

## Musical Times Publications Ltd.

---

Handel's Borrowings (Continued)

Author(s): J. S. Shedlock

Source: *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*, Vol. 42, No. 702 (Aug. 1, 1901), pp. 526-528

Published by: [Musical Times Publications Ltd.](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3366187>

Accessed: 22-10-2015 13:53 UTC

---

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



*Musical Times Publications Ltd.* is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

piano-duets. Sometimes I brought him the libretto of a comic opera I had just written, which he always most unwisely rejected. At other times we would sally forth to a pit door to wait for a first performance—once we had a tall youth with us, who has since become known as H. Beerbohm Tree—or I would sit and listen to Fanning as he played sketches of songs and of operettas; my favourite was 'The Two Majors.' And on Sundays we would go to St. John's, Lewisham High Road, where he was organist. Why I went, I don't know. I believe I used to sing in the choir. I know I always used to get a lunch or a supper at the houses of his admirers. Perhaps that is why. And we went to the old Her Majesty's together and heard the 'Nibelungen.' And we sang in the same chorus together at the Albert Hall when Wagner conducted—that is worth remembering! And we visited Bayreuth together, and Dresden. And always I think of him as a true and loyal friend, and the best of all good company.

Although Dr. Fanning has retired—on his own initiative, let us add—from his worthily held position at Harrow, he by no means intends to devote himself to a life of idleness; it is not in his nature to indulge in a chronic *dolce far niente*. When these lines appear he will be on the high seas steaming to the Cape, where he will examine for the Associated Board of the Royal Academy of Music and the Royal College of Music. Upon his return he hopes to devote much of his time, or, in Harrow parlance, to 'follow up' composition. From this change of work much may be expected, as Dr. Fanning possesses the rare and precious gift of melody. He can write a tune, and when he has written it he does not disdainfully throw it into his wastepaper basket because it is a tune. His sketch-book is a very tune-besprinkled, miniature tome which contains the germs of some promising things—for instance, a part-song, which bids fair to become a Vikings the Second, and other melodious themes in embryo. A half-programme cantata is not beyond the bounds of possibility in the near future, and so on. May all these things and much else come in due time to maturity!

#### HANDEL'S BORROWINGS.

(Continued from page 452.)

WE now come to the third question:

'Has any student ever verified the Professor's [Crotch's] statement by furnishing chapter and verse from the works of every one of these 'twenty-nine, &c., composers?'

Many scholars, from Burney onwards, have written, as we have seen, upon the question of Handel's borrowings. For the most part, however, they have confined themselves to the more important of these, and it seems safe to say that no one has yet 'furnished chapter and verse' bringing home to Handel Dr. Crotch's charge of plagiarism from 'every one of these twenty-nine, &c., composers.' But we have been able to collect instances of Handel's borrowing from all except a few.

Putting aside those names concerning which the charge of plagiarism rests entirely on Dr. Crotch's word, the list falls naturally into two classes: (1) that containing composers from whom Handel borrowed wholesale, and (2) those of whom he apparently made slight and infrequent use. Among the latter we shall include doubtful cases in which the alleged theft proves to be the use of a fugue theme which was then common property, or of a subject of uncertain origin.

Commencing with the *Erba Magnificat*, which was used so freely in the composition of 'Israel in Egypt,' the earliest published reference to it in connection with Handel appears to have been made, in 1837, by Sir Henry Bishop in his 'Songs, Duets, and Trios from Handel's oratorios.' We quote his words, which occur in a footnote to 'The Lord is my strength' ('Israel'): 'This duet is from a Magnificat by Handel, to which there is no date. It is probable that it was composed at Rome, about the year 1707, and it was introduced in the above oratorio ["Israel in Egypt"] in 1738.' Sir G. A. Macfarren wrote an analysis of 'Israel' for the Sacred Harmonic Society's performance of that oratorio in 1857. He touched upon the Magnificat, and also concluded it to be Handel's own—influenced by Sir Henry Bishop; by the fact that in the MS. of the oratorio the borrowed passages are marked 'Mag.,' which Macfarren thinks is to identify them with an earlier work of the composer; and also by what he considers the Handelian character of the music. A writer in the *Athenæum* for April 4 of the same year (1857), in remarking on Macfarren's analysis, raised the other side of the question, pointing out that Handel marked the Pastoral Symphony in The Messiah 'Pifa,' which, indeed, refers to the ancient Christmas hymn of the Roman Pifferari, and not to an earlier work of his own.

