



ClairCity: Citizen-led air pollution reduction in cities

D4.14 Mutual Learning Workshop Complete – First city

August 2017 (Updated April 2018)

1 Document Details

Authors	Emily Prestwood (UWE) Eva Csobod (REC)
Contact	Emily Prestwood <Emily.Prestwood@uwe.ac.uk> <u>Eva Csobod <ecsobod@teammembers.rec.org></u>
Creation Date	07/08/17
Date of Last Revision	13/04/18
Description	The first city, Bristol report is one of the deliverables on the task of WP 4.4.1. Mutual Learning Workshops (MLW). After Bristol the workshops were held in 3 other pilot cities and 2 regions with stakeholders to share and discuss the health risk factors of their changing city environment now and within the timescale of the future scenarios (2020-2030-2050). The current report contains the general concept of the MLW, the summary of the Bristol MLW, the scenario outputs and conclusions, the list of participants and the MLW Guideline.

2 Version History

Version	Updated By	Date	Changes / Comments
V1	Emily Prestwood	26/7/17	Version 1
V2	Eva Csobod	27/7/17	Small update of the structure, V2
V3	Emily Prestwood	04/08/17	Proof-reading and minor edits 2 V3
V4	Emily Prestwood	11/07/18	Update according to the review letter
V5	Eva Csobod	12/07/18	Small update
V6	Corra Boushel	13/04/18	Formatting check

3 Contributions and Acknowledgements

The authors would like to thank the following people for their important contributions used in the preparation of this final document.

Quality Assurance	Eva Csobod (REC)
Native Language Check	Corra Boushel (UWE)
Project internal comments	Internal comments ask for detailed information on the stakeholder groups and the conclusion of the Bristol MLW.

Contents

- 1 Document Details 2
- 2 Version History 2
- 3 Contributions and Acknowledgements..... 3
- 4 Executive Summary 6
- 5 Mutual Learning Stakeholder Workshop in Bristol (UK) 7
 - 5.1.1 MLW Concept 7
 - 5.1.2 Workshop Aim..... 7
 - 5.1.3 Facilitators..... 7
 - 5.1.4 Participants 7
 - 5.1.5 Organisations 7
 - 5.1.6 Logistics 8
 - 5.1.7 Resources..... 8
- 6 Agenda..... 9
- 7 Minutes of the Mutual Learning Workshop10
 - 7.1.1 Introduction10
 - 7.1.2 Panel session.....10
 - 7.1.3 Poster session (A) Strategies 202011
 - 7.1.4 Poster session (B) Visions 2050.....12
 - 7.1.5 Break12
 - 7.1.6 Poster session (C) Challenges and Barriers.....12
 - 7.1.7 “Mood of the room” activity12
 - 7.1.8 Scenario session: actions, milestones and priorities.....13
 - 7.1.9 Feedback on actions, priorities and milestones to the rest of the room.....13
 - 7.1.10 Closing words/next steps14
- 8 Comments.....15

8.1	Initial outputs	15
8.1.1	Bristol 2020	15
8.1.2	Bristol 2050	15
8.1.3	Challenges and barriers	16
8.1.4	Bristol 2020 – 2050: Actions, milestones and priorities.....	16
9	Conclusions.....	18
10	List of participants.....	19
11	Stakeholder Groups.....	21
12	ClairCity Mutual Learning Workshop: Facilitator Rough Guide.....	22
13	Guideline for the cities/regions: How to prepare the Mutual Learning Stakeholder Workshop.....	24
13.1	General introduction.....	24
13.2	The Mutual Learning Stakeholder Workshops.....	24
13.3	Concept and participants of the workshop.....	24
13.4	The outcome of the MLW	25
13.5	Proposal for the agenda of the workshops	25
13.6	Activity plan (information for the cities/regions and project partners)	26
13.7	Technical details	27

4 Executive Summary

The activity belongs to the work package Citizens and Stakeholder Engagement, WP4.4 – Citizens and their Health, Task 4.4.1 Mutual Learning Stakeholder Workshop.

The aim is to empower citizens to better understand the specific challenges and opportunities that their city currently offers and engage them into moving towards reduce pollutants emissions and carbon footprints, improved air quality and decreased health risks. This is achieved as part of overall perceptions and ideas of citizens on sustainable lifestyles and a '*better quality of life*' within their city in the future. The main outcomes will support the policy development of the cities towards 2050 in the field of integrated city planning, air quality and climate change.

The REC (WP4 lead) design of the Mutual Learning Stakeholder Workshops (MLSW); the content, methodology, structure, the potential stakeholders and timeframe. The MLW is implemented by the partners and cities/regions. The first city is Bristol. UWE and the Bristol city adapted the proposed method in MLW Guidelines (see in the Annex) to the local needs and conditions.

