *Do*, and so on throughout the septenary, what chance is there of understanding and remembering the unalterable scientific fact that G has an existence wholly independent of its position as a member of any scale whatsoever?" But this is scarcely worse than placing the first semitone, for instance, between *Mi* and *Fa*, on a black board, and afterwards explaining that it will never be found there in any other scale: first im-

pressions are not easily effaced; and that a practical difficulty will not be rendered more agreeable on account of its absolute truth may be sufficiently proved by the almost universal acceptance of the acoustical falsehood "equal temperament." For ourselves, we cannot believe that the relative and absolute systems can ever be properly combined without a new notation; but that letters on a straight line will supply us with all we desire may reasonably be doubted, in spite of the temporary success of such a method.

RUDALL, CARTE AND CO.

The Musical Directory, Annual and Almanack, for 1875.

THIS very useful work is now so carefully edited as to deserve the warmest commendation. The list of contents, and Index to the advertisements, will be found to facilitate reference to any part of the book; and a well written article on the musical events of the past year materially adds to its value as a Record, both for professors and amateurs.

DUFF AND STEWART.

Over the Mountain. Ballad. Words from "All the Year Round."

Song with a Burden. Words by Beatrice Abercrombie. Composed by J. L. Hatton.

MR. HATTON'S songs are always acceptable both to a musical and a non-musical audience, for he has the happy faculty not only of writing attractive melodies, but of treating them so artistically as to lift them above the ordinary vocal music of the day. "Over the Mountain" is a good specimen of a musician's ballad, which we need scarcely say is an utterly distinct work from the amateurish productions which have too long been accepted and fostered by those who know no better. The melody is extremely vocal, and the triplet accompaniment flows most sympathetically with the voice-part throughout. In the "Song with a Burden" we have a graceful theme, which well expresses the words; the "Burden"—written for Soprano, Contralto, Tenor and Bass—occasionally stealing in with happy effect, after the principal voice, except at the conclusion of the verse, when it joins it, harmonizing the final phrase. Where any able vocal volunteers can be found in a drawing-room, this composition will be certain to prove highly effective.

ORIGINAL CORRESPONDENCE.

BRIXTON CHORAL SOCIETY.

TO THE EDITOR OF THE MUSICAL TIMES.

SIR,—Without going into any discussion on my brother's letter to you, I am desirous of assuring you that it was written *quite unknown to me*, and without consulting me at all on the subject.

Yours very truly,
WILLIAM LEMARE.

THE HARMONY PRIZE OF THE CHURCH CHORAL SOCIETY.

TO THE EDITOR OF THE MUSICAL TIMES.

SIR,—Will you permit me a few words in reply to Mr. Iliffe's letter on the subject of the above? It would appear from his letter that graduates in music are debarred from competing for the Harmony Prize. This is not the case. Graduates are not *required* to take the Harmony papers, but they are at liberty to take *all* the paper work if they choose, and to compete for any honours or prize open to non-graduate candidates. Had Mr. Iliffe put the question to the examiners or Registrar at the time of examination, he would have received this answer. Mr. Corbett *did* put the question, and was told that the prize was open to all.

I am empowered to add that if Mr. Iliffe or any other graduate (and nearly all our senior choral fellows are graduates), who may not have been clear on this point, should