artstyle.international

ART STYLE

Art & Culture
International
Magazine

Volume 8 | Issue 8.1 | September 2021

METROPOLIS

Visual Dynamic and Democratic Ideals

Part 2

Cover photo by Mike Chai.

Academic Editors

Editor-in-Chief and Creative Director
Christiane Wagner

Senior Editor
Martina Sauer

Associate Editors
Laurence Larochelle
Katarina Andjelkovic
Natasha Marzliak

Collaborators

Charlotte Thibault
Denise Meyer
Jan Schandal
Marjorie Lambert

Art Style | Art & Culture International Magazine

editorial@artstyle.international

+1 347 352 8564 New York
+55 11 3230 6423 São Paulo

The Magazine is a product of Art Style Communication & Editions.
Founded in 1995, the Art Style Company operates worldwide in the fields of design, architecture, communication, arts, aesthetics, and culture.

ISSN 2596-1810 (Online)
ISSN 2596-1802 (Print)

Theodor Herzi, 49 | 05014 020 Sao Paulo, SP | CNPJ 00.445.976/0001-78
Christiane Wagner is a registered journalist and editor: MTB 0073952/SP
© 1995 Art Style Comunicação & Edições / Communication & Editions

Art Style | Art & Culture International Magazine is an open access, biannual, and peer–reviewed online magazine that aims to bundle cultural diversity. All values of cultures are shown in their varieties of art. Beyond the importance of the medium, form, and context in which art takes its characteristics, we also consider the significance of socio-cultural and market influence. Thus, there are different forms of visual expression and perception through the media and environment. The images relate to the cultural changes and their time-space significance—the spirit of the time. Hence, it is not only about the image itself and its description but rather its effects on culture, in which reciprocity is involved. For example, a variety of visual narratives—like movies, TV shows, videos, performances, media, digital arts, visual technologies and video game as part of the video's story, communications design, and also, drawing, painting, photography, dance, theater, literature, sculpture, architecture and design—are discussed in their visual significance as well as in synchronization with music in daily interactions. Moreover, this magazine handles images and sounds concerning the meaning in culture due to the influence of ideologies, trends, or functions for informational purposes as forms of communication beyond the significance of art and its issues related to the socio-cultural and political context. However, the significance of art and all kinds of aesthetic experiences represent a transformation for our nature as human beings. In general, questions concerning the meaning of art are frequently linked to the process of perception and imagination. This process can be understood as an aesthetic experience in art, media, and fields such as motion pictures, music, and many other creative works and events that contribute to one's knowledge, opinions, or skills. Accordingly, examining the digital technologies, motion picture, sound recording, broadcasting industries, and its social impact, Art Style Magazine focuses on the myriad meanings of art to become aware of their effects on culture as well as their communication dynamics.

Content

Editorial

Christiane Wagner
Editor-in-Chief and Creative Director

Essays

11 La Estela de Luz: Cultural Policies for National Identity through a Monument
by Omar Cerrillo Garnica

23 The 1970s Radical Rethinking of Architecture Social Rebellion and Terms of Aesthetic Experience
by Katarina Andjelkovic

43 Visions of Modernity: Architecture, Colonialism, and Indigeneity Across the Americas
by Brandon Sward

57 Socializing Sculpture: Commemorative Public Art as a Pedagogical Tool
by Piper Prolago

81 Silent Witnesses of Art Nouveau in Perm or the Story of One Treasure
by Vera Ustyugova and Mariya Mingaleva

109 Construction of the Pacification through Comics in Africa
by Idah Razafindrakoto

125 From Head to Toe: Visual Stereotyping as Practice in Pre-Modern European Works of Art
by Melis Avkiran

153 Responsibility: The Charge of Meaning in Art and Language
by Martina Sauer

169 Scientific Committee
Editorial Board & Information

Metropolis: Visual Dynamic and Democratic Ideals

Part 2, Editorial

Dear readers,

This second part of *Metropolis: Visual Dynamic and Democratic Ideals* addresses public space and its architectural structures and monuments with the following authors: Omar Cerrillo, Katarina Andjelkovic, Brandon Sward, Piper Prolago, Vera Ustyugova, and Mariya Mingalev. These authors are representative and complementary in their analyses of urban space and its sociopolitical and cultural meanings. In the sequence, the theme related to visual dynamics and democratic ideals embraces the image of comics and art history through the essays of Idah Razafindrakoto and Melis Avkiran. Finally, our senior editor closes with her writing on democratic values in all its possible extension, which discusses "responsibility."

As an opening statement, I present "La Estela de Luz: Cultural Policies for National Identity through a Monument" by Omar Cerrillo a Mexican professor in cultural sociology and director of the Humanities School and School of Architecture, Art and Design at Campus Cuernavaca, Instituto Tecnológico y de Estudios Superiores de Monterrey. His essay addresses the state's cultural policies in generating a unique view of culture and Mexican national identity, and also discusses other cultural policies of that society. In this sense, his essay enables debates that favor a democratic scenario and presents new views on cultural policies related to national identity and contemporary democratic societies in a synthesis based on the analysis of Alberto Rosa, which concentrated on the symbolic philosophy of Patxi Lanceros and García Canclini on the notion of cultural policies, also considering other significant authors and, undoubtedly, his own critical analyses. Following this analysis of urban space and architecture is the essay "The 1970s Radical Rethinking of Architecture: Social Rebellion and Terms of Aesthetic Experience" by Katarina Andjelkovic, which discusses Gordon's architecture and his provocative physical interventions oriented towards a rejection of architectural materiality. Andjelkovic's writing shows how Matta-Clark's "anarchitectural" environments contribute to socio-political, aesthetic, and cultural development. As the author explains, "Gordon Matta-Clark's (1943–1978) art interventions during the 1970s challenged the materialist concerns of architecture as a radical struggle against the prevailing social structures." Katarina Andjelkovic is a renowned architect and theorist whose research, writings, and teachings are transdisciplinary and span architecture, visual arts, and film. She has been a visiting professor at the University of Oklahoma (US), at the Institute of Form Theory and History and Institute of Urbanism and Landscape in Oslo, and the University of Belgrade.

How can we still see the meaning of architecture between the old and new worlds and between past and present? Moreover, how can we understand the political, cultural, and democratic meaning in this context? "Visions of Modernity: Architecture, Colonialism, and Indigeneity Across the Americas" by Brandon Sward concentrates on the history of Latin America and the Americas as a whole in their conception of the "new world." In this case, the author relates the city of Los Angeles and the California state to its past dominated by the Spanish and the architectural representation of this period—one of the earliest forms of conquest and transformation of the environment—and highlights the influence on Latin American history while outlining challenges for the function of architecture in the present and near future as regards to overcoming differences. Sward is an artist, writer, and scholar who lives and works in Los Angeles. He was a quarterfinalist for the VanderMey Nonfiction Prize, shortlisted for Disquiet International's Literary Prize, and honorable mention and finalist for the New Millennium Writing Awards.

Who among us has not followed the recent demonstrations in numerous metropolitan centers against the statues of personalities from a historical moment that did not value fundamental human rights? "Socializing Sculpture: Commemorative Public Art as a Pedagogical Tool" by Piper Prolago, from the University of Tulsa, Oklahoma and managing editor of *The Collegian*, shows a comparison between celebration and contemplation when dealing with the relationship between historical, figurative monuments, such as statues of people seen as heroes by history, especially national history. Her essay shows the significance of interactivity with the contemplation of the abstract artwork *Vietnam Veterans Memorial* by Maya Lin and the *NAMES Project AIDS Memorial Quilt*. Masterfully, the author demonstrates the dynamics of art in public space and its possibilities to offer an aesthetic education and political awareness by analyzing the significant work of Paulo Freire for education. Piper Prolago also examines the legacy of the relationship between things and the social individual in public space for the universe of arts with Joseph Beuys' "social sculpture" with "the idea that everything is an art and in turn, everyone is an artist with the capacity to shape society through creativity."

The growth of large metropolitan centers involves diverse technological, economic, political, and social development, whereby the majority of factors saw their starting point from the first Industrial Revolution and the reproduction of all its effects on arts and culture. It is in this way that we can take the example of the Russian city, Perm, an important administrative, industrial, scientific, and cultural center with "Silent Witnesses of Art Nouveau in Perm, or the Story of One Treasure" by Vera Ustyugova and Mariya Mingaleva from the Department of Interdisciplinary Historical Studies of Perm State University. This article focuses on life in Perm as a provincial city in XIX and the beginning of the XX century, analyzing the history of the local culture and events in the Art Nouveau period. The article searches this analysis to conceive the development of the city and the authors emphasize the inherent infrastructural transformations. Furthermore, the authors bring Perm city closer to global societies as in Walter Benjamin's *Arcades*

Project (*Le Livre de Passages*, the French edition), which described the years from 1927 until the end of his life (1940). Thus, the historical analysis of Perm development is well constructed, while simultaneous analysis is conducted of the sociocultural context and representing cultural projects. Leaving Russia and arriving in Africa, we have the article "Construction of the Pacification through Comics in Africa" by Idah Razafindrakoto, which presents the security context of the African scenario and the state's role in the exercise of power through political discourses and actions in the construction of governance and, consequently, the transition from this scenario to the arts. The central discourse of Idah Razafindrakoto's article is the role of the cartoon as a form of "artivism" in the practice of artistic pacification manifested by protest tendencies. Many of Africa's current problems are transferred from political discourse to social critique through "artivism," a predominant feature of global urban culture. The focus is on comics as a medium of political communication. The article is significant because it is from this analysis of the discourses that African comics strengthen the construction of peace. Idah Razafindrakoto is a PhD student in Governance and Regional Integration, Institute of Governance, Humanities and Social Sciences, Pan-African University, Yaounde, Cameroon.

After the African context, let us always remember our ancestors and our origin. History is fundamental for us to understand and be aware of the values necessary to build a more inclusive, just, and democratic world in which we avoid the mistakes of our ancestors. "From Head to Toe: Visual Stereotyping as Practice in Pre-Modern European Works of Art" by Melis Avkiran, a PhD candidate and lecturer in the art history department of the Ruhr-University Bochum (Germany), discusses the representation, fragmentation, and integration of black people through iconographic analysis concerning the social and artistic aspects and the historical and cultural effects. The painting analyses are developed by comparing the different political and religious contexts between the 15th century in Spain and other regions of Europe. Finally, to conclude this issue, the essay "Responsibility: The Charge of Meaning in Art and Language" by Martina Sauer, from the Institute of Image and Cultural Philosophy (Germany) and senior editor of *Art Style, Art & Culture International Magazine*, deals with responsibility for what is produced, as an effect and influence on individuals and their actions. The author discusses responsibility and its consequences based on the theories of Ernst Cassirer, Aby Warburg, and Hartmut Böhm.

With this selection of articles presented, comprising parts one and two, the theme of this issue is explored through different points of view and thus contributes not only to further discussions and new publications, but above all to a reading and reflection on our metropolitan and global context.

Enjoy reading this second part,

Christiane Wagner
Editor-in-Chief

Art Style, Art & Culture International Magazine,
v. 8, no. 8.1, part 2 (September 2021), 7-9.
DOI: 10.5281/zenodo.5450199

La Estela de Luz
Cultural Policies for National Identity through a Monument

Omar Cerrillo Garnica

Abstract

In 2010, Mexico celebrated 200 years of the beginning of the Independence War and a Centenary of the beginning of the Mexican Revolution. As part of the commemoration of both festivities, the Mexican government promoted certain cultural activities, like public photographic expositions, music festivals, museum exhibitions, and the lifting of a commemorative monument, which passed through many proposals and finally became a kind of monolith called "La Estela de Luz" (The Light Stele). Since the inauguration, this sculpture wasn't received as a commemorative landmark. Instead, people used it as a point of reference to begin protest walks through the main avenue in Mexico City, Paseo de la Reforma. It was baptized as "La Estela de la Corrupción" (The Corruption Stele) for political opposition supporters. Eleven years later, new historic commemorations arrived—200 years of the ending of the Independence War and 500 years of the Spanish Conquest of Tenochtitlan. A different government, ideologically identified with the ones that give the alternative name to the monument, must run this festivity. This work aims to identify what Estela de Luz means for Mexican society if it evokes historical commemorations, or it means a different thing, or it really means nothing. This work is theoretical-oriented on collective identity theory, by Alberto Rosa; the symbolic philosophy of Patxi Lanceros; and the notion of cultural policies, from García Canclini, Miller and Yúdice, among others. With these concepts, the text affirms that State-made cultural policies trend to generate a unique vision of culture and of national identity. But there are also other cultural policies, emerged from different societal groups. These new visions allow democratic debates that trend to create better democratic scenarios. This work aims to provide new visions about the relationship of cultural policies with national identity and democratic societies in the 21st century.

Omar Cerrillo Garnica, "La Estela de Luz: Cultural Policies for National Identity through a Monument,"
Art Style, Art & Culture International Magazine, v. 8, no. 8.1, part 2 (September 2021), 11-21.
DOI: 10.5281/zenodo.5497846

Introduction

In globalized times, it's hard to say how people identify themselves with national ideals. Some countries had certain historical and mythical values that give a solid frame to national identity. Others were created through colonial processes with heterogenic settings to produce a national feeling. Mexico is a country with both realities; it is, at the same time, a country with ancestral History, with great civilizations that can give people a sense of belonging from a glorious time when Aztec and Maya empires were ruling on North America. On the other hand, Mexico is a post colonized country that came to Independence at the beginning of the 19th century, with a long revolution that brought into a new Nation-State on the map of the Americas. Both realities are in the same country: a valuable pre-Hispanic heritage and a diffuse European hybrid standard that make Mexico a kaleidoscopic culture.

Now, two hundred years after this war, Mexico has to define certain symbols to recognize the nation's evolution, incorporate this powerful ancestral background, and project the nation's greatness into the years to come. In that dilemma, the Mexican government built a monument to commemorate two centuries of freedom and Independence.

This essay will analyze the process of this monument known as "La Estela de Luz." First of all, a theoretical framework is established by defining concepts of symbol, national identity, and cultural policies, all important to understand and construct the research object. In a second moment, the essay describes how The Light Stele was planned and built. Later, it looks at how people identify this symbol to provide an analytical framework for the research. Finally, this text aims to provide a new understanding of the construction of cultural policies and give a framework for the relationship between artwork, politics, and democratic values in modern societies.

National Identity and Cultural Policies at the 21st Century: A Theoretical Review

The sense of belonging is a crucial part of the human condition. Since the cavern times, people needed to feel part of a group in order to survive. Through time, human groups developed this feeling as identity, which means recognizing another one as an equal, not a stranger. Also, this feeling helps self-understand, to recognize who I am by looking to others, what others are in me, who I feel like a partner, and who can be a menace for us.

Figure 1: *The Light Stele* and *Major Tower*.
Photo by Rossell1789. August 2012.
Licensed under CC BY-SA 3.0.

The sense of identity can be found in the cross between two conceptual lines: the individual-social axis and the synchrony-diachrony axis. About the first one, we must say that identity processes occur at both ends of the axis; individuals configure their own identity schemes by receiving information from their social environment; on the other side, social groups are created by individual selves that share part of their own identities. In the other axis, identity is formed by the pass of time—diachrony—for both individuals and collectives; identity is also produced by the relationship that each one establishes with others at the same moment of History—synchrony. Individuals and groups explain themselves concerning their journeys and their interrelations, forming History that is also explained in its diachronic and synchronic dimensions by their stories.[1] These possibilities of existence maintain a common thread, an internal cohesion that gives meaning to History—individual or social. The support for an idea of identity lies in memory, understood as the selection of facts to be considered memorable for the future and selected and interpreted to give total congruence to both, History and story. It is not about the most precise record of each individual or collective experience, but only the most representative ones.

Collective identity is built not only about the remarkable facts that can be verified. Many other symbolic discourses are essential for this construction, such as legends and myths, not only from the ancient times—archetypes, Jung *dixit,*[2] also modern times are full of not verifiable stories that are part of popular narratives about historical events. Patxi Lanceros explains the connection between these two ways to watch events. Thanks to the symbolic dimensions of narrative, it is possible to connect past and future in the historical line and the origin and ending on the mythical side. The connection of the past with origins, History with myths, is only possible through a feeling of yearning. On the other side, projecting an idea of the future is only possible if we are aware of its apocalyptical approach, which can be reached through desire, craving. Both feelings, yearning, and craving, are possible in the existence of symbols that can connect people with rational and emotional approaches to watch back or further in their own life.

In Lanceros' view, a symbol works like a "symbolic suture for a real wound" (Lanceros 1997, 9). Through it, it's possible to join the inapprehensible facts for the chronological or the epistemological dimensions. A symbol is a route to connect the individual with the collective, the diachronic with the synchronic. Artworks are potent symbols that can generate not only culture but also identity processes. In this sense, collective identity can be framed in different ways. The most modern form can be stated in nationalism, a political value that was essential for Enlightenment philosophers and got its more reluctant moment in the 19th century. This specific way of identity was a critical issue for certain independent movements in Europe and America all along that century.

It can be said that there is a direct connection between nationalism and democracy because both concepts were born in Enlightenment and were essential in liberal revolutions that led to throwing down the despotic regimes and started the modern democratic state. All States design, plan, and instrument cultural projects to make people feel part of their national sphere. These expressions, recognized as cultural policies, are "the set of interventions carried out by the State, civil institutions and organized community groups in order to guide symbolic development, satisfy population cultural needs and obtain consensus for any direction, order or change" (Canclini 1987, 26) based on symbols, values, traditions and, consequently, an idea of the nation. Cultural policies involve all kinds of creative activity in society, both consecrated activities and those that come to be called popular or non-professional, as well as mass culture expressions (Nivón 2006, 21). Miller and Yúdice describe how the state conceives and articulates cultural policy, through which the formation of a "cultural citizen" is pursued, under the idea that culture "is capable of producing the national consolidation, guaranteed by state institutions" (Miller 2004, 21). If the state can build a general idea of what the nation is, people will accept the state norm, thus creating citizenship, a "civic conscience."

The state is not the only political actor that can create cultural policies. In a democratic society, there should be more than just a unique idea about "nation." Chantal Mouffe considers that the public sphere is not more a site of consensus but an interchange between different people. The natural activity of public space has been abandoned and turned towards a false consensus, generally stimulated by the extreme right. Democracy seeks consensus between dissent, but recognizing that even reaching an agreement, there is tension with the opposite, that friend-enemy duality of politics seen in Carl Schmitt's theory. It should be noted that "this form of agonist public sphere" is not something that should be considered as "threatening to democracy," but rather how the tendency to right-ideology totalizing discourses can be avoided (Mouffe 2007, 58). This notion of an agonistic democracy recognizes its disagreements and accepts the potentiality of conflict, where artistic activities are relevant to generate identities, either with the hegemonic discourse or its opposite:

> It is not possible to distinguish between political art and non-political art, because all forms of artistic practices either contribute to the reproduction of the given common sense—and in that sense, they are political—, or they contribute to its deconstruction or criticism. All artistic forms have a political dimension (Mouffe 2007, 58).

The political expression of art is found in the dislocation of ideas and forms in transporting objects to other places. Contemporary art responds to many ways of watching political life. It barely corresponds to aesthetic politics for a homogenous taste or cultural politics based on a unique vision. Diverse art is also a crucial piece for building democratic societies. Also, a piece of art with a specific intention can generate other interpretations in different societal groups. So, diversity is a critical value in artistic processes in these times. This work is about this relationship between art and the other points of view about it.

Mexican Significance of Independence through Artistic Symbols

As other Latin American countries did, Mexico had its Independence Movement in the early 19th century, but, paradoxically, there wasn't an immense nationalist feeling in the patriots that led the insurgence. Nationalism was developed slowly all along the century and reached its top moment at the dictatorship of Porfirio Díaz at the end of that century. There's a well-extended story in Mexico about choosing the date of commemorating Independence. There were two possibilities: the beginning, September 16th, 1910, more related to liberal-ideology leaders at the start of the fight, or the ending, September 27th, 1921, which should raise the conservative ideology that new revolutionary leaders praised. No matter about these historical reasons and ideological consequences, the date was chosen was September 16th. The reason? Díaz's birthday was September 15th, so the party can begin on the night of September 15th and end the day after. Reality or myth: this is when Mexicans still celebrate their Independence, the essential civic date in the Mexican calendar. Also, during Diaz's period, Mexico celebrated the first 100 years of the beginning of the Independence War, a situation that led the government to organize events, public and symbolic acts. The most visible one is commonly known as "El Ángel de la Independencia"—Independence Angel—a statue set over a column in a roundabout in Paseo de la Reforma, the most emblematic street in Mexico City, all rebuilt and glamourized by the dictator in order of his admiration for the modern Paris. A hundred years later, in 2010, Mexico celebrated the second Centenary of its Independence. Then, there was no Porfirio Díaz, no dictatorship, neither the need for national identity. At the beginning of the 21st Century, Mexicans were more into the sense of globalization nor the nation. In 1910, Mexico was pursuing to project the image of a modernized country that can emulate the glamour of France. Now, modernity is based on other models,

quite different from "La Belle Epoque": Dubai, Hong Kong, Singapore are the new modern standards in the world. In this new modernity, no more classic art statues with Corinthian capitals should arise. Now, the model was quite different. Digital and luminescent art is the proper fashion. At the Centenary, Mexico was in a dictatorship; now, at the Bicentenary, the country was living in a democracy. In the pursuit of a monument for the Bicentenary, the government made a call for proposals. The first idea to emerge was "Torre Bicentenario"—Bicentenary Tower—, a skyscraper that will be located in the area of Lomas de Chapultepec, near two important streets, Periférico and Paseo de la Reforma, in Mexico City. The government of Mexico City convened the ambitious project in 2007, submitted to a contest between great architects from Mexico and the world. The winning design was proposed by the famous Dutch architect Rem Koolhas. A 300-meter-high tower, emulating a pyramid that mirrors itself, would have a base 40 meters wide in its narrow areas and reach 60 meters in its widest part, at 73 meters high. Through many protests, the project was dismissed mainly because of the environmental and urban impact (Cuenca 2007). The second idea would be called the Bicentennial Arch. It would rise at the crossing between Paseo de la Reforma and Circuito Interior, the other two essential avenues in Mexico City. Many important Mexican architects attend the call, such as Teodoro González de León, Fernando Romero, Pedro Ramírez Vázquez and Alberto Kalach (Expansión 2007). Months later, the authorities announced the winner, who was… a light stele! That aroused the annoyance of Pedro Ramírez Vázquez. His son declared that the winning project should have been disqualified for not complying with the requirements of the call: "You cannot make a contest to build a stadium and the one that wins is a hospital, that is not possible" (Expansión 2007).

The project began to be built on September 22nd, 2009, with many complications. The foundations were poorly planned, the quartz needed for the light plates should be imported from Brazil, and it must be assembled in Italy. Progress was negligible. Little was said about the project. In September 2010, the project was not ready, so they postponed the inauguration until December 2011. The cost grew exponentially, going from 398 million Mexican pesos in the original budget to 1,035 million pesos.[3] Even though the monument wasn't ready in December to be inaugurated, it was until January 7th, 2012, when President Felipe Calderón unveiled the memorial. He expressed his desire "that the Monument of the Estela de Luz could be an emblem of a new era for Mexico; an era where the seed of a more secure, fair and prosperous Nation will flourish with force, and illuminates the existence of future generations of Mexicans."[4]

On the day of the inauguration, a group of protesters was outside the monument and interrupted a dancing number part of the program. They claimed about the monument's costs and proposed to turn it into a memorial for the victims of the fight against organized crime in Mexico or into the museum of corruption (Milenio, January 9th, 2012). During the week after the inauguration, protests broke out on social media, particularly on Twitter. In addition to the criticisms made during the opening, the monument was compared with a popular cookie known in Mexico as "suavicrema" due to its squared design and rectangular form, similar to that of the stele.

The Light Stele in Mexican Imaginary

Nine years later, Mexico had the "other" commemoration of Independence. The ending of the war happened on September 27th, 1921; another bicentenary is here. Almost a decade later, the Light Stele is now part of the standard view of the capital city, and all stories around the inauguration can be filed as part of History. One new representation about the Light Stele lies in its basement, where a Digital Culture Museum is located, coordinating activities like public lectures, workshops, movies, among others. In 2021, the Light Stele may represent something else from independence and history, maybe corruption, maybe a museum, perhaps just another rock in the city. In this sense, we designed a small survey[5] applied through social media about the monument to capture how modern Mexican society has incorporated this construction into their everyday lives, the city, and collective identity.

The poll consisted of nine questions, four about general demographic information about the respondent, and five more about the monument that goes from its existence to the common and popular use of the monolith. But, first, let's see the main results.

About demographic information, it must be said that there's a balance in the gender of the respondents: 49% identified as male, 49% identified as female. Half of the sample (51%) are young people between 18 and 39 years. A significant majority lives in Mexico City and its suburbs (73.5%). All our respondents are educated people, with at least high school finished. The trends in the answers about the Light Stele are evident: 94% knows what it is; 77% have visited it; 95% knows that it was initially started as a commemorative monument for Bicentenary of the Independence; 65% identified it as a symbol of corruption, and 30% looks at it as a place for starting a protest.

Even though, it's essential to look at other possibilities to answer these questions. For example, only 10% of the answers still watch the Stele as a historic commemorative symbol, and 20% watch it as an irrelevant place. About everyday use, 42% say that it is only a meeting point for people. In comparison, the other 22% feel that the digital culture museum located in the basement is relevant for attending it.

It should be clarified that this poll is just a bare approach to the most accurate quantitative research. It was just a first exercise for a deeper and more valid poll to apply later this year. But it still gives us a critical perspective about the perception of this landmark and the way people respond to it. Therefore, we can first make photography about the perception of this monument and the way it was incorporated into everyday life in Mexico City. Nevertheless, some general ideas can be stated through this small exercise.

Figure 2: *La Estela de Luz*. Mike Ramirez, Pixabay, 2019.

Conclusions

After watching the results of this poll, it can be said that the alternative story that emerged by people protesting during the inauguration of the monument is the winner discourse after 2012. People don't recognize the Light Stele as a symbol of Independence or Bicentenary. Instead, it is seen as an icon of corruption or barely an insignificant space. Following Patxi Lanceros, the mythical line in this topic is stronger than the historical one. However, it's still is a symbol that can unite people into a narrative that can make sense of identity. This narrative is about the government's corruption and how people can give new meanings to cultural and urban objects.

The Light Stele is not a historical landmark neither a symbol for national identity. It is inserted into another conception of symbols, where a nation is not a central conception for collective identity. Through this artwork, we can redefine the concept of the modern state, where the cultural dimension is not a definitory element. The State-proposed cultural policies are not as powerful as they used to be a hundred years ago. Now, social-originated cultural policies are most accurate for constructing a sense of belonging and identity. They can define the winning narrative into historical events and landmarks, restating the power of civil society in 21st Century modernity. The different narratives about The Light Stele support the idea of an agonistic democracy in Mexico, where diverse perspectives can antagonize and create a debate about public matters, such as artworks placed on the urban space. In addition, cultural policies that emerged from civil society give new repertoires of symbols for building new cultural identities parameters.

It is also important to say that democracies are built through public discourse, debating ideas, and building consensus. Unfortunately, in recent years, many Western countries have turned into Far-Right governments with autocratic and populist discourses which haven't create debate either consensus, just polarization in between society. In this context, Mexico is under this menace, with a non-right-but-populist government that has made a polarized political environment and a less debating public sphere far from building agreements. We need to strengthen these debate exercises where different points of view about public affairs can be stated without disqualifying others with a different point of view—more agonistic democracy instead of antagonistic irrationality.

Author Biography

Omar Cerrillo Garnica is a Mexican researcher (SNI-1) and professor in Cultural Sociology. He got a PhD in Social and Political Sciences and a Master's Degree in Sociology at Iberoamerican University in Mexico City, graduated with honors. Since 2007 is professor at Instituto Tecnológico y de Estudios Superiores de Monterrey, in 2019 becomes Director of Humanities School at Campus Cuernavaca. He is specialized in social analysis of art, music and culture. He also developed a successful community engagement social service program through arts and sports. As a researcher, he has worked in politics in music –rock, Mexican folk genres–, cultural policies, digital culture, and cyberactivism. He has participated in many academic events in Mexico and other countries, with articles and book chapters published in Mexico, Brazil, Chile, and France.

Notes

[1] Rosa, *Memoria colectiva e identidad nacional*

[2] Jung, *Arquetipos e inconsciente colectivo.*

[3] Infobae. "La Estela de Luz: cuánto costó el criticado monumento de Felipe Calderón para celebrar el Bicentenario." August 4th, 202https://www.infobae.com/america/mexico/2020/08/04/la-estela-de-luz-cuanto-costo-el-criticado-monumento-de-felipe-calderon-para-celebrar-el-bicentenario/

[4] Inauguración de la Estela de Luz, Presidencia Felipe Calderón Hinojosa, accessed June 28th, 2021, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=sQyZyVjYkq4

[5] 50 respondents answered it in this first stage of the project.

Bibliography

Cuenca, Alberto; Robles, Johana; Alcaraz, Yetlaneci. "Ebrard ofrece dialogar sobre Torre Bicentenario," *El Universal*, July 27th, 2007. https://archivo.eluniversal.com.mx/ciudad/85741.html

Expansión. "Abren concurso para Arco Bicentenario," January 27th, 2009. https://expansion.mx/obras/2009/01/27/abren-concurso-para-arco-bicentenario

Expansión. "Desaprueban fallo de Arco Bicentenario," April 22th, 2009. https://expansion.mx/obras/2009/04/22/desaprueban-fallo-de-arco-bicentenario

García Canclini, Néstor. *Políticas culturales en América Latina.* México: Grijalbo, 1987.

Jung, Carl. *Arquetipos e incosciente colectivo*. Barcelona: Paidós, 1970.

Lanceros, Patxi. *La Herida Trágica*. Barcelona: Anthropos, 1997.

Miller, Toby y Yúdice, George. *Política cultural*. Barcelona: Gedisa, 2004.

Mouffe, Chantal. *Prácticas artísticas y democracia agonística*. Barcelona: Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona, 2007.

Nivón, Eduardo. *La política cultural. Temas, problemas y oportunidades.* México: Intersecciones, 2006.

Rosa Rivero, Alberto, *et. al. Memoria colectiva e identidad nacional*. Madrid: Biblioteca Nueva, 2000.

Encuesta Estela de Luz 2021 https://docs.google.com/forms/d/1mje9teRtxTm-Au2P44BCFe1mX4qNkvUZVjGR8zX8odM/edit

The 1970s Radical Rethinking of Architecture
Social Rebellion and Terms of Aesthetic Experience

Katarina Andjelkovic

Abstract

Driven by capitalist society's attention on the conduction of social life, Gordon Matta-Clark's (1943–1978) art interventions during the 1970s challenged the materialist concerns of architecture as a radical struggle against the prevailing social structures. In the first step of the analysis, we recognise that neither his cuts into the buildings were examinations of the history and design practice, nor his provocative physical interventions were oriented toward a rejection of architectural materiality. Quite to the contrary, through the physical act of building dematerilisation it seems that Gordon wishes to disclose how different familiar ideas were in conflict with each other. Accordingly, we can interpret Matta-Clark's activation of physical sites as a critical device for detecting how these "internal conflicts" embrace cultural paradox, new values and system of visuality. In fact, his 'anarchitectural' environments, to use Matta-Clark's term, recalibrate our appraisal of his spatial acts along the political, aesthetic and cultural evolution of the city. Along what is considered the politics of radical practices, his spatial interventions appear to be ventures into disappearance, a dream-like state, voyage to madness, or into the energetic event that one can almost inhabit. Having engaged his viewers in what appears to be a radical rethinking of the status, history and purpose of the buildings, and their relationships in the urban environment, this activist mode of operation undoubtedly challenged the boundaries between architecture, everyday life and high art. Then, could the condition in which architecture contemplates both its ontological mode of existence and its relations to the outside world, be seen as an opportunity to destabilize the very terms of aesthetic experience? The aim of this article is to disclose Matta-Clark's materialist concern as an opportunity for problematizing the rejection of logic, reason, and aestheticism of capitalist society and, accordingly, to expose architecture to new cultural intentions.

Katarina Andjelkovic, "The 1970s Radical Rethinking of Architecture: Social Rebellion and Terms of Aesthetic Experience,"
Art Style, Art & Culture International Magazine, v. 8, no. 8.1, part 2 (September 2021), 23-40.
DOI:10.5281/zenodo.5498375

Introduction

A pivotal figure in the Postminimalist generation, who was also the son of a prominent Surrealist, Matta-Clark, was a leader in the downtown artists' community in New York in the 1970s. He is widely seen as a pioneer of what has come to be known as social practice art. The relationship between the paradoxical durability of Matta-Clark's language and the ephemerality of his destructive acts, challenges the notion of durability in the present age in the global rhetoric of change, destruction and violence. This is particularly significant in reference to the space, building structures and destruction, which have been historically imbued, or in Mark Wigley's terms, "there is no space without violence and no violence that is not spatial."[1] In consequence, it becomes essential to visually analyse the notions of change and violence in their social context, as aesthetic, political, and fundamental experiences of liberty by the social actors. Accordingly, in the first step I will address Matta-Clark's relation to violence, destruction and change, and his proclivity toward counter cultural resistance. The late 1960s spirit of change has thrived on the repressive conditions generated by the system causing all aspects of our society to change dramatically. Society's attention is focused on the conduct of social life, a question of its ultimate aims, with inevitable effects on intellectual and artists pursuits. In urbanism, radical struggle was initiated against the city alienated by the capital and the state, while radical rethinking of architecture has emerged in relation to the tendency to undermine the homogeneity and repetitiveness that characterised neo-modernism. It is interesting to note that former architecture students acted like cultural innovators in such a way to engage the viewers in a radical rethinking of the status, history and purpose of buildings, walls and their relationships as part of the urban environment. These architectural 'activists' challenged the boundaries between everyday life and high art. Gordon Matta-Clark chose a specific approach to the buildings that symbolise the reality of our everyday life, with an aim to provoke it. His interest does not lie in the possible use of these buildings, but rather in places where you stop and spaces that are interruptions in your everyday movements through the city. These places inspired him to act as an artist and a critically alert inhabitant of the city, performing 'a continual process of moving in, passing through and getting away with it.'[2] He acted as the director of his own reality in the name of social rebellion and the desire to uncover the essence of social relations. For him, buildings comprise both a miniature cultural evolution and a model of prevailing social structures, and can therefore reveal the mask that lies on the surface of these relationships. He chose punching the facades, weakening the structural stability and testing resistance of materials, and intervened (fig. 1).

Figure 1. Gordon Matta-Clark, *The Conical Intersect,* 1975, photograph. Gordon Matta-Clark and Gerry Hovagimyan working on *Conical Intersect;* SFMOMA, San Francisco © Photo by Harry Gruyaert Estate of Gordon Matta-Clark/Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York/David Zwirner, New York.

The urge both to demolish an abandoned building and reinvent it by visual means perhaps speaks of a paradoxical superposition of diverse realities that cannot be understood within art or architecture historical accounts. Art historical accounts testify that, like many artists who used destruction as a means for creation, Matta-Clark was committed to transformation rather than to invent a new object.[3] This is evidenced in Matta-Clark's treatment of the *cut*, whereby *cut* is not an *object*, it is *performance* – live experience (fig. 2). Therefore, by re-inventing the building, the artist doesn't seek to invent a new object, but rather to change the perception of it, social perception, and overall perception. To be able to do that, he is addressing the anarchic energies that haunted the established order in favor of organizing experiential environments and exploring new modes of production. If we understand the abandoned buildings to be mediators of urban renewals and other transitional conditions, processes and relations, then our focus shifts from the 'buildings' towards the 'processes' that are organised around them. Thus, the analysis of Matta-Clark's work moves from object (building) to function (understanding this reality). The 'process of destruction' characteristic of his acts refers to a multitude of processes, from destructive operations implied in the understanding and structuring of spatial knowledge to the discursive implications of this artist's work as a locus for political intention. Therefore, this research addresses capturing the transformation of buildings: their use, processes of destruction, recording and translation, in Matta-Clark's films and photo-collages, which are ordered by chronological jumps and folds. In this context, asking how violating the building will open possibilities for new connections to occur, means drawing on Matta-Clark's dilemma: 'what working upon real world implies?'