Dr. Gauntlett, in *Notes and Queries* (February 5, 1859), asks that 'the movements from which Handel has borrowed' should be published, adding: 'The most important at first to produce would be the Magnificat, which forms so large a part of the second act of "Israel" . . . and might well be produced by Mr. Costa, under the auspices of the Sacred Harmonic Society.' Already, in 1858, in the same paper, under the heading, 'Handel as a Conveyancer,' he had mentioned the plagiarisms from Stradella, Urio, Erba, and Muffat; with regard to the last named, however, his statement that the march in 'Judas' is 'verbatim' is an exaggeration. Macfarren was evidently only acquainted with the MS. of the Magnificat belonging to the Sacred Harmonic Society (now in the Royal College of Music Library), which bears Erba's name. But in the Buckingham Palace Library there is a MS. copy (very incomplete), made by Handel himself, which, Dr. Chrysander argues, in his preface to the Magnificat, contains internal evidence that it is the work of a copyist,

not of a composer. The same writer, as we have stated, speaks curiously enough of Erba as having been discovered by himself in one of the articles on F. A. Urio (*Allgemeine Musik-Zeitung*, August 28, 1878). Dr. Crotch does not mention Erba, and as so acute an observer could not have failed to notice the resemblance between certain movements of this Magnificat and the 'Israel,' we may conclude that he had never seen the former work.

We now come to the Te Deum of Padre Urio, from which, as is well known, Handel borrowed unblushingly. We shall not here discuss the very interesting history of these borrowings in detail, our chief purpose being to show, so far as is possible, what Dr. Crotch knew of them and the source of his knowledge. Three MSS. of the work are known—viz., one in the Royal College of Music, inscribed John Stafford, which there is some reason to believe was Handel's own copy; one in the British Museum, which has a note supposed to be in the handwriting of Dr. Thomas Bever, a musician of the eighteenth century, referring to the borrowing of Handel from the Te Deum; and a third in the Library of the Paris Conservatoire, with the long list, already mentioned, of eighteen passages in Urio's work used by Handel. The third manuscript, containing a number of interesting notes (one mentioned by Dr. Chrysander, in *Allgemeine Musik-Zeitung*, Aug. 14, 1878), belonged to Edmund T. Warren. It afterwards passed to J. W. Callcott, author of the 'Grammar of Music,' and a note in his writing shows that he was aware of the Handel plagiarisms; then to Charles Stokes, Vincent Novello's friend. Mrs. Stokes gave it to Novello in 1839, after her husband's death, and subsequently it was purchased at an auction in London (1863) by Victor Schœlcher, who presented it to the Conservatoire. Neither the date nor the authorship of the list of eighteen passages is known; Novello, by the way, quotes the latter in the preface to Purcell's 'Sacred Music' (1832). Dr. Crotch was acquainted with the Urio Te Deum, but whether he had already seen all three of the above MSS. is doubtful. We incline to think that he only knew the British Museum MS. for the following reason: In that copy the name is incorrectly spelt Uria, a spelling which Crotch invariably adopts; although in the other two MSS. the name is written correctly Urio, as printed in his published works. In the foot-notes to his organ adaptation of the Dettingen Te Deum, Crotch instances nine borrowings from Urio, and in his adaptation of 'Saul' he gives five. The list in the Paris MS. mentions ten in the Te Deum and six in 'Saul.' After Crotch, Vincent Novello, as we have seen, mentioned Handel's pillaging at Urio's expense, and later, Professor Prout (*Monthly Musical Record*, November, 1871) and Dr. Chrysander (*Allgemeine Musik-Zeitung*,

1878-9) have published detailed accounts of the plagiarisms.