5 Mutual Learning Stakeholder Workshop in Bristol (UK)

The Bristol Mutual Learning Stakeholder Workshop (MLW) was held on the 20th July 2017 between 9.00 and 13.00 at the University of West of England City Campus at Arnolfini.¹

5.1.1 MLW Concept

The MLW is designed for different stakeholders who are engaged in environment, health issues and policies in Bristol and ready to participate in the MLW.

5.1.2 Workshop Aim

To develop routes to a “clean air”, healthy, zero-carbon Bristol by 2050 by understanding specific challenges and opportunities for organisations, and engaging them to identify actions, milestones and priorities.

5.1.3 Facilitators

- Emily Prestwood (UWE) Workshop Lead
- Andy Edwards (Bristol City Council) (Mark Leach (BCC) involved in organisation)
- Enda Hayes (UWE)
- Jo Barnes (UWE)
- Corra Boushel (UWE)
- Laura Fogg-Rogers (UWE)
- Eva Csobod (REC)

5.1.4 Participants

Participants of the workshop were from a range of organisations: Bristol City Council, South Gloucestershire Council, NGOs and campaign groups, health and environmental organisations, partnerships and consultancies, businesses, UWE and University of Bristol, and transport providers, and included city councillors from the Labour Party and the Green Party. See participant list for full range of stakeholders.

5.1.5 Organisations

Participants were invited through a number of routes (invites included a link to register for the workshop on Eventbrite: <https://www.eventbrite.co.uk/e/claircity-mutual-learning-workshop-tickets-35788570578#>):

- Invites sent to selected members of Bristol Green Capital Partnership (<http://bristolgreencapital.org/>)
- Invites sent to known contacts of UWE and Bristol City Council
- Event advertised in Low Carbon South West Newsletter

¹ See <http://www1.uwe.ac.uk/about/visitus/campusmapsandinformation/citycampus/aboutcitycampus/arnolfini.aspx>

(<https://www.lowcarbonsouthwest.co.uk/>)

- Event advertised on twitter by @ClairCity and @bgreencapital
- Event advertised at North Bristol SusCom meeting by Jo Barnes

5.1.6 Logistics

Two rooms were used for the workshop: one set up for a discussion with three keynote speakers and one set up for the poster creation and group work. See photos.

Tea, coffee and croissants were available on arrival (9.00-9.30). More tea and coffee plus cookies were provided at 11.10.

5.1.7 Resources

Participant sign-up sheet

Consent forms

Participant information sheets

Large posters for Bristol 2020, Bristol 2030 and challenges and barriers, and Bristol 2050

Ppt slide presentation

Pens, scissors, stickers, sellotape, blue tack, post it notes, paper (for poster creation)

6 Agenda

9:00: Arrival and sign in (with tea, coffee and croissants)

Start

- 9:30: Welcome and outline of programme *10 mins*
- 9:40: Panel session with keynote speakers *35 mins*
- Graham Parkhurst: Centre for Transport and Society UWE
- David Relph: Bristol Health Partners
- Adrian Davies: UWE and Bristol City Council
- 10:15: Panel session Q&A *15 mins*
- 10:30: Strategies and creating visions: 2020 & 2050 *40 mins*

11:10: Break

(With Tea and Coffee)

- 11.25: Challenges and barriers – 2020-2050 *25 mins*
- 11:45: Scenario sessions (in 4-5 groups) *40 mins*
- Milestones, priorities and actions
- 12.30: Scenario knowledge sharing discussion *20 mins*
- Milestones, priorities and actions
- 12.50: Conclusions/closing words *10 mins*

13.0 End

7 Minutes of the Mutual Learning Workshop

7.1.1 Introduction

(10 minutes)

A 10 minute introduction was given by Emily Prestwood giving an overview of the ClairCity project, the key message of why we had arranged the workshop, and the purpose and the aim for the MLW.

“A chance to share knowledge and learning about how to achieve a “clean air”, healthy, zero-carbon Bristol”

With the aim:

To develop routes to a “clean air”, healthy, zero-carbon Bristol by 2050 by understanding specific challenges and opportunities for organisations, and engaging them to identify actions, milestones and priorities.

7.1.2 Panel session

(60 minutes)

Graham Parkhurst (Professor of Sustainability Mobility, UWE): A Critical View of the Four Key Transitions in the Mobility Sector

Graham gave a short overview of the key transitions in the transport sector and some of the challenges in the future: electrification; automation and interconnection; more flexible supply and user choices; more sharing of vehicles.

David Relph (Director, Bristol Health Partners): The need for long term planning and investment in health

David spoke about the need to consider the long term impact of environmental factors, including air pollution, in health planning and policy to challenge the current short-term, inadequate thinking in terms of investing in health.