Figure 2. Gordon Matta-Clark, *Circus*, 1978,
photographs © 2019 Estate of Gordon Matta-Clark, New York.

The Aesthetics of Worklessness

Today, Matta-Clark's violence over the prevailing social structures could be read as a redefinition of the art practices along what he considered 'performative act'. Nonetheless, I argue that it is possible to destabilize the very terms of aesthetic experience in the destructive processes of art making. For example, 'Object to Be Destroyed' is a work by American artist Man Ray, originally created in 1923. Publishing a book with the same title *Object to Be Destroyed. The Work of Gordon Matta-Clark* (2001), art historian Pamela M. Lee deals with the nature of Matta Clark's destructive acts. After Man Ray's original work was eventually destroyed 34 years later, multiple replicas started to appear renamed *Indestructible object*. A later version of the piece, called 'Object of Destruction,' was clear of a purpose and a motivation of destruction: cut out the eye from a photograph of one who has been loved but is seen no more. Attach the eye to the pendulum of a metronome and regulate the weight to suit the tempo desired. Keep going to the limit of endurance, and with a hammer well-aimed, try to destroy the whole at a single blow. The faith of Ray's object was eventually recounted after a group of students walked off the exhibition with his sculpture and then shot it. On the other hand, Pamela M. Lee chooses the same title 'Object to Be Destroyed' for her book, in which she points at the problematic behind the fact that Matta-Clark has been largely ignored within the history of art. This is evident in the chapter where she emphasizes his materialist concerns and describes his aesthetics as one of worklessness. Lee explains that Matta-Clark rejected reclamation, accumulation, and progress in favor of 'workless economies,' that 'intervene in the collective imperative to waste.'[4] Matta-Clark, Lee concludes, succeeded in threatening the ontological security of the art object, and in destabilizing the very 'terms of aesthetic experience.' [5] Therefore, the connection beyond the choice of the same titles seems obvious: both Matta-Clark's and Man Ray's objects are destroyed with intention to be re-invented, this time by visual means. More importantly, both objects are exposed to 'ephemeral acts' and for Lee this means that their ontological security is threatened.

We can also indicate the implicit ontology of contemporary architecture given the ephemerality of Matta-Clark's work. Indeed, his thinking in terms of forces, correlations, fields and transformational objects, has inscribed a 'relational ontology' within architectural discourse and practice. This is easy to prove if we start the analysis by opening the question regarding the nature of Matta-Clark's destructive acts: destruction was the answer, but what was the question behind his acts? As the 'house' is the main object of his intervention, and is ultimately the 'object to be destroyed,' this question directly addresses an uncritical attitude towards that problem. Le Corbusier warns us that the problem of the house has not been stated. In fact, Matta-Clark has shown his adherence to Le Corbusier's attitude by turning to Duchamp's statement, 'There is no solution because there is no problem.' Although Le Corbusier confidently 'threatens' with a radical statement in his *Vers une architecture:* 'Architecture, or Revolution,'[6] he clearly had 'The plan as the generator,' in his mind, in opposition to Matta-Clark who defined his interests in built space in more Duchampian way denying any established plan or program.[7] For him, this method would be just another way to show respect for the conventional methods of architecture. Instead, as Frances Richard noted, 'he hoped to circumvent the power struggles endemic to searches for programmatic truths.'[8] To do that, he started recognizing buildings in the sequential statement, comprised of segments, as intervals that simultaneously separate and link, deprived of any order in their mutual spatial relationships. Consequently, the poetics of space in Matta-Clark's terms take on specific meaning: it is in opposition to anything that is understood as the dictates of the profession. It disrupts conventionalised meaning by acting in direct experience, in order to invoke an exchange of the notion of artwork for the notion of art practice. In this new critical context, Matta-Clark offered a different option: understanding that a work of art is never really a 'finished' thing, because its reception admits to the time-consuming experience of the sequent deconstruction of architecture work. In consequence, what we recognise in Matta-Clark's interventions could be understood as an episodic structure that accommodates aggressive interventions on the products of human labor. Namely, we could understand his act as putting the material values of buildings into performative relationships within the built environment, whereas the time of performance coincides with the time of contemplation over the possible future of their relationships.

Act of Violence, Act of Liberation

Examining ways to reduce the violent temperament that is embedded in urban space, Keller Easterling claims 'I also don't need to drive a stake through the heart of the creator of that violence to reduce it; I don't need to exacerbate that violence to reduce it. It would be better if that violence (or that superbug) withered and died from lack of attention.'[9] Although Matta-Clark had an anarchic attitude to the built environment, he could direct attention to the act of violence only once he started filming his interventions. Although these records primarily served to capture the ephemeral status of the building and his actions around it, they in turn changed fundamentally their significance to a scale they didn't necessarily have before filming. Today we read the *performed violence* as Matta-Clark's intention to violate the traditional values of art practice and completely redefine it along what he considered a 'performative act,' while committed to collaborative and politically inflected art-making. Although his intention remains focused at buildings at all times, his research of architecture and space is initiated by taking references outside architecture. More precisely, what he considered limitations of architectural profession was reversed by questioning everything he would consider non-architectural: for example, movement, tactility and time. These ideas are easily detected in his recordings made by passing camera from hand to hand to create all around images, which enabled a continuous film flow and communication of the real time taken for each project. Therefore, his *performed violence* might be closely related to attacking what he considered essentially wrong in our perception of architecture. In his own words, 'Buildings are fixed entities in the minds of most. The notion of mutable space is virtually taboo – even in one's own house.'[10] From this reason he coined a term 'anarchitecture' which turned out to be more elusive than the fact that his works demonstrate an alternative attitude towards the architectural constructions, or against the attitudes of containerization of the usable space. Having this in mind, it is no surprise that Matta-Clark's act of violating the building is premised on what he called 'cutting a building for surprise,'[11] and 'to transform space into a state of mind.'[12] It was all a lesson in social engagement, play and possibility; or he only wanted to play innocently from his belief that art in a social context is a generous human act. And while most people criticised him for being esoteric or even absurd, he saw his own acts as a measure of freedom in society, claiming: 'All spaces have ambiguities. (…) Space is more than an 'esthetic' manipulation of form. It is this ambiguity that demands the liberation, clarification, amplification, augmentation, call it whatever you want.'[13] For this reason, the form of performance becomes a key tool for documenting different dimensions of his works. Using various film formats available at that time, he succeeded in not only capturing the complexity of the completed forms, but more importantly to achieve the effect of performance in these recordings.

Nonetheless, to be able to examine the concept 'mediating the spatiality of violence,' the research focuses on the analysis of Matta-Clark's distancing from architecture and approaching to the art world through film. His questioning of the everyday space in the context of *performed violence* starts inseparably from media and develops through negotiating the role of the media in our everyday life. In perhaps his most famous work *Splitting* (1974, fig. 3), un-edited film sequences show Matta-Clark cutting through a typical suburban house[14] in New Jersey. Matta-Clark made two parallel cuts down the center of the old frame house slated for demolition as part of an urban renewal scheme. He is bisecting the home and creating an ephemeral display of light inside the once-compartmentalised interior. Consequently, an apocalypse scenario is artificially challenged by moving and cutting the building, followed by moving and recording, as a way to inscribe the conflicting realities of the newly created space. On the one hand, the conflict is clearly communicated through the instability of a structure. We clearly see this threat of stability in the scene showing Matta-Clark working, walking, climbing around a ruin, in close-ups, and focusing the fragments of the structure that has nothing but a few jacks preventing it from collapse. On the other hand, his collages of photographs seem to offer an immediate solution by reconnecting the disassembled parts narratively and 'rebuilding' the house in imaginary way from tracings and recordings of the light beam which passes through the fissures of the disassembled structure. Clearly, Matta-Clark's work is premised on the role of media in space. Namely, if understood as components of physical and social landscapes, media display a distinctive and decisive set of qualities. More than tools for recording, storing, and transmitting information, they appear as resources negotiating with reality and with others within a particular situation. This way, media ultimately become tools for a situated mediation of violence. Consequently, a negotiation becomes necessary, which 'allows a space to acquire in itself a certain quality of mediation: space mediates – it becomes a medium.'[15] Media and spaces, inseparable entities as they seem to be, the first is enhancing, corrupting, extending or replacing the second, but media inherently shape our spaces, as well as violence that is taking place in them, warranting the term 'mediation.'

Figure 3. Gordon Matta-Clark, *Splitting*, 1974, collage of gelatin silver prints
© 2021 Estate of Gordon Matta-Clark / Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York.

Capturing Altered Perception

Through his practice, Matta-Clark communicates concepts and facts about the space in an attempt to negotiate physical boundaries by visual means. From this reason, it is not surprising that the camera was a constant element within his artistic process and that it took on a significant role in these negotiations. After starting out as an instrument for recording his performances, camera very quickly became a tool for perceiving the architectural, urban and social space, in which his interventions took place. Firstly, it was a logical way to capture altered perception provoked by the artist's 'building cuts.' Secondly, it was his way to refocus attention from architecture to exploration of the basic elements of movement and weight, as well as the redistribution of the light, the distorted sense of direction, the laws of gravity and the measuring of time. This way, for Matta-Clark camera became a critical device for transforming the spatial tropes of the everydayness and its system of visuality, physicality and performativity. His primary interest for considerations of everyday space was raised during the studies at Cornell, which was in complete opposition, focusing on formalism. War, political and racial assassinations and street riots, conflict between generations, all contributed to the feeling that a new order was evolving. Matta-Clark sensed both the dissolution of the old and the invigoration of seeking the new … He proceeded like an inspired alchemist — experimenting, remaking what art can be, and turning unexpected things, acts, and sites into poetic and memorable aesthetic experiences.[16] Anyhow, Matta-Clark felt a lack of means to express this feeling that a new order was evolving. While intervening within the building, he could only be focused at one part of the structure at a time, and thus he couldn't experience the building in its entirety. For this reason, he lacks capacity to receive that whole just as it is. However, when space is mediated by media, for example through Matta-Clark's photo-collage, the message conveyed to the observer changes drastically. In his *The Conical Intersect*[17] (1975, fig. 4), performed in the building next to the construction site for the future Georges Pompidou Center in Paris, we recognise Matta-Clark's intention to capture giant ideal circular openings on the façade, as precise as possible, to communicate with the world outside that frame. Obviously, looking for the ideal formal connection in the physical frame is a passage towards creating mental connection - a 'frame of vision' - considering a new view of the world. Like many artists who used destruction as a means for creation, Matta-Clark was committed to transformation.[18] Therefore, his intervention presents a transitory non-instrumental aspect of architecture, which gets its physical dimension by transposing into a transitory object: a residue after cutting the building in the shape of geodetic dome, space tube or kaleidoscope. In this way, contemplation of a new connection is understood in the possibility of repairing the remnants of lived life inside the house, as this intervention made possible to take a peep through into the content of the house, in a Duchampian way, while its function is exposed onto the facade like 'life on repair'.

Figure 4. Gordon Matta-Clark, *Conical Intersect*, 1975, silver dye bleach print, printed 1977
© 2018 Estate of Gordon Matta-Clark/Artists Rights Society (ARS), New York.

Such 'peephole show' is even more noticeable in the concept for his installation *Window Blow-Out* (1976, fig. 5). Mediated by film, both interventions transmit the invisible systems of meaning that lie on the threshold of the visible: while our eyes try to reconstruct the proper image of 3d space in the represented 'cut', what is omitted from the frame tend to confuse the viewer. If observed through Benjamin's notions of images as 'dialectics,'[19] Matta-Clark's work has the power to bring together a dialogue between the two conditioned points of view of the image maker and image reader. Likewise, dialectics begin at the image plane, but extend and further intensify at the limits of the image itself. In addition, there is always that mystical space beyond the image plane, outside the frame, a contested vision exposed to speculation. Those thresholds of perception open a vision to interpretation by the viewer, because our eyes constantly try to recompensate what cannot be seen beyond our own visual frame. Given that perception is far from an instantaneous mechanical function, but is rather a real-time cinematic process that blends images together through time,[20] the interpretation by the viewer is subject to the cognitive process of imaging space, as the mind carries forward the memory of the past while creating or interpreting images. This kind of art practice is also characteristic of late 60s and early 70s, the time when Matta-Clark actively contributed the art scene. It was the subject of critical exploration of the nexus between the different avant-gardes in film and art, which called for a radicalised understanding of the viewer's perception from filmic action to the particular temporalities of the medium. Matta-Clark's work was inspired by such exploration, whose representatives Bruce Nauman or Robert Smithson were intervening with the diverse practices of post-Minimalism and Land art. They were engaged in critical investigations with film as a medium within the domain of visual arts, with the aim to resist the technological and ideological forces of the globalised marketplace. Most importantly, the main motive of these films was to refuse and frustrate the normative processes by which the mass media imposes subjective identification with its social apparatus.[21]

Figure 5. Gordon Matta-Clark, *Window Blow-Out*, 1976, photograph
© 2019 Estate of Gordon Matta-Clark, New York.

Conclusion

Hito Steyerl reminds us that a material thing is never just an object, but a fossil in which a constellation of forces is petrified.[22] She continues by claiming that, 'Things are never just inert objects, passive items, or lifeless shucks, but consist of tensions, forces, hidden powers, all being constantly exchanged.'[23] It is the classical materialist insight through which Matta-Clark's interventions tend to provoke the forces at play in our society. These forces are present in his sketches of the representation of movement and time (fig. 6), through which he communicates that the things could speak to one another in our society. It is this entanglement with the society that differs Matta-Clark from the Dada artists and Land artists, with whom critics often associate him. As Clark explains, unlike Smithson *et al.*, 'I have chosen not isolation from the social conditions but to deal directly with social conditions whether by physical implication (…) or through more direct community involvement.'[24] From this reason, the views of architecture he provided through camera are themselves provocations, as 'punch holes' in the city's nomenclature helping 'the slumbering collective from the dream-filled sleep of capitalist production' to wake up and tap into the forces.[25] He further aroused our curiosity by offering the impossible views into the skin of the old buildings, from inaccessible locations, as well as the ephemerality of the building structure destined for demolition, so that we inevitably become part of his peep-show. This kind of artistic voyeurism is stimulated by architectural 'cut' as argument that accommodates his desire to discover what constitutes the foundation of human society and culture. After all, these 'anarchitectural' environments, to use Matta-Clark term, recalibrate our appraisal of his spatial acts along the political, aesthetic and cultural evolution of the city. Along what is considered the politics of radical practices, he created the condition in which architecture contemplates both its ontological mode of existence and its relations to the outside world. Each of us is offered a spyglass to turn it to the world, which opens up a double introspection: directed toward the interior, it casts doubt on architecture; while directed toward the exterior, it casts doubt on the world, and thus destabilize the very terms of aesthetic experience. Consequently, the left-overs from his interventions look more like the relationship between: visible remnant (rejected reality) and invisible harmony (idealised visions of a perfect society).

Figure 6. Gordon Matta-Clark, *Energy Tree*, ca. 1972-73,
graphite, ink, felt-tip pen, and crayon on paper, 22 ½ x 28 ½ in. (57.2 x 72.4 cm)
© 2019 Estate of Gordon Matta-Clark, New York.

Author Biography

Katarina Andjelkovic (PhD, MArch Eng), Atelier AG Andjelkovic, is a theorist, practicing architect, researcher and a painter. Katarina's research, writing and teaching is transdisciplinary and crosses architecture, visual arts and film. She served as a Visiting Professor at the University of Oklahoma (the US), at the Institute of Form Theory and History in Oslo, Institute of Urbanism and Landscape in Oslo, the University of Belgrade, and guest-lectured at TU Delft, AHO Oslo, FAUP Porto, DIA Anhalt Dessau, SMT New York, ITU Istanbul. She has lectured at conferences in more than twenty-six countries in Europe, the UK, the US and Canada; has published her research widely in international journals (Web of Science); won numerous awards for her architecture design and urban design competitions. Katarina won the Belgrade Chamber of Commerce Award for Best Master Thesis defended at Universities in Serbia in all disciplines. Katarina has published two monographs; a book chapter and several journal articles with Intellect. E-mail: katarina.code@gmail.com

Notes

1. Frances Richard, *Gordon Matta-Clark: Physical Poetics* (Oakland, CA: University of California Press, 2019), 231.

2. In Matta-Clark's own words, cited by Frances Richard in her Frances Richard, *Gordon Matta-Clark: Physical Poetics* (Oakland, CA: University of California Press, 2019), 4.

3. Kristine Stiles, review of *Object to be Destroyed. The Work of Gordon Matta-Clark*, by Pamela M. Lee, *caa.reviews,* August 23, 2000, http://www.caareviews.org/reviews/350#.XY4SQUYzaUk. Accessed on September 29, 2019.

4. Pamela M. Lee, *Object to be Destroyed: The Work of Gordon Matta-Clark* (MIT Press, 1999).

5. Kristine Stiles, review of *Object to be Destroyed*.

6. Le Corbusier, *Towards a New Architecture*, trans. Frederick Etchells (1931; repr., New York: Dover Publications, Inc., 1986), 17-47.

7. In the interview, Marcel Duchamp replies to Pierre Cabanne's question on the expectation from painting: "I have no idea. I really had no program, or any established plan." In Pierre Cabanne, *Dialogues with Marcel Duchamp*, trans. Ron Padgett (1967; repr., Da Capo Press, 1971), 25.

8. Frances Richard, *Gordon Matta-Clark: Physical Poetics* (Oakland, CA: University of California Press, 2019), 244.

9. Cit. Keller Easterling in: George Papamattheakis, "Inside Keller Easterling's personal medium design," *Strelka Mag,* September 18, 2019, Strelkamag.com. Accessed on September 30, 2019.

10. Donald Wall, "Gordon Matta-Clark's Building Dissections," *Arts* 50, no. 9 (May, 1976). Reprinted in *Gordon Matta-Clark,* ed. Corinne Diserns (Phaidon, 2003).

11. Adrian Searle, "How Gordon Matta-Clark took a chainsaw to 70s New York," *The Guardian*, last modified November 30, 2018, https://www.theguardian.com/artanddesign/2018/nov/30/gordon-matta-clark-new-york-art-deconstruction

12. Ibid.

13. Yann Chateigné, "Material Thinking: Gordon Matta-Clark," revu par Yann Chateigné, at CCA, Montreal, Canada, lecture June 7, 2019, on the occasion of the 2019–2020 Out of the Box exhibition opening at Octagonal Gallery, June 7 - September 8, 2019.

14. Gordon Matta-Clark, *Splitting*, 1974: 10:50 min, b&w and color, silent, Super 8mm film on HD video.

15. Francesco Casetti, "Mediascapes: A Decalogue," *Perspecta* 51: Medium (The MIT Press, 2018), 21.

16. Michael Danoff, "Foreword," in *Gordon Matta-Clark: A Retrospective*, ed. Mary Jane Jacob (Chicago: Museum of Contemporary Art, 1985), 6.

17. Gordon Matta-Clark, *The Conical Intersect,* 1975, 18:40 min, color, silent, 16 mm film on HD video.

18. Kristine Stiles, in *caa.reviews,* August 23, 2000.

19. Read about the dialectical images in Benjamin's Arcades Project. Furthermore, the most compelling interpretation of dialectical image is to be found in Susan Buck-Morss, *The Dialectics of Seeing: Walter Benjamin and the Arcades Project* (Cambridge: MIT Press, 1989). See also Michael Jennings, *Dialectical Images: Walter Benjamin's Theory of Literary Criticism* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1987).

20. Gilles Deleuze, *Cinema 1: The Movement-Image*, trans. Hugh Tomlinson and Barbara Habberjam (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1986).

21. Tanya Leighton, "Introduction," in *Art and The Moving Image. A Critical Reader,* ed. Tanya Leighton (TATE Publishing + Afterall, 2008), 18.

22. Hito Steyerl, *The Wretched of the Screen* (Berlin: Sternberg Press, 2012), 55.

23. Ibid, 55.

24. This passage is from one version of Donald Wall's conversation with Matta-Clark, where Matta-Clark discusses Duchamp in reference to Dadaist and Land Art concerns. In Donald Wall, "Gordon Matta-Clark's Building Dissections," *Arts* 50, no. 9 (May 1976): 77.

25. Christopher Bracken, "The Language of Things: Walter Benjamin's Primitive Thought," *Semiotica,* no. 138 (February 2002): 347.

Bibliography

Nowell-Smith, Geoffrey. *L'Avventura*. London: BFI Publishing, 1997.

Richard, Frances. *Gordon Matta-Clark: Physical Poetics*. Oakland, CA: University of California Press, 2019.

Stiles, Kristine. Review of *Object to be Destroyed. The Work of Gordon Matta-Clark*, by Pamela M. Lee. *Caa.reviews,* August 23, 2000. http://www.caareviews.org/reviews/350#.XY4SQUYzaUk

Lee, Pamela M. *Object to be Destroyed: The Work of Gordon Matta-Clark.* MIT Press, 1999.

Le Corbusier. *Towards a New Architecture*. Translated by Frederick Etchells. 1931. Reprint, New York: Dover Publications, Inc., 1986.

Cabanne, Pierre. *Dialogues with Marcel Duchamp*. 1967. Translated by Ron Padgett. Da Capo Press, 1971.

Papamattheakis, George. "Inside Keller Easterling's personal medium design." *Strelka Mag,* September 18, 2019. Strelkamag.com

Wall, Donald. "Gordon Matta-Clark's Building Dissections." *Arts* 50, no. 9 (May 1976).

Searle, Adrian. "How Gordon Matta-Clark took a chainsaw to 70s New York." *The Guardian*. Last modified November 30, 2018. https://www.theguardian.com/artanddesign/2018/nov/30/gordon-matta-clark-new-york-art-deconstruction

Chateigné, Yann. "Material Thinking: Gordon Matta-Clark," by Yann Chateigné, at CCA, Montreal, Canada, lecture June 7, 2019.

Matta-Clark, Gordon. *Splitting*, 1974: 10:50 min, b&w and color, silent, Super 8mm film on HD video.

Casetti, Francesco. "Mediascapes: A Decalogue." *Perspecta,* no. 51: Medium (2018): 21.

Danoff, Michael. "Foreword." In *Gordon Matta-Clark: A Retrospective,* edited by Mary Jane Jacob, 6. Chicago: Museum of Contemporary Art, 1985.

Matta-Clark, Gordon. *The Conical Intersect,* 1975: 18:40 min, color, silent, 16 mm film on HD video.

Deleuze, Gilles. *Cinema 1: The Movement-Image*. Translated by Hugh Tomlinson and Barbara Habberjam. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1986.

Leighton, Tanya. "Introduction." In *Art and The Moving Image. A Critical Reader, edited by* Tanya Leighton, 18. TATE Publishing + Afterall, 2008.

Steyerl, Hito. *The Wretched of the Screen*. Berlin: Sternberg Press, 2012.

Bracken, Christopher. "The Language of Things: Walter Benjamin's Primitive Thought." *Semiotica,* no. 138 (February 2002): 347.

Visions of Modernity

Architecture, Colonialism, and Indigeneity Across the Americas

Brandon Sward

Abstract

In this essay, I use the "The Metropolis in Latin America, 1830–1930" exhibition at the Getty Center to think through how and why *criollos*, Latin Americans who are solely or mostly of Spanish descent, adopted the aesthetics and techniques of Mesoamerican construction methods. I then introduce the Walt Disney Concert Hall and the Broad Museum in downtown Los Angeles to explore the resonances between Euro-American postmodernism and colonial urban planning, especially with regard to the clean lines and rational geometry of the Royal Ordinances through which the Spanish king wielded his authority in the faraway New World. In this way, I propose a revisionist history of modernism which suggest that Indigeneity played an important role in these developments as a source which was at once appropriated and disavowed. Far from being a specifically Latin American phenomenon, I argue that colonial architecture was strongly taken up in Anglo America, particularly in the Southwest (which of course only became part of the US as a result of the Mexican Cession). I argue that aspiring modernists turned to these traditions in their search for a uniquely "American" style to distinguish itself from its European inheritances, resulting in a predilection for movements such the Mission and Pueblo Revivals. I conclude with some reflections as to the potential implications of this argument as to what an anti-colonial architecture might entail, with a focus on museum display practices and what these imply about how they envision their purpose and relationships with their publics.

Brandon Sward, "Visions of Modernity: Architecture, Colonialism, and Indigeneity Across the Americas,"
Art Style, Art & Culture International Magazine, v. 8, no. 8.1, part 2 (September 2021), 43-54.
DOI: 10.5281/zenodo.5498383

Building Between Past and Future

Between West Second Street and West General Thaddeus Kosciuszko Way in Downtown Los Angeles, the Broad (2015) rises above South Grand Avenue, as if it were silently competing with the Walt Disney Concert Hall (2003) across the street for the award of "most modern" building. Such a contest would be difficult to judge, as the two landmarks offer such different visions of modernity. The Walt Disney Concert is steel, curves, and constant movement. The Broad, on the other hand, is white, hard lines, and pores. Both buildings seem to proudly proclaim their liberation from the past, the fever dream of all diehard modernists. But we can of course only ascertain what is "new" through comparison to the past. In this way, the past lives on in even the most modern of presents, even if only negatively. Accordingly, the question we might pose to modern architecture is: What is a building's connection to the past, particularly if it doesn't have any readily identifiable markers of that past?

A recent exhibition organized by the Getty Research Institute in Los Angeles entitled "The Metropolis in Latin America, 1830–1930" is helpful in answering such a question, insofar as explores the relationship between history and architecture within the region where both the Walt Disney Concert Hall and the Broad were to be constructed (Remember: the Western US was once all part of the New Spanish province of *Alta California*, "Upper California"). In architecture, the new is not always as new as it seems and is often a more or less overt reassembly of the past. But in order to get a fuller sense of the stylistic fodder for the Walt Disney Concert Hall and the Broad, let us start even before 1830. For even from the first moment of colonial encounter, the Spanish had distinct ideas about how their settlements in the New World were to look. Consider the following words written by King Felipe II of Spain, as recorded in the "Royal Ordinances Concerning the Laying Out of New Towns," written on July 3, 1573 in San Lorenzo, outside of Madrid:

> On arriving at the locality where the new settlement is to be founded (which according to our will and ordinance must be one which is vacant and can be occupied without doing harm to the Indians and natives or with their free consent) the plan of the place, with its squares, streets and building lots is to be outlined by means of measuring by cord and ruler, beginning with the main square from which streets are to run to the gates and principal roads and leaving sufficient open space so that even if the town grows it can always spread in a symmetrical manner. [1]

Figure 1. Isaak Tirion, *Platte Grond van Lima, de Hoofdstad van Peru*, ca. 1760
Getty Research Institute, P840001. Image reproduced under 'Fair Use' condition.

This "main square" was so closely associated with Spain that it became known as a *cuadrícula española*, or Spanish grid (fig. 1). Many of the cities founded during the period of Spanish colonization remain centered on a plaza, streets stretching from each of its four sides. It is as if the plaza were the seed of the city, containing within itself a logic waiting to unfold. This invocation of Cartesian space is the perfect metaphor for imperialism. Although rooted in the square, the settlement could extend *ad infinitum* as long as it didn't run into unconsenting "Indians and natives." Later on, the King acquiesces that if the Indigenous peoples resist conversion, "the settlers are to proceed to establish their own but are not to take any of the personal belongings of the Indians or to do them more hurt than what may be necessary in order to protect the settlers and enable them to build without interference." [2] Of course, this is only the natural consequence of the centralization and hierarchy implied by building around a square. By leaving the center of the town empty, it is as if the King, who decreed these settlements but never saw them, were leaving a space for himself, from which he would rule with perfect, uniform, geometric sovereignty. The Laws of the Indies (*Leyes de Indias*), which encompassed the "Royal Ordinances," were the embodiment of reason and order. Like all ideas of "civilization," this model understood itself against the uncivilized, in this case the irrational and disorderly Indigenous peoples. So superior did the King believe Spanish culture was to Indigenous culture that the Indians would be "filled with wonder" by it and "fear the Spaniards so much that they will not dare to offend them and will respect them and desire their friendship." [3]

When we think of Spaniards in the New World, we indeed tend to think of their influence in terms of culture (language, religion, etc.); "The Metropolis in Latin America," however, invites us to reconsider that influence in terms of architecture. From the time of King Felipe II to 1830, a constant stylistic source for architecture in New Spain was Europe and many of the metropolises of Latin America bearing a striking resemblance to their European counterparts (fig. 2).

As Europe experimented with its own architecture, bits and pieces of it were effectively flung across the Atlantic Ocean, landing in cities like Buenos Aires, Mexico City, and Rio de Janeiro. Colonial holdovers like the plaza were joined by emulations of Georges-Eugène Haussmann's famous renovation of Paris (1853–70). This architectural blend had the effect of creating internal divisions within Latin America, with more status accruing to those cities and countries that were more able to imitate European ideals. For example, Argentinians, and especially residents of Buenos Aires, have long been stereotyped as snobs, accused of

regarding themselves as the "Europeans of Latin America." To this day, the main opera house in Buenos Aires, the *Teatro Colón*, is regarded as the premier Latin American opera house and continues to stage performances of what might be considered the most quintessentially European of art forms. Time and again, architecture was operationalized to show how much the New World could resemble the Old.

Figure 2. Auguste Génine, *Las Iluminaciones, Calle del 5 de Mayo*, 1910
Getty Research Institute, 95.R.104. Image reproduced under 'Fair Use' condition.

"The Metropolis in Latin America" also shows us, however, how the 19th century was simultaneously an era of revolution, wherein Latin America separated itself from Europe. Shrouded by a mythology comparable to that of George Washington, Simón Bolívar helped to liberate Venezuela, Bolivia, Colombia, Ecuador, Peru, and Panama from Spanish rule and even envisioned a confederation of Latin American states similar to the US. By the 1910s, most Latin American countries were celebrating the centennials of their independence from Spain, leading to various identity crises intensified by the most terrible war the world had yet seen. As the centennials and their attendant celebrations crept up, Latin Americans were forced come to terms with what it meant to commemorate revolutions against a colonizer they had tried so hard to emulate. During this period architecture shifted away from being a tool with which to quash Indigeneity toward being one to foster it, though we will see that this revivified Indigeneity was all too often a twisted, funhouse-mirror version of itself. Although this reclamation could have occurred in any number of ways, architecture was the most natural choice since it was through architecture that the Spanish exercised their

authority in the first place (both generally through the very act of building on Indigenous land and more specifically through less subtle displays of dominance like constructing Catholic churches atop Indigenous temples). Through the efforts of archeologists, a past that had been literally pressed into the earth came again to see the light of day. In sharp contrast to the austere lines of the Spanish grid and the wide boulevards of the European capitals, the twisted forms of the Mesoamerican deities suggested a very different model for design. Rather than rational modernism, these pagan gods evoke a realm of ancient mysticism and communion with nature (fig. 3).

Figure 3. Elena Izcue, "Pre-Hispanic figures," 1926.
From *El arte peruano en la escuela II* (Paris), pl. 31
Getty Research Institute, 91-B7095. Image reproduced under 'Fair Use' condition.

Attempts to revive cultures that were once the enemies of Spanish hegemony led to folklorized and sanitized recollections of pre-Colombian history. This selective amnesia was particularly pointed in Southern California, where "Mission Revival" architecture flourished between 1890 and 1915, and a trend to which "The Metropolis in Latin America" also devotes attention. During the colonization of California, Franciscans built 21 missions stretching from present-day San Diego past the San Francisco Bay. El Camino Real, the "Royal Road" or "King's Highway," connected these missions, creating a single front of Spanish power in North America. With their tiled roofs, stuccoed walls, and arched windows/doors, the missions were direct responses to the difficulties attending their construction (limited materials, unskilled labor, a desire to imitate Spanish architecture, etc.). The Mission Revival decontextualized the missions, using them for the political purpose of finding a "vernacular architecture" to counter the various forms of "polite architecture" imported from Europe. This new architecture deemphasized the association of the Spanish missionaries with cultural genocide by inserting them into a new context wherein viewers would often not know the histories of these structures but might nevertheless recognize them. The proponents of Mission Revival used the missions as a kind of "authenticity Viagra" intended to prop up Californian uniqueness. But these tactics were geared at more than mere spectacle.

Figure 4. Unknown, Hollywoodland, 1923–29. Image reproduced under 'Fair Use' condition.

For example, San Diego held the "Panama–California Exposition" from 1915 to 1917 in order to celebrate the opening of the Panama Canal and to advertise the city as the first US port for ships passing westward through the Canal. The Exposition naturally required the construction of many buildings, originally planned in the Mission and Pueblo Revival styles. Under the supervision of New York architects Bertram Goodhue and Carleton Winslow, however, the Exhibition moved toward the Spanish Baroque, distinguished by its use of Churrigueresque, a style of elaborate sculptural ornamentation named after the Spanish architect José Benito de Churriguera and visible on the façade of the Cathedral of Santiago de Compostela. Spanish Colonial revivalists like Goodbye and Winslow rerouted architecture that was once intended to inspire awe among the Indians to instead exude a folksy charm that shared several elements with Mission Revival like stucco, tile, and arched windows, but added others such as balconies (fig. 4). Though visually distinct, the revivals of mission and Spanish colonial architecture share a common aim: the dehistoricization of architecture to cultivate a sense of idiosyncrasy.

Moving beyond "The Metropolis in Latin America," we can appreciate how retrospective paradigms like Mission, Pueblo, and Spanish Colonial Revival architecture uncouple style from oppression, marginalization, and dominance. By purging these architectural forms of their negative associations, the various revivals of these styles were freed up to become badges of newly neutralized uniqueness. But we almost always see the past through rose-colored glasses. When it comes to time, the "Royal Ordinances" have a definite beginning but no foreseeable end; they are the work of a King who thought colonialism might go on forever. Revival architecture, on the other hand, has a definite "end," or point from which it surveys the past, but does not really have a clear "beginning" it looks back upon. In other words, it is often unclear what exactly is being revived because the Revivalists stripped their historical sources of much of their historicity. We can witness in these Revivals missions divorced from their proselytizing function and colonial architecture from its own violent history—a convenient forgetting allowing us to remember only the parts of the past that do not make us uncomfortable. There is a similar temporal disconnect in the case of the Pueblo Revival. For many of the ancestral Puebloans, architecture was connected to *timelessness*, as construction was often guided by astronomical phenomena, such as solar and lunar cycles. But for Santa Fe, the most notable example of Pueblo Revivalism, the decision to architecturally privilege adobe as a construction material in 1912 was motivated by little other than the desire to transform Santa Fe into "The City Different" and thereby attract tourist dollars. Rather than timeless, Santa Fe's embrace of Pueblo revival architecture couldn't have been timelier.

"The Metropolis in Latin America" helps us understand how urban architecture provided a site within which nations reimagined themselves. But does "The Metropolis in Latin America" rise above mere antiquarian interest? How might the history of Latin American architecture help us understand how we build today? For the sake of example, let us return to the city with which we opened: Los Angeles. This choice is not arbitrary. The second largest city in the US has several qualities that make it an ideal case for thinking about the future of construction. Unlike the settlements radiating outwards from a central plaza qua the "Royal Ordinances," Los Angeles is a city that feels more as if its peripheries determine its center. Much of our sociological knowledge is predicated upon 19th-century cities centralized around a certain area, like Chicago's "Loop." But the oft-maligned "urban sprawl" of Los Angeles seems to be the more appropriate prototype for the cities of the 20th and 21st centuries.