Five Duets of Clari form No. 4 of Chrysander's 'Sources of Handel's Works.' Handel borrowed from these for 'Theodora.' Chrysander specifies a passage in each duet used in that oratorio. Burney had already heard of these borrowings. 'Handel is supposed to have availed himself of Clari's subjects and sometimes more in the choruses of Theodora,' he remarks in his 'History of Music' (Vol. III., p. 536).

In the *Notes and Queries* article of 1859, quoted above, Dr. Gauntlett asks for the publication of 'The Serenata' of Stradella, which forms so much of the first [act of 'Israel']. Professor Prout dealt with Handel's borrowing from Stradella in the *Monthly Musical Record* in 1871, and Dr. Chrysander published the Serenata in question as No. 3 of his 'Supplements,' &c. Stradella, however, is not mentioned by Dr. Crotch.

We now come to Gottlieb Muffat, a composer from whom Handel borrowed as much, if in a less barefaced way, as from either Urio or Graun. Muffat's 'Componimenti Musicali' provided the material for movements in the 'St. Cecilia Ode,' 'Theodora,' 'Samson,' 'Judas,' 'Solomon,' &c., no fewer than thirty passages in 'Handel,' according to Dr. Chrysander (preface to 'Sources of Handel's Works,' No. 5), being taken from these works. The first to detect these plagiarisms may have been John Groombridge, at one time organist of St. John's, Hackney, and St. Stephen's, Coleman Street, who died in 1827. He possessed the copy of the 'Componimenti,' 'supposed to be the only copy in this Kingdom,' which is now in the British Museum. A list of twelve passages from which Handel borrowed is pasted into it, evidently written before 1827, in which year the volume was presented to the Museum Library.

The first published reference to Handel's obligations to Muffat, however, was made by Dr. Crotch, either in his 'Substance of Lectures,' 1831, or in his 'Arrangement of "Samson"' (p. 2), in which he has the following note on the overture: 'Many of the subjects of this overture are taken from the works of Muffat.' Dr. Gauntlett knew Groombridge's book, and cites the plagiarisms given in the above-mentioned list in his *Notes and Queries* article. Dr. Chrysander confirms all Groombridge's instances, and adds others of his own, bringing the number of movements in Muffat which Handel used up to eighteen, omitting doubtful and slight resemblances.

Handel's borrowings from Carissimi did not escape Burney, who remarks that the divisions in a fragment of Carissimi, and several of his 'cheerful movements, were not disdained by Handel.' What these cheerful movements were he does not say, but we presume that 'Plorate filia Israel,' 'Heu mihi, filia mea,' 'Et

ululantes filii Ammon,' &c., from Carissimi's 'Jephthah,' all of which Handel used, are not intended. Crotch, however, mentions them and others in his 'Substance of Lectures,' pp. 94 and 95. The 'Plorate filiæ,' he says, 'is quoted in 'Hear Jacob's God' ('Samson') and in 'Father of Mercies' ('Joshua')'; while again, in his adaptations of 'Samson' for the organ, pianoforte, &c., a foot-note to 'Hear Jacob's God' reads: 'Several passages in this chorus are pretty exactly copied from Carissimi's chorus 'Plorate filiæ.' The chorus 'With thunder armed,' in 'Samson,' is taken, Crotch tells us, from 'Et ululantes filii Ammon,' Carissimi's 'Jephthah' (see 'Substance of Lectures,' *loc. cit.*), and organ arrangements, 'Samson,' p. 27.

Passages from the same oratorio of Carissimi used by Handel are 'Et clangebant tubæ,'\* imitated in 'We come in bright array,' from 'Judas'; 'Heu mihi, filia mea,' in 'He chose a mournful muse,' from 'Alexander's Feast' ('Substance of Lectures,' *loc. cit.*). Crotch also refers 'If there was any virtue' in Handel's Funeral Anthem to Carissimi, but does not name the passage in the latter.