Dr Adrian Davies (Visiting Professor Transport and Health, UWE): Health, transport and air pollution: At a glance

Adrian spoke about transport and health in conjunction, highlighting the role of physical activity as a defence against disease as well as the importance of air pollution as a health problem with new evidence still emerging



The talks from the guest speakers were followed by questions from the audience around the future role of hydrogen in sustainable transport, options for public transport e.g. buses and around the broader challenges and barriers to Bristol effectively addressing the problem of air pollution.

The session was recorded and is available on youtube at: https://youtu.be/kq41O_Op3aY

7.1.3 Poster session (A) Strategies 2020

(20 minutes)

Prior to the workshop attendees had been asked to bring a leaflet or print-out of their organisation's strategies around clean air. In the session, participants had 30 seconds to talk about their organisations' aims, actions and visions around a "clean air, healthy and low carbon Bristol in 2020". The information attendees had brought was stuck on the 2020 poster. Facilitators also took notes recording each participants' comments and these notes were stuck on the Bristol 2020 poster as well.

The majority of participants had not bought any information/strategy document with them so capturing their organisational strategies on post its was essential to create the group 2020 poster.



7.1.4 Poster session (B) Visions 2050

(20 minutes)

Participants were asked to think about their organisation's place in relation to a vision for a "clean air", healthy, low-carbon Bristol in 2020 prior to attending the workshop. In the session, participants drew, wrote and created their organisation's visions for Bristol 2050. These visions were stuck on the Bristol 2050 poster by facilitators. During the session participants discussed their visions with other people on their table, but were asked to create their own organisational vision.



7.1.5 Break

Over a tea and coffee break, participants finished creating their visions.

7.1.6 Poster session (C) Challenges and Barriers

(20 minutes)

Attendees were asked to identify the challenges and barriers for their organisations of moving from where they could be in the near future (2020) to the vision of a "clean air, healthy, low-carbon Bristol in 2050. Challenges and barriers were written on post-its by participants and then stuck on the "challenges and barriers" poster.



7.1.7 "Mood of the room" activity

Attendees were given 5 minutes to stretch their legs and to go and look at the posters for Bristol 2020, Bristol 2050 and "challenges and barriers" to see what other participants had contributed. They were then asked to answer two questions

- How big a change is needed to achieve the visions for a "clean air", healthy, low-carbon Bristol in 2050?
- How realistic is it that the visions can be achieved by 2050?



Participants were asked to rank themselves across the front of the room. For the first question the ranking was between “no change (carry-on with business as usual)” and “big change” needed. For the second question the rank was between “will happen” and “won’t happen”. For question 1, the majority of the group were on the side of the room for “big change needed”. For question 2 there was more of a spread between the two extremes (see photos).

7.1.8 Scenario session: actions, milestones and priorities

(30 minutes)

For the final activity, participants worked in groups of approximately 5-6. Leading on from the “mood of the room activity”, participants were asked to consider the strategies, visions, and challenge and barriers they had identified in the previous activities and to think of definite actions of how Bristol and their organisation can move to the visions of a “clean air”, healthy, low-carbon city by 2050. They were then asked to identify some milestones; years when actions would have to happen by for the visions to be achieved. Finally, they were asked to prioritise the actions and identify those which were most significant in achieving the visions for 2050. The group discussions were recorded on large pieces of paper by facilitators and participants. The groups were asked to identify somebody to feed back to the rest of the group.



7.1.9 Feedback on actions, priorities and milestones to the rest of the room

(15 minutes)

Each group fed-back to the rest of the group, describing the discussions they’d had and their main actions, milestones and priorities. Their action lists were attached to the poster for 2030 – an interim period between 2020 and 2050



7.1.10 Closing words/next steps

(10 minutes)

The group were given a short presentation by Jo Barnes on the next steps of the workshop in relation to the app (ANTZ) and the ClairCity game. They were also asked if they would like to attend the Bristol Stakeholder Dialogue workshop next summer (2018). Finally, they were asked for comments or questions on the workshop. Questions focussed on the outputs of the MLW and the information and resources available to organisations wishing to raise awareness about air pollution.

8 Comments

An initial appraisal of the workshop suggests that overall the workshop had a positive atmosphere and was a good experience for attendees. Participants were happy to be involved and mutually learn about and discuss air pollution, health and carbon reduction. The keynote speakers provided a good amount of information across air pollution, health and sustainable transport, and there is the opportunity to continue with the mutual learning by making the talks and posters available online.

A challenge of the workshop was supporting the groups to turn their attention to definite “actions” in the scenario session at the end. For some attendees it was difficult to change their focus from talking about the issues to talking about what needs to actually happen. If more time was available, there would perhaps be a benefit to facilitators summarising and presenting the action lists to allow for a better comparison and discussion between the groups in the feedback session