Without a doubt, Los Angeles has its fair share of Mission, Pueblo, and Spanish Colonial Revival architecture, but what about buildings being built there now like The Broad? The Broad seems to be an archetypical modern, "starchitect"–designed building, as if Steve Jobs were to build a museum. There is simultaneously enough about it to make it look like all too many other buildings and enough about it to make it feel unique. There is nothing about the Broad that feels particularly nostalgic—no references to Californian pasts to shore up its authenticity *pace* Mission, Pueblo, and Spanish Colonial Revival architecture. But does this mean there is no connection between the Broad and the past? If we return to the time before the Revivals, is there perhaps some resonance between the clean geometry of the Broad and the archetypal grid of the New Spanish city?

Answering to this question requires a bit of backtracking. We see that the architectural scheme initially envisioned in the "Royal Ordinances" involved an engagement with Indigeneity that is ironically absent from the various Revivalisms, since these movements were more concerned with pilfering scraps of autochthonous cultures to stylistically distinguish themselves than they were with appreciating the complexity of Indigenous life. This outcome makes sense, however, once we remember the rose-colored glasses that cause whatever is seen through them to appear both attractive and distorted, or attractive precisely *because* it is distorted. By contrast, the initial colonial conquest did not confront Indigeneity as a buried ideal to be resurrected, but as a concrete reality to be resolved. But the Broad has at best only a tangential relationship to Indigeneity. What sense does it make to speak of it in such a context?

The answer lies not in Indigeneity per se, but in a certain relationship to the world. Though the colonial age is sometimes euphemistically referred to as the "Age of Discovery," it was not merely fueled by European curiosity. The ships crossing the Atlantic were propelled not just by wind but also by capital. Many of these "discoverers" were hoping to get rich, initially by locating shorter transportation routes, but then by finding a whole New World rich with natural resources. The monarchs overseeing these expeditions used this increase in new objects to demonstrate the extent of their empires, creating "cabinets of curiosities" or encyclopedic collections showcasing objects from all over the world (fig. 5). Although they did not make distinctions between areas like natural history, geology, archeology, and art, these rooms were in many ways the precursors of modern museums. We might see an analogy between the cultural globalism implied by these cabinets and the museum. In both cases, objects are linked to certain geographic locations, understood to represent some inherent quality of that place. In the same way that these cabinets functioned as architectural microcosms, museums usually assign different time periods and regions to different wings, thus reproducing a world in miniature.

Figure 5. Unknown, *Museum Wormianum; seu, Historia rerum rariorum*, 1655
Leiden: ex officina Elseviriorum. 6 p. l., 389, [3] p. illus.
Image reproduced under 'Fair Use' condition.

The cabinet of curiosity strangely echoes the linearity of "Royal Ordinances." Everything within the cabinet is ordered, even when it confronts radical Otherness. In fact, these devices might be interpreted as ways otherness is tamed and translated. The "Royal Ordinances" decreed that the Spanish settlers were to make good faith efforts to convert the Amerindians not only to Christianity but also to Spanish custom; similar to how Indigenous objects were brought into the classificatory schemes of the cabinets. Architecture was a key part of this strategy, inasmuch as the Spaniards thought their buildings would cow the Indians into cooperation, or at least acceptance. In either case, an encounter with the Other is settled through incorporation into a preexisting "neutral" and "natural" order. When European maps began to be drawn upon the gridlines of latitude and longitude, a Cartesian space opened up in which the cartographer might draw sea monsters or other mythological creatures to mark the unknown. Through conquest, the Europeans began to replace myth with reality—or so they thought. The specific objects brought back from the Americas made the distant near and helped anchor a rapidly expanding world, providing possibly the first glimpses of global consciousness. What if we understood the museum as a modern-day cabinet of curiosities? Like the cabinet, the museum brings together objects from different countries made by artists of different races, genders, and sexual orientations. These works are carefully displayed in an orderly fashion, down to the wall texts giving us whatever some curator determined was the necessary information for their appreciation. Both the museum and the cabinets of curiosity architecturally perform the key function of authoritatively organizing the world by recreating this world within a building, or even a room.

From one point of view, art ostensibly represents the height of capitalist excess—within it production becomes entirely divorced from need. From another point of view, art might interrupt consumerist modes of engagement by forcing us to interact with that which cannot immediately benefit us. In short, art could be radically transformative, but is all too often a mere selfie backdrop. This shallow engagement is encouraged by museums like the Broad, which rely upon sensational exhibits like Yayoi Kusama's *Infinity Mirrors* to attract visitors; an Instagram post by Katy Perry within one of these rooms was attributed with increasing public interest in Kusama's work. Through their orderliness and sterility, museums defang whatever radical potential art might have. This occurs through framing practices geared to make the public feel like they "got" the work, practices that include the architectural spaces within which art is shown.

Is it possible to envision new types of architecture that do not try to render the Other docile and legible? If so, museums are the ideal places to begin this reimagining, since they are in many ways the repositories of the world's cultural wealth. If we cannot have difficult conversations around topics like Indigeneity within a museum, where are we to have them? With every modern architecture comes a vision of modernity because every architecture implies a certain way of arranging space and by extension of ordering the world. And every modernity has heretofore created a premodernity as its dark shadow. Is modernity truly incapable of universality or is there a way of squaring this circle? Could an architecture of the future help us imagine new and less exclusionary ways of being together? Regardless of our answers to these questions, it is clear that any path forward requires knowing how we got where we are and knowing how we got where we are now requires understanding how the production of space simultaneously creates and is created by how we see one other and our world.

Author Biography

Brandon Sward is an artist, writer, and scholar who lives and works in Los Angeles. He was a quarterfinalist for the VanderMey Nonfiction Prize, was shortlisted for Disquiet International's Literary Prize, and was an honorable mention and finalist for the New Millennium Writing Awards. He's won residencies at Alternative Worksite, Byrdcliffe, the Hambidge Center, the Institute for LGBTQ+ Studies, Main Street Arts, NAVE, SloMoCo, the Sundress Academy, the Vermont Studio Center, the Virginia Center for the Creative Arts, the Wassaic Project, and Western Montana Creative Initiatives. His first solo show, *How the West was lost*, opens at Stone House Art Gallery in October 2021.

Notes

1. Nuttall, "Royal Ordinances," 250.
2. Ibid., 254.
3. Ibid.

Bibliography

Nuttall, Zelia. "Royal Ordinances Concerning the Laying Out of New Towns." *The Hispanic American Historical Review* 5, no. 2 (May 1922): 249–54. https://doi.org/10.2307/2506027.

Socializing Sculpture

Commemorative Public Art as a Pedagogical Tool

Piper Prolago

Abstract

As protestors across the world call for the toppling of statues celebrating racist figures, cities must consider what new narratives and designs for public art can most appropriately and inclusively engage communities in conversations about the past. While many studies center on finding anti-racist figures to instead celebrate, I propose a method for evaluating projects that centers upon critical pedagogy and community involvement rather than emulating the monumental hero model with new heroes. In this way, we might envision a more inclusive commemorative landscape by entirely reimagining its structure. While the public may trust monuments to present an unbiased account of history, implicit in their status as representations of history is their interpretive nature, which is necessarily situated in a particular viewpoint. Creators must maximize the potential of public spaces to communicate to a wider audience while also considering the historic asymmetries that continue to favor white, male perspectives within these spaces. Public art serves as a potential tool to reshape cityscapes and address historic injustices. This paper investigates projects' abilities to meet this potential by combining scholarship in critical pedagogy and memory studies, as well as analyzing existing projects in terms of their educational and interactive qualities. I conclude that public art projects addressing historical injustices must incorporate inclusive pedagogical models like those of Paulo Freire and bell hooks. Tulsa's Greenwood Art Project, which commemorates the 1921 Race Massacre, might serve as a model for this. Head artist Rick Lowe, informed by the theory of social sculpture, is able to address community members' various perspectives, not just in the realization of the project but in all levels of its conception. By rethinking the relationship between artist and audience, public art projects have the potential to incorporate previously erased perspectives without positing a single, universal truth.

Piper Prolago, "Socializing Sculpture: Commemorative Public Art as a Pedagogical Tool,"
Art Style, Art & Culture International Magazine, v. 8, no. 8.1, part 2 (September 2021), 57-78.
DOI: 10.5281/zenodo.5498389

Introduction

Commemorative public art has the exceptional potential to narrate history to a larger community but does so without the space to explore the nuances allowed for in museums. In the urban environment, artists must doubly consider the ways to frame the narrative of an event, person, or place, as well as to consider the particular audience they wish to reach. In doing this, public art can frame the past by composing a specific perspective of history that becomes the "truth." The stories that are told here, in turn, often recreate power structures underlying a particular community; only those with resources can access the space to create these works. They are therefore effectively allowed to write history as it manifests in them. As the toppling of confederate and other racist monuments challenges people across the world to rethink the role of public art in remembering the past, creators must respond to these changes by adapting new models to create art that more appropriately addresses historic injustices.

As we consider the ways to reframe history through art, a shift in thinking about the relationship between the artist and the community is an effective means to not only work towards overturning the whitewashing of history, but also engaging a wider audience. Over time, commemorative public art projects have been transformed, moving from an older model seen in statues looking back at historical "heroes," through the abstracted memorial to become increasingly interactive. Through these shifts, the distance between artist and audience gradually shrinks. As this happens, public art projects move more and more towards representing the public, rather than representing history *to* the public. Reframing discourse about these projects and planning for public art initiatives with the intention to fuse the artist and audience allows communities to address history most effectively and inclusively, particularly historical injustices that are perpetuated in systemic racism and classism.

Constructing Heroes

Monuments in public spaces have been a particularly hot topic as protestors across the world topple statues of controversial figures like confederate soldiers or political figures with histories of exploitation. As these monuments fall, it is increasingly urgent to both consider the systems which allowed them to be erected and the effects that these have on the collective memory of the individuals that cities choose to remember. The endeavor to monumentalize history in the form of heroic individuals is a particularly illustrative example of the ways in which public space can be mobilized as a tool to control the collective memory of an event, person, or circumstance. If the ideal notion of public spaces aspires to assign them a level of universality, the messages that public art carry consequently aspire to represent universal values. The selected candidates for monuments, then, are representative of political powers constructing a particular national consciousness, a self-replicating system that advantages white male perspectives of history.

The celebration of an individual like Christopher Columbus, for example, highlights the ways in which a dishonest and privileged framing can shape public opinion—both of Columbus himself and of the legacy he represents. While the long-standing perception of Columbus in the country credits him with the discovery of the Americas, this perspective necessarily ignores the resulting colonization and genocide of Native Americans which his expeditions spurred.[1] Celebrating Columbus allows the country to avoid confrontation with this destructive past and to frame the beginnings of American history as a triumph in exploration rather than in exploitation. Individuals with a vested interest in bolstering this view of history are those who benefit from the gaping holes it leaves in considering the implication of "discovering" land that was already populated. To protect these interests, those with economic resources and political power can "organize public space to convey (and thus to teach the public) desired political lessons."[2] In this, monuments to figures such as Columbus allow for a fabrication of consensus cementing them in history, effectively squelching opposing perspectives.[3] Recalling the contradiction of a single public, the model for memorializing circumstances such as the colonization of the Americas definitionally privileges the white, upper-class public at the expense of individuals affected by this exploitation. As public spaces are mobilized to serve the interests of those in power, they effectively become less about serving and more about controlling the public.

The growing debate over blatantly racist figures like Jefferson Davis and Robert E. Lee has shown, however, the model of monumentalizing any figure brings with it certain limitations. Even when depicting non-white individuals, monuments to historic "heroes" can still white-wash and regulate history to continue to serve the interest of those with existing power. The Martin Luther King, Jr. Memorial (see Figure 1) in Washington D.C., the first memorial honoring an African American on the National Mall, represents another complication in producing monumentalized statues of individuals. Both in Savannah and in Washington, the impetus for creating monuments to Black people in America came from a call for diversity in the commemorative landscape; the historically Black fraternity Alpha Phi Alpha, of which King himself was a member, had to lobby Congress for several years before President Clinton signed an act authorizing the construction of the memorial in 1996.[4] In 2011, the memorial was finally unveiled.

Figure 1. Lei Yixin, *Martin Luther King, Jr. Memorial*, 2011, Washington, D.C.
Photo by Ron Cogswell. December 31, 2011. Licensed under CC BY 2.0.

The selected design derives from a quote from King's "I have a Dream" speech, in which he promises "With this faith, we will be able to hew out of the mountain of despair a stone of hope." Building on the image of a stone of hope, the memorial features a piece being pulled from a monumental carved mountain; this "stone of hope" features a rendering of King made by Chinese sculptor Lei Yixin.[5] Joining the ranks of four other sculptures—to Presidents George Washington, Thomas Jefferson, Abraham Lincoln, and Franklin Delano Roosevelt—Martin Luther King Jr. was both metaphorically and visually cemented in the fabric of American history through his induction into the National Mall. King's memory, though, has been somewhat distorted by his ubiquity as a lone figurehead of the multifaceted struggle for Civil Rights. While justly celebrated as a martyr today, King had a public disapproval rating of nearly 75 percent during his lifetime of advocacy for a "revolution of values," as he described to journalist David Halberstam in 1967.[6] Today, though, powerful individuals, many of them white, adopt King's image to represent peace, integration, and "some panracial form of the 'Beloved Community' that he often preached" that has somehow moved past race.[7] The neutralization of King's legacy is in part achieved through monuments like his memorial on the National Mall; several elements in the final design for King's memorial not only distance him from the Civil Rights Movement, but also entirely decontextualize his own words. The initial design for the memorial included 24 niches featuring additional figures from the Civil Rights movement, including Rosa Parks and Fannie Lou Hamer, contextualizing King as a *part*, rather than the only actor in the movement.[8] In the process of selecting quotes to inscribe on the memorial, King was further dissociated from his historic context. The two original quotes from King's "I Have a Dream" speech—meant to visually accent either side of King's likeness—were to be the section describing the Stone of Hope that inspired the design and another referred to as the "Promissory Note" section. In the latter, King outlines that in the Constitution and Declaration of Independence, "they were signing a promissory note to which every American was to fall heir. This note was a promise that all men … would be granted the unalienable rights of life, liberty, and the pursuit of happiness," but that "it is obvious today America has defaulted on the promissory note in so far as her citizens of color are concerned …" In place of this poignant passage, the designers instead inscribed, "I was a drum major for justice, peace and righteousness," (see Figure 2) effectively epitomizing the abstract and universal image of King that is favorable to white and powerful decision-makers. In removing the element of antagonism and blame, King's message of racial justice could be co-opted by the same people responsible for this oppression.

Figure 2. Lei Yixin, *Martin Luther King, Jr. Memorial* (detail), 2011, Washington, D.C.
Photo by Tim Evanson. March 15, 2012. Licensed under CC BY 2.0.

Extracting King from his position as a leader against oppression enacted by the same category of authority, the drum major quote aims to make King a neutralized figure for everyone regardless of their positionality. The quote was met with outrage at the memorial's 2011 opening, where it was criticized for being misquoted to the point of misrepresentation. A year later, the quote was replaced with King's original words: "If you want to say that I was a drum major, say that I was a drum major for justice. Say that I was a drum major for peace. I was a drum major for righteousness. And all of the other shallow things will not matter."[9] Still detached from the topic of race, the new design for the memorial embodied the shift that chief architect Ed Jackson Jr. described, accounting that "the sponsoring foundation has clarified the memorial's focus to include Dr. King's broader impact on issues of universal importance, extending beyond the civil rights movement …"[10] Without the context of the racially charged threats to justice against which King fought, the specific meaning of his words are reduced to aphorisms.[11]

The processes which the Alpha Phi Alpha fraternity in D.C. endured to break into the decidedly white commemorative landscape highlight the distance between marginalized groups and those with the power to shape public spaces. Only through the exceptional efforts of Black individuals and groups were these monuments created; only with pointed criticism of whitewashed public spaces were these strides made in the first place. The years that separated the starts of these efforts from the realization of the projects themselves reveal the dissociation of governing bodies from their constituents. For the Martin Luther King Jr. Memorial in D.C., such strenuous parsing of message entirely removed King from the Civil Rights struggle, instead manufacturing an inoffensive hero for the country to applaud. The processes which stifled King's role in dismantling a deeply racist system are the same which wish to erase the continued existence of the same oppressive system. By reframing King as a depoliticized figure, his memorial is in turn distanced from the Civil Rights Movement, fabricating its distance from the present.

The inclusion of the Martin Luther King Jr. Memorial on the National Mall is undoubtedly a momentous stride in remembering history. Here, King is justly contextualized as one of the most decisive actors in American history. However, the controversies that arise in its fulfillment are in part a result of a desire to address an unattainable monolithic public to achieve the ideal of the universal and neutral public space. The conspicuous distance between the public calls for diversity in who is monumentalized as a figure and those with the power to mold the public environment allows for manipulation and distortion. People's calls for monuments may be answered, but their perspectives are inhibited in the realization of these projects. The desire to generate inoffensive heroes is of concern mainly to those in power. When presented with the problem of addressing multiple publics, heroic figures, even justifiably heroic figures like King, are distorted. Inclusion of diverse figures in the commemorative canon is not enough when their legacies are watered down to feign universality. While King's striving for justice and courage in the face of deeply rooted hatred can and should be universally admired, neutralizing his words absolves oppressors from their role in these systems. Thus, the production of King through the historic model of the heroic monument relies on narratives of the past that are asymmetrically reliant on white male perspectives. This issue is not singularly a result of misinterpretation and misrepresentation of the past, but moreover of a failed system for making meaning of history.

Public Pedagogy

If a major goal of commemorative public art is to educate inhabitants about a particular history, it is necessary to consider the ways in which history is produced. While the public may trust monuments to present a true account of history, implicit in their status as *representations* of history is their interpretive nature that is inherently situated in a particular viewpoint.[12] As a discipline, history seeks to understand and analyze the past; this is often done through careful parsing of primary sources, of memories. In this way, history relies on individual memories to make meaning and construct the truth. However, history and individual memories often come in conflict as sources of information. Transforming individual memories into a kind of national memory "replaces experience with a unifying abstraction to which the memories are co-opted."[13] In order to lend legitimacy to a particular narrative—one that can be modeled as an objective narrative—individual connections must be negated in favor of the collectively accepted storyline. In his essay *Les Lieux de Mémoire,* Pierre Nora distinguishes between history and memory, arguing that "Memory is a perpetually actual phenomenon …[while] history is a representation of the past."[14] For Nora, the ideal history represents an entirely objective and true account of history, regardless of its attainability. In the process of constructing history, the resulting narrative is necessarily distanced from personal experience to produce an illusion of neutrality. History seeks to become objective, no longer owned by the individuals who experienced the past, but rather a universal truth.

If history is, as Winston Churchill was famously quoted saying, "written by the victors," this must come at the expenses of the losers of history. The endeavor to produce an objective account of the past inevitably favors those with the power and resources to write history. By only accepting perspectives of the past that bolster the narrative of history, in Nora's sense, memories that contradict this narrative must be delegitimized. However, just as the public is idealized as a universal community, imbued with the ability to serve every individual equally, Nora's sense of history is detached from the inevitability of contradicting perspectives. In both cases, the ideal is unattainable, an unreality that can only be preserved by disempowering and negating perspectives that are incompatible with this utopian vision. Building on this principle, Michael Apple challenges education systems and their role in emboldening some forms of knowledge over others in his book, *Official Knowledge: Democratic Education in a Conservative Age*. Raising the question of "*Whose* knowledge is of the most worth," Apple points out that what counts as legitimate knowledge is far from neutral, but rather reflective of power relationships and struggles of certain race, class, gender, and religious groups.[15]

In the context of the city, the internally contradictory ideals—of an objective history, of a neutral and all-serving public space, and of the universal values represented in heroes—collide. Evaluating the consequences of these convenient distortions demonstrates the ways in which the continuity of unattainable ideals bolsters the authority of those in power by masking power structures under the guise of objectivity. As Richard Dyer outlines in *White: Essays on Race and Culture*, "whiteness as power is maintained by being unseen," creating a sense of superiority by going unnoticed; those who are not white are characterized as being "colored," as having something *added* to the pure slate of whiteness.[16] Through this process, the systems of authority that disempower individuals based on racial identities and economic status stay in power through their invisibility. With their claims to neutrality and legitimate knowledge, conflicting perspectives are effectively undermined.

The construction of a single, true history is achieved by suppressing memory; individual memories expose the internal inconsistencies in history and undermine the claim to objectivity. Rather than encouraging individual connections with the past, history is manufactured as detached reality. In the realm of commemorative public art, this is especially illustrated in the model of heroic individuals. In these sculptures, the audience is hand-fed a narrative of history, indoctrinating the public with an appropriate attitude. As figures like Martin Luther King Jr. are severed from their revolutionary context, history is mobilized to serve the interests of those in power rather than those whose lives were directly affected by King's legacy. In some sense, King "belonged to the whites, who claimed the final say in his representation."[17] Monumental statues commemorating the Civil Rights Movement in this way replicate the Western monumental tradition that revered figures from emperors and kings to confederate leaders, historically only produced by the elites with disproportionate power and prestige. Inheriting this visual tradition only perpetuates the myth of an objective history.

Navigating the inconsistencies in history through the medium of public art necessitates a consideration of alternate modes of teaching and remembering the past. In his revolutionary text, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, Paulo Freire warns against aspiring to the position of the oppressor, rather than to liberation from the system of oppression as a whole.[18] Celebrating figures that stand for liberation of Black people using a prototype of Churchills "victors" of history replicates the model of history that only allows for a single perspective—that of the victors. Faced with the endeavor to diversify the commemorative landscape as racist heroes of the past are toppled, a new mode of representation that reimagines history with a new visual vocabulary might be taken as an opportunity to rethink how art can represent the past more meaningfully. As Audre Lorde taught, "the

master's tools will never dismantle the master's house."[19] Put another way, the endeavor to use public art as a tool to promote inclusivity and diversity in history cannot be achieved by replicating the praise of white male heroes; inserting figures like Martin Luther King Jr. into the canon of history in this way legitimizes the figuration of other historic heroes. In the process of representing King as a depoliticized hero, those in power inhibit individual inquiry and connection by instead using propagandistic manipulation. Rather than allowing for dialogue and ambiguity in the King memorial, the design dictates an appropriate attitude from which no deviation is possible.

In *Teaching to Transgress*, bell hooks similarly explores the ways in which education can be adapted to be more democratic and inclusive for students of all backgrounds and social statuses. While society has shifted to emphasize multiculturalism, she teaches, there has been little discussion about ways to transform education to incorporate methods to include diverse perspectives and experiences.[20] Similarly, calls to diversify monuments reflect the growing emphasis on diversity and multiculturalism; however, without consideration for alternate pedagogical methods in application of projects that increasingly feature new narratives, multiculturalism is merely superficial. Failing to consider a diverse audience and the ways that public art is an educational tool to teach about the past disallows engaged learning. Freire distinguishes between pedagogical and manipulative techniques in the endeavor to create inclusive education. Defining the typical "banking" mode of education in which the students are passively filled with knowledge belonging to the educator, "projecting an absolute ignorance" onto the student.[21] This model only allows for a narrow view of truth; by only allowing for a single narrative of experience and reality, students are taught from a singular perspective presented as universal.[22] In assuming a passive role in learning that is disconnected from the lived experiences of many students, they increasingly become objects in the learning process with no avenues for critical inquiry. The same principles that hooks and Freire explore in building inclusive educational practices in the classroom must be considered in the realm of public art. The problem of dictating a single perspective of the past—of emphasizing Nora's history at the expense of individual memory—delegitimizes any narrative that conflicts with those constructed to serve the interests of the upper-class white men at the center of historic representation. Looking to pedagogical theories, the alternative to the problems this poses in cultivating inclusivity and diversity lies not only in representation, but further in rethinking how information is communicated. Rather than emulating the model of heroic individuals to insert new figures, innovative projects might challenge existing pedagogical tools to instead encourage alternative narratives and individual inquiry.

Interactivity

Public art projects looking to commemorate history have increasingly searched for ways to engage their audiences in meaningful dialogue about narratives previously absent from the public sphere. As Quentin Stevens, in his book *Memorials as Spaces of Engagement*, outlines, in some cases these repressed histories recognize and articulate darker histories of the country. Whether this be through increasing abstraction that presents alternative perspectives of histories we are already familiar with in works like Maya Lin's *Vietnam Veteran's Memorial* (see Figure 3) or models that encourage audience participation in newly articulated narratives like the *NAMES Project AIDS Memorial Quilt* (see Figure 4), innovative choices by artists seek to encourage individuals to interact with the ideas presented in public projects, or even with the physical project itself. While on a national level, these works may succeed in encouraging the kind of critical inquiry that Freire outlines, the specific circumstances of smaller communities necessitate approaches that center the experiences and needs of a particular place. By applying similar methods in project design but ensuring that economic and creative resources are primarily sourced to the spaces with individuals affected by a particular history, public art projects can both contribute to remedying asymmetric historic narratives and concretely benefit the community.

Figure 3. Maya Lin, *Vietnam Veterans Memorial*, 1982, Washington, D.C.
Photo by Howard Ignatius. November 28, 2014. Licensed under CC BY 2.0.

Maya Lin's *Vietnam Veteran's Memorial* is among the first major works of commemorative public art that challenged the existing national consciousness and the prevailing exaltation of war as an act of bravery. The black granite design features the names of more than 58,000 individuals who were killed in Vietnam or as a result of injuries sustained there.[23] Dug into the earth, rather than rising above it, Lin imagined the memorial as a park-like area meant for "personal reflection and private reckoning."[24] With this, Lin seems to move away from the practice of monumentalizing, distancing the works to look over the people; instead, the *Vietnam Veteran's Memorial* is carved into the landscape of the National Mall, seeming to not only emphasize permanence and loss, but also reimagining the relationship between audience and work by moving them closer together (Fig. 5). Lin's use of an abstracted design, as opposed to the kinds of figural representations of heroes of war, challenges viewers to interpret the design more individually.[25] Rather than offering a comforting answer to the audience, Lin cultivated a space more centered on contemplation than celebration.

The *Vietnam Veteran's Memorial* not only encourages individual thought through abstraction, but also encourages individual interactions, both with the themes folded into the design and with the physical work itself. The black surface of the granite is reflective, seeming to encourage visitors to consider themselves in relation to the design and names inscribed on the wall. Lin goes on to describe that viewers should have to come increasingly closer to the wall to read the name, ensuring that visitors make individual connections to the design by shaping their movement towards the wall.[26] Once close enough to read the wall, the memorial design even allows for physical interaction. Here, Lin's design invites visitors to experience the wall in a multisensory way, able to look up specific names on the directory and create a rubbing of the inscription to take home.[27] In encouraging individual experiences with the design as opposed to a clear and dictated message, Lin's memorial allows for multiple interpretations. While the commission, and therefore Lin's proposal, was specified to be apolitical, various interpretations elicit political agendas from it. The departure from the traditional model of monumentalizing war led to a criticism of the memorial as being anti-war, characterizing the war in Vietnam in terms of defeat and degradation.[28] Alternately, the sheer number of names inscribed in the wall emphasize the enormity of the loss, seeming to highlight the theme of sacrifice. Ultimately, the pointed abstraction and intention to depart from the monumental tradition marks Lin's *Vietnam Veteran's Memorial* as a turning point in approaches to remembering history.

Lin's somber and contemplative approach to the war in Vietnam comes in contrast to previous commemorative works. While the memorial to the veterans of the war in Vietnam expresses profound loss and devastation, works like the *Marine Corps Memorial* (Fig. 4) are more celebratory and triumphant. While this memorial is dedicated to the Marines and the country's gratitude for their service, the specific image references Joe Rosenthal's photo taken after the Battle of Iwo Jima. At Iwo Jima, troops erected an American flag to celebrate victory in capturing the small island after a 72-hour bombardment.[29] The strenuous raising of the flag on the top of Mount Suribachi reflects a vision of the event synonymous with the monumentalizing of figures like the presidents imagined on the National Mall: heroic soldiers overcome the odds and prevail in raising the flag, a symbol of American achievement and nationalism. The memorial intentionally centers on a moment of triumph in the face of devastating losses—notably, three of the six men depicted in the original photo were killed on Iwo Jima—framing the American military's impact singularly in terms of bravery. Lin's departure from this method of framing was even offset with the addition of an additional statue of *Three Servicemen* (Fig. 5) intended to reincorporate traditional war memorial features by depicting those who served in the war in a heroic light.[30] In the context of narratives of history that celebrate victories—even victories at the expense of thousands of lives—the *Vietnam Veteran's Memorial* notably complicates the national attitude towards war through the use of abstraction and interactivity. By allowing space for the audience to interpret the design outside of the traditional model of heroism and exaltation of war, Lin effectively reimagined the commemorative landscape to allow space for alternative perspectives.

Figure 4. Cleve Jones, *NAMES Project AIDS Memorial Quilt*, started in 1987, pictured in Washington, D.C. Photo by Elvert Barnes. June 26, 2004. Licensed under CC BY 2.0.

Figure 5. Maya Lin, *Vietnam Veterans Memorial*, 1982, Washington, D.C.
Photo by Ron Cogswell. December 28, 2017. Licensed under CC BY 2.0.

Other commemorative art projects dealing with darker histories further expand the principle of interactivity to engage audiences. Through this process, memorial designs allow visitors to choose how to engage with the spaces and memories depicted, "framing them as actors, not just viewers."[31] While the *Vietnam Veteran's Memorial* both facilitates individual inquiry and contemplation as well as physical interaction with the design, projects like the *NAMES Project AIDS Memorial Quilt* (Fig. 6) are designed to rely on individual contributions, not just interactions. San Francisco gay rights activist Cleve Jones conceived of the project in 1985, creating its first panel in memory of his friend Martin Feldman.[32] Anyone can submit a 12" x 12" panel to be added to the quilt; each panel includes the name of someone who died from AIDS. The project has grown to incorporate almost 50,000 panels with contributions from every state and from 28 countries.[33] While the quilt is primarily housed in San Francisco, it has been showcased in several cities, including on the National Mall, where it covered the entire Mall in 1996.[34] With the *NAMES Project AIDS Memorial Quilt*, the role of individual connections to history is not only encouraged, but required. This model for design responds to the desire for informal memorials that center on individual connections. Despite this, these inputs take the form of specifically delineated panels, which dictates the ways in which individuals can contribute.

In both the *Vietnam Veterans Memorial* and the *NAMES Project AIDS Memorial Quilt*, the creators were able to fold elements of memory, as opposed to history, into their designs. Allowing for interactivity as well the abstraction of the *Vietnam*

Veterans Memorial facilitates individual connection and interpretation that isn't possible in the heroic monuments with clearly dictated messages. This similarly disrupts the narrative of war as an exclusively noble endeavor. The criticisms of the project as being anti-war and the assumption of a negative attitude towards the military reflects the pervasive nature of pre-existing sentiments. While Lin's design does not specifically take a position on war, the deviation from the idealization of war is taken as a challenge. The *NAMES Project AIDS Memorial Quilt* delves more into interactivity in the project's foundation of public contribution. With each panel contribution, people from all around the world add to the growing quilt, both emphasizing the individuals affected by the AIDS epidemic as well as the enormity of the devastation. Each of these projects pointedly allow and facilitate individual interactions and in turn encourage connections beyond recognition of a motif like courage or heroism. However, as histories of a particular space are increasingly publicized and acknowledged, new approaches to commemorative public art must also consider the locality of projects. Here, art projects commemorating a circumstance or event in a particular community might incorporate the methods that creators like Maya Lin and Cleve Jones employed to reinvigorate what a memorial can be by encouraging physical and personal engagement. However, without centering the experiences of individuals in a particular community at all levels of creation—from commission, to design, to audience interactivity—these projects will not fully realize the potential of public art as a tool in educating equitably and inclusively.

Social Sculpture

The designs of works like the *Vietnam Veterans Memorial* and the *NAMES Project AIDS Memorial Quilt* were effective in achieving their specific visions on a national level, but it is perhaps more relevant to consider the specific circumstances of the audience a work aims to engage with. Moreover, to genuinely achieve the educative goal of public art projects, the entire audience (effectively, the students) might take a more active role in the conception of a project, not singularly in the execution of an individual's vision. Here, by further blurring the line between artist and audience, projects can most effectively deal with issues in a way that facilitates individual inquiry and dismantles the ideal of a single, universal history.

German artist and social activist Joseph Beuys explored this concept in the theory of "social sculpture" in the 1970s. Social sculpture revolves around the idea that everything is art and in turn, everyone is an artist with the capacity to shape society

through creativity. Through art projects, individuals within a community would be able to directly impact public policy. Rather than viewing these projects as art dealing with social issues, social sculpture "transformed the way artists interacted with the public and allowed them to approach community development through an artistic lens."[35] In this way, the principles of thinkers like Freire that demand agency and humanity be granted to the students are folded into Beuys's teachings on what art can and should be. Rather than conveying a single message, social sculpture relies on participation. If, as Freire asserts, pedagogy best serves the interests of everyone through dialogue and inquiry rather than a "banking" system of education that dictates a single correct message, social sculpture is structured to facilitate more meaningful interactions.

With the system of social sculpture, the idea that the foremost goal is concentrated in community action rather than on a particular aesthetic objective. In this way, the theory of social sculpture facilitates a more regional approach to projects, centering actionable objectives for the audience. Particularly in considering commemorative public art that aims to deal with histories that continue to affect contemporary populations, the reframing of projects to focus on the needs of the audience most aptly incorporates the pedagogical techniques that Freire and hooks encourage. If the adaptations to a traditional model of commemorative works by artists like Lin and Jones allow projects to incorporate interactive elements that avoid the "banking" model of education by facilitating individual connections to a history and message, these elements might be most effectively applied in a particular space by incorporating elements of the social sculpture theory.

Beuys's theory of social sculpture has been extended into the present through the works of several contemporary projects by Rick Lowe. Lowe was awarded a MacArthur Genius Grant in 2014 for his affiliation with the *Project Row Houses (PRH)* in Third Ward, a historically Black community in Houston.[36] *PRH* intended to revitalize a gentrified neighborhood through the transformation of 22 houses within two blocks into spaces for arts education and community development.[37] Here, Lowe incorporates the principles of social sculpture by concentrating on direct action in the community and on the potential of art to facilitate these changes. Perhaps the most impactful aspect of the *PRH* is the longevity of the project based on the incorporation of local organizations and artists in programming. Artist residents are invited to work on projects in the houses to address issues dealing with African American experiences.[38] Further, Lowe involves local organizations like churches, schools, and community groups in

services and programs offered by the *PRH*. With this, Lowe's approach to public art necessarily approaches issues through the lens of the specific community which he addresses. In this way, the audience is involved in every step of producing the final project, not singularly in its execution. While works like the *NAMES Project AIDS Memorial Quilt* also incorporate participation by individuals, their contributions are delineated by specific requirements. Instead, within the *PRH,* contributions are allotted freedom to shift based on individuals' ideas, experiences, and needs.