Handel perpetrated some of his most flagrant thefts from the earlier of the two 'Brunswick Passion' oratorios of Karl Heinrich Graun. Professor Prout's two articles in the *Monthly Musical Record* for May and June, 1894, prove this conclusively. In these articles he describes a very curious chain of coincidences that led up to what he justly calls the 'discovery' that the chorus, 'Ere to dust is changed thy beauty,' in the 'Triumph of Time and Truth,' was taken practically without alteration from a movement in the above-mentioned earlier Graun Passion. Professor Prout found music in Handel's own handwriting, now in the Fitzwilliam collection, copied by Handel from the almost unknown Passion of Graun in a way which left no doubt that he meant to use it of *malice prepense* when and where he found occasion. But important as these results were, Professor Prout was not the first to glean in this curious by-way of musical criticism. Dr. Crotch many years before had written in a printed copy of the 'Triumph of Time and Truth,' which belonged to him, under the first two bars of the chorus 'Ere to dust is changed thy beauty' (p. 142): 'slightly altered from a Mass of Graun's.' Against the next three bars (p. 143), in the chorus, we find 'This is a Motet by Graun, the subject being slightly altered to suit the words.' On p. 146, still referring to the same chorus, Crotch has written 'the original subject and best'; on p. 150, at the end of the chorus, 'Graun's subject is this,' followed by the subject in question, written out in ink, just as it occurs in Latrobe; and finally, 'The

whole is taken, key-time, modulations, &c.' In this copy, Dr. Crotch, above 'Loathsome urns disclose your treasure,' has written: 'This in the original is an alto song terminating in a chorus, which contains the subjects of 'Mourn, ye afflicted children,' and 'For Zion lamentation make' ('Judas Maccabæus'), and these are from Graun.' With regard to 'Mourn, ye afflicted children,' the passage is specially noted by Dr. Crotch in his organ adaptation of 'Judas,' as taken from a Graun Mass. On comparing it, however, with the supposed original, we find the same sequence of notes, yet different rhythm. Dr. Crotch's references to Graun are extremely interesting, though mere foreshadowings of what Professor Prout achieved with the aid of the Handel autograph and the Graun score. It may be added that the Dublin Professor has shown that Handel also made use of this Graun Passion for certain movements in his 'Giustino,' 'Atalanta,' 'The Wedding' Anthem, and 'Alexander's Feast.'

In the foot-notes to his organ adaptation of 'Jephthah,' Dr. Crotch mentions six instances of borrowing from a Mass of Habermann's. A copy of the Mass in question, in Handel's writing, is preserved among the Handel MSS. in the Fitzwilliam collection. The editors of the Fitzwilliam catalogue (p. 216) give four movements in it used by Handel in 'Jephthah,' but their list does not tally with Dr. Crotch's, except in the first instance, that of the chorus 'No more to Ammon's God and King,' in 'Jephthah.'

Franz Johann Habermann was born in 1706 at Königswerth, and, after a course of literary and philosophical studies at Klattau and Prague, devoted himself to music. He completed his musical education in Italy, where he visited Rome, Naples, and other art centres, Spain and France. At Paris he entered the service of the Prince de Condé, in 1731, but on the death of that Prince he went to Florence, where he became Maëstro to the Grand Duke of Tuscany. This patron dying, he returned to Prague, where an opera of his, specially composed for the occasion, was successfully performed at the coronation of the Empress Marie Theresa. At Prague he lived some years as a teacher: his pupils were chiefly noble and wealthy amateurs of music, but Dussek, Mislivec, and Cajetan Vogel were among them. He became musical director at the church of the Theatines, in Prague, and between 1750 and 1773 held the same post at the Maltese church in that city. In the latter year he became Kapellmeister at Eger, where he remained till his death in 1783.

Habermann's printed works consist of twelve Masses and six Litanies. Besides these he left in MS. two oratorios, the 'Conversio Peccatoris' and 'Deodatus,' and a good deal of ecclesiastical music of various kinds. [J. S. S.]

\* In a manuscript copy of Carissimi's 'Jephthah,' which belonged to Dr. Crotch, he has again pointed to Handel's borrowing from this chorus.

(To be continued.)