Tulsa's *Greenwood Art Project (GAP)* commemorating the 1921 Race Massacre can be similarly seen as an example of a project that effectively incorporates the pedagogical tools of thinkers like Freire and hooks, and Lowe's approaches in social sculpture. As the head artist of GAP with William Cordova, Lowe expands on his principle of centering audience. An initiative of the 1921 Tulsa Race Massacre Centennial Commission funded by a $1 million grant from The Bloomberg Philanthropies Public Art Challenge, *GAP* incorporates more than 30 discrete, temporary projects proposed and undertaken by Tulsa natives or current residents of Tulsa rather than one large project.[39] These projects range from dance performances to sculptural installations to a directed walk following the path of an individual fleeing from the Massacre. Expanding the tenet of social sculpture that everyone is an artist, these projects incorporate proposals from all members of the community, rather than just local artists. This includes contributors like an individual whose family experienced the Massacre, a chef, educators, activists, and business owners whose lives were impacted by the Massacre and its legacy. Through the process of selecting "artists" to contribute based on a wide range of experiences, *GAP* embodies the pedagogical principles that emphasize the role of the "student" in jointly building knowledge rather than passively receiving teachings. By blurring the line between artist and audience, *GAP* empowers individuals in Tulsa to share their experiences and reclaim ownership of public spaces.

Conclusion

With an increasing shift to remember histories of injustice, the public sphere offers a setting for learning that is both accessible and engaging. If art can be an opportunity to evoke personal and emotional responses to these histories, it is imperative to evaluate the ways in which these histories are constructed and presented. Freire and hooks each outline ways in which education must be adapted to recognize the humanity of students, looking to engage them in critical inquiry rather than deposit information unto a passive and ignorant subject. Through the process of emphasizing the abilities and experiences of students, they are empowered; this lends legitimacy to experiences outside of the narratives of history that serve the interests of those with existing authority. These are the same individuals whose power and resources have historically dictated the figuration of public spaces.

This power is continuously reaffirmed in public art projects that dictate certain attitudes, whether it be through the monumentalizing of historic heroes or in the celebration of war. Works like the *Vietnam Veterans Memorial* and the *NAMES Project AIDS Memorial Quilt* depart from this tradition by facilitating interactivity. With these design features, these projects look at history in a way that allows more for connection outside of a dictated standard. However, individual participation in these works is still delineated by specific standards and limitations. Joseph Beuys's theory of social sculpture builds on the pedagogical tools of Freire and hooks by asserting the possibility of art to invoke community changes. Through this, public art is mobilized as a tool in shaping contemporary populations rather than singularly as a tool to remember the past. With this, public art acts as a bridge to visualize and materialize the experiences of marginalized communities as they manifest today.

Artists like Rick Lowe embody this endeavor by centering individuals within a particular community in the process of designing and carrying out projects. In the *PRH* project, Lowe used transformed houses with programming centered on revitalizing a gentrified area through arts education. In this, Lowe includes input of local organizations and artists. Further building on community-based programming, *GAP* aims to commemorate the Tulsa Race Massacre through a series of art projects proposed and undertaken solely by individuals in Tulsa. *GAP*, through this process, not only expands on the theory of social sculpture and the pedagogical teachings of Freire and Hooks by centering the experiences and agency of the "audience," but also pours economic resources back into the community through the allocation of grants to contributing artists.

To approach histories that affect a particular space, new projects must find innovative ways to meet the needs of that specific community. While design features may encourage interaction beyond the visual, delving more into personal connection and inquiry, it is increasingly urgent to fold members of the affected community into the creative process at all levels. Rather than studying the impact of design features to implement indiscriminately in commemorative projects, it is perhaps more constructive to focus on the group it aims to address. Expanding the role of the audience as a multifaceted and diverse collective in the design process, these projects can most effectively and appropriately address histories of injustice by refusing to reproduce the systems that created these injustices.

Author Biography

Piper Prolago studies art history and anthropology at the University of Tulsa in Tulsa, Oklahoma. She has worked with the Center for Health, Arts and Measurement Practices, the Oklahoma Center for the Humanities, the Oklahoma Visual Arts Coalition, and as a public art intern in the Oklahoma City Office of Arts & Cultural Affairs. She can be reached at pipercp168@gmail.com

Notes

1. "Confederate and Columbus statues toppled by US Protestors," *BBC,* June 11, 2020, https://www.bbc.com/news/world-us-canada-53005243.
2. Sanford Levinson, *Written in Stone: Public Monuments in Changing Societies* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1998), 7.
3. Malcolm Miles, *Art, Space and the City* (London: Routledge, 1997), 58.
4. Upton, *What Can and Can't Be Said,* 118.
5. Nathan King, "Building the Memorial - Martin Luther King, Jr. Memorial," National Park Service, Last Updated June 14, 2019, https://www.nps.gov/mlkm/learn/building-the-memorial.htm.
6. James C. Cobb, "Even Though He Is Revered Today, MLK Was Widely Disliked by the American Public When He Was Killed," *Smithsonian Magazine*, April 4, 2018, https://www.smithsonianmag.com/history/why-martin-luther-king-had-75-percent-disapproval-rating-year-he-died-180968664/
7. Upton, *What Can and Can't Be Said*, 98.
8. Ibid., 118.
9. King, "Building the Memorial."
10. Upton, *What Can and Can't Be Said*, 119.
11. Ibid., 116.
12. Ibid., 14
13. Miles, *Art, Space and the City*, 67.
14. Pierre Nora, "Between Memory and History: Les Lieux de Mémoire," *Representations*, no. 26, Special Issue: Memory and Counter-Memory (Spring 1989), 8.

15. Michael Apple, *Official Knowledge: Democratic Education in the Conservative Age* (London: Routledge, 1999), 44.
16. Richard Dyer, *White: Essays on Race and Culture* (London: Routledge, 1997), 45.
17. Upton, *What Can and Can't Be Said,* 110.
18. Paulo Freire, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, trans. Myra Bergman Ramos (New York: Continuum International Publishing Group, 1970), 44.
19. Audre Lorde, *Sister Outsider: Essays and Speeches by Audre Lorde* (Berkeley: Crossing Press, 2008), 112.
20. bell hooks, *Teaching to Transgress: Education as the Practice of Freedom* (London: Routledge, 2014), 35.
21. Freire, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, 72.
22. hooks, *Teaching,* 35.
23. "About the Wall," Vietnam Veterans Memorial Fund, accessed June 5, 2020, https://www.vvmf.org/About-The-Wall/.
24. "Maya Lin - Designer of the Vietnam Veterans Memorial," Vietnam Veterans Memorial Fund, accessed June 5, 2020, https://www.vvmf.org/About-The-Wall/history-of-the-vietnam-veterans-memorial/Maya-Lin/.
25. Quentin Stevens and Karen A. Franck, *Memorials as Spaces of Engagement: Design, Use and Meaning* (London: Routledge, 2015), 42.
26. "Maya Lin."
27. Stevens and Franck, *Memorials*, 41.
28. Marita Sturken, "The Wall, the Screen, and the Image: The Vietnam Veteran's Memorial," *Representations* 35 (Summer 1991), 122.
29. "History of the Marine Corps War Memorial," National Parks Service, last updated February 24, 2020, https://www.nps.gov/gwmp/learn/historyculture/usmcwarmemorial.htm.
30. "10 things you should know about the Three Servicemen Statue," Vietnam Veterans Memorial Fund, November 1, 2019, https://vvmf.wordpress.com/2019/11/01/10-things-you-should-know-about-the-three-servicemen-statue/.
31. Stevens and Franck, *Memorials*, 29.
32. "History - Activist Beginnings," National AIDS Memorial, accessed June 5, 2020, https://www.aidsmemorial.org/quilt-history.
33. "How to make a panel for the quilt," National AIDS Memorial, accessed June 5, 2020, https://www.aidsmemorial.org/make-a-panel.
34. Ibid.
35. Cara Jordan, "The Evolution of Social Sculpture in the United States: Joseph Beuys and the Work of Suzanne Lacy and Rick Lowe," *Public Art Dialogue* 3, no. 2 (2013), 145.
36. "Rick Lowe," MacArthur Foundation, accessed June 5, 2020, https://www.macfound.org/fellows/920/.
37. Jordan, "The Evolution of Social Sculpture," 157.
38. Jordan, "The Evolution of Social Sculpture," 159.
41. "About," Greenwood Art Project, accessed May 1, 2021, https://www.greenwoodartproject.org.

Bibliography

Apple, Michael. *Official Knowledge: Democratic Education in the Conservative Age*. London: Routledge, 1999.

Dickinson, Maggy. "The Making of Space, Race and Place: New York City's War on Graffiti, 1970—the Present." *Critique of Anthropology* 28, no. 1 (2008): 27-45.

Dyer, Richard. *White: Essays on Race and Culture*. London: Routledge, 1997.

Cobb, James C. "Even Though He Is Revered Today, MLK Was Widely Disliked by the American Public When He Was Killed." *Smithsonian Magazine*, April 4, 2018. https://www.smithsonianmag.com/history/why-martin-luther-king-had-75-percent-disapproval-rating-year-he-died-180968664/.

"Confederate and Columbus statues toppled by US Protestors." *BBC,* June 11, 2020. https://www.bbc.com/news/world-us-canada-53005243.

Freire, Paulo. *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. Translated by Myra Bergman Ramos. New York: Continuum International Publishing Group, 1970.

Greenwood Art Project. "About." Accessed May 1, 2021. https://www.greenwoodartproject.org.

Hickey, Andrew. "When the Street Becomes a Pedagogue." In *Handbook of Public Pedagogy: Education and Learning Beyond Schooling*, edited by Jennifer A. Sandlin, Brian D. Schultz, and Jake Burdick, 161-170. London: Routledge, 2009.

hooks, bell. *Teaching to Transgress: Education as the Practice of Freedom*. London: Routledge, 2014.

Jordan, Cara. "The Evolution of Social Sculpture in the United States: Joseph Beuys and the Work of Suzanne Lacy and Rick Lowe." *Public Art Dialogue* 3, no. 2 (2013), 144-167.

King, Nathan. "Building the Memorial - Martin Luther King, Jr. Memorial." National Park Service. Last Updated June 14, 2019. https://www.nps.gov/mlkm/learn/building-the-memorial.htm.

Levinson, Sanford. *Written in Stone: Public Monuments in Changing Societies*. Durham: Duke University Press, 1998.

Lorde, Audre. *Sister Outsider: Essays and Speeches by Audre Lorde*. Berkeley: Crossing Press, 2008.

MacArthur Foundation. "Rick Lowe." Accessed June 5, 2020. https://www.macfound.org/fellows/920/.

Miles, Malcolm. *Art, Space and the City*. London: Routledge, 1997.

National AIDS Memorial. "History - Activist Beginnings." Accessed June 5, 2020. https://www.aidsmemorial.org/quilt-history.

National AIDS Memorial. "How to make a panel for the quilt." Accessed June 5, 2020. https://www.aidsmemorial.org/make-a-panel.

National Parks Service. "History of the Marine Corps War Memorial." Last updated February 24, 2020. https://www.nps.gov/gwmp/learn/historyculture/usmcwarmemorial.htm.

Nora, Pierre. "Between Memory and History: Les Lieux de Mémoire." *Representations*, no. 26, Special Issue: Memory and Counter-Memory (Spring 1989), 7-24.

Stevens, Quentin. *The Ludic City: Exploring the Potential of Public Spaces.* New York: Routledge, 2007.

Stevens, Quentin, and Karen A. Franck. *Memorials as Spaces of Engagement: Design, Use and Meaning.* London: Routledge, 2015.

Sturken, Marita. "The Wall, the Screen, and the Image: The Vietnam Veteran's Memorial." *Representations* 35 (Summer 1991), 118-142.

Topaz, Chad M., 2 Bernhard Klingenberg, Daniel Turek, Brianna Heggeseth, Pamela E. Harris, Julie C. Blackwood, Kevin M. Murphy. "Diversity of artists in major U.S. museums." *PLoS ONE* 14, no. 3 (2019). https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0212852.

Upton, Dell. *What Can and Can't Be Said: Race, Uplift, and Monument Building in the Contemporary South*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2015.

Vietnam Veterans Memorial Fund. "10 things you should know about the Three Servicemen Statue." November 1, 2019. https://vvmf.wordpress.com/2019/11/01/10-things-you-should-know-about-the-three-servicemen-statue/.

Vietnam Veterans Memorial Fund. "About the Wall." Accessed June 5, 2020. https://www.vvmf.org/About-The-Wall/.

Vietnam Veterans Memorial Fund. "Maya Lin - Designer of the Vietnam Veterans Memorial." Accessed June 5, 2020. https://www.vvmf.org/About-The-Wall/history-of-the-vietnam-veterans-memorial/Maya-Lin/.

Silent Witnesses of Art Nouveau in Perm or the Story of One Treasure

Vera Ustyugova and Mariya Mingaleva

Translated by Veronika Barsukova

Abstract

Today, Perm hosts its cultural projects, which are heard of in Russia and abroad – the Russian Povera exhibition and the Museum of Contemporary Art with its founder Marat Guelman, Diaghilev Festival, and opera staging by Teodor Currentzis. The beginning of the XX century saw Perm as the capital of the county, ship empire, a strategic hub in the construction of the Trans-Siberian Railway. This essay shows that a popular Art Nouveau style contributed to its aesthetics and visual promotion during modernization in provincial Perm at the turn of XIX-XX centuries. At the turn of the century, the Russian province readily absorbed things that the modern technological revolution could deliver. The *Great Race* movie by B. Edwards, which was filmed in 1965 and hilariously portrayed the 1908 transcontinental race, featured a scene when the racers arrived in Russia (it was cut out for the Soviet screen). This scene portrayed the night with gloomy bearded men with the torches and a banner "Tobolsk Car Lovers Club welcomes you." The *Great Race* illustrates Belle Époque with its feminists, obsession with aviation and cars. However, it was not that bad for Russia at that time when the movie was filmed. Art Nouveau being an artistic style per se has its traits and its chronological limits. Nevertheless, the social history of Art Nouveau was uninterrupted despite its origin as an elite phenomenon. The key message of the artists and ideological leaders (English movement of Arts and Crafts, German Gesamtkunstwerk, Louvre Union of Decorative Arts, World of Art Association in Russia, etc.) was to unite architecture, interior, and art in one style, to inspire the contemporaries. This message was supported in different areas of the industrial epoch design and transformed daily routine. A new style was determined by more extensive consumer behaviour among the urban dwellers. Exhibitions and journals, photos, and colored lithographs spread the ideas of famous designers globally. A large-scale Art Nouveau distribution is connected with an overarching experience of modernity.

Vera Ustyugova and Mariya Mingaleva, "Silent Witnesses of Art Nouveau in Perm or the Story of One Treasure,"
Art Style, Art & Culture International Magazine, v. 8, no. 8.1, part 2 (September 2021), 81- 106.
DOI: 10.5281/zenodo.5498393

Introduction

In June 2019, in Perm, archeological excavations in one of the central streets – Lenin street, former Pokrovskaya street – found a buried treasure. An urban legend says that place used to be Lara's house from *Doctor Zhivago* by Boris Pasternak. A beautiful Art Nouveau mansion constructed before the Revolution by S. Gribushin, a tea and sugar king, was opposite that place (fig. 1).

Archeological Expedition of Perm University did the archeological excavations.[1] As it usually happens, the city excavations find a lot of artifacts. The remains from a burnt ice cellar, buttons with the Perm province coat of arms from the civil officers' uniforms, a rear section form like Cameo Whitby,[2] a French cuff link featuring a lady's leg in a stocking (journalists call it a Diaghilev's cuff link) (fig. 2), and CHATEAU LAFITTE wine bottle stamp were of particular interest (Mingaleva 2020). However, June 21 saw the real sensation. "We were about to finish our work on one site and didn't expect to find anything of interest," archeologists recalled. "The only thing to examine was some stuff which looks like a usual rubbish bin of the beginning of XX century" (A Century Underground…).

This bin turned out to contain a surprise – the archeologists discovered a storage chest with antique crockery: porcelain, glazed, glass, and other utensils. There were four Art Nouveau perfectly preserved sets: dinnerware, coffee and two tea sets, as well as many other different items – 247 in total.[3] All pieces were carefully wrapped in pre-revolutionary newspapers, which helped the things to be better preserved, although the newspapers themselves nearly decomposed; only some items were left. While the archeologists were carefully removing the treasures from the earth, a summer wind blew away one piece: "Tuesday, February 14, 1917." The other preserved fragments contained the messages from the battle fronts of the First World War, advertisements, an event poster of the local theater. The newspapers which could be identified from some fragments – *Russian Word* (in Russian: Русское слово) and *Perm Province Bulletin* (in Russian: Пермские губернские ведомости) – speak for the political preferences and indirectly prove the assumption that the landlords were hurriedly leaving the place to run away from the Revolution, buried their belongings, and left the city, country. So, the storage chest was not found for 100 years…

Figure 1. S.M. Gribushin's Mansion, a tea and sugar king. Designed by A.B. Turchevich.
A photo from the collections of Perm Regional Museum.

Figure 2. A French cuff link featuring a lady's leg in a stocking.
Turn of XIX-XX centuries. Photo by Mariya Mingaleva.

Design of Industrial Epoch

Art Nouveau is a recognizable flowery style with the feeling of dynamics and movement. Modernity became a common platform for architects, artists, designers of various schools. Art Nouveau is not only about artistic experiments, which makes it a socio-cultural phenomenon. The commercial manufacturers supported the enthusiasm aroused by this new style in the capitals and fast growing big cities. Art Nouveau products which were not suitable for the museums and galleries "were rapidly introduced into the people's environment, in commonplace consciousness of the inhabitants in this environment" (Borisova and Sternin 1990, 49–50).

A unique culture being the locus of modernity shaped the turn of XIX-XX centuries (Charle 2018, 9–23; Matich 2018, 49–73). The term *Art Nouveau* is defined by art analytical experts, historians, culturologists, philologists, cinematologists. Art Nouveau could be interpreted by art critic analysis, cultural studies, social history. Debora Silverman, in her book titled *Art Nouveau in Fin-de-Siècle France: Politics, Psychology and Style,* explores the style in terms of ideology and social culture (Silverman 1989). D. Silverman addresses Art Nouveau in wide comparative interdisciplinary studies by describing political, gender arts history by analysing the visual language of this multimedia style, connection with the political doctrines, social psychology, interest to the cultural symbolism. Art Nouveau had its roots in economic and social modernization, growth of agency. It was not for nothing that Walter Benjamin was thinking to name his book about a XX century Paris in XIX century *Passagenwerk* – passages were seen to represent the changes in economy, architecture, way of life (Benjamin 2000, 153–167). Infrastructural transformations, new phenomena of the provincial culture and events in Art Nouveau, information, and visual revolution were compared to develop the parameters for the urban space analysis. Urban culture "was born from" a traditional society, created the context for new aesthetics, could be seen in the world of symbolic, visual images. The new style played a huge role in aestheticization of the industrial century, manifested in new values, translated into everyday life. Consumption universe was penetrating even into the remotest places, and reproduction technologies provided easy access to mass media, photography, cinema, gramophone records, which transfered and distributed new values for the provincial settlements. A new aesthetics turned out to be one cultural aspect in internationalism that contributed to extensive penetration of the ideas.

Arriving at Modernity Station

The archeological finds somewhat vividly represent the life in Perm as a provincial city in XIX– the beginning of XX century. Uniform buttons, cameo, a French cuff link… The upper class in Perm consisted of merchants and intellectual elite, civil servants. Cultural life concentrated in City Theater (fig. 3), Noble and Merchants Clubs, Music Saloons in private reception rooms. City Theater was built at the end of the 1870s and remains an attractive place for people all over the world – its stage saw dancing Diana Vishneva, acting Denis Lavant and Audrey Bonnet; Robert Lepage and Romeo Castellucci staged their plays there. Diaghilevs' House was one of the music saloons in Perm at the turn of XIX-XX centuries. Sergei Diaghilev graduated from a gymnasium in Perm, and his father was a civil, military servant, a public figure and a patron.

Figure 3. City Theater in Perm. A photo from the collections of Perm Regional Museum.

The image on the French cuff link – a lady's leg wearing a stocking – speaks for the style, fashion, humor at the beginning of XX century. CHATEAU LAFITTE wine bottle stamp means that, like many other cities, Perm followed the modern trend for a popular French wine exported to the Russian Empire by the Rothschild family from the last quarter of the XIX century. Vitalii Mingalev, an archeologist, wrote a letter to Chateau Lafite Rothschild wine estate in France. Baron Eric von Rothschild answered him. "He gets quite excited about this story, gave his contacts, promised to find the experts, and asked to write him back about 'the name of this wine expert with such a choosy and exceptional taste,'" said Vitalii (A Century Underground). French historians Marguerite Figeac and Didier Ters proved that these wine bottle stamps were distributed in the last third – end of the XIX century.[4]

Rapid urbanization processes cracked the closed purified culture of elite classes in Perm at the turn of XIX-XX centuries.[5] The urban population in Perm province consisted of Russians, Ukrainians, Jews, Polish, German resettlers from the northern and central areas of the European part of Russia and the region's locals. Being a provincial administrative city, Perm had many civil servants, while the regio's successful economic development results in more merchants and craftsmen. The city was known for the merchant families, trade houses. Perm developed regional and transit business between the European and Asian parts of the country. Steam navigation was the most profitable business for Perm merchants. XVIII century gave birth to the metallurgical population that co-existed with peasants, merchants, etc., up to the 1917 Revolution in the Russian Empire. Although the social structure of the urban population was changing, the classes turned into professional groups. Cities extensively grew thanks to the village inhabitants, and the peasants became factory workers and merchants. In the early period of the industrial period, Russian cities were the agglomerations of settlements, "villages playing hide-and-seek with the city."[6]

Pre-Revolution time in Russia could be characterized as a breakthrough in education. Perm had a network of elementary and secondary schools, gymnasiums, specialized schools (railway, naval, trade, etc.). Ekaterino-Petrovskoe, Olginskoe, Stefanovskoe specialized schools, and others were located in the buildings designed in modern geometric style. Interestingly, the construction of the educational institutions for the scanty urban population was connected with Art Nouveau. The specialized school appeared in different parts of the city, including its suburbs: Soldatskaya village, Razgulyai area, Sludka area.

An extensive railway network covered Russia and moved the multi-national Empire. Railway construction brought dynamics into space perception in the public consciousness. A railway system was the key for modernity development, and railway roads brought the modern world to life by offering modern time zones, circulation of people, products, places, visual images. XIX century gave the visual reproduction technologies, including camera obscura, the Claude Lorrain glasses, guidebooks, maps, photos, postcards, shopping arcades, cafes, dioramas, train windows (Urry 2012, 200–232). In his book, F.B. Schenk shows that railway construction had a decisive impact on Russia's "arrival" to Modernity station at the beginning of the XX century, although new unprecedented risks accompanied this (Schenk 2016, 215–230; Narskii 2016, 208–221). Art Nouveau captured infrastructural progress – erection of stations, bridges. Perm I Railway Station was erected under a typical project in 1877–1878 (fig. 4). In his book *Zhenia Luvers' Childhood*, B. Pasternak recalled,

> That was quite a provincial railway station, with no hustle and bustle of the big cities, with passengers arriving on time to the station from the night of the city, with long waiting; with silence and resettlers sleeping on the floor among hunting dogs, chests, matted cars, and uncovered bikes. (Pasternak 1991, 44)

Figure 4. Perm I Railway Station. Album "Perm-Yekaterinburg Part of Urals Railway Road and Lunevskaya feeder." Photo by Sherer, Nabgoltz and Co in Moscow, His Imperial Majesty Photo Agency.

The building of the railway station with the top small, sharpened towers resembling the ancient chambers was an illustrative example of the Russian style. F.B. Schenk notes that the Russian "gates of Modern Style" were manifested in "modern structures in historisized clothes" (Schenk 2016, 216). Perm II Railway Station was opened in 1909, and the building was designed with a huge ellipse shaped window in the upper part of the façade, high round-headed windows, stucco works, had specific Art Nouveau curved shapes (fig. 5). Here are J. Urry's words about the railway stations, "It is hard to imagine the shock experienced by the contemporaries when they saw those structures from steel, bricks, and glass in the middle – at the end of XIX century. At that time, those structures could be comparable by their loftiness and size with the churches and temples of the Middle Ages" (Urry 2012, 227). Russian provincial railway stations were one- or two-floor buildings, but the city dwellers, newcomers, resettlers were impressed by their intricate architecture. European and Russian railway stations shared one feature – they immediately became overcrowded, "burst at the seams" due to the inflow of people, thus turning into the symbols of social erosion.

Figure 5. Perm II Railway Station. A photo from the collections of Perm Regional Museum.

Visual Attractions

Ariadna Tyrkova-Williams, a well-known journalist and a public figure, recalls the stories from the Head of Novonikolaevsk City which "remind of the stories about American life," "There were gardens, sturdy roads, trams, electricity; spacious public buildings, schools, theater, comfortable private houses were put up" (Tyrkova-Williams 1998, 511).

At the turn of the centuries, central Perm streets were electrified, a city water pipe was constructed. New technologies penetrated the telegraph business: the wireless telegraph was created by a Russian – that was the message of the local media about a professor A.S. Popov, an inventor of the wireless telegraph, who was born in Perm province and was very successful at the exhibitions in Chicago and Nizhny Novgorod (Ustyugova 2017, 172–180). Perm introduced and quickly developed a city telephone network: very often, a house owner installed one telephone for all residents in the house near the doorman's lodge (Muraveva 2004, vol. 2, 20). City transport also changed; coaches could be seen in the city. Trams came on stage later (end of the 1920s), although citizens in Moscow, Kiev, Vitebsk, Nizhny, Ekaterinoslavl, and some other cities could use them a lot at the end of XIX – the beginning of XX centuries. Anna Stepanovna Lyubimova, a sister of a shipowner Lyubimov, brought the first car from the Nizhny Novgorod trade fair in September 1900. All provincial media were full with the news about the car races, cars (Ford cars, and others) were advertised, car magazines were distributed, taxi cabs came into play at the beginning of the 1910s.

Perm Society of Cyclists was established in 1897 (fig. 6). City dwellers bought the English Gumber, Anfield, Whitworth, Swift, Crawford, New Gau, New Yard, and American bikes Viktor, Gikori, etc. The City Garden opened a cycle track,[7] which became the venue for races and celebrations. The newspapers wrote about the festivals and celebrations, and the viewers occupied even the roofs of the neighboring houses. Running and races were announced in summer. A racecourse in action in Perm was opened in 1900.[8] Many people in the Russian province, as well as in the capitals, were obsessed with aviation. In summer 1911, a futurologist Vasilii Kamenskoi flew a Blériot monoplane in Perm racecourse and Nizhnyaya Kurya settlement. Bright and symbolic phenomena of culture distinguish the turn of the centuries. Interest in aviation, car and other new types of sport are the indicative features of the Belle Époque culture. Illustrated journals, photography, cinematography also maintained the interest in these activities.

New types of pastimes were institutionalized in hobby groups, societies, clubs. Perm Society of Amateur Photographers was established in 1901 to promote artistic and technical knowledge about photography.[9] Racecourse and cycle tracks were the venues for shooting films; movie plots were sent to Pathé-Journal. Lawn tennis, football, croquet, Sokol gymnastics were among new types of sports. Public urban spaces were occupied with Sokol Festivals, the ones in 1914 in Perm, filmed.[10] In 1914, Perm set up a River Yacht Club, which held yacht races and football matches up to autumn 1917.

The provinces demanded new visual attractions, which turned out to be a variety of theaters, modern circuses, sport shows. Society industrialization and urbanization resulted in more efficient working time and more free time. S.Yu. Malysheva notes that the classes allocate different periods on rest, although time algorithms of city dwellers were nearly the same (Malysheva 2011, 39–78). Belle Époque markers are modern leisure time practices. With its opera and ballet private companies, City Theater in Perm competed with Summer Stage in the City Garden, where residents could see the staged entertaining genres (fig. 7). The past time culture of the higher classes in the society was scaled into the middle and lower urban classes, and the leisure activities evolved "from elitism to commerce." (McReynolds 2003) Provincial restaurants and pubs were used as café chantants (Uvarova 2004, 145). Wealthy inhabitants relaxed in first-class city restaurants. Newspapers were flooded with adverts for N.E. Trutnev's restaurant with a menu and an entertainment program. Traditional subcultures of the urban society were preserved, while a consumer of the commercial industry was being developed.

A person from a province could feel a new art style in the newspaper, journal, and book graphics. Perm Regional Museum keeps the books in Art Nouveau: from classical ones to modern essays, from fairy tales to the music notes. A documentary fund stores a collection of Art Nouveau postcards, Christmas, Easter, congratulatory, welcoming cards. At the beginning of the XX century, the development of communication means was connected with a postcard boom. The postcards contained a personal message and a picture. These were new "vision technologies" and other features of modernity and contributed to shaping a modern mobile world (Nashchokina 2004; Ovsyannikov 2005; Rowley 2013).

Figure 6. Perm cyclists. A photo from the collections of Perm Regional Museum.

Figure 7. A postcard "Hello from Perm."
Taken from the collections of Perm Regional Museum.

Many subjects in the Russian Empire were visual recipients with a low writing literacy level (Wortman 2004; Yankovskaya 2009; Vishlenkova 2001). At the beginning of the XX century, "the epoch of technical reproduction" was connected with the development of newspapers and journals, industry of postcards, adverts, distribution of posters, photos, cinematography which set an information agenda, contributed to information perception as an entertainment. New media played their role in shaping the image of the Russian Empire. At the same time, Lumier cinema tradition was a cult of reality, nature (Burch 1990: 6–22), which made cinematography a modern project. M.A. Doane writes about an imposed narrative in documentaries, although she also notes that a photographic movie actually recorded any moments, absolute incidences (Doane 2002, 15). Specific plots showed regional and local differences. Local identity tended to underlie the authentic properties, values of cultural diversity. Specific and fiction films shaped modern times with exhibitions, car races, international competitions, and shop windows. J. Arnason writes about a late-Imperial Russia that the combination of westernization and Empire modernization triggered different socio-cultural flows: Empire construction was the primary imperative for some. In contrast, others voted for the reforms bringing together Russia and European modernity models, and the revolutionary westernization served to be the third force (Arnason 2017, 37–69). There is some sense to distinguish between the progressive and regressive movements inside a transformation, rationalization, and traditionalism in a modernized society.

Sides of Belle Époque Tangible and Visual Images

The speedy modernization of the society, capitalism development, changes in the urban context, social improvements gave rise to Art Nouveau. Although Art Nouveau was born in arts and crafts, it was an elegant and versatile style aimed to beautify the environment. The art matched the events at the turn of the centuries; the dynamics of its harmonic shapes met the metaphor of European growth, changes (Silverman 1989, 1-7). Previous styles referred to the classical or gothic heritage, Renaissance or Baroque. Japonisme successive waves and Rococo rebirth influenced Art Nouveau and its unusual shapes. Surrounding space, architecture, interior, and life itself should be internally connected – Modern style arrived at the idea of an ensemble, an aestheticized, visually oriented model of modernity. Back in 1907, V. Meyerhold noted that Art Nouveau and Modern style could be seen everywhere – "on walking sticks, houses, in confectionaries, and on the posters" (Meyerhold 1968, part 1, 165). "It serves everyone", D.V. Sarabianov, a Russian art critic, wrote. Modern style "is wider in its' class scale"; its social roots "being extensive give an unprecedented range of 'social consumer'" (Sarabyanov 1989, 9–10).

The center of Perm was occupied with two- and three-storey stone houses owned by people, city administration, commercial banks, hotels, shops, etc. Private and public constructions were designed in Art Nouveau – stations, tenement buildings, summer houses, theaters, community halls. Hospitals, educational institutions (Specialized School for visually impaired children, Cyrill-and-Methodius Society, etc.), religious structures (a chapel in honor of the Kazan icon of the Mother of God, which was decorated with a majolica panel by N. Roerich) were erected with Art Nouveau elements. Modern style architecture was democratic and very flexible in its structural and technical innovations, had various genres. A private mansion could be seen as a face of Modern style in its Russian version. A merchant S.M. Gribushin's house (fig. 1) (just opposite the place where the treasure was found) designed by an architect A.B. Turchevich and E.I. Lyubimova's house designed by the same architect are very vivid illustrations of the Modern style in architecture in Perm. Reinforced concrete structures were used in the bridges, beams for the railway platforms, huge city markets, factory facilities. A good illustration could be a house occupied by the Engineer Society or a brewery factory ordered by Izhevsk Brewery Company, an example of modern industrial style. A new type of public buildings was designed in Art Nouveau style – cameo theaters, cinemas, and circuses. An Engineer Society opened Triumph Electrotheater. In one Perm newspaper, an article *Skyscraperers* (in Russian, Небоскребатели) described skyscrapers in America. Provincial Perm opened design bureaus ready to accept the orders for constructing reinforced concrete structures, for example, A.B. Turchevich's bureau.

The rapid pace of modern city life was compensated with the soothing atmosphere of private interiors (Silverman 1989, 5–180) Middle classes of the urban population got interested in the artistic finishing of the houses (fig. 8). In Perm, the furniture in the Russian and Japanese styles was sold. The newspapers published the adverts about selling the furniture in Rococo style, a living room suite made from "redwood with bronze ware in Modern style, Jacobean redwood suit." Perm Regional Museum preserved the samples of Art Nouveau furniture pieces owned by people from different classes. Many items of art castings were made in the Urals: Kaslinskii, Bilimbaevskii, and Kusinskii factories. The Russian provinces extensively used the pieces (coffee pots, sugar bowls, milk jugs) manufactured in Warsaw by Norblin, Fraget, etc.[11] Writing desks were full of inkpots, pencil cups, and candle holders, which could easily fit a civil servant's office, the rooms of people belonging to different classes. Inkpots and bells to call the servants, trowels to collect the litter from the desks were designed in Art Nouveau (fig. 9). Objects visualize the time, prove the circulation of products and ideas, support the values of aestheticism, utility function, consumerism (Ustyugova 2016, 53–63).

Figure 8. A.N. Zelenin. Ceramic tiles left from a friso above the chimney place in a painter's studio. Arts and crafts collection of Perm Regional Museum.

Figure 9. A bell to call the servants. Turn of XIX-XX centuries. Taken from metal collections of Perm Regional Museum. Photo by Vera Ustyugova.

Perm Regional Museum had a collection of candle holders with about 200 items. The Museum lamps are stamped with the brand name of Otto Mueller and Ehrich and Graetz factories in Berlin, Hugo Schneider in Leipzig, Brünner Brothers in Vienna. Some items have typical Art Nouveau smooth outlines and are decorated with exotic flowers, delicate shapes, and extravagant thorns and weed plants (fig. 10). The lights pointed to the diversity and a wealth of tastes among the urban elites. At the same time, many museum artifacts were owned by the middle class, the employees from the railway road, pharmacists, etc. Lights used among democratic classes were simpler and unpretentious, but they were also decorated with Art Nouveau flowers. Gorgeous glazed dinnerware sets or separate pieces by Kuznetzovs,' Gardner, Kornilovs Brothers' factories are the tableware items in the collection of Perm Regional Museum. Modern style was metonymic towards society; people of different classes and ages could boast of having the goods in this style. Some items carry the stamps of famous trading houses – M.I. Gribushin and Successors, P.S. Dosmanov in Perm, etc. Cool ornate metal, warm carved stone, soft velour, reserved porcelain biscuits are the sides of Belle Époque tangible and visual image (fig. 11).

Figure 10. A kerosene lamp. Milk glass. End of XIX century.
Taken from the arts and crafts collection from Perm Regional Museum.
Photo by Vera Ustyugova.

Figure 11. Easter egg-shaped small vase. Biscuit porcelain. Turn of XIX-XX centuries.
Taken from the arts and crafts collection from Perm Regoinal Museum.
Photo by Vera Ustyugova.

Cherchez la Femme

The treasure with the porcelain sets dated the beginning of the XX century is an unprecedented find in the history of the archeological excavations in Perm. The dinner set for 24 people is the largest one (figs. 12-14). The set was manufactured by M.S. Kuznetzov's factory in Riga and consists of 101 pieces: a soup tureen with a lid, a large fish platter which used to be placed at the center of the table, several smaller plates for fish and meat, a goulash plate, a herring plate, a salad bowl, a sauceboat, a mustard pot, a fruit vase, a lot of plates for salads, first and main courses, plates for pies (Mingaleva 2020). This dinner set is green with a gold foliage pattern with beads that are partially preserved. At those times, porcelain set by Kuznetzov for 24 people cost 75 rubles. That was the equivalent of the worker's wage for three months.

Figure 12-13. Pieces from a dinner set manufactured by M.S. Kuznetsov's factory in Riga.
Turn of XIX-XX centuries. Photo by Aleksey Utkin.

Figure 14. Pieces from a dinner set manufactured by M.S. Kuznetsov's factory in Riga.
Turn of XIX-XX centuries. Photo by Rodion Balkov. Perm Regional Museum.

Two separate tea and coffee sets for 12 people each have the same pattern: a black chain against gold coating (figs. 15-20). The sets were manufactured by M.S. Kuznetzov's factory in Dmitrov City at a former Gardner's factory.[12] The sets consist of a biscuit dish, a fruit vase, a jug, a coffee pot, sugar bowls, a cream jug, a butter dish, a teapot, a milk jug, dessert cups, slop bowls, coffee, and tea cups with saucers, jam plates, pie plates, a service tray.

Figure 15-16. Pieces from coffee and tea sets.
Manufactured by M.S. Kuznetsov's factory in Dmitrov City.
Turn of XIX-XX centuries.
Photo by Aleksey Utkin.

Figure 17. A biscuit dish from a coffee set for 12 people. Manufactured by M.S. Kuznetsov's factory in Dmitrov City. Turn of XIX-XX centuries. Photo by Elizaveta Bobyleva. PSU Media Center.
Figure 18. Pieces from a tea set for 12 people. Manufactured by M.S. Kuznetsov's factory in Dmitrov City. Turn of XIX-XX centuries. Photo by Elizaveta Bobyleva. PSU Media Center.

Figure 19. Pieces from a coffee set for 12 people. Manufactured by M.S. Kuznetsov's factory in Dmitrov City. Turn of XIX-XX centuries. Photo by Rodion Balkov. Perm Regional Museum.
Figure 20. Pieces from a tea set for 12 people. Manufactured by M.S. Kuznetsov's factory in Dmitrov City. Turn of XIX-XX centuries. Photo by Rodion Balkov. Perm Regional Museum.

A tea set for six people was manufactured by M.S. Kuznetzov's factory in Dmitrov City (figs. 21-23). The set has a foliage printed pattern (greens and gold coating). This hideout kept porcelain deep tea saucers, mug and saucer sets, a presentation dish "Bread-Salt" (in Russian, Хлеб-Соль), glass vases *Bertz*, and other items.

Figure 21. A tea set for 6 people. Manufactured by M.S. Kuznetsov's factory in Dmitrov City. Turn of XIX-XX centuries. Photo by Rodion Balkov. Perm Regional Museum.
Figure 22. Pieces from a tea set for 6 people. Manufactured by M.S. Kuznetsov's factory in Dmitrov City. Turn of XIX-XX centuries. Photo by Elizaveta Bobyleva. PSU Media Center.

Figure 23. A tea set for 6 people. Manufactured by M.S. Kuznetsov's factory in Dmitrov City. Turn of XIX-XX centuries. Photo by Aleksey Utkin.
Figure 24. A glazed tray with silver contour featuring a stylized raspberry twig. It is probably of Austrian origin. Turn of XIX-XX centuries. Photo by Mariya Mingaleva.

All porcelain goods were manufactured by M.S. Kuznetzov Company in Riga, Moscow, Dmitrov, Dulevo, and Budy Cities. The only exception is a glazed tray with silver contour and a stylized raspberry branch. This tray is likely to be of Austrian origin (fig. 24). This archeological find triggered a historical investigation to find the owner of the treasure. They managed to obtain the title records and information about the land arrangement in city block 85 (the block where the excavations took place). The area along Pokrovskaya street, 16, had a wooden two-story house, an outhouse, a bathhouse, and other backside buildings. Several families occupied the house and the outhouse, which was a commercial apartment housing. Up to 1915, this area was owned by Semen Fedorovich Trutnev, and then it was transferred to Anna Petrovna Isupova.[13]

Anna Isupova was a petty bourgeoisie from Vyatka. Perm Archive had a case which is a confirmation letter, that Anna was 20 years of age, and she requested for a peasant Petr Vasilevich Starostin to be appointed her trustee till she would reach her full legal age. Petr Starostin was her father, and this request for trusteeship was important to perform business deals, maybe to buy a land plot from S.F. Trutnev.[14]

Art Nouveau Female and Emotional World

The petty bourgeoisies continued to preserve their subculture against industrialization, demographic growth, traditions erosion, social mobility. At the end of XIX – beginning of XX centuries, petty bourgeoisies of Perm province were very diverse and structured in a highly complex manner. The petty bourgeoisies differed significantly by their living standards, incomes, and modes of existence. They traded in small amounts and bulks, did some crafts. They could be hired and own small workshops and factories (Belosludtzeva 2006). Some of them ran the shops, hotels, rented flats, or rooms with meals; some of these enterprises were held by women. The development of services helped women come to the cities, work in the shops, restaurants, leisure, and entertainment institutions.

In a pre-revolutionary Russia, women from the elite and middle classes were not socially wanted enough, while they were quite educated, as R. Stites notes (Stites 2004, 244). At the beginning of the XX century, Perm province had gymnasiums for women: many gymnasiums were progymnasiums and organized under Kushvinskii, Kyshtymskii, and Nevianskii factories. By 1917, there were 24 gymnasiums for women in Perm Region. Perm was known to have Mariinskaya gymnasium for women, as well as private gymnasiums owned by L.V. Barbatenko, M.N. Zinoveva, and A.I. Dreksler-Golynets. Female emancipation touched education, employment, freedom in wearing clothes. Modern values were visualized in clothes, journals, window shops, cinematography persuaded women of different classes to dream about their social roles. Fashion functioned as a narrative about a new social subject, and it played a huge role in transforming the traditional approach to women (Bartlett 2018, 76). Women's images inspired the artists at the turn of the century; the development of Art Nouveau was linked with the arts feminization. The women were on advert tags and posters. Belle Époque lady photos were placed in the shop windows. The women's depiction created a visual profile of consumption culture. D. Silverman writes that the "soaring grace" of the Eifel Tower metal structures was replaced with "soaring grace" of a dancing girl mimicking "a flying bird" (Silverman 1989, 7). Art Nouveau invaded city life so that public and charity campaigns, balls, and festivals were performed in this style. Many of these manifested the female principles typical for Art Nouveau (for example, the White Flower Festival was held in the Russian Empire cities at the beginning of the 1910s). Perm Regional Museum keeps some samples of ladies' dresses of the turn of the centuries – from wedding dresses to the petticoats and corsets, as well as Belle Époque accessories: wide scarves, neck wears, gloves,

mittens, bags, lace umbrellas (Ustyugova 2016, 70–78). Women belt buckles, safety pins for hats are love hymn to the tiny elements, and the leading style touches even the tiniest decorative piece (figs. 25-26). A dressing table of a woman was occupied with elegant and playful things (figs. 27). Art Nouveau revolution transferred modernity ideas to the private space. Symbols of the visual markers were represented in flora, fauna, female images. In the intimate environment, challenges to selfhood were compensated, in organicism interiors, in kitchen utensils, clothes. These images manifested emotional conditions that nurtured and expanded sensitivity. Visual representations were extensively determined in a social and gender manner following the principles of W. Morris and H. C. van de Velde, who called for the art to embody community pleasure of daily beauty admiration in a modern manner rather than to serve the elite.

Art Nouveau was shaping the language of an exciting modernity performance, and its cultural codes were manifested in the stylistics of everyday life. The aesthetic and utilitarian functions of the art followed the world perception of a private person. Its specific and recognizable aesthetics characterized urban culture. At the beginning of the XX century, Provincial Perm was an open city that welcomed students, guest actors, curiosity seekers; railway stations and ports were full of the hustle and bustle, more and more restaurants, hotels were organized, music could be heard in the gardens. Urbanization and goods accessibility generated a stratum of city dwellers who were interested in delicate things. However, the urban culture showed both dualism and drama of the time. Representation and reality dualism carries a lot of conflicts in the pre-revolutionary period. A former peasant arrived in the city, read newspapers, and went to the movies, while the society continued to be hierarchical and segregated; as a result, social behavior accumulated the energy to be burst out later.

Figure 25. A hatpin. Iron core with a decorated copper alloy head. Beginning of XX century. Taken from the arts and crafts collection from Perm Regional Museum. Photo by Vera Ustyugova.

Figure 26. A laced agrafé, fake-gagate-like, bakelite. Attached to a belt, clothes elements. Beginning of XX century. Taken from the arts and crafts collection from Perm Regional Museum. Photo by Vera Ustyugova.

Figure 27. A jewel-box for ladies' watch. Opaque glass, metal frame. Beginning of XX century. Taken from the arts and crafts collection from Perm Regional Museum. Photo by Vera Ustyugova.[15]

A Landlady at Lara's House: Afterword

What happened with the assumed landlady of the treasure after the Revolution? State Archive of Khabarovsk Krai kept the documents about Anna Petrovna Isupova. The Archive Fund "Chief Bureau for the Russian Emigrants to the Empire of Manchuria" had personal files about Anna Isupova and her family. These documents state that Anna Petrovna was born in Perm in 1893. Her father Petr Starikov, was a prominent salt trader, the councilor of Perm State Duma, owned salt storage facilities on the Kama River banks and several houses in the city. In 1909, Anna graduated from the gymnasium and got married to Yakov Isupov, an office clerk in the Perm Office of M.I. Gribushin and Successors Trading House.[16]

Back in 1919, Anna Isupova and her family left Perm for Harbin. She arrived there on June 23. She is likely to hide valuable things before her departure. Thus, this storage hideout was dated May beginning of June 1919 – in June, Kolchak's Army left Perm, which the Red Army soon occupied. In Harbin, Anna Isupova wrote in all her applications that she had no relatives in the Soviet Union, but she had some belongings in Perm. The documents were compiled in 1935–1944. There is no information about Anna Isupova's family after 1945 (her brother left for Brazil in the 1930s). In autumn 2019, Perm University organized the presentation of the find *A Century Underground* (in Russian, Сто лет под землей) in Gribushin Tea House. Once the discovery was handed over to Perm Regional Museum, located in the N.V. Meshkov's house, a well-known owner of the steamship, an exhibition titled *The Secret of Treasure from Lara's House* was organized. Tatiana Pochinova, a museum employee, says, "literary theory states that Perm is a prototype of Yuryatin's city in *Doctor Zhivago* by Boris Pasternak. Lara's house opposite the house with the figures, a popular Gribushin's mansion, is one of these Yuryatin's locations on a real city map. The circumstances when this treasure was found picture the image of a feminine, caring housewife who reminds us of Lara Antipova from the novel energized "with all global femininity", as the author puts it (A Century Underground).

Authors Biography

Vera V. Ustyugova Doctor of Historical Sciences, an Associate Professor at the Department of Interdisciplinary Historic Studies of Perm State University. Modernism and early silent movies, Urban Studies, history of fashion, Media Studies are the scientific focuses. She is the author of Belle Epoch of Cinematography. 1896–1919. A Case of Russian Provinces (in Russian, "Прекрасная эпоха" синематографа. 1896–1919. На материале русской провинции") (Perm, 2015), a co-author of Noah's Ark of the Russian movies: from Stenka Razin to Dandies ("Ноев ковчег русского кино: от Стеньки Разина до "Стиляг") (Vinnytsia, 2012) and Feature Stories about Russian Culture ("Очерки русской культуры") (L.V. Koshman Workshop, Moscow State University), the author of the journal publications in Ab Imperio, Dialog with Time ("Диалог со временем"), Modern History of Russia ("Новейшая история России"), Ural Historic Bulletin ("Уральский исторический вестник"). She participated in cultural projects: Perm Cinémathèque, International Documentary Film Festival Flahertiana, Diaghilev Festival, etc. Email: vera_ust@list.ru

Mariya K. Mingaleva She is an employee at Kama Archeological Expedition, a junior research assistant at the Department of History and Archeology at Perm State University (PSU). She graduated from the faculty of history and politology at Perm State University with the major in history back in 2008. She finished a postgraduate course in Archeology at the Institute of Archeology named after A. Kh. Khalikov, Tatarstan Academy of Sciences in 2020. She has been participating in the archeological excavations of Kama Archeological Expedition since 2002, performing independent archeological works over the territory of Perm Krai, including the excavations in Perm, since 2012. She is the author of 9 articles in archeology and 16 scientific reports about archeological works. Her scientific interests cover Cis-Urals region archeology in early Iron Age; urban archeology; museumification of archeological artifacts. She promotes archeological science and organizes the exhibitions with archeological finds. Email: m.yukova@yandex.ru

Notes

1. Kama Archeological Expedition was headed by an associate professor Grigorii Golovchanskii. The excavations were managed by Mariya Mingaleva. A scientific team consisted of Lyudmila Romanova, Vitalii Mingalev and others. The collection of things was handed over to Perm Regional Museum. Elena Artishcheva is the keeper of the collection of arts and crafts. Tatyana Pochinova, Svetlana Neganova, Tatyana Murueva, Elena Merkusheva are the specialists who work with the artifacts in the Museum.

2. This back lid of the accessory is similar to Whitby Victorian cameo in style, made from black plastic material (gagate or volcanite) with an image of a castle.

3. Some objects could not resist the ground pressure for a century and had some cracks, but their location at one place helped collect them with no major losses. Now they are handed over to be restored to Tatyana Murueva, a specialist of Perm Regional Museum. https://www.facebook.com/museumperm

4. Message from Eric de Rothschild by Vitalii Mingalev to e-mail, 19 july 2019.

5. Half a century after the peasants were freed from serfdom in 1861, the share of urban dwellers increased from 10 to 18% among the population of the Russian Empire. This figure could be seen to be minor: at the beginning of XX century the European urban societies included 40–50% of population. However, urbanization in Russia in absolute figures was 15.6 mln people in 1897, 25 mln people by 1913. The 1897 first Russian census in Perm revealed 45 403 inhabitants, and 75 thousand people by the beginning of 1913.

6. Before the Revolution, Motovilikha did not belong to Perm, it was its suburb, a factory village.

7. State Archive of Perm Krai, f. 35, op. 1, d. 151: 12, 19–20 (Case about reservation of a cycle track area in a public garden for games and physical exercises of the school students in Perm. 1905–1915).

8. State Archive of Perm Krai, f. 35, op. 1, d. 120: 1–15 (Case about reservation of a city land plat for racecourse construction in Perm. 1900–1903).

9. State Archive of Perm Krai, f. 680, op. 1, d. 287: 1–18 (Charter of Perm Photography Society, business letters to the organizations and people, Minutes from the meetings. 1902–1905)

10. Event Poster, *Perm Province News*, 1914, 21 May (no. 106); 22 May (no. 107); Perm Regional Museum. Department of Collections, DI Sector. No. 18496/675–676 DI/FK–2677, NV–4306/12–15 (Photocards). State Archive of Perm Krai, f. 36, op. 1, d. 173 (Case about turning V.B. Khalupa, a Check Republic citizen, into a Russian). The Sokol Gymnastics Festival was organized by Ivan Khalupa, a teacher in the first gymnasium, in the non-classical and commercial specialized schools.

11. The materials from N.A. Krasnoslobodskaya, a keeper of metal collection in Perm Regional Museum, have been used. See also: Warsaw silver. Polish silver coated items dated XIX-XX centuries in State Museum of Saint Petersburg History: Album Catalogue (Saint Petersburg: GMI SPb, 2018).

12. Two pieces (butter dish and a dessert cup) bear Gardner factory stamp. M.S. Kuznetzov is known to stamp the pieces with the old Gardner mark even after he bought the factory.

13. State Archive of Perm Krai, f. 40, op.1, d.163 (1st part of Perm, block 85).

14. State Archive of Perm Krai, f. 175, op.1, d. 264 (Case about trusteeship over A.P. Isupova, an underaged merchant from Vyatka).

15. The authors thank Perm Regional Museum, PSU Media Center and Aleksey Utkin for te photos.

16 State Archive of Khabarovsk Krai, f. P830, op. 3, d. 18482 (Case of A.P. Isupova); also see State Archive of Khabarovsk Krai, f. P830, op. 3, d. 18481 (Case of Ya.M. Isupov); State Archive of Khabarovsk Krai, f. P830, op. 3, d. 18480 (Case of D. Ya. Isupov).

Bibliography

A Century Underground. A Story of One Treasure. Summer 2021. https://permskiy-universitet-pgni.timepad.ru/event/1106202/

Arnason, Jjhann Pall. "Revolution, Transformations, Civilization: Prolegomenons to Framework Transfomation." *Emergency Reservces*, no. 5, 2017, 37–69.

Bartlett, Djurdja. "Nadezhda Lamanova and Modernity in Pre-Revolutionary Russia: Between High Fashion and Avant-Garde Arts." *Theory of Fashion*, no. 47 (Spring 2018): 73–112.

Belosludtzeva, V.V. "Merchant class in Perm Province at the Second Half of XIX – Beginning of XX Centuries." PhD diss., State University of Perm, 2006.

Benjamin, Walter. *Paris, the Capital of XIX Century*, *Insights*. Moscow: Martis 2000.

Borisova, E. A., Sternin, G.Yu. *Russian Modern Style*. Moscow: Sovetskii Khudozhnik, 1990.

Burch, Noël. *Life to Those Shadows*. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press 1990.

Charle, Christophe. "The End of Century." *New Literature Review*, 149, no. 1 (2018): 9–23.

Doane, Mary Ann. *The Emergence of Cinematic Time: Modernity, Contingency, the Archive*. Cambridge and London: Harvard University Press, 2002.

Malysheva, S.Yu. *Day for Celebration, Evening for Leisure. Leisure Culture in the Russian Provincial City at the second half of XIX – beginning of XX centuries.* Moscow: Academia, 2011.

Matich, Olga. "Fin de siècle: Barocco and Modernism (Intermediacy, making time spacious, visuality)." *New Literature Review*, 149, no. 1 (2018): 49–73.

McReynolds, Louise. *Russia* at *Play: Leisure Activities at the End of the Tsarist Era*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2003.

Meyerhold, V.E. *Articles, Letters, Talks*. Moscow: Iskusstvo, 1968.

Mingaleva, M.K. *Report about archeological excavations at the site of archeological heritage "Provincial Perm, Settlement." Perm in 2019. In 3 volumes.* Perm: 2020. Archive of PSU Archeology Office, manuscript.

Muraveva, I.A. *Century of Modern Style. A Panoramic View of Life in the Capital*. Saint Petersburg: Pushkinskii Fund, 2004.

Narskii, I. Review of *Russlands Fahrtindie Moderne. Mobilitat und sozialer Raum im Eisenbahnzeitalter* by F.B. Schenk. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 2014. *Russian History*, no. 5 (2016): 208–221.

Nashchokina, M.V. *An Art Russian Modern Style Postcard*. Moscow: Zhiraf 2004.

Ovsyannikov, A.I. *Perm Province City on the Illustrated Postcard 1899–1917*. Yekaterinburg: Uralskii Rabochii, 2005.

Pasternak, B.L. *Zhenia Luvers' Childhood*. Moscow: Detskaya Literatura, 1991.

Rowley, Alison. *Open Letters: Russian Popular Culture and the Picture Postcard, 1880–1922*. Toronto: Toronto University Press, 2013.

Sarabyanov, D.V. *Modern Style. Roots, History, Problems*. Moscow: Iskusstvo, 1989.
Schenk, Frithjof Benjamin. *A Train to Modernity. Mobility and Social Space of Russia at the Epoch of Railway Roads*. Moscow: New Literature Review, 2016.
Silverman, Debora L. *Art Nouveau in Fin-de-Siècle France: Politics, Psychology and Style* Berkeley: University of California Press, 1989.
Stites, Richard. *Women's liberation movement in Russia: Feminism, nihilism, and bolshevism. 1860–1930*. Moscow: ROSSPEN, 2004.
Tyrkova-Williams, A. *Memoirs. Something that has gone*. Moscow: Slovo, 1998, 511.
Urry, John. *Mobilities*. Moscow: Praksis, 2012.
Ustyugova, V.V. "Belle Epoque a la province: Modernization processes in a Russian city at the turn of XIX-XX centuries." *Bulletin of Tomsk State University*, no. 422 (2017): 172–180.
Ustyugova, V.V. "Townswoman in Modern Style: Interests and Entertainments in the Russian Province at the Beginning of XX Century." *Ural Historic Bulletin*, 52, no. 3 (2016): 70–78.
Ustyugova, V.V. "Social History of Modern Style in a Case of a Russian City at the Turn of XIX–XX Centuries." *Bulletin of Perm University. History Series*, 35, no. 4 (2016): 53–63.
Uvarova, E. D. *Leisure Activities in the Russian Capitals*. Saint Petersburg: Aleteiya, 2004.
Vishlenkova, E. A. *Visual Ethnology of Empire or Not everyone could have a chance to see a Russian*. Moscow: New Literature Review, 2011.
Wortman, R.S. *Scenarios of Power: Myth and Ceremony in Russian Monarchy: in 2 vol*. Moscow: RGGY, Institute "Open Society," 2004.
Yankovskaya, G. "Review of Picturing Russia: Explorations in Visual Culture." V.A. Kivelson and J. Neuberger, eds. *Ab Imperio*, no 1, (2009): 440–441.

Construction of the Pacification Through Comics in Africa

Idah Razafindrakoto

Abstract

There are many armed conflicts, political violence, protests, rebellions, barbarism and *putsches* in Africa. In some African countries, these violent actions threaten urban contexts, so they are always at risk of spreading from one territory (or country) to another. They have become lasting and perennial. Consequently, they affect not only the national and continental security, but also the economy, the political stability, the social quietude and the community production. At the continental level, 13 countries faced armed conflict account for almost 90 percent of the 25 million people displaced. To face the security and conflict issues which are strongly present in Africa, a variety of initiatives are being implemented to stabilize areas in crisis. If the peace actors are numerous and extensively studied, this article rather offers an analytical reading of the contributions and the intervention of a peace actor who is less documented. They are cartoonists. Cartoonists are indeed dynamic actors who are actively involved in dealing with issues of protest, insecurity, violence and conflict. They are artists, mostly from urban areas, who use their comics as a committed artistic expression. To this end, this research deals with the construction of the pacification through comics in Africa. It is therefore concluded that this pacification is built by speeches and actions. On the one hand, the speeches are founded by the discourses of "transition of the arts" and securitization. On the other hand, the actions focus on the coalition of cartoonists and the institutional partnerships. To carry out this research, we mobilize the theory of constructivism to highlight the process operationalized by the comics to contribute to the pacification in Africa. Our methodology is based on documentation (speeches, reports, artworks), participant and non-participant observation and interviews with peace actors (youth association for peace and security experts), and cartoonists.

Idah Razafindrakoto, "Construction of the Pacification: Through Comics in Africa,"
Art Style, Art & Culture International Magazine, v. 8, no. 8.1, part 2 (September 2021), 109-122.
DOI: 10.5281/zenodo.5498397

Introduction

There are many armed conflicts, political violence and protests in Africa, including the Arab Spring revolutions and numerous *putsches* in several countries since 1960, as rebellions in Mali and Madagascar. Several cases reported around disputes over resources and borders are causing insecurity in African countries (ACLED 2017, 2-5). These African crises are characterized by a heterogeneity of causes (historical rivalries, natural resources and economic greed, political interests, relational and diplomatic degradation, exogenous interference, identity demarcation, etc.). The urgencies of pacification and return to stabilization are much intensified. So the establishment of national, sub-regional and continental mobilizations and initiatives are numerous and consecutive. They are usually around promoting the dialogue-centered approach to conflict prevention and resolution of conflicts (1) and establishing a culture of peace and tolerance through peace education (2) (AU 2021). However, the continent has various disadvantages, particularly in financial resources. In addition, new barbarism (Mateos 2010, 29) and issues of unity in cultural diversity intensify the ideological and tribal rivalries. In this very sensitive context, all these problems and major security challenges disadvantage the most affected and exposed African countries by wars and conflicts. The development problems caused are delays or stagnation of economic growth, cultural psychoses and xenophobism, return to social intolerance, political jostling and destruction of environments.

The successive security conflicts, violence and wars on the continent have become lasting and perennial. And although they are generally located in decentralized regions, urban cities are automatically affected indirectly. It therefore threatens urban centers and is always at risk of spreading from one territory to another. At the continental level, 13 countries faced armed conflict account for almost 90 percent of the 25 million people displaced (William 2019, 6). This is the case with the Boko Haram phenomenon in Nigeria, Cameroon, Niger, Chad and Mali. Faced with this perpetual observation, various initiatives located in urban cities are being carried out to try to slow down, contain and solve this problem. These initiatives are: security research centers (CREPS in Cameroon), state cooperation (transnational funding of military bases), inter / intraregional negotiations (ECOWAS, ECCAS), etc.). However, these initiatives converge more on political and socio-economic actions.

Existing studies jointly deal with stakeholder analysis for the pacification process. We distinguish a group of authors who question state actors with either realistic or liberal visions (Conciliation Resource 2015). And another majority group that studies non-state institutional actors (entrepreneurs, civil society, etc.) and the orchestration of their mobilizations (Ebogo 2020). After analyzing this duality, it would be interesting to focus on a stakeholder who intervenes in the process of peace building but who is also less exploited and documented (ACCORD 2015, 39)[1] in literature. So, we introduce the case of artistic creators. If musical and audiovisual artworks are the most prominent in raising awareness and preventing peace, we will focus on a discipline of visual arts that has remained shy and marginalized: the comics.

This cultural and artistic product is considered to be a practice of leisure, entertainment and enjoyment (Razafindrakoto 2020, 25-27) in Africa. As its techniques and codes have been imported through globalization and syncretism, readers have not necessarily a sense of belonging to it. However, it remains practiced and develops gradually in the media sphere and public spaces. Since 2015, comics have started to be more and more visible in urban cities and on social networks. And indeed, a new cartoon trend that deals with issues of peace and security (anti-war) is observable on social networks (Facebook). The flow is more visible in countries in conflict (Mali, Cameroon, Nigeria, South Africa, etc.). This observation therefore deducts that a growing number of African cartoonists engaged in pacification is evolving.

Our interest in this research is to understand the link between comics and the process of pacification in Africa in the face of conflict and security contexts. So, how is pacification constructed through comics in Africa? As a hypothesis, to understand its construction, we anticipate that it is founded on discourses (speeches) and that it is operationalized by actions and interactions. To carry out this research, we mobilize the constructivism. Our methodology is based on documentation (speeches, reports, artworks[2]), participant and non-participant observation and interviews with peace actors (youth association for peace and security experts), and cartoonists.

The Discursive Foundations of Pacification Through Comics

To apprehend the origins of social constructs, we will focus on the discourses and the representations they generate.

The Discourses of the "Transition of the Arts"

The role of visual art has been documented at length: wonderment, astonishment, technical initiation, creative awakening (Eckhoff 2008, 468-472), entertainment, etc. But when it comes to the field of comics, its narrative content is more focused, for the most part, in technicality and aesthetics. This is due to the fact that it combines two different arts: literature and drawing. This does not allow to fully develop a complete focus on the content (the message conveyed and the moral of the story). For the most part, it aims to contextualize a universe (circumstance) and the chronological sequence of the narration. Basically, the comic strip requires more time/ step for its realization (from its conception, until its edition): the time/ step for story conception, the time/step for scenario, the time/ step for storyboard, the time/ step for sketching, the time/step for bubble, the time/ step for inking, the time/ step for coloring, the time/step for framing, the time/ step for finishing, etc. . Consequently, the cartoonist is thus a visual artist who works at length on logic and aesthetics.

However, a discursive construction is underway and mechanically attracts, by performative scope, African cartoonists. The benchmark year (2015) of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) led to a wave of ideological reforms in the planetary arguments. The sense of intersubjectivity and the sharing of common values on a global scale have led the authorities and political elites of African culture to align themselves behind various paradigms: that of governance. This same concept of governance comes to attribute the consideration and the mobilization of all the stakeholders to aspire to the search for peace:

> Culture also raises strategic stakes for global governance today. Many have written of the "global village" emerging today. […] New forms of expression are emerging, along with innovative venues for dialogue. At the same time, in increasingly complex societies, within cities that are ever more diverse, the challenge of living together has increased in importance […] This work is closely tied to UNESCO's promotion of cultural diversity as the basis for deepening understanding and fostering dialogue. This mandate led the

> United Nations General Assembly to request UNESCO to lead the International Decade for a Culture of Peace and Non-violence […] These global initiatives mobilized an impressive range of actors, from young people to heads of state. More than 75 million people worldwide signed the Manifesto 2000 for a Culture of Peace and Non-Violence. (Bokova 2011, 12)

This speech by UNESCO's political elite (Bokova) will form the foundation of the inclusion of artists in the process of non-violence. They therefore become key players in development and deconstruct discriminatory practices against them. This speech therefore reinforces the enunciation of Kofi Annan who observed: "Political cartoons make us laugh. Without them, our lives would be quite sad. But this is also a serious matter - they have the power to inform, but also to offend" (IFHR 2015). This empowerment discourse is repeated at various levels (ministries of culture in Africa, community leaders and artistic festival-goers/managers). And they evolve further in the age of the SDGs (2015). Empowerment discourses of artistic and cultural actors, including cartoonists are growing. The security theme is SDG 16 on peace[3]. Moreover, the discursive foundation at the continental level springs from the co-construction of Agenda 2063 by political speakers. Three agenda aspirations are very significant and can demonstrate the argumentation of visual art mixed with contemporary battles: the aspirations 4 (A peaceful and secure Africa), 5 (Africa with a strong cultural identity common heritage, values and ethics) et 6 (An Africa whose development is people-driven, relying on the potential offered by the African people, especially its women and youth, and caring for children) (AUC 2015, 2).

In these two very distinct but complementary trajectories (global and continental), a deviance can be observed. This deviance is marked by the shift from an old world of urban African cartoonists to a new one. The old world refers to the prevalence over technicality, while the new world refers to governance of the arts for the SDGs. In short, the unspoken ideas behind the speeches aimed the artistic transition. Let us therefore evoke the aesthesis which deals with perception by the intellect (Solomos 2017, 2-6). Artists are therefore led to take a greater interest in contemporary issues (ecological, social crisis, etc.). This interactive dynamic encourages the aggressive switch from the contextualization and aesthetic trends (form) addressed by the cartoonists to militant and activist themes (substance/content). This is how the neological and constructivist concept of artivism is born. This concept brings together as many common and militant causes, and shared values built on the citizen participation of the artist. The aim is to stimulate positive change in communities. Basically, this glossary aims to link the arts to

contemporary issues in order to produce a social impact. To illustrate it, we take the case of Cameroon where artistic encounters are abundant due to insecurity resurgences (Anglophone-NOSO-Ambazonia crisis and Boko Haram crisis), for example: #TheMovementAfrica, le #peacejam de #defyhatenow and #defyhatenow. We can also enumerate the experiences of Ethiopia and Sudan. So, the artistic pacification is based on ideological and practical transition towards artivism which is driven by the governance and empowerment discourse.

The Discourses of Securitization

It is quite normal for the state to react and act in front of the various identity and socio-political tensions that persist in various African countries. The first tendencies converge towards the construction of discourse of victimization. The countries where there are armed conflicts and insurgencies are the most dynamic. Apart from the islands (from the Indian Ocean such as Seychelles, Comoros, Mauritius and Madagascar) and Cape Verde, the mobilization of cross-border countries is involved in the stabilization of the neighboring country concerned. This transnationalism is generated by feeling the threat and its growing risks.

Regarding the country concerned, the speeches of victimization will form the foundation of the strategic acts of state security. The speeches of Heads of State or the commanders of the armies will automatically forge intolerance and their standard response may be the transformation into a nation state. They will further centralize power to strengthen their authority. The speeches can therefore easily emerge the confusion between political calculation and opportunistic patriotism (Ebogo 2020). In this act of discursive securitization, the restrictive measures will be amplified as in the case of the Cameroonian Government to protect itself from Boko Haram[4] or the Malian Government against jihadist groups.[5] The construction of this reform is based on the act of defending power and the people.

It is obvious that it causes popular reactions and response from cartoonists who see their freedoms restricted. In a context of fragile and skewed construction of democracy, Africans are sensitive to decisions that shake up their logic and *habitus*. The feeling of frustration and discontent will automatically be heavier compared to the process of understanding state decisions. This is due to the logic of crowd movement (Lebon 1899, 521-523) and fallacy. In this rush, the cartoonists will highlight their citizen participation. So they will respond by illustrating the crowd's (or their) protests and denunciation through memes (if it is freelance) and

cartoons (if the opposition to the regime frames the editorial line). In other circumstances, cartoonists are likely to support securitization. In these cases, the speeches of reform will influence the production of cartoons for acclamation and sensitization. It all revolves around the interest of social influence and public opinion.

However, when we analyze the securitizing discourse, challenges remain unresolved, but they are still topical: On the one hand, a temporal duality complicates the artistic reactions. It is about the urgency of pacification, as desired by securitization reforms *versus* the sustainability of pacification, as desired by sustainable development. Failure to understand this nuance skews the alignments of cartoonists. This is how we can explain the hasty and tendentious impulsion in the artistic approaches. As a result, we deduct that the securitization discourses are foundational and transform the comics as a political communication medium in the process of pacification. They therefore deconstruct the simplistic reduction of comics as a socio-cultural medium of entertainment.

To sum up, pacification through comics is based on transitionalist and securitizing speeches. And in these two cases, the deconstruction of the prior representation of cartoonist artists is automatic (technical focus, entertainment and in other rare cases: drugs). This deviated trajectory towards artivism plays a strong social role and further guarantees popular recognition of African cartoonists.

The Operationalization of Pacification Through Comics

Operationalization is the stage of implementation. It also consists in analyzing the means and instruments put in place as well as the actions and interactions between the actors.

The Coalition of Cartoonists

Speeches are followed by actions. These actions therefore constitute the mechanism for operationalizing pacification through comics. To observe this concretization, we must first focus on the organization of the meetings. The most striking in Africa are the annual meetings which bring together cartoonists. Cartoon festivals are indeed numerous and are identified as the most publicized crossroads in the field of comics: Festival International de Caricature et de Bande Dessinée de Bamako (FESCAB), Salon International de la Bande Dessinée de Tazarka (SIBDT) (Tunisia), Festival international de la Bande Dessinée d'Alger (FIBDA) (Algeria), Vootoon (Benin), MboaBD (Cameroon), Festival Gasy Bulles (Madagascar), Bilili Festival (Congo), Cairo Comix Festival (Egypt), etc. During these event-driven practices, two operations can be observed in behavior: the transfer of knowledge and the synchronization of thematic knowledge (cohesion, peace, multiculturalism, etc.). Both are about networking in order to stay connected, associated and up to date in a cohesive movement. This forum has informational interests. This is the case with associations or platform of cartoonists like "Cartooning for Peace in Africa."

Secondly, the actions also revolve around solidarity. This solidarity is reflected in the virtual support (encouragement) of artworks by peers. But it is also a strategic action. The challenge is to remain visible in the media sphere. Visibility is an important asset that the African cartoonists develop. Their artivism stimulate them to aspire to become "*ambassadors of peace*" (Defy Hate Now 2020) or social influencers. This "influencer" designation has been very popular since 2018 on social networks. It enhances and magnifies the image and public reputation of artists. It is therefore common to notice the affinities and mutual aid between cartoonists on social networks (free sharing and promotion of the artworks of another cartoonist to always perpetuate visibility). This network seems to embellish solidarity, which automatically blurs the pictorial competition between artists. This operationalization through free promotion through networking and solidarity also reveals an individualized reason, which nevertheless remains linked to communitarianism. Its unsaid aspect is due to the support of the cartoon industry in the art market[6]. It means it is about collective survival.

Thirdly, the most common cartoon peace action is virtual "*cancel culture*" which is a social tool to stop offensive and harmful behavior. So this is a practice or tendency of engaging in mass canceling as a way of exerting social pressure and expressing disapproval (Webster 2021). With the development of NTICs and easy access to the Internet in African urban cities. The new democracy, the freedom of expression and the practices of comments fuse and amplify. Facebook's observation shows a dynamic filled with waves of popular, real-time reactions. As soon as a conflict or a wave of violence arises, the virtual world is immediately informed. In this interactive context, cartoonists acquire rapid responsiveness and draw instantaneously to quickly produce a work, often in the form of caricature and satire. Getting to publish a work within a few hours (on the same day at the latest) following the conflicting event, demonstrates the retroactivity, seriousness and commitment of the cartoonist. Indeed, concerning the content of these artworks, the editorial line is strongly skewed. Satire and irony are observable. For some, they denounce the authorities or the rebels openly. But for others, there is a touch of ambiguity, given the punitive or criminal intimidation that artists would risk. So they draw and don't clearly represent the information. Their use abstract art or approximate representation (clue) and let the reader interpret and guess for himself the hidden message by contextualizing it. For the cartoonist, this is a form of self-protection.

These two forms of cancel culture practice are co-operationalized by the participation of the popular mass. The objective here is not to disseminate hate speech (even if it is susceptible to happen), but to denounce or even, sometimes to denigrate (by harassing and bludgeoning) through excessive sharing of the artworks on social networks. It is an artistic strategy to discredit the target and make them prey to public opinion. In short, the cancel culture aims to cancel an agent, a decision or a reality. It is the most visible form of protest in the effects of internet buzz in Africa. To illustrate it, the cases of the liberation crisis in Togo (2018), the xenophobic violence in South Africa (2019) and the war in Sudan, are all conflicting events that have triggered a wave of caricatures of denunciation shared by all the other African cartoonists on the continent. In other circumstances, alliances are created (contractual or associative). As a result, pacification through comics is implemented and achieved in a collective movement of information co-management and social solidarity of artists.

The Institutional Partnerships

In this contemporary and globalized context, cooperative and partnership values become co-constructed and intersubjective. Cultural cooperation through international institutions is really visible. They obey editorial lines and programmatic agendas. In French-speaking African countries, Western cultural structures are established, notably the Institut Français, the Goethe Institut and the US Embassy. Their mission is to promote their culture while promoting cultural diversity in the host country. They are based on the principle of cultural cooperation which aims to develop peaceful relations and friendship between peoples (UNESCO 1996, art. 1-11). This gives African cartoonists the occasion to seize funding opportunities for artistic projects (international mobility, residency, workshop, exhibition and edition). Other institutional partnerships focus on the logic of international governance. This partnership generates more or less opportunities of gratification. We cite, for example, the cartoon competition organized by UNESCO and the Organisation Internationale de la Francophonie (OIF) in 2015 on cohesion in cultural diversity (for peace). Or the case of UNWOMEN cartoon competition for a theme on "women and armed conflicts" (2021). The other institutional scenarios consist of exploiting the performativity of comics on positive change. This refers to its use as a communication medium, such as United Nations Agencies (banners, awareness campaign, communication for development, etc.), civil society platforms and public institutions. This form of communicational co-management of peace building is the most common and maintains the professional employment of cartoonists. Otherwise, a variety of inter-African (Arterial Network and ACF), interregional (Ho avy an-tsary) or inter-provincial partnerships is also present.

But, it should be observed that cartoonists in urban cities are, over all, the most privileged and targeted by institutional support or offers of opportunities. This context generates a disparity between urban and provincial/ rural cartoonists. This centralization of contracts and funding explains the construction of a base of inequity and can creates elitist competition process. For example, the artists closest to the institutions gain more funding opportunities thanks to retention and locking of information. It is obvious that conflict zones are mostly outside urban territories. So cartoonists do not have an authentic and faithful connection with the realities they illustrate (war, emotions, etc) even if they feel and demonstrate compassion. The reason is that urban cartoonists do not have access to the study grounds due to the insecurity in the concerned zone, unless they are on an expedition/ exploration. If their information is less documented and less

substantiated, they risk to produce speculative artworks. The virtuality of the information and the speed of the misinformation sharing can demonstrate the disconnection of the artists from the event. This binding working condition, characterized by agglomeration in an urban environment, also emanates skewed audience targeting. So the general trend targets urban readers for denunciation and awareness. However, the targeting of readers in the provinces and in conflict zones is not really noticeable, yet those most concerned do not have a strong chance of accessing artistic works: rural, isolated and disadvantaged populations who are the most vulnerable to threats or who are already in the conflictual context. Since the possible digitalization of drawings in Africa, traditional readers in books and newspapers are gradually declining. So the digitalization worsens the inequity between towns and villages. This gap has a hard effect on access to comics. Ensuring communication and awareness in conflict zones (inaccessible or restricted) and rural areas (where dissemination and popularization costs are very high, and purchasing power is low) is a perpetual partnership challenge for the actors involved in the cartoon market. Another paradox is also remarkable in the professional behavior of cartoonists. If initially, artivism is motivated by awareness, citizen participation and volunteering, the professionalization of comics encourages the hunt for funding. This provokes the gradual shift from artivism towards the objective of financial stability. Therefore, partnership opportunities and financial subsidies/ grants from institutions contribute to the development of the achievement of pacification through comics. But, as a consequence, these opportunities create the ambiguous distinction between communitarianism (citizen participation) and individualism in the actions of cartoonists.[7] In summary, the interactions and actions between artists and their entourage demonstrate human and relational behaviors of professional survival (crowd movement, alliance, alterity, common growth, etc.). But at the same time, these behaviors take into account the competition. Cartoonists must be able to effectively identify funding opportunities to perpetuate and to ensure permanence. However, in this dynamic, the support for the peace building campaign has increased tenfold. In addition, the fluidity of message transfers has become very efficient with free digital and digitized comics. Social receptivity is clear and guarantees the robustness of the messages in the social *doxas*.

Conclusion

In sum, our study has shed light on the foundations and the realization of the construction of pacification, by taking comics as a medium in Africa. Indeed, we have seen a couple of materialization: the one is the speeches or discourses (what is said) and the other is the actions (what is done). It means that, upstream, political and intersubjective discourses have built the governance and the transition of the arts and thus, the discourses of securitizing reforms have (in)directly reinforced the status of the comics as a medium of political communication. It is in these speeches that the African comics for peace building will found its strength. Downstream, in terms of realization, we have shown that globalization and the competitive context bring urban cartoonists together. The actions, mechanisms and operationalization strategies are diverse (alliance, contractual partnership, etc.) even if dissonances and controversies can be identified at the level of individualist and centralized logics. However, it is appropriate to emphasize that this practice of artistic pacification manifests itself tendencies of protest, acclamation or awareness. To conclude, we induce that it is a process in full evolutionary construction in the cities of Africa which brings about, on its constructive pathway, changes and heterogeneities, and also, synergies and controversies.

Author Biography

Idah Razafindrakoto is a PhD Student in Governance and Regional Integration, Institute of Governance, Humanities and Social Sciences, Pan-African University, Yaounde, Cameroon. She is native of Madagascar and holds a BA in Cultural Mediation and Management at the University of Antananarivo, Antananarivo, Madagascar. She is also a visual artist (cartoonist and illustrator). Her areas of expertise are culture (visual arts and cultural governance) and sustainable development (energy transition and climate change).
Email: idah.razafindrakoto@gmail.com

Notes

1. These are the actors focused on the cultural theme who promote and study art as a medium. Otherwise, classical literature omits it. Art is reduced to equipment as "art communication."

2. Comics (books and illustrations) on banners, profile logos, satires, sarcastic press cartoons, digital comics and graphic t-shirts.

3. SDG 16: Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels.

4. Prohibition of groupings and closure of drinking establishments after 6 p.m., strengthening of the workforce in the North, strengthening of controls on road axes, prohibition of street vendors, restriction of the circulation of two-wheeled vehicles (motorbikes), ban on wearing the full veil and surveillance of mosques.

5. Prohibition of motorcycles and pick-ups in certain areas of the north and the center, in particular Tombouctou, Mopti and Ségou.

6. Interviews show that the African cartoon sector remains very fragile and vulnerable. Even if the consumers of the product are numerous, the purchases of comics remain rare since the public prefers the free.

7. The majority of African communities strongly value communitarianism and feelings of ethnic belonging. However, precarious situations weaken and contradict these communitarian values. Individualistic acts emerge in the contexts of competition and interest.

Bibliography

ACCORD. *Silencing the guns, owning the future: Realizing a conflict-free Africa*. Durban: Process Litho, 2015.

ACLED. "Conflict trends (no. 55) real-time analysis of African political violence." ACLED: 2017. https://reliefweb.int/sites/reliefweb.int/files/resources/ACLED_Conflict-Trends-Report-No.55-February-2017-pdf.pdf

AUC. *Agenda 2063. The Africa We Want*. Addis Ababa: African Union, 2015.

AU. "Conflict resolution, peace & security." Addis Abbaba: AU, 2021. https://au.int/es/node/34990

Bokova, Irina. "Global governance for the 21st Century: The UNESCO angle by Irina Bokova Director-General of UNESCO." UNESCO, 2011. https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000192499

Conciliation Resource. *Analysis of conflict and peacebuilding in the Central African Republic.* Report November 2015. London: Conciliation Resource, 2015.

Defy Hate Now. "7 art pour la paix: #artivisme. #DefyHateNow Guide pratique pour lutter contre la diffusion des discours haineux en ligne au Cameroun." 2020. https://defyhatenow.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/09/7_dhn-Cameroon_FG_FR_FINAL_ONLINE.pdf

Ebogo, Frank. *Les Mobilisations collectives anti-Boko Haram au Cameroun. Entre calculs politiques, patriotisme exacerbé et solidarités transversales*. Paris: Publibook, 2020.

Eckhoff, Angela. "The importance of art viewing experiences in early childhood visual arts: the exploration of a master art teacher's strategies for meaningful early arts experiences." *Early Childhood Education Journal*, 35 (5), 2008: 463-472, 2008.

International Federation for Human Rights. *Cartooning for Peace "lends its pencils" to FIDH*: FIDH, 2015.

Lebon, Gustace. "The Crowd: A Study of the Popular Mind." *International Journal of Ethics* 9 (4), 1899, 521-523.

Mateos, Oscar. "Beyond greed and grievance. Towards a comprehensive approach to African armed confl icts: Sierra Leone as a case study." In *Understanding Africa's contemporary conflicts Origins, challenges and peacebuilding*. Monograph 173, 2010, 24-59.

Merriam Webster. *Cancel culture*: Merriam Webster Dictionary, 2021.

Razafindrakoto, Idah. "The governance of visual arts in Namibia. A focus on social perceptions around professional integration in the art market in Windhoek." In *History, Politics, Culture.* Windhoek: *Journal of Namibian Studies*, 2020, 25-35.

Solomos, Makis. "Notes sur la « transition » des arts. Transitions des arts, transitions esthétiques : processus de subjectivation et des-croissances." 2017. ffhal-02055255f.

William, Wendy. *Shifting borders: Africa's displacement crisis and its security implications*. Paper No. 8. Washington: Africa Center for Strategic Studies Research, 2019.

From Head to Toe
Visual Stereotyping as Practice in Pre-Modern European Works of Art

Melis Avkiran

Abstract

By taking the basic idea of democratic ideals about equal coexistence and inclusion of all society members as a theoretical starting point, I focus on those (historical) social processes that contradict this vision, such as forms of group-focused discrimination. From an art-historical perspective, it seems conclusive to proceed from the artistic representation of human beings. This article asks for the artistic methods of early stereotyping in pre-modern European visual culture, which consolidated already existing practices and transmitted them as visual knowledge to subsequent generations. Benefiting from sociological reflections on the visual methods of social discrimination, these insights are brought to bear for art-historical considerations on the representation of Black people. The approach shows a deconstructive artistic access to Black body figurations, which correspond to already prevalent stereotyping processes and include forms of homogenization and fragmentation. The text argues for an analytical differentiation into group and single figure representations. In this way, the question can be answered whether possible conventions were resorted to when artists depicted Black individuals in a collective. Further, it discusses the fragmented use of the head in the heraldic tradition, which has subsequently been adopted as stereotyped form for the conceptualization of Black figures in some narrative artistic compositions. Finally, those strategies are discussed particularly in the iconography of the prominent so-called "Leg Miracle"—legend of Sts. Cosmas and Damian described in the *Legenda aurea* by Jacobus de Voragine. The different artistic realizations of the theme not only confirm the incorporation of the practices mentioned, but furthermore demonstrate a European perception of Black bodies as a collective marker, which is still a constitutive element in racist knowledge formation today. The direct argumentative involvement of the artists shows their participation in social processes of perception and knowledge formation, instead of excluding them, especially where their artistic practice is concerned.

Melis Avkiran, "From Head to Toe: Visual Stereotyping as Practice in Pre-Modern European Works of Art," Art Style, Art & Culture International Magazine, v. 8, no. 8.1, part 2 (September 2021), 125-151.
DOI: 10.5281/zenodo.5498405

Introduction

Discrimination is contrary to the idea of equal coexistence of all members of society. Thus, it clearly attacks democratic ideals on every level of social life. Forms of group-focused discrimination such as racism are historically evolved social phenomena. Their impact and knowledge systems reach into all areas of society, including the field of visual culture. Stereotyping can be one element of their mediation. The mechanisms are characterized by their reference to the human being, their immutability and their continuity over long periods of time, despite new or even contrary experiences (Hillmann 1994, 842-843). The considerations on their essential characteristics can certainly be transferred to the visual mode (Hoffmann 2002), which will be discussed here through the example of the artistic conceptualization of Blacks in pre-modernity, which considers the role that the traditions of visual art play in the formation of social knowledge. The general question could be asked how much social impact these visual interpretations had, if the artists mainly engage them with discourses on the miraculous, alterity and foreignness.

Reflections on the Transmission of Stereotypes and Social Knowledge

When it comes to group-focused discrimination the effectiveness and persistence of stereotypes cannot be underestimated. From a sociopsychological perspective stereotypes are fundamental narratives in discriminatory social practice. Admittedly, the term 'group-focused discrimination' is not a medieval or an early modern one, it is a contemporary term. Discrimination is defined as:

> a social construction and use of distinctions between categories of people and imagined groups associated with ideas about similarity and strangeness, belonging and non-belonging, and appropriate positions in the fabric of social inequality. […] [D]iscriminatory distinctions [are] anchored in specific ways in the structures of social subsystems and inscribed in socially influential discourses and ideologies. (Scherr 2017, 39)[1]

Their modes of operation cannot be explained solely through speech or action in isolated interactions. Sociologically, discrimination cannot be traced back to individual attitudes or actions, which are not the starting point or cause, but rather are the part and result of social structures and processes (Scherr 2017, 39-40). In this sense, we cannot explain the prevalent systems that lead to discrimination through the cultural studies analysis of specific objects alone, but rather we should

understand these objects as components of social communication and resources of knowledge that help maintain, propagate, and stabilize those systems. Such a comprehensive analysis of visual culture can reveal implications and recourse to such knowledge, and initiate a critical discussion about the possible spectrum of their social impact.

Various forms of discrimination have developed over a long period of time and can be self-perpetuating (Pettigrew and Taylor 1990, 501; Scherr 2017, 41). As Scherr explains, "the consequences of past discrimination can lead to certain conditions and social orders that […], in conjunction with the transmission of ideologies, discourses, and stereotypes, enable and make likely further discrimination" (2017, 41).[2] Discrimination has a self-reinforcing effect, e.g. when its consequences are not perceived as the result of social structures and processes, so the causes are therefore not recognized (Scherr 2017, 41). If they are instead interpreted as an expression of the supposedly typical characteristics of the discriminated group, this can lead to a confirmation, consolidation and possibly reinforcement of already existing stereotypes and established patterns of action (Scherr 2017, 41).

The visual mode is also considered in discrimination research. Thus, Reisigl (2017, 95-96) cites the considerations of the socio-semiotician Theo van Leeuwen, who distinguishes different forms of discrimination in the field of contemporary visual communication. Among these, he names strategies such as homogenization, i.e. de-individualizing egalitarianism (Reisigl 2017, 95-96). Discriminatory stereotyping of certain groups through visual representations is clearly named as a practice, although art works are not explicitly mentioned here (Reisigl 2017, 96). Furthermore visual fragmentation is cited, in which people interpreted as belonging to a marked group are reduced to certain body parts (Reisigl 2017, 96).

Taking these considerations into account, I examine the practice of visual stereotyping in pre-modernity. Artistic images can serve as potential orientation aids for the perception of the surrounding world. I understand visual stereotyping in the sense of Hoffmann (2002), who, also following perceptual-psychological considerations, understands it as something unchangeable that is based on duplication and not on modification. The fact that the images themselves may not offer a key to resolution or relativization holds potential for conflict. It then arises when the visual stereotype "which is a scheme, an idea, a generality" makes the claim "that the things of the world look as they do in the picture"—a conflict that is inevitably invoked in naturalistic and illusionistic painting (Hoffmann 2002, 84).[3]

In this article I am not aiming to tell a 'history of racism' from past to present. Rather, I want to pose the question differently here, in order to clarify what points of contact exists between social processes and their cultural expression at different times in history. My considerations are therefore based on the following question: What discriminatory potential do pre-modern articulations hold if they a) show parallels to later racisms or racist content (in word and image) and b) can be used without hesitation to underpin and disseminate (modern) racist knowledge formation?

Lowe's studies, which focus primarily the Mediterranean, already demonstrated the close interconnection of stereotyping and representation that unfolded in the context of early travel accounts and the West African slave trade of the 15th and 16th centuries. Using various sources, she formulates the interrelationship of socio-historical, economic as well as cultural factors that together form a knowledge system for stereotyping to find its way into contemporary visual culture (Lowe 2010). Likewise Kümper (2011) asked what contribution the study of European pre-modernity could make to the research field of early stereotyping. Kümper shows how stereotypes about the sexuality of Black men were already prevalent in European medieval discourses. According to Kümper (2011, 949-950), numerous texts speak of a supposedly heightened, disinhibited libido of 'the' Black man and even make comparisons with wild animals, such as the ape. The historically recurring stereotype of the uncivilized savage is the worst intensification of this supposed disinhibition, even today pejorative comparisons with animals can still be detected.[4] Stereotypes, as Kümper defines them, are essentially assertions of identity that are projected onto an individual or a group (of individuals) on the basis of one or a combination of several markers, such as body color, religion or origin, from which presuppositions about the nature, way of life or action of that individual or group are derived (Kümper 2011, 944). Regardless of which markers are chosen, the perception of the individual in question takes place exclusively in relation to an (abstract) group[5] to which they attributed, intentionally or unintentionally. The element of group construction is decisive here. It makes no difference whether the individual 'feels' that they belong to the group or whether the supposed members of the constructed group really know each other and share a collective identity. Stereotypes are assigned from the outside. Based on certain markers, actions and character traits are always evaluated as an expression of a collective (as whose alleged representative they act), rather than of an individual. With reference to the chosen markers, it is already inherent in the concept of such a social practice that the individual dissolves in the collective.

Dissolving in the Collective: Visual Fragmentation & Homogenization

Representational practices in Western European countries historically prioritized non-Black subjects, which means that previous art-historical considerations regarding the depiction of Black individuals and collectives need to be reevaluated. The representation of Black bodies (as single figures as well as in depiction of groups) have to be examined separately in order to understand the possible social impact of certain artistic strategies in images made for and by people who are not Black[6]. Since our attention is on aspects of stereotyping, artistic approaches to the pictorial conceptualization of individualization and human collectiveness play a decisive role here.

Besides several biblical and holy personages, such as the prominent St. Maurice and the Queen of Sheba, have been depicted as single figures with dark *inkarnat*[7] in late medieval works of art, there are also noteworthy examples showing group representations of Black individuals. Occasionally, in images of the Queen of Sheba or the adoration of the magi from around 1400 onwards, Black figures are included in the entourage of the royal representatives. Although there are several depictions as recognizably cohesive groups or gatherings of figures, they receive less art-historical attention than those single figure depictions. While group representations are subsumed under the broad category of 'images of Blacks' they are rarely examined as motifs in their own right. Still to be addressed are questions about the artistic concepts that shaped group constellations, which present varying degrees of attention to the physical appearance of Black bodies.

One could certainly ask how collective are conceptualized artistically, and if particular conventions are used in group representations of Black individuals. Here, it might be helpful to carry out detailed studies of compositions, as well as the inner-image constellations and relationships. Unlike representations of non-Black persona, there is already an established artistic tradition in European visual culture that is most closely linked to the representation of Black people. Some artistic approaches seem to draw on this very tradition for their multi-figure compositions, incorporating and translating stereotypes into visual form.

Depictions of Black bodies entered society's perceptual spectrum with different understandings of their mapping function in pre-modern European artistic practice.[8] Sometimes the body is shown as a whole, while at other times it appears fragmented and refers, as pars pro toto, to both the body's presence and absence. In yet other representations, both approaches are used to conceptualize the figure.

Such fragmented bodies often appear in the visual traditions of European heraldry (Devisse and Mollat 2010)[9], in most cases in the form of the Black Head on the armorial bearings (Fig. 1). The heraldic motif usually shows a male head, sometimes bust length, in profile, aligned to the left. In various cases there is a white bandeau on the forehead added to the isolated head, which is interpreted as a sign of African or at least foreign origin. Especially from the late Middle Ages, several prominent families, in the north as well as in the south, are known to have used the Black head in their family coat of arms, such as the Florentine Pucci family (Fig. 2) or the Moreels from Bruges (Fig. 3) (McGrath 2002; De Vos 1994, cat. No. 22, 131). The heads have a similar appearance with only few variations. Accordingly, in its use as a symbol of identification, it works foremost through its patterns of repetition and uniformity. The constant repetition of more or less the same design, which at best reflected a Western-European idea of a person of color, may have shaped audience reception in such a way that those images became automatically associated with Black people in the minds of white European viewers. There seems to be at least some evidence for this when we examine representations of Black people in the period that followed. After all, it must be remembered that behind the artistic practice there also stands a socialized individual who is shaped by his environment and its culture of knowledge, and, in the task of pictorially representing a person of color, resorts to precisely those patterns.

Figure 1. a-c: Armorial bearings of a) Coenrat van Elvervelde (Berg), b) H'Henric van Bruecdorp (Holstein), c) H'Henric van Eswielre (Jülich), from the Bellenville Armorial, MS fr. 5230, fols. 69r, 72r, 69v (details), Paris, BnF. Image available from the Bibliothèque nationale de France (BnF). See also: Bindman/ Gates 2010, 33, fig. 1.

Figure 2. Coat of arms of the Pucci family upon Palazzo Pucci in Florence, Italy.
Photo by Giovanni Dall'Orto. January 27, 2008. Licensed under CC0 1.0.

Figure 3. Hans Memling, coat of arms of the Moreel family, portrait backsides, c. 1472-75.
Image in the public domain.

The established pictorial means used in heraldry to depict Black figures seemed to offer suitable models for artists, for we see essential elements that are adopted in the narrative scenes of various works. In the 14th century artists began to illustrate stories based on the crusades and, as Devisse/Mollat put it, "[…] the law of the genre, of course, dictated that adversary should be treated with obloquy. Heraldry was the first means used to accomplish this end" (2010, 92).[10] Executed in 1337, on fol. 19r of the *Roman de Godefroi de Bouillon* we see such an artistic adaption that clearly incorporates elements derived from heraldry (Fig. 4) (Devisse and Mollat 2010, 92). The miniature shows crusaders fighting against Saracens with a brownish *inkarnat*. The white bandeau, which we know from the heraldic motif, is here used as an attribute for the viewer to identify the opponents as Saracenes and does not appear in their heraldic emblems. The one ahead of the group carries a shield with three Black heads in profile, which is repeated numerous times on his horse's caparison.

Figure 4. *Roman de Godefroi de Bouillon*, MS fr. 22495, fol. 19r (detail), 1337, Paris, BnF. Image available from the Bibliothèque nationale de France (BnF).

While this miniature obviously represents heraldic objects due to the military context of the scene, an example of a manuscript dated in the second half of the 15th century shows how the well-established iconography originating from heraldic aesthetics is applied to the figuration of then 'acting' Black characters in narrative scenes more broadly. Fol. 31r of the *Roman de Troie*—so far, a truly unique and unusual realization of the theme—shows the departure of the famous Argonauts (Fig. 5). The figures preparing and loading the Argo for the upcoming mission resemble the heraldic motif so closely that it seems as if bodies have simply been attached to the recognizable schematic heads. Although the figures differ from another in the color of their garments, they hardly show any forms of variability in their figurative physique. This becomes all the more evident when we compare them with the non-Black figures in the foreground, who are also indicated as laborers, or with the non-Black figures of Jason and Hercules on the left, shown playing chess while waiting for the vessel to be ready to sail. Now, of course, one could argue that in many examples of medieval illuminations, it is not unusual for staffage figures, often appearing in groups, to have few individualized traits. But the question must be asked whether this does not have a completely different social impact in terms of stereotyping the supposedly other and foreign.

Figure 5. *Roman de Troie*, MS Douce 353, fol. 31r (detail), France, c. 1470, Oxford, Bodleian Library. Photo: © Bodleian Libraries, University of Oxford. Licensed under CC-BY-NC 4.0.

The pictorial vocabulary that is chosen here is part of a repertoire that can be observed many times, from which European artists seem to have made selective use of for the representation of Black figures, particularly evident in facial features. This is also true regarding the single figure of the king, for which artists choose very different approaches. The detailed, naturalistic realization of Hans Memling in the so-called Prado triptych is unquestionably opposed to the king on the Polling panel, which is dated about twenty-six years earlier.[11] The schematized physical features such as a broad nose, thick lips, visibly white teeth and eyes, and short frizzy hair clearly point in the direction of an established stereotyping practice in the visual sphere (Mellinkoff 1993, 127). Sometimes such tendencies can also be discerned when the artist has visibly sought to render highly sophisticated and nuanced scenes. It is precisely here that the focus on pictorial group constellations can help to bring to light comparative insights. A good example is a Gospel book housed in the Austrian National Library, probably dating from the second half of the 14th century.[12] The scribe named is John Oppava (Johann von Troppau), at that time parish priest in Landskron (Villach, Austria). It was commissioned by Duke Albrecht III. of Austria and was later in the possession of Emperor Frederick III.[13] The elaborately designed manuscript contains 189 leaves and features numerous miniatures, ornamental details and several full-page images, some of which are dedicated to the lives and legends of the evangelists.[14] In considering how certain artistic approaches convey notions of a Black body, this miniature cycle allows us to study a specific work that presents multi-figure constellations of pale and dark *inkarnat* in direct comparison to each other. Fol. 1v shows St. Matthew's miracles in Ethiopia (Fig. 6).

Figure 6. John of Oppava (Johann von Troppau), *Evangelistary*,
Cod. 1182 HAN MAG, fol. 1v, 1368, Vienna, Austrian National Library.
Image available from the Austrian National Library (ÖNB).

The folio presents an almost full-page framed image field, with detailed chronological scenes divided into twelve sequences. As Devisse/Mollat state, the artist "strove to re-create the setting of Matthew's mission as concretely as possible" (2010, 50). The depicted scenes are set in Ethiopia, where, according to legend, Matthew was missionary.[15] In the city of Nadaber, Matthew confronts two powerful sorcerers named Zaroes and Arphaxat, who were accompanied by two dangerous dragons. He exposed their tricks and the dragons submitted to him in the name of Christ. After this success Matthew begins his preaching, and miraculously resurrects king Eggipus's son, inspiring the king, his family and their

people convert to Christianity and get baptized by the apostle. As Matthew continues his preaching, the king dies and Hirtacus succeeds him. Hirtacus falls in love with Egippus' daughter Ephigenia, who escapes by taking the veil. Enraged by this, the new king holds the apostle responsible and has him sentenced to death. The middle scene of the last row shows Matthew being stabbed in the back by one of the king's henchmen. Even after the apostle's death, Ephigenia refused Hirtacus, who, again enraged, set her house on fire to kill her and her virgins. But Matthew appeared and directed the flames to the royal palace instead, where Hirtacus and his only son just barely escaped the fire. The son is then immediately seized by the devil and confesses his father's deeds at the apostle's tomb.

The story ends tragically, as we see in the last scene at the bottom right the repentant son lying in front of the tomb and on the right his father, who stabs himself with his own sword. The issue here is not whether the figures with dark *inkarnat* are portrayed negatively. Quite the contrary, as Devisse/Mollat have already noted. The Ethiopians depicted here are characterized as human and sympathetic figures, despite some of their transgressions, as in the case of Hirtacus (Devisse and Mollat 2010, 50). The image's statement here certainly concerns the character traits attributed to this group. In this respect, it hardly distinguishes them from other people who engage in morally dubious acts. The visibly, most obvious distinction in the pictorial representation between this scene and comparable compositions with saints and groups without dark *inkarnat* is that here they are missionized by a figure, who does not share the same complexion as they do. Interestingly the sorcerers are presented as figures with pale *inkarnat* like the apostles. We therefore see no primary interest in depicting dark *inkarnat* as an aesthetic indicator of immorality. As far as the body figurations are concerned, it is apparent that the artist shows a high degree of compositional detail and a variety of facial expressions and gesture to express a wide range of emotions, but it is also noticeable that he uses the same head pattern for the features of the Ethiopians, both for the male and female figures (Fig. 7).

This seems to be in direct contrast to the figures with pale *inkarnat*, who demonstrate a clear variability in their appearance, such as in facial features, age characteristics, and hairstyles and hair colors. Only tentatively and at certain points in the cycle does he seem to deviate from this approach for mediating (or symbolic) reasons, such as in the scene of the penultimate row in which Matthew explains to the Ethiopians that their worship should not be to him and that they should spend their precious gifts on building a magnificent church in praise the Lord Jesus Christ (Fig. 8).[16]

Figure 7. John of Oppava (Johann von Troppau),
Evangelistary, fol. 1v (detail), 1368, Vienna, Austrian National Library.
Image available from the Austrian National Library (ÖNB).

Figure 8. John of Oppava (Johann von Troppau), *Evangelistary*,
fol. 1v (detail), 1368, Vienna, Austrian National Library.
Image available from the Austrian National Library (ÖNB).

The figure, which interacts directly with the apostle, seems to mirror the latter and echo certain characteristics. The striking external similarity in this context could also be understood here as an inner, religious rapprochement, which is sealed in the following scene by the baptism of the king. While the figures with pale *inkarnat* show much more variability in their physical presence, the Black figures in most cases seem to follow an established pattern of schematized basic features, although the artist would demonstrably have had other means at his disposal. Cases of duplicating an ever-same physiognomy in favor of reinforcing the perception of individuals as a homogeneous group can be discovered in very different pictorial contexts, as examples from France, Italy or Portugal show (Fig. 9, 10, 11). In considering how social stereotyping functions visually, the question arises as to whether such a practice may have contributed the limited European social perception of diverse Black bodies and to the understanding of Black individuals solely in collective terms.

Figure 9. *Les Secrets de l'histoire naturelle contenant les merveilles et choses mémorables du monde*, MS fr. 22971, fol 2r (detail), France, c. 1480, Paris, Bibliothèque nationale.
Image available from the Bibliothèque nationale de France (BnF).

Figure 10. Triumph of Julius Caesar, *Romuleon*, MS 667, fol. 170r (detail), Italy, late 15th c., Paris, Bibliothèque de l'Arsenal. Image available from the Bibliothèque nationale de France (BnF).

Figure 11. Detail of the *Marriage of St. Ursula to Prince Conan*, panel of the Santa Auta Altarpiece, Monastery of Madre de Deus in Lisbon, c. 1520, Lisbon, Museu Nacional de Arte Antiga. Photo by Sailko. Licensed under CC BY 3.0.

Figures 12–13. Master of the Rinuccini Chapel, Miracle of the Leg and Matyrdom (details), predella of the altarpiece of Sts. Cosmas and Damian, left and right panel, Raleigh, Samuel H. Kress Collection, North Carolina Museum of Art. Image in the public domain, available from the Samuel H. Kress Foundation.

Between 'Some-body' and 'No-body': The Case of the "Miracle of the Leg"

The visual fragmentation and de-individualizing tendencies of depictions of Black figures are also notably evident in the so-called "Miracle of the Leg"—legend of Sts. Cosmas and Damian. The two patrons of medicine (Artelt 1974) are particularly known for 'transplanting' a Black leg (Zimmerman 2013), which has been often discussed in the context of early medical history as a representation of a 'surgical' procedure (Lippi 2009).

According to the story in Jacobus de Voragine's *Legenda aurea*, a man was once serving in a church dedicated to the two saints in Rome when his leg was consumed by cancer. At night, as he slept, the saints appeared and discussed where they could find a leg to replace it. It occurred to them that an Ethiopian was buried on the same day in the cemetery of St. Peter in Chains, and they decided to exchange the diseased leg with the one from the dead Ethiopian. This they did and the man woke up with a healthy leg.[17] Voragine was the first to mention that the substitute derives from a Black person (De Long 2013, 39). Interestingly and in contrast to the Latin text, the older Greek legend does not mention an Ethiopian, but rather indicates that "both the recipient and the donor of the leg belonged to the same ethnic group" (Fracchia 2013, 87).[18]

One could argue that fragmentation of bodies, regardless of their complexion, was not that unusual, especially if we think of medieval relic cult.[19] But the integration of a Black individual into this legend and its iconography provides a significant social dimension to the artistic treatment as well as to its reception. The close visual relationship to the heraldic motif is particularly evident in one of the earliest depictions of this legend on the predella of an altarpiece by the Tuscan Master of the Rinuccini Chapel (c. 1370, Fig. 12, 13) (Devisse and Mollat 2010, 101). The fragmentary reference to the Black body image is articulated twice: First, in the scene if the leg-miracle, and second, in another scene showing the beheading of the saints in the presence of the emperor and his men, who bear the head emblem on their shields (Devisse and Mollat 2010, 101). Here, a pejorative notion emerges in the "degrading use" (Devisse and Mollat 2010, 101) of the heraldic head. The deconstructive character in the intentional utilization of Black figure bodies suggests a direct connection between the heraldic tradition and the iconography of the leg-miracle. Thus Devisse/Mollat note: "There is also the possibility that heraldic art […] may have inspired the painters to propose new forms, of which the Black leg would be an example" (2010, 101). I would like to emphasize that depending on how the Black body is referred to in the composition, the social assertion can be reinforced.

Figure 14. The Miracle of the Leg by Sts. Cosmas and Damian, *Legenda Aurea*, fol 132r (detail), copy of French origin, 13th c., HM 3027, San Marino, CA, Huntington Library. This image is available from the Huntington Library/ Digital Library.

The iconography of this miracle shows different artistic approaches to the visibility of the Black body. Voragine's text offered painters an attractive source, because the concept of contrast was easy and perceptible to implement visually (Devisse and Mollat 2010, 229).[20] The difficulty the painters faced was rather to integrate the transplanted Black leg as such into the composition in a way that was comprehensible to the audience, without looking like a stocking (Devisse and Mollat 2010, 229). For it is only with the Black leg—and this lies at the heart of the Latin version—that the miracle becomes a miracle and achieves the desired effect. Mostly we see compositions that integrate the figure of the Ethiopian donor and/ or showing the procedure in process, while sometimes displaying the removed diseased leg (Devisse and Mollat 2010, 229). Several possible solutions seemed to emerge, in which either an absence or presence of the Black corpse was chosen. In the earliest known realization of the story, a miniature from the *Legenda Aurea* from the end of the 13th century, we see the latter. The two saints are shown at the patient's bedside attaching the Black leg onto the awake man, but with an absent corpse and thus any visible explanation of the new leg's origin (Fig. 14) (Zimmerman 2013, 18, Fig. 01). Others expanded it to include a scene showing the saints at the cemetery exhuming the dead man, as can be seen on the inner side door of a late 14th century Cosmas-and-Damian-reliquary in the Jesuit church of St. Michael in Munich.

Figure 15. Isidro Villoldo, Miracle of the Leg, Monastery of San Francisco in Valladolid, Spain, 16th c., Valladolid, Museo Nacional del Esculturas. Photo by Luis Fernández García. 3 July 2014. Licensed under CC BY-SA 4.0.

The socio-political undertone of the motif is elaborated particularly in the context of late 15th/ 16th century Spain and unmistakably brought to the forefront of the scene, when merging the former two separated settings (bedroom and graveyard) into one (Fracchia 2019, 143-153). The presence of the Black corpse in the same pictorial space as the procedure provides completely new semantic content. Especially when it is not instantly obvious from the pictorial context whether the Black figure is still alive.[21] In this respect, a version of this motif that expresses a "gratuitous cruelty" as shown in the studies of Carmen Fracchia, is very clear (2019, 143-153; 2013, 79-91; 2007, 181-184). Illustrations show a significant shift "in which the 'Ethiopian's' corpse becomes the enslaved Afro-Hispanic man who suffers *in vivo* amputation" (Fracchia 2019, 143). Two works by Isidro Villoldo show a mutilated African man lying at the bed end. While a relief in Ávila (1538-43) shows the man in chains, at a polychrome bas-relief in Valladolid (c. 1539) we see a man obviously in great pain, reaching for his stump (Fig. 15). The violent interpretations of the legend are linked to the earliest known image of the 'in vivo-type' on a wooden polychrome relief by Felipe Vigarny in the Cathedral of Palencia (Fracchia 2019, 145). Fracchia places the compositions in close relation to the reality of slavery in early modern Spain and shows how the artistic realization resembles actual political practices. The motif "refers to the methods of control of the social behavior of the slave population deployed by 'local police forces,' known in Spain as the Holy Brotherhood (*Santa Hermandad*)" (Fracchia 2019, 148).

Figure 16. *Miracle of the Leg*, early 16th c., Stuttgart, Landesmuseum Württemberg. Photo by ©Landesmuseum Württemberg, Stuttgart / P. Frankenstein; H. Zwietasch. Licensed under CC BY-SA.

The practice of amputations and mutilations as punishments (e.g., for escape attempts) seems to be literally embodied in the violated Black figure of the Christian subjet. Such violent and dramatic interpretations of the legend are not known outside of Spain and are unique, due to its local and historical specificities. Nevertheless, it was probably also true for other regions where the iconography referring to Voragine's version prevailed, that a certain degree of socio-political significance about the relationship of one's own, mainly white society towards members or other people of color was effective. In their function as mediators of knowledge, images continue to communicate and generate a certain spectrum of social knowledge that can be consciously or unconsciously accessed as pictorial evidence. Therefore, it would be rash to completely disregard the social and political implications that the images certainly contain, despite the different historical and geographical circumstances.[22] In this respect, not only the presence of the (involuntary) Black donor/body that can open a de facto socio-political level of interpretation, but also the absence of the Black' donor'-body.

The detail of the Black leg, which we find introduced in Voragine's version, does not happen without reason: It is only through this that the miraculous potential of the legend is further increased, which is reinforced by the means of contrast (white leg – black leg) (Fichtner 1968, 96; Devisse and Mollat 2010, 229-230; Greve 2013, 166-167). Something seemingly impossible becomes possible through the healing powers of the two saints, which only succeeds with God's help. Already the literary introduction of the Black figure does not reveal any information about a specific individual. Thus, it is explained that it is an Ethiopian, who in the further course of the legend is referred to as "Mauri".[23] For the intention of the text, the reference to any Black body is sufficient, thus making the physical appearance a group marker. It is the lack of any literary information or explanation of the Black individual in the legend that generates an anonymity of the Black body.

The 'no-body-type' draws the focus to the procedure. For a better comprehension of the legend's content, artists use the means of present the already removed cancerous leg, as illustrated by the early French miniature (Fig. 14) and other later works (Fig. 16, 17). It points just as much to the fact that the removed leg has not (yet?) been attached to the corpse.

Figure 17. *Miracle of the Leg*, panel from the *Retable de St. Jean l'évangéliste*, L'église Sainte-Marie, Palau del Vidre, France, 15th c. Image by Kees W. Zimmerman. Source: One Leg in the Grave Revisited. The miracle of the transplantation of the black leg by saints Cosmas and Damian, edited by Kees W. Zimmerman 2013. With kind permission of Kees W. Zimmerman.

Whereas in some Spanish images Fracchia sees in the absence "a reminder of the law promulgated by the Catholic Monarchs during the last decade of the fifteenth century ordering the expulsion of the Moors from the crowns of Castile and Leon" (Fracchia 2013, 80) we cannot name a similarly concrete political context for the 'no-body-type' versions outside Spain. But what else can it mean for the reception on the social level if the scene is reduced to the procedure alone and the Black body from which the leg came is not thematized? It cannot be entirely dismissed that there is a certain conspicuousness involved when the image does not communicate what is happening to the 'donor-body.' Something worth thinking about, because the literary sources themselves certainly provide an explanation for the not unimportant detail of attaching the removed leg from the patient to the corpse: that the body will be intact on the day of the resurrection (Fracchia 2019, 143; Fracchia 2013, 89). So what is being referred to here is an exchange to ensure the integrity of both bodies (despite the possibly questionable access to the body of the unknown deceased, which resonates subliminally). The removal

and division of bodies, especially holy or royal ones, was a common medieval practice. But because the body was "integral to person," it was accompanied by "ambivalence, controversy and profound inconsistency" (Bynum 1995, 204-205). According to Bynum (1995, 205) it could be both acceptable and offensive. In this sense, Bynum also understands the miracle, in which she sees the "triumph over partition […] as an expression of sanctity" (1995, 208). While compositions including the corpse address this part of the legend, the question of the integrity of the body in the 'no-body-types' remains completely open and thus possibly disappears from the reception horizon of the viewers. While scholars occasionally referred to the Black as a "pagan," Helas (2010, 313) pointed out that it must be a Christian, as he was buried in the church cemetery.[24] If we think about questions of coexistence of all society members, this is an important note to consider in the 'no-body-type,' because if attention is drawn away from the Black corpse to the body part as a fragment, the image solely addresses its function as a substitute object and the figure literally becomes by its bodily absence a 'no-body' within the Christian iconography. Here, anonymity and objectification converge.

Conclusion

The stereotypical modes of representation that early artistic practices employed show that dark body color as a collective marker had social and political implications. Essential elements of such representations were handed down in the art of heraldry, which were apparently adopted as the basis for narrative scenes. The aforementioned considerations are expressed above all in the example of the prominent miracle of the leg-legend by Jacobus de Voragine. Its iconography demonstrates that these implications, which are already inherent in the Latin source, can be artistically elaborated in various degrees using a deconstructive access to Black body figurations, which, as has been shown, finds its most drastic version in the adaption of some Spanish compositions. The tendencies of objectification and simplification as well as the intentional use of Black figures as contrast foils for white ones, form a vocabulary that artists could incorporate and refine in the conceptualization of their figures with dark *inkarnat*. In such a manner, as practiced by some pre-modern artists, qualities of stereotyping are formulated for social perception, and are conveyed and made adaptable for subsequent generations. Established visually in this way, stereotyping of this kind can enter discriminatory discourse practices as supposed knowledge.

Author Biography

Melis Avkiran is a PhD candidate and lecturer at the art history department of the Ruhr-University Bochum (Germany). She is a doctorial scholarship holder of the Hans Böckler Foundation and the FAZIT-Foundation. Her dissertation project focuses on the representation of Black people in the oeuvre of the Bruges painter Hans Memling. After her master's degree in 2016, she worked as a research assistant in the DFG-project (German Research Foundation) *Pictorial Myth Reception in the Middle Ages and Modern Art Historiography's Discourse of Periodization* under the direction of Prof. Ulrich Rehm (Ruhr-University Bochum). Here she carried out a sub-project on the reception of antiquity and the close intersections between early German ethnology and art history. She examined Erwin Panofsky's so-called *principle of disjunction* in the context of models of time and culture in the early 20th century, which were published in two parts in the *Zeitschrift für Ästhetik und allgemeine Kunstwissenschaft.*
Email: melis.avkiran@rub.de

Notes

1. Scherr 2017, 39. My translation.

2. Scherr 2017, 41. My translation.

3. Hoffmann 2002, 84. My translation.

4. E. g. if we think of racism in context of European football games, at which fans in the stadium stands imitating insulting monkey sounds to attack Black players of the opposing team.

5. Georg Simmel uses the term „abstrakte Gruppen", cf. Simmel 1968, 335; see also Scherr 2017, 40, footnote 2.

6. On this subject see also Greve 2013.

7. In German art-historical literature the term "Inkarnat" refers to painted flesh color. In this use I endorse the remarks of Daniela Bohde and Mechthild Fend (2007). Accordingly, *inkarnat* means the medial representation of skin and refers to a critical distinction between the object and its pictorial representation. Thus, in the examination of the work, the subjective concept of the artist is explicitly included in the process of applying the paint.

8. On "body-mapping" see Biddick 1993; Diprose and Ferrell 1991; Sarasin 1999.

9. Cf. Chapter "The Shield and the Crown", 31-82.

10. Cf. Chapter "The Appeal to the Ethiopian", 92.

11. In his great study Paul H. D. Kaplan also notes that the figure is more like a "caricature" than a naturalistic representation of an African, cf. Kaplan 1985, 99.

12. ÖNB Cod. 1182 HAN MAG.

13. Johann, Albrecht III, and Friedrich III. Evangeliarium: so-called "Troppauer-Evangeliar", 1368. Accessed 30.06.2021: http://data.onb.ac.at/rec/AC13953158.

14. Interestingly the adoration of the magi scene on fol. 3v does not show a Black magus. This indicates a status of its iconography, in which the introduction of a king figure with dark *inkarnat* had not yet begun or been established. This will happen in the course of the 15th century. On this subject see also Avkiran 2018.

15. Cf. Art. 140. Saint Matthew, Apostle in: The Golden Legend. Readings on the Saints, transl. by William G. Ryan (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2012), 569-574, here 569-572.

16. Cf. Art. 140. Saint Matthew, Apostle in: The Golden Legend. Readings on the Saints, transl. by William G. Ryan (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2012), 570-571.

17. Cf. Art. 143. Saints Cosmas and Damian in: The Golden Legend. Readings on the Saints, transl. by William G. Ryan (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2012), 582-584, here 584.

18. See also Jović and Theologou 2015, 335; Artelt 1974, col. 350.

19. See Bynum 1995, in particular chapter 5, 200-225.

20. Cf. Chapter "The African Transposed", 229.

21. See Fig. 21 and 24 in Zimmerman 2013, 70, 73.

22. The question of how this scene should actually be understood in a social context is not entirely new and was already posed tentatively by Devisse and Mollat (2010, 101). It shows the strong socio-political undertone of the legend that always resonates.

23. Cf. Legenda aurea ed. Graesse 1846, 639.

24. Bynum also noted: "By the twelfth century, it is clear that burial outside consecrated ground usually marked one as a sinner or a nonperson." (1995, 204).

Bibliography

Primary sources

Legenda aurea, edited by Theodor Graesse. Ed. 3. Vratislaviae: Koebner 1890.
The Golden Legend. Readings on the Saints. Translated by William G. Ryan. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2012.

Secondary sources

Artelt, Wolfgang. "Kosmas und Damian." In *LCI VII*, col. 344-352. Freiburg im Breisgau et al: Herder, 1974.

Avkiran, Melis. "Das rassifizierte Fremde im Bild. Zur Genese differenzbildender Konzepte in der Kunst des 15. Jahrhunderts am Beispiel des Malers Hans Memling, Ikonische Grenzverläufe. Szenarien des Eigenen, Anderen und Fremden im Bild," edited by Martina Sauer. *IMAGE, Zeitschrift für interdisziplinäre Bildwissenschaft*, issue 28 (July 2018): 40-74. https://doi.org/10.11588/artdok.00006024.

Biddick, Kathleen. "Genders, Bodies, Borders: Technologies of the Visible." *Speculum* 68, no. 2 (April 1993): 389-418. https://doi.org/10.2307/2864558.

Bohde, Daniela and Mechthild Fend, eds. *Weder Haut noch Fleisch. Das Inkarnat in der Kunstgeschichte*. Berlin: Gebr. Mann Verlag, 2007.

Bynum, Caroline Walker. *The Resurrection of the body in Western Christianity*, 200-1336. New York: Columbia University Press, 1995.

De Long, Jan L. "Transplantation and Salvation." In *One leg in the grave revisited: The miracle of the transplantation of the black leg by the saints Cosmas and Damian*, edited by Kees W. Zimmerman, 37-49. Groningen: Barkhuis, 2013.

Diprose, Rosalyn and Robyn Ferrell, eds. *Cartographies. Poststructuralism and the mapping of bodies and spaces*. Sidney: Allen and Unwin, 1991.

Devisse, Jean and Michel Mollat. "The Shield and the Crown," "The Appeal to the Ethiopian" and "The African transposed." In *The Image of the Black in Western Art: From the Early Christian Era to the 'Age of Discovery': Africans in the Christian Ordinance of the World*, edited by David Bindman and Henry Louis Gates, Jr., 2.2, Cambridge, Mass. London: Harvard University Press, 2010.

Fichtner, Gerhard. "Das verpflanzte Mohrenbein – Zur Interpretation der Kosmas-und-Damian-Legende." In *Medizinhistorisches Journal* 3, issue 2 (1968): 87-100. https://www.jstor.org/stable/25803207.

Fracchia, Carmen. "Constructing the Black Slave in Early Modern Spanish Painting." In *Others and Outcasts in Early Modern Europe. Picturing the Social Margins*, edited by Tom Nichols, 179-195. Burlington: Ashgate, 2007.

——. "Spanish depictions of the Miracle of the Black Leg." In *One leg in the grave revisited: The miracle of the transplantation of the black leg by the saints Cosmas and Damian*, edited by Kees W. Zimmerman, 79-91. Groningen: Barkhuis, 2013.

——. *'Black but Human': Slavery and Visual Arts in Hapsburg Spain, 1480-1700*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019.

Greve, Anna. *Farbe – Macht – Körper. Kritische Weißseinsforschung in der europäischen Kunstgeschichte*. Karlsruhe: KIT, 2013.

Helas, Philine. "Schwarz unter Weißen. Zur Repräsentation von Afrikanern in der italienischen Kunst des 15. Jahrhunderts." In *Fremde in der Stadt. Ordnungen, Repräsentationen und Praktiken, 13.-15. Jahrhundert*, edited by Peter Bell, Dirk Suckow and Gerhard Wolf, 301-331. Frankfurt am Main: Lang, 2010.

Hillmann, Karl-Heinz. *Wörterbuch der Soziologie*. 4th rev. ed. Stuttgart: Kröner, 1994.

Hoffmann, Detlef. "Visuelle Stereotypen." In *Stereotyp, Identität und Geschichte. Die Funktion von Stereotypen in gesellschaftlichen Diskursen*. Edited by Hans H. Hahn. *Mitteleuropa-Osteuropa – Oldenburger Beiträge zur Kultur und Geschichte Ostmitteleuropas*. Vol. 5, 73-85. Frankfurt am Main: Lang, 2002.

Kaplan, Paul H. D. *The Rise of the Black Magus*. Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 1985.

Jović, Nebojša J. and Marios Theologou. "The Miracle of the Black Leg: Eastern Neglect of Western Addition to the Hagiography of Saints Cosmas and Damian." In *Acta Med Hist Adriat* 13, no. 2 (January 2015): 329-344.

Kümper, Hiram. "Schwarze Sexualität. Fragmente zur Archäologie eines modernen Mythos." In *Farbe im Mittelalter*, edited by Ingrid Bennewitz and Andrea Schindler, 941-955. Berlin: Akademie Verlag, 2011.

Lippi, Donatella. "The Transplant of the white man's leg: a novel representation of Cosma and Damian's miracle." In *International Journal of Immunopathology and Pharmacology* 22, no. 2 (2009): 517-520. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F039463200902200228.

Lowe, Kate. "The stereotyping of black Africans in Renaissance Europe." In *Black Africans in Renaissance Europe*, edited by T. F. Earle and K. J. P. Lowe. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010.

McGrath, Elizabeth. "Ludovico il Moro and His Moors." In *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 65 (2002): 67-94. https://doi.org/10.2307/4135105.

Mellinkoff, Ruth. *Outcasts. Signs of Otherness in Northern European Art and the Late Middle Ages*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993.

Pettigrew Thomas and Marylee Taylor. "Discrimination." In *Encyclopedia of sociology*. New York: Macmillan, 1990, 498-503.

Sarasin, Philipp. "Mapping the body. Körpergeschichte zwischen Konstruktivismus, Politik und Erfahrung." In *Historische Anthropologie*, issue 3 (1999): 437-451.

Scherr, Albert. "Soziologische Diskriminierungsforschung." In *Handbuch Diskriminierung*, edited by Albert Scherr et al. Wiesbaden: Springer VS, 2017, 39-58.

Simmel, Georg. *Soziologie. Untersuchungen über die Formen der Vergesellschaftung*. 1908. Reprint, Berlin: Duncker & Humblot, 1968.

Reisigl, Martin. "Sprachwissenschaftliche Diskriminierungsforschung." In *Handbuch Diskriminierung*, edited by Albert Scherr et al. Wiesbaden: Springer VS, 2017, 81-100.

Zimmerman, Kees W, eds. *One leg in the grave revisited: The miracle of the transplantation of the black leg by the saints Cosmas and Damian*, Groningen: Barkhuis, 2013.

Responsibility
The Charge of Meaning in Art and Language

On the consequences of the cultural anthropological approaches of Cassirer, Warburg and Böhme

Martina Sauer

Abstract

This article starts from the assumption that there is a connection between art and language and responsibility. What is it based on? It follows on from the research of the Hamburg Circle in the 1920s by Ernst Cassirer and Aby M. Warburg, and was strengthened in the 2000s by Hartmut Böhme. Their joint starting point is the emotional life of human beings. Thus, they assume that already the perception is shaped by it and can be increased in rituals. Comparably hardly noticed by us, it continues to have an effect in art and language and thus influences the recipient. From this derives the demand that both the one who speaks and the one who is creatively active bears responsibility for his or her doing. With the knowledge of the effect of art and language, however, the recipient is also required to take responsibility for his actions influenced by it. The article aims to show this connection, which is deeply rooted in the nature of human beings.

The article was originally published in German. It has now been translated by the author with the kind permission of the Evangelical Church in Germany. Additions were made only in the notes and in the bibliography. The concept for the text goes back to a conference of the Evangelical Academy of the Martin Luther City of Wittenberg (Saxony). On this basis, the author was invited to contribute to the publication of the Evangelical Church in Germany (EKD) *Mitteilungen—Zur Erneuerung evangelischer Predigtkultur* (Kirche im Aufbruch 5), edited by Kathrin Oxen and Dietrich Sagert. Leipzig: Evangelische Verlagsanstalt, 2013. The selection of the text for this issue of *Art Style Magazine* was based on one of the fundamental ideals of Metropolis, which sees itself as democratic and based on the responsibility of each member in dealing with art and language.

Martina Sauer, "Responsibility: The Charge of Meaning in Art and Language,"
Art Style, Art & Culture International Magazine, v. 8, no. 8.1, part 2 (September 2021), 153-167.
DOI: 10.5281/zenodo.5498411

Starting Point

They are "gestures of attention" with which things are charged with meaning. It is precisely this perspective that Hartmut Böhme brings to the cultural studies discussion with his view of fetishes and thus proposes a different theory of modernity. Böhme presents this approach in his 2006 book *Fetishism and Culture* (cf. Sauer´s 2007 review, see also Böhme 1997). In considering this approach, it is important to emphasise that the charging with meanings occurs in a moment of devotion and is embedded in a ritual. This understanding of fetishes gains importance when it becomes clear what a central role they play for the self-image and the cultural and social integration of the individual. Taking Böhme's approach as a starting point, this paper—inspired by the cultural anthropologists Aby M. Warburg and Ernst Cassirer—undertakes a change of perspective that focuses not only on the person caught in ritual but also on the "active" producer of fetishes in art and language, and, from there raises the question of the individual's responsibility for his or her actions.[1]

Starting Thesis

The background for this expansion of focus is thus, in addition to Böhme's approach, the contribution of the cultural scientist Aby M. Warburg (1893, 1923), who, as Böhme emphasizes, is very important for the foundation of his thoughts, as well as the approach of the philosopher Ernst Cassirer (1923, 1924–25, 1929, 1944), who in turn was very close to Warburg.[2] Inspired by Warburg and Cassirer, the extended assumption pursued here is accordingly: just as we perceive and understand things as meaningful or are grasped by their meaning, we are also constantly producing that meaning. Seen in this light, we are responsible for what we produce, since it has an effect or influence on the recipient's feeling and thus on his or her action.

Premises

According to Böhme, our longings, desires, wishes and fears are the reason why we charge things with meaning so that they can function as fetishes. Behind the desire to form fetishes and charge things with foreign meanings is, according to Böhme, the fear of death. Unlike humans, only one thing can live "forever," although both are material in nature. Thus, according to Böhme, "it is the fear that we will die and that things will never lose their materiality just as we lose our life (...) that drives us to transform the universe of things into thoughts."[3] The animation of things, then, is about overcoming death in order to live on in things. In this way, basic values open up to the individual, the satisfaction of which can

be seen as independent of culture. The things to which the individual turns prove to be more or less arbitrary in the light of modern development (Böhme 2006, 287). Warburg refers here to comparable processes, which he makes the starting point of his cultural theory. Based on observations made during a trip to America in 1895–96, in an essay from 1923 (on the snake ritual of the Hopi Indians) Warburg speaks of the fact that in the magical animation, as performed by the Pueblo Indians in the mask dance, not only is a primal fear is overcome, but at the same time an explanation of the world takes place. To this, he said literally:

> The Indian opposes the incomprehensibility of the processes in nature with his will to comprehend by transforming himself personally into such a cause of things. In a libidinous way he puts the cause of the inexplicable consequence in the greatest possible comprehensibility and vividness. The mask dance is danced causality. (Warburg [1923] 1992, 45–5, transl. by the author)[4]

This form of mastering ("causation") need not take place in rituals, as Warburg makes clear; it can also purely mental: "The will to devotional surrender is a refined form of masking." For Warburg, in this respect, a development can be suggested "from symbolism that is real in the flesh and adopted in the flesh to symbolism that is merely imagined" (Warburg [1923] 1992, 54–5, transl. by the author).[5] Warburg's theory of culture is thus based on the assumption, as Böhme aptly states in a 1997 essay, that it is "symbolic and ritual processes that first create a space of distancing from a universal primal fear" (Böhme 1997, 5, transl. by the author). The process of charging things, but not only them, with meaning goes back, as Cassirer points out, to processes deeply rooted in the human psyche. They rest on a "strong and libidinous underlayer (Cassirer [1929] 1964, 79)" or on a "soul-spiritual basis (ibid., 94)". All perception is characterised by this. Cassirer calls this form of perception, which he assumes to be original, as *Ausdrucks-Wahrnehmung* (perception of expression). Before any linguistic or conceptual version, experience is present as an *Ausdruckserlebnis* (expressive experience). The phenomenology of pure expressive phenomena is characterised by the fact that:

> concrete perception (...) is never absorbed in a complex of sensual qualities—such as light or dark, cold or warm—(...) it is never exclusively directed towards the "what" of the object, but grasps the nature of its overall appearance—the character of the alluring or the threatening, the familiar or the uncanny, the soothing or terrifying, which lies in this appearance, purely as such and independent of its present interpretation. (ibid., 78, transl. by the author)[6]

According to Cassirer, a renouncement of this original way of accessing the world is not possible: "(...) no abstraction, however far it is pushed, is capable of eliminating and erasing this layer as such (...) (ibid., 85, transl. by the author)." In this way, the expressive character as it lives in the perception of expression has always been an essential component of perception and not a subsequent "subjective adjunct" to what is "objectively" given in sensation.

Function

The charging with meaning belonging to man, which is recognizable here in all three approaches, has, as Böhme emphasizes, a fundamental, existential meaning. Thus, the creation of fetishes serves to establish a social order. It can be seen as "a complex system of creating order, controlling action, securing boundaries, protecting, overcoming fear, creating symbolic meaning and ritually integrating communities and individuals" (Böhme 2006, 185, transl. by the author)[7]. They convey the value of utility (function), social status (meaning), lust or unlust (aesthetics), freedom (through plenitude), and on an immaterial level, survival (in the last things) and remembering and forgetting (in the trash and in the museum) (ibid., 106–36). In them lies a promise of happiness and meaning. In this respect, fetishes contribute fundamentally to distinction between "lust/unlust, participation/non-participation, happiness/non-happiness, beauty/non-beauty, meaning/non-sense, one could almost say [between] being/non-being" (ibid., 287).

Warburg sees in the actions of humans (especially in religion, but also in art and technology, i.e. in rituals with language, design, and in abstract signs) a specific task to charge things with meaning. They can be understood as "cultural techniques of controlling body and affect," as Böhme summarises (Böhme 1997, 31, transl. by the author).

It is significant for Cassirer that while he sees the libidinous underlayer as essential to the human development, he does not make it an issue itself. Rather, he describes man's journey as a constant process of distancing and objectification, or rather as a process of creation, whose achievements (the symbolic forms) Cassirer finally evaluates as "creations of cultural conscience" (Cassirer [1929] 1964, 105–6).

How are Things Charged with Meaning?

According to Böhme, the prerequisite for making still things speak is ultimately "amazement, curiosity, attention, persistent dwelling on a thing, moment and intensity and respect, that is, aesthetic sensation" (Böhme 2006, 89). This attitude opens a window to things and makes it possible (with Merleau–Ponty) to establish a bond with them (ibid., 100). If these gestures of attention are missing, as in depression or melancholy, it is impossible to unite things and people in actions (ibid., 124). Practised rituals are essential for the "auratization" and "memory impregnation of things." The former makes it possible to transform them from dead objects into living memory carriers (ibid., 355–64). Böhme, following Marcel Mauss, speaks in this context of a "magical milieu," of a scenic embedding and situational presence that the fetishes require (ibid., 230–37; 256). The understanding that begins in this moment or situation is not a cognitive act of decoding, but a participatory act. Through it,

> they [things] become an event that grasps those addressed, pulls them out of their ordinariness, and thereby makes them ecstatic in a certain sense. (...) Scenic symbols are not perceived, deciphered, interpreted and recognized from a distance. They captivate, they impress, they fascinate, they attract, they even suck in, they overwhelm and enchant (...). (ibid., 257, transl. by the author)[8]

Warburg speaks of the influencing or affecting of the individual as a process of "embodiment". In this context, he refers in particular to collective-cultic acts of religious ceremonies in which fears are banned and at the same time "engrams" (gestures) are imprinted. These can be understood as patterns of experience that then "survive in memory as heritable material" (Böhme 1997, 70). The first forms of a so-called "figure of order," a first shaping of the "wild" life of affect, are thus not taken over by the arts, but by religions. The captivating presence of affect, which first inscribes itself in the body and remains in memory as a "bodily inscribed course of action" (pathos formula), takes shape in the cultic action in a specific way as gesture. Only from here are they grasped and realized by the artist. It becomes clear, however, that art does not refer exclusively to the gestures of religion, but is able to develop its forms directly in confrontation with the "imprint" (pathetic forms) of the reflexes of fear (ibid., 31). It is devotion, but also more or less the very active doing itself (action, language, design, and sign-making) through which this charging of meaning takes place.

For Cassirer, it is essential that human beings interpret in each moment what they perceive as significant. Cassirer describes this original form of human experience as one of *Erleben und Erleiden* (living through and suffering) (Cassirer [1929] 1964, 88). It is determined by a volitional acceptance or an originally affective-emotional interpretation of the first moments of perception (soul features):

> In the mirror of language (...) one can mostly still immediately recognize how all perception of an ´objective´ originally proceeds from the apprehension and distinction of certain "physiognomic" characters and how it remains, as it were, saturated by them. The linguistic designation of a certain movement, for example, almost always contains this moment: instead of describing the form of the movement as such, as the form of an objective spatio-temporal event, it is rather the state of which the movement in question is the expression that is named and linguistically fixed. ´Speed´, ´slowness´ and, if necessary, ´angularity´ (...) can be understood purely mathematically; on the other hand, ´force´, ´haste´, ´restraint´, ´delay´, ´exaggeration´ are names for states of life as well as for forms of movement, and in truth describe them by indicating their characters. Those who wish to characterize forms of movement and forms of space involuntarily entangled in a labelling of characteristics of the soul, because forms and movements have been experienced as phenomena of the soul before they are judged by the intellect from the standpoint of objectivity, and because the linguistic proclamation of objective concepts takes place only through the mediation of experiences of impressions. (Cassirer [1929] 1964, 94, transl. by the author)[9]

The path away from this original form of experience, which however always remains, can be described as a twofold "process of externalization" in which ultimately subject and object can be perceived separately. It leads from the world of immediate "expression" (sensuous-visual and phonetic) to the world of "representation" (language and image work) to that of "pure sense" (concepts) (ibid., 99). The conception of one's own ego, of man's "self", Cassirer argues, following Max Scheler, emerges only at the end of this process. It is not its starting point (ibid., 94). But as soon as this self, the ego, is discovered and thus the separation of subject and object is accomplished, there is inevitably a break with the original world of expression. The newly acquired concept of thing and causality cannot be reconciled with it (ibid., 99–100). Even when, thanks to

Anschauung (aesthetic consciousness or contemplation), the individual grasps what is perceived as his or her own creation, as in art, the recipient, according to Cassirer, does not relate the "living forms" then perceptible back to himself or herself, but evaluates them in the context of occasion/motif: "Art is intensification of reality" (Cassirer [1944] 2007, 221).

With regard to the activity of the artistically or linguistically active person, the question arises to what extent he or she can bring about a participatory process with his or her own means, or does this "only" require a ritual embedding? Especially the approach of Warburg and Cassirer, but also my own reflections[10] suggest this extension of Böhme's approach. According to this, this charging with meaning begins much earlier and can already be stimulated with every word heard and every pattern perceived. In this respect, meaning depends not only on the rituals practiced, but on the respective "expressive potential," specifically the "affective potential" of the words spoken or the forms designed. Cassirer refers here to *Bewegungsformen und Raumgestalten* (forms of movement and spatial forms), that are always already interpreted as properties of the soul, while Warburg draws attention to bodily inscribed courses of action ("pathos formula") that can be conveyed through design. Related to my own research, the view of both can become much more concrete if one takes into account that this expressive potential, in relation to speech, already lies in the raising and lowering of the voice, in the ductus and intensity of the sound or its sequence, or in relation to design, for example in the field of painting, is characterized by the intensity (saturation) and brightness (valeur) of the color, the extension and density of the spots, the direction and position of the lines. Not only rituals, but also very concretely the way something is said and shaped, and thus the rhetoric and style, have a decisive influence on the what and to that extent on the meaning, according to this expanded view (Sauer 1999–2000, 2012b).

Distinguishing Fetishes

The mere fact that things or works of art or even linguistic expressions can absorb the individual, whether through ritual and/or through what is said and shaped itself, leads to the legitimate question: Can we distance ourselves from their "pull" at all? Böhme also sees this moment and refers in this context to "mechanisms" in the cultures to counteract this effect, which leads to a reification and devaluation of things by separating very specific things and keeping them in very specific places, in order to declare them in this way the *unveräußerlichen* (immutable) and thus sacred things. In this respect, it is the specific rituals "produced" in the handling of these things that make a distance possible. It is the distance created by the glass in the museum or other taboo boundaries between us and the thing that, as Böhme points out with Kant, makes it possible to experience oneself in the perception of the object, "in the matrix of lust and unlust (and not of commanded/forbidden, true/false)" and thus to feel oneself and to exchange ideas about it with others. Böhme refers to these things, thus tabooed as first-order fetishes, in contrast to second-order fetishes associated to consumption (an insatiable desire) and economics (for profit optimization) (Böhme, 2006, 298–307; 330–71). By being marketable like a commodity, second-order fetishes cannot fulfil their promise of happiness and meaning in the long run. However, they too contribute to the distinction between "lust/unlust, participation/non-participation, happiness/non-happiness, beauty/non-beauty, meaning/non-sense, one might almost say [between] being/non-being." First-order things. on the other hand, in a world of series and copies, of alienation and disposition, prove to be incomparable, untouchable, and thus absolute.

Thus, through the meaning they create, they are able to connect to one's own being and, beyond that, to the "chain of life." Only they can convey uniqueness and individuality, and a meaning beyond one's own death. Thus, first-order fetishism within the economic system has a "transcendentally economic purpose (ibid., 287)." In pre-economic cultures, *unveräußerbare* (non-salable) and sacred things traditionally fulfilled this purpose; in modern cultures, works of art do so. While first-order fetishes were initially kept in churches and temples, today they are found primarily in museums and private collections. Only when the fetish is withdrawn from the cycle of disposal, and thus what "circulates in society as desire and fear is shut down and exterritorialized," does its protective and sustaining power come into its own. Then, according to Böhme, fetishism functions aesthetically and not as "external" economic, religious, sexual, consumerist. First-order fetishes allow us playfully deal with the unconscious desires and threats that we encounter in the fetish but that are normally remain hidden. At the moment of encounter (event) they reveal them (performance of the fetish). Thus, they prove to be media of envisioning (ibid., 355–364).

According to Warburg's observations, the excitations that cause us to charge things with meaning can be processed in very different ways. This can be done by objectifying or embodying the excitement in the form of a magical animation (fetish/totem). Another possibility lies in the setting of abstract signs that create an absolute distance to the arousal (fear) and enable a purely reflexive processing. A third way opens up through the creation of symbols and images in which the arousal finds an expression and, at the same time, a form is given to the arousing object. In this way, images in particular take on a task fundamental to cultural development. They "are a distancing form and an expression-giving gesture, enabling thought without abstraction, reflexive without a reflexive spell, mimetic without any mimicry-like consummation, significant without loss of contact with the signified." Returning to the anxiety (arousal) by which the individual is characterized, Warburg says in reference to the experience of images: "You live and do me no harm." Accordingly, in Warburg´s view, images can be seen as "spaces of thinking through in contemplation (Böhme 1997, see 10 also 17–22, transl. by the author)."

A process of distancing from a world determined by fetishes, which Cassirer regards as original (mythical consciousness), is described by him as indicated above as a gradual process of externalization: from a world of the Thou to one of the It and finally of the Ego (Cassirer [1929] 1964, 99–107). With Cassirer, our modern understanding of the world, which knows how to distinguish between subject and object, is ultimately based, on an originally emotional interpretation of the world. What is remarkable at this point—and here further references to Böhme and Warburg can be made—is that it is precisely the arts that can reveal the original expressive sensations in a pure, potentiated form. Thus, the arts, by their very nature, are initially to be understood less as carriers of information than as means of expression of specific experiences. They are, comparable to myth, directly connected to our ability to react to experiences (forms of movement and space) from the outside and to transform them into an artistic form or to bring them to view. This concept was also formulated by Warburg. It is the art that reflects the world to us in such a primal way as alive and animated. The "homely, familiar, and secure" can be expressed in this way as well as the "inaccessible, the frightening, or the dull and cruel." It is the original potential for effect of an expressive experience that, as Cassirer makes clear, can be banished by art. For the artist, Cassirer says in parallel to Warburg, the power of passion "has become a formative, form–giving force." By undergoing a transformation in the face of artistic works, our passions are deprived or their material burden. Art transforms them into actions, into movement rather than feeling, into a dynamic process of inner life that moves us (Cassirer 1944, 229). Remarkably, and comparable to my own research, it is the work itself, and not just its setting, that is able of arousing these feelings (Sauer 1999–2000, 2012b).

> (...) I begin to form an image of her (the landscape, MS). Thus, I have entered a new terrain, the field not of living things but of "living forms." I no longer stand in the immediate reality of things, but I move in the rhythm of spatial forms, in the harmony and contrast of colors, in the balance of light and shadow. Immersion in the dynamics of form establishes the aesthetic experience. (ibid., 233–34, transl. by the author)[11]

However, in describing the development of man as an increasing process of objectification and distancing, and in elaborating the emergence of symbolic forms as creations of cultural consciousness, Cassirer does not explicitly address the life of the soul itself (the libidinous underlayer).

Consequences for Perceiver: Responsibility

For Warburg as well as for Böhme, however, it is precisely this moment that becomes significant for their approach. Accordingly, it is one's own soul life, or rather, it is one´s longings, needs, desires, and above all, fears that are fundamental for the charging with meanings. Thus, for Böhme, given the ubiquitous presence of the fetishes we create, it is not a matter of repressing or forgetting fetishism as an apparently dark side within us, but of developing a self-reflexive relationship to it. Only self-reflexivity enables each individual to come to terms with what grows out of the centre of our derives, desires, and fantasies, so that a path can be found between devotion and distance, between control and identification, without freezing in "compulsive rationalizations of a pseudo-enlightenment" or falling into the "pathologies of addiction." Finally, the modernity of cultures is characterized by the fact that the "ineradicable need for magic and fetish can become a play form of culture and the culture of play" (Böhme 2006, 480–83).

With regard to the question of the recipient's responsibility, it can be argued that the space for reflection created in particular by first-order fetishes, but which can also be gained through playful interaction with second-order fetishes, enables not only a confrontation with one´s own concerns, fears, and needs, but also a conscious examination of the decisions and actions initiated by the power of the fetishes. The distance to them, which the taboo border or the game opens up, makes it possible to become aware of them and to take responsibility for one's own actions accordingly.

Consequences for Designer: Responsibility

From the perspective of the artistically and linguistically active person, something comparable arises: What happens if this distance is not sought by this person with their work (the words and images) and thus not wanted, so ultimately no distance is created by a glass, etc.? Propaganda and advertising will hardly seek this distance. Does the person concerned then still have responsibility for his or her actions? From this perspective, this then lies exclusively with the one who seduces to (blindly) run along. Against this background, a self-reflexivity practiced independently of experience seems inevitable as an attitude toward the world.

But this also means that if works, linguistic and formative, already have an "effect" through their pronunciation and design, that is, through their "expressive potential" as well as the "gestures of regard" (attention and curiosity) they receive, then the speaker and designer bear responsibility for their actions at every moment.

It follows, especially with regard to the broader perspective of Böhme's approach, that already the creator is able to transmit meanings by stylistic or rhetorical means and thus to "enchant." A context based on ritualization is able to strengthen or increase this effect. In view of this finding, however, an uneasiness almost inevitably arises. As a speaker and designer, how can I be responsible about what I do? Am I not already seducing? As a designer and speaker, opening up the game itself with the help of new deconstructive methods, as Böhme points out, seems to be a path that enables both understanding and thus closeness as well as a distance-creating effect.[12] One can also be helped by the arts, which, as Böhme confirms with his reference to the function of first-order fetishes, and as Warburg, Cassirer, and my own research add, are capable to open up a space of thinking through in contemplation. Another, as already noted, is to become aware of one's own receptivity and actions, and thus to practice self-reflexivity so that everyone—both the producer and the recipient—not only has responsibility for themselves, but can and will take it.

Author Biography

Martina runs an Institute of Image and Cultural Philosophy: www.bildphilosphie.de. She is senior editor of *Art Style, Art & Culture International Magazine* and a scientific advisor at the Society of Interdisciplinary Image Science and the German Society of Semiotics. She is currently a lecturer in the fundamentals of perception at the Academy of Fashion and Design (AMD) in Hamburg and Düsseldorf. In her career she was a scientific associate in philosophy of art, aesthetics, and design in Basel, Zürich, Bremen, and Witten, as well as a scientific associate at Bauhaus-University Weimar. Cf. for publications: researchgate.net, academia.edu, philpeople.org, and bildphilosophie.de.

Dr. Martina Sauer, e-mail: ms150@web.de

Notes

1. Cf. my earlier research in Martina Sauer: "Wahrnehmen von Sinn vor jeder sprachlichen oder gedanklichen Fassung? Frage an Ernst Cassirer," in *Kunstgeschichte. Open Peer Reviewed Journal* (December 3, 2008). Access date: March 22, 2021, www.kunstgeschichte-ejournal.net/discussion/2008/Sauer/, and the comments on the thesis in Lambert Wiesing´s review, cf. in: *Kunstgeschichte open peer reviewed Journal* (December 22, 2009) Access date: March 22, 2021: https://www.kunstgeschichte-ejournal.net/56/. Cf. furthermore the following four publication by Martina Sauer: "Bild- versus Kunstbegriff Cassirers," in *Das Bild als Denkfigur, Funktionen des Bildbegriffs in der Philosophiegeschichte*, edited by Simone Neuber, Roman Veressov (München: Fink, 2010), 183–98; Martina Sauer: "Affekte und Emotionen als Grundlage von Weltverstehen. Zur Tragfähigkeit des kulturanthropologischen Ansatzes Ernst Cassirers in den Bildwissenschaften," in *IMAGE* 13, no. 1 (January 2011); Martina Sauer: "Zwischen Hingabe und Distanz—Ernst Cassirers Beitrag zur Frage nach dem Ursprung der Bilder im Vergleich zu vorausgehenden (Kant), zeitgleichen (Heidegger und Warburg) und aktuellen Positionen," in *IMAGE* 15, no. 4 (April 2012); and Martina Sauer, *Faszination—Schrecken. Zur Handlungsrelevanz ästhetischer Erfahrung anhand Anselm Kiefers Deutschlandbilder* (Heidelberg: Arthistoricum.net, 2012).

2. A connection that can be seen both in their joint work in Hamburg and in the exchange of writings. Cf. John Michal Krois: "Zum Lebensbild Ernst Cassirer (1874–1945)," in *Internationale Ernst Cassirer Gesellschaft* (November 2011).

3. Hartmut Böhme, *Fetischismus und Kultur. Eine andere Theorie der Moderne* (Reinbek bei Hamburg: Rowohlt, 2006), 53–4, 53: Thus, according to Böhme "[treibt uns] jene Sorge, dass wir sterben und dass die Dinge ihr Dingliches niemals so verlieren wie wir unser Leben, (…) dazu, das Universum der Dinge in Denken zu verwandeln."

4. Aby M. Warburg, *Schlangenritual. Ein Reisebericht* (Berlin: Wagenbach, [1923]1992), 45–55: "Der Unfassbarkeit der Vorgänge in der Natur stellt der Indianer dadurch seinen Willen zur Erfassung entgegen, dass er sich in eine solche Ursache der Dinge persönlich verwandelt. Triebhaft setzt er für die unerklärliche Folge die Ursache in größtmögliche Fassbarkeit und Anschaulichkeit. Der Maskentanz ist getanzte Kausalität."

5. See also Ulrich Raulff: "Nachwort," in *Warburg, Aby M. Schlangenritual, Ein Reisebericht* (Berlin: Wagenbach, 1992), 80.

6. According to Cassirer, the phenomenology of pure expressive experiences is characterized by the fact that "[die] konkrete Wahrnehmung (...) niemals in einem Komplex sinnlicher Qualitäten—wie hell oder dunkel, kalt oder war—[aufgeht], (...) sie ist niemals ausschließlich auf das ´Was´ des Gegenstandes gerichtet, sondern erfasst die Art seiner Gesamterscheinung—den Charakter des Lockenden oder Drohenden, des Vertrauten oder Unheimlichen, des Besänftigenden oder Furchterregenden, der in dieser Erscheinung, rein als solcher und unabhängig von ihrer gegenwärtigen Deutung, liegt." Cf. Ernst Cassirer, *Die Phänomenologie der Erkenntnis* (Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, [1929] 1964), 78.

7. Hartmut Böhme, *Fetischismus und Kultur. Eine andere Theorie der Moderne* (Reinbek bei Hamburg: Rowohlt, 2006), 185: "Es kann angesehen werden als "ein komplexes System der Ordnungserzeugung, der Handlungssteuerung, der Grenzbewahrung, des Schutzes, der Angstbewältigung, der symbolischen Sinnstiftung und der rituellen Integration von Gemeinschaften und Individuen."

8. Ibid., 257: Through it, "werden sie [die Dinge] zu einem Ereignis, das Adressaten erfasst, aus ihrer Alltäglichkeit herausreißt und dadurch in gewisser Hinsicht ek-statisch macht. ... Szenische Symbole werden nicht aus der Distanz wahrgenommen, entziffert, interpretiert und erkannt. Sie schlagen in Bann, sie imponieren, faszinieren, sie ziehen an, ja saugen ein, sie überfluten und bezaubern (…)."

9. Ernst Cassirer, *Die Phänomenologie der Erkenntnis* (Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, [1929] 1964), 94: "Im Spiegel der Sprache (…) lässt sich zumeist noch unmittelbar erkennen, wie alle Wahrnehmung eines ´Objektiven´ ursprünglich von der Erfassung und Unterscheidung gewisser ´physiognomischer´ Charaktere ausgeht, und wie sie mit diesen gleichsam gesättigt bleibt. Die sprachliche Bezeichnung einer bestimmten Bewegung etwa birgt fast durchweg dieses Moment in sich: statt die Form der Bewegung als solche, als Form eines objektiven raum-zeitlichen Geschehens, zu beschreiben, wird vielmehr der Zustand genannt und sprachlich fixiert, von dem die betreffende Bewegung der Ausdruck ist. ´Raschheit´, ´Langsamkeit´ und zur Not noch ´Eckigkeit´ (…) mögen rein mathematisch verstanden werden; dagegen ´Wucht´, ´Hast´, ´Gehemmtheit´, ´Umständlichkeit´, ´Übertriebenheit´ sind ebenso sehr Namen für Lebenszustände, wie für Bewegungsweisen und beschreiben in Wahrheit diese durch Angabe ihrer Charaktere. Wer Bewegungsgestalten und Raumformen kennzeichnen will, findet sich unversehens in eine Kennzeichnung von Seeleneigenschaften verstrickt, weil Formen und Bewegungen als Seelenerscheinungen erlebt worden sind, ehe sie aus dem Gesichtspunkt der Gegenständlichkeit vom Verstande beurteilt werden und weil die sprachliche Verlautbarung der Sachbegriffe nur durch Vermittlung von Eindruckserlebnissen stattfindet."

10. Cf. in addition to the publications mentioned in note 1, the first discussion by me on this topic against the background of developmental psychology and neuroscience approaches, Martina Sauer: "Entwicklungspsychologie/Neurowissenschaft und Kunstgeschichte—Ein Beitrag zur Diskussion von Form als Grundlage von Wahrnehmungs- und Gestaltungsprinzipien," in *ejournal.net* (June 5, 2011), 1-10: Access date: March 22, 2021. http://www.kunstgeschichte-ejournal.net/134/.

11. Ernst Cassirer, *Versuch über den Menschen. Einführung in eine Philosophie der Kultur* (Hamburg: Meiner, [1944] 2007), 233–34: "(…) ich fange an ein Bild von ihr [der Landschaft] zu formen. Damit habe ich ein neues Terrain betreten, das Feld nicht der lebendigen Dinge, sondern der ´lebendigen Formen´. Nicht mehr in der unmittelbaren Wirklichkeit der Dinge stehend, bewege ich mich nun im Rhythmus der räumlichen Formen, in der Harmonie und im Kontrast der Farben, im Gleichgewicht von Licht und Schatten. Der Eintritt in die Dynamik der Form begründet das ästhetische Erlebnis."

12. Cf. in particular Böhme's comments in the last chapter 4 on fetishism, sexuality, and psychoanalysis, in which he shows that the feminist movement in particular has demonstrated this connection since the 1970s. See Hartmut Böhme, *Fetischismus und Kultur. Eine andere Theorie der Moderne* (Reinbek bei Hamburg: Rowohlt, 2006), 373–483, cf. for a summary on this: 481–83.

Bibliography

Böhme, Hartmut. *Fetischismus und Kultur. Eine andere Theorie der Moderne*. Reinbek bei Hamburg: Rowohlt, 2006.

——. "Aby M. Warburg (1866–1929)." In *Klassiker der Religionswissenschaft. Von Friedrich Schleiermacher bis Mircea Eliade*, edited by Axel Michaels. München: Beck, 1997, 133–57. Access date: March 22, 2021. https://www.hartmutboehme.de/media/Warburg.pdf.

Cassirer, Ernst. *Die Sprache* (Philosophie der symbolischen Formen, I). 1923. Reprint, Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1964.

——. *Das mythische Denken* (Philosophie der symbolischen Formen, II). 1924–25. Reprint, Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1964.

——. *Die Phänomenologie der Erkenntnis* (Philosophie der symbolischen Formen, III). 1929. Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1964.

——. *Versuch über den Menschen, Einführung in eine Philosophie der Kultur*, translated by Reinhard Kaiser. Hamburg: Meiner, 2007 (1944).

Krois, John Michael. "Zum Lebensbild Ernst Cassirer (1874–1945)." In *Internationale Ernst Cassirer Gesellschaft* (November 2011). Access date: March 22, 2021. https://ernst-cassirer.org/wp-content/uploads/2011/11/Krois_Zum-Lebensbild-Ernst-Cassirers.pdf.

Raulff, Ulrich. "Nachwort." In *Warburg, Aby M. Schlangenritual, Ein Reisebericht*. Berlin: Wagenbach, 1992.

Sauer, Martina. *Cézanne—van Gogh—Monet. Genese der Abstraktion*. PhD diss., University of Basel 1998, Bühl: Selbstverlag, 1999–2000. https://doi.org/10.11588/artdok.00001536.

——. Review of *Fetischismus und Kultur. Eine andere Theorie der Moderne*, by Hartmut Böhme. Hamburg: Rowohlt, 2006. In *Kunstchronik* 60, no. 7 (July 2007): 282-85. https://doi.org/10.11588/artdok.00000948.

——. "Wahrnehmen von Sinn vor jeder sprachlichen oder gedanklichen Fassung? Frage an Ernst Cassirer." In *Kunstgeschichte. Open Peer Reviewed Journal* (December 3, 2008). Access date: March 22, 2021: www.kunstgeschichte-ejournal.net/discussion/2008/Sauer/.

——. "Bild- versus Kunstbegriff Cassirers." In *Das Bild als Denkfigur, Funktionen des Bildbegriffs in der Philosophiegeschichte*, edited by Simone Neuber, Roman Veressov. München: Fink, 2010, 183–98. https://doi.org/10.11588/artdok.00002764.

——. "Affekte und Emotionen als Grundlage von Weltverstehen. Zur Tragfähigkeit des kulturanthropologischen Ansatzes Ernst Cassirers in den Bildwissenschaften." In *IMAGE* 13, no. 1 (January 2011). https://doi.org/10.11588/artdok.00003200.

——. "Entwicklungspsychologie/Neurowissenschaft und Kunstgeschichte—Ein Beitrag zur Diskussion von Form als Grundlage von Wahrnehmungs- und Gestaltungsprinzipien." In *ejournal.net* (June 5, 2011), 1-10: Access date: March 22, 2021: http://www.kunstgeschichte-ejournal.net/134/.

——. "Zwischen Hingabe und Distanz—Ernst Cassirers Beitrag zur Frage nach dem Ursprung der Bilder im Vergleich zu vorausgehenden (Kant), zeitgleichen (Heidegger und Warburg) und aktuellen Positionen." In *IMAGE* 15, no. 4 (April 2012a). https://doi.org/10.11588/artdok.00003197.

——. *Faszination—Schrecken. Zur Handlungsrelevanz ästhetischer Erfahrung anhand Anselm Kiefers Deutschlandbilder*. Heidelberg: Arthistoricum.net, 2012b. https://doi.org/10.11588/artdok.00001851.

Warburg, Aby M. *Sandro Botticellis "Geburt der Venus" und "Frühling." Eine Untersuchung über die Vorstellungen von der Antike in der italienischen Frührenaissance*. Hamburg, Leipzig: Voss, 1893. Access date: March 22, 2021. https://archive.org/details/sandrobotticelli00warb.

——. *Schlangenritual, Ein Reisebericht*. 1923. Reprint with a postscript by Ulrich Raulff. Berlin: Wagenbach, 1992.

Wiesing, Lambert. Review of "Wahrnehmen von Sinn vor jeder sprachlichen oder gedanklichen Fassung? Frage an Ernst Cassirer," by Martina Sauer. In *Kunstgeschichte open peer reviewed Journal*, December 22, 2009. Access date: March 22, 2021. https://www.kunstgeschichte-ejournal.net/56/.

The Art Style Magazine's Scientific Committee

Dominique Berthet is a University Professor. He teaches aesthetics and art criticism at the University of the French Antilles (UA). Founder and head of CEREAP (Center for Studies and Research in Aesthetic and Plastic Arts). Founder and director of the magazine *Recherches en Esthétique*. Member of CRILLASH (Center for Interdisciplinary Research in Literature, Languages, Arts, and Humanities, EA 4095). Associate Researcher at ACTE Institute (Université Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne). Art critic, member of AICA-France (International Association of Art Critics). Exhibition curator. His research focuses on contemporary and comparative aesthetics, contemporary art, Caribbean art, and Surrealism. He has directed more than 50 volumes, published more than 110 articles and ten books among which: Hélénon, "Lieux de peinture" (Monograph), (preface Édouard Glissant), HC Éditions, 2006; André Breton, l'éloge de la rencontre. Antilles, Amérique, Océanie, HC Éditions, 2008; Ernest Breleur (Monograph), HC Éditions, 2008; Pour une critique d'art engagée, L'Harmattan, 2013.

Gary Bratchford runs photography projects, writes, and teaches photography at the University of Central Lancashire (UCLan), where he is a Senior Lecturer. He is also the President of the International Sociological Associations' Visual Sociology Research Group and co-editor of the Journal Visual Studies. Gary's teaching and research focus around notions of power, politics, visibility and space. Gary's photographic practice centres on collaborative and participatory visual practices, including socially engaged, process-based community projects. He participated in many international conferences and forums, published in conference proceedings, and several international academic journals. Among his publications in these fields are the recent articles Socially Engaged Photography and Wellbeing: Reflections on a Case Study in the Northwest of England. (2019) Visualising the invisible: a guided walk around the Pendleton Housing Estate, Salford, UK.

Hans-Dieter Huber, artist, filmmaker, scientist. 1997 to 1999 professor HGB Leipzig; 1999-2019 Professor of Contemporary Art History, Aesthetics and Art Theory at the State Academy of Fine Arts Stuttgart. 2006-2011 Head of the International Master Program "Conservation of New Media and Digital Information" at the State Academy of Fine Arts Stuttgart. 2007 Senior Fellow at the International Research Center for Cultural Studies in Vienna. 2006-2009 Professor at the Post Graduate Program "Image, Body, Medium" at HfG Karlsruhe. Since 2013 Member of the Scientific Advisory Board of the International Institute for Subjective Experience and Research (ISER) at the MSH Medical School Hamburg. Since 2015 member of the scientific board of Society for Interdisciplinary Image Science (GIB). Since 2016 Deputy Chairman of the Württembergischer Kunstverein Stuttgart. From 2017-2020 Member of the Board of Trustees of the Adolf Hölzel Foundation, Stuttgart.

Lars C. Grabbe, Dr. phil., is Professor for Theory of Perception, Communication and Media at the MSD – Münster School of Design at the University of Applied Sciences Münster. He is managing editor of the Yearbook of Moving Image Studies (YoMIS) and the book series Bewegtbilder/Moving Images of the publishing house Büchner-Verlag, founder member of the Image Science Colloquium at the Christian-Albrechts-University in Kiel (Germany) as well as the Research Group Moving Image Science Kiel | Münster (Germany). He is working as scientific advisor and extended board member for the German Society for Interdisciplinary Image Science (GiB). Furthermore, he is a member of the International Society for Intermedial Studies, the German Society for Semiotics (DGS) and the German Society for Media Studies (GfM). His research focus lies in phenosemiotics, media theory, and media philosophy, image science, perception studies and psychology of perception, communication theory, aesthetics, semiotics, film studies and history of media as well as theory of embodiment and cognition.

Marc Jimenez is a professor emeritus of aesthetics at University Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne, where he taught aesthetics and sciences of art. With a PhD in literature and a PhD in philosophy, he translated from German into French T.W. Adorno's Aesthetics, August Wilhelm Schlegel's philosophical Doctrines of Art, and Peter Bürger's Prose of the Modern Age. Since 1986, when he succeeded Mikel Dufrenne, he directed the aesthetics collection Klincksieck Editions Collection d'Esthétique, Les Belles Lettres. Professor Marc Jimenez is a specialist in contemporary German philosophy, and his work contributed, in the early 1970s, to research on Critical Theory and the Frankfurt School. He is also a member of the International Association of Art Critics, participates in many conferences in France and abroad, and has been a regular contributor to art magazines. Recent publications: *La critique : crise de l'art ou consensus culturel ?* (Klincksieck, 1995), *Qu'est-ce que l'esthétique ?* (Gallimard, 1997), *La querelle de l'art contemporain* (Gallimard, 2005), *Fragments pour un discours esthétique. Entretiens avec Dominique Berthet* (Klincksieck, 2014), *Art et technosciences. Bioart, neuroesthétique* (Klincksieck, 2016), *Rien qu'un fou, rien qu'un poète. Une lecture des derniers poèmes de Nietzsche* (encre marine, 2016).

Omar Cerrillo Garnica is a Mexican researcher (SNI-1) and professor in Cultural Sociology. He got a PhD in Social and Political Sciences and a Master's Degree in Sociology at Iberoamerican University in Mexico City, graduated with honors. Since 2007 is professor at Instituto Tecnológico y de Estudios Superiores de Monterrey, in 2019 becomes Director of Humanities School at Campus Cuernavaca. He is specialized in social analysis of art, music and culture. He also developed a successful community engagement social service program through arts and sports. As a researcher, he has worked in politics in music –rock, Mexican folk genres–, cultural policies, digital culture, and cyberactivism. He has participated in many academic events in Mexico and other countries, with articles and book chapters published in Mexico, Brazil, Chile, and France.

Pamela C. Scorzin is an art, design, and media theorist and Professor of Art History and Visual Culture Studies at Dortmund University of Applied Sciences and Arts, Department of Design (Germany), since 2019, vice-dean. Born 1965 in Vicenza (Italy), she studied European Art History, Philosophy, English and American Literatures, and History in Stuttgart and Heidelberg (Germany), obtaining her M.A. in 1992 and her Ph.D. in 1994. She was an assistant professor in the Department of Architecture at Darmstadt University of Technology from 1995 to 2000. After completing her habilitation in the history and theory of modern art there in 2001, she was a visiting professor in Art History, Media and Visual Culture Studies in Siegen, Stuttgart, and Frankfurt am Main. Since 2008 Professor of Art History in the Department of Design at the Dortmund University of Applied Sciences and Arts; since 2020 Vice-Dean. Since 2005, she is a member of the German section of AICA. She has published (in German, English, French, and Polish) on art-historical and cultural-historical topics from the seventeenth to the twenty-first century. She lives and works in Dortmund, Milan, and Los Angeles.

Waldenyr Caldas is a full professor in Sociology of Communication and Culture at the University São Paulo. He was a visiting professor at University La Sapienza di Roma and the Joseph Fourier University in Grenoble, France. Professor Caldas has been a professor since 1996 as well as the vice-director (1997-2001) and Director (2001-2005) of ECA - School of Communications and Arts, University of São Paulo. In his academic career, he obtained all academic titles until the highest level as a full professor at the University of São Paulo. Currently, he is a representative of the University of São Paulo, together with the Franco-Brazilian Committee of the Agreement "Lévi-Strauss Chairs," and a member of the International Relations Committee of the University of São Paulo. Its scientific production records many books published and several essays published in magazines and national and international collections.

Art Style | Art & Culture International Magazine

Art Style Magazine is an open access, biannual, and peer–reviewed magazine

Submission

Art Style Magazine publishes both themed issues and issues with a variety of themes. If you are interested in publishing in the current themed edition, check out the call for papers for details on the upcoming editions. You are also welcome to contribute an extended essay or scholarly article on one of our past issues' themes or a new subject. You just need to follow our Author Guidelines and submit your essay or scholarly article for evaluation. We will get back to you with acceptance or nonacceptance feedback after the reviewers have evaluated your contribution. If your submission is accepted, we will inform you about the publication schedule.

Peer-Review Process

Papers submitted to *Art Style Magazine* are subject to strict peer review and published in the online issue when two external reviewers have approved them. Deadlines and publication dates are designated in each respective issue's planning stages. We will get back to authors with acceptance or nonacceptance feedback after the reviewers have evaluated the contributions, and we will inform them about the publication schedule.

Plagiarism

Papers submitted to *Art Style Magazine* are automatically checked for plagiarism; if a paper is plagiarized, it will not be accepted. All published articles go through the plagiarism scanner and must meet the ethical standards of academic conduct. If plagiarism is discovered in a published article, the plagiarized piece will be removed, and the author will no longer be able to publish in this magazine.

Research Publishing Ethics

Art Style Magazine outlines the best practice principles for publications. We defend the best practices in our publications and follow top institutions' directions on teaching, science, and research worldwide. With this practice, we wish to remember the fundamental values of recognition of merit and the originality of researchers and authors. Therefore, we present here the central notions of good conduct and research publishing ethics, based on the Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE), the United States National Science Foundation's policies and procedures, the European Science Foundation's code of conduct, and the FAPESP São Paulo Research Foundation's code of good scientific practice.

License and Publishing Agreement

Authors are required to sign a License and Publishing Agreement, when a paper is accepted for publication, retaining copyright while allowing the *Art Style Magazine* to publish under the terms of that agreement. Authors of *Art Style Magazine* are invited to accept and agree to be bound by the terms and conditions of Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY-NC-SA 4.0).

Author Guidelines

Language: American or British English. Everything written should be proofread.

The extended essay should be submitted to editorial@artstyle.international

Required structure

Required structure of the extended essay: title; abstract (approx. 300 words); introduction; body of the essay; conclusion; author biography (at least 150 words), endnotes, bibliography (only authors cited in the text should be referred to in the bibliography). Please, use The Chicago Manual of Style system, in Microsoft Word format (.docx). The extended essay must be of a word count of minimum 3,000 and maximum 5,500 (excluding figures, endnotes and bibliography). Page setup A4 (210 by 297 mm), default settings (based on the normal Microsoft Word template). Title: Times New Roman 16 pt, flush left. Sub-title: Times New Roman 14 pt, flush left. Sub-section Heading: Times New Roman 14 pt, flush left. Text body: Times New Roman 11 pt. Line spacing: 1.15, justified. Quotations: more extended quotations should be single-spaced and separated from the text. Also, we accept scholarly articles with a limit of 8000 words (including endnotes and bibliography). Page setup A4 (210 by 297 mm), default settings (based on the normal Microsoft Word template).

Figures: images are required—color or monochrome in RGB color mode. Please, set the resolution of images destined for web pages to 72dpi, and save images in jpg or png format only. Resolution: between 1500 and 2500 pixels wide. Don't enlarge a small image to avoid pixelated images. The related images to incorporate into your paper should have permission from the image owner or use pictures in the public domain. You can choose royalty-free photos with a Creative Commons or similar license. Otherwise, you can create some images of your own. The editorial team will evaluate the images and choose the most appropriate. The author is responsible for the images used in the article, attending to the recommendations indicated in this guide, besides using the image under Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY-NC-SA 4.0).

Captions for figures

Works of art can be cited using this format:

Figure 1: Artist's name, *Title*, Date, Medium, and support. City, Collection. License information.

But include the publication citation for where the artwork's image was found unless you have viewed the artwork in person. Any image that is being reproduced publicly should consider adding copyright information, i.e., who owns the right to an image or if it is under a Creative Commons Attribution License.

Before you submit your essay, please ensure your paper is ready for submission.
Essays and articles submissions that do not meet these recommendations will be returned.

For more information, please see:
The Chicago Manual of Style and Magazine's Author Guidelines

Terms & Conditions

Publishing in *Art Style Magazine* is free of charge for anyone, there are no article processing charges or other publication fees. Art Style Magazine is independent and supports the Open Access Movement. *Art Style Magazine* is following what is recommended in international guidelines of the Berlin Declaration on Open Access to Knowledge in the Sciences and Humanities.

This magazine is available under the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY-NC-SA 4.0). All authors (have) permitted the publication under this license. There is no copyright transfer towards *Art Style Magazine*, the authors hold the copyright and publishing rights without restrictions. Papers submitted to *Art Style Magazine* are automatically checked for plagiarism; if a paper is plagiarized, it will not be accepted. All published articles go through the plagiarism scanner and must meet the ethical standards of academic conduct. If plagiarism is discovered in a published article, the plagiarized piece will be removed, and the author will no longer be able to publish in this magazine. The editors of Art Style Magazine cannot be held responsible for errors or any consequences arising from the use of information contained in essays published on the Art *Style Maganize*'s website. Authors agree to the terms and conditions and assure that their submissions are free of third parties' rights. The views and opinions expressed in the essays are those of the author and do not reflect the views of *Art Style Magazine*. The authors of *Art Style Magazine*'s essays are responsible for its content. Images from other sources should be fully acknowledged in the caption. The *Art Style Magazine* website provides links to third-party websites. However, the magazine is not responsible for the contents of those linked sites, nor for any link contained in the linked site content of external Internet sites.

Editor-in-Chief and Creative Director

Christiane Wagner is the editor-in-chief, founder, and creative director of the *Art Style, Art & Culture International Magazine*, and a member of the College Art Association of America in New York. She has been a visiting research professor at the University of São Paulo. She was a research visiting professor of aesthetics and science of communication, UNICAMP (Fellowship CAPES 2014–2018, qualification for a professorship, Habilitation, Venia Legendi). Both universities (USP and UNICAMP) are ranked as the best universities in Latin America. She was awarded a doctoral degree (Promotion 2014) in Germany in the science of art and aesthetics, recognized by the Hessian Ministry of Science and Art. She has a Ph.D. in science of art and aesthetics from Université Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne with highest honors (mention très honorable/summa cum laude). Also, she holds a Ph.D. in design and architecture (with highest honors) and a master's degree in science of communication (with highest honors) from the University of São Paulo. She gave lectures and participated in panel discussions at the Stuttgart State Academy of Art and Design, Germany; L'École des Arts de la Sorbonne – Université Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne; Universität Wien; Contemporary Art Museum of the University of São Paulo (MAC USP); Institut für Kunstgeschichte, FAU – Friedrich Alexander Universität, Erlangen Nürnberg; The City University of New York (CUNY), New York City College of Technology (City Tech); University of Hertfordshire, London, and in many international conferences. Prof. Dr. Christiane Wagner is a scientific advisor of the São Paulo Research Foundation FAPESP in cooperation agreements with national and international research funding agencies including the UK Research Councils, the Agence Nationale de Recherche (ANR) in France, the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (DFG) in Germany, and the European Commission. She has several publications, including peer-reviewed articles, books, and essays in German, English, French, and Portuguese, some of the many languages, including Spanish, in which she is fluent.

Senior Editor

Martina Sauer runs an Institute of Image and Cultural Philosophy: www.bildphilosphie.de. She is a senior editor of Art Style | Art & Culture International Magazine and a scientific advisor at the Society of Interdisciplinary Image Science and the German Society of Semiotics. She was a scientific associate in philosophy of art, aesthetics, and design in Basel, Zürich, Bremen, and Witten, as well as a scientific associate at Bauhaus-University Weimar. Cf. for publications: researchgate.net, academia.edu, philpeople.org, and bildphilosophie.de.

Associate Editors

Laurence Larochelle is a PhD Candidate on Sociology of Communication and Cultural Studies at the Communication Department of the New Sorbonne University (Paris, France). She is currently working as a Research and Teaching assistant (ATER) at the University of Burgundy – Franche-Comté. She has two master degrees on Sociology (University Paris Descartes) and on Communication (French Institute of Journalism, Panthéon-Assas University). She has worked as a teaching staff at the New Sorbonne University, at Paris Descartes University, at Saint-Denis University and at the University Paris XII. She has published papers in French, in English and in Greek and she has worked as a researcher in France as well as in Cyprus. Since 2018 she is member of the board of the Research Committee 14 (Sociology of Communication, Knowledge and Culture) of the ISA (International Sociological Association).

Katarina Andjelkovic, Atelier AG Andjelkovic, with a PhD, M.Arch.Eng., is a theorist, a practicing architect and a painter, with teaching/research experience as a Visiting Professor at University of Oklahoma, Chair of Creative Architecture, at Institute of Form Theory and History and Institute of Urbanism and Landscape in Oslo; at University of Belgrade. She lectures at international conferences and gives workshops: Europe, America and Canada; published her research widely in international journals (Web of Science); won numerous awards for her architecture design and urban design competitions; published two scientific monographs. She is a full author of the National project supported by the Government (RoS); exhibited internationally (architectural, painting and photography); won.

Natasha Marzliak holds a PhD in Multimedia and Art from UNICAMP with a doctorate stage in Cinema and Audiovisual from the Université Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne, a Master degree in Audiovisual Culture and Media from UNICAMP and Bachelor degree in Visual Arts from UNICAMP. As part of complementary academic training, she studied Video, Photography, and Multimedia at the École Supérieure d'Arts de Grenoble (ESAG), History of Modern and Contemporary Art, French Literature and French Cinema at the Université Paul Valéry - Montpellier 3. As a visual artist and researcher, she has been working in the areas of curatorship, conception, production, and post-production of audiovisual projects that are at the intersection of contemporary art with cinema, video, and new technologies.

Art Style Maganize's website: artstyle.international

CC BY NC SA

Art Style | Art & Culture International Magazine

editorial@artstyle.international

+1 347 352 8564 New York
+55 11 3230 6423 São Paulo

The Magazine is a product of Art Style Communication & Editions.
Founded in 1995, the Art Style Company operates worldwide in the fields of design, architecture, communication, arts, aesthetics, and culture.

Theodor Herzi, 49 | 05014 020 Sao Paulo, SP | CNPJ 00.445.976/0001-78

Christiane Wagner is a registered journalist and editor: MTB 0073952/SP

© 1995 Art Style Communication & Editions

artstyle.international Volume 8 | Issue 8.1 | Part 2 | September 2021

ART STYLE

Art & Culture International Magazine

ISSN 2596-1802

9 772596 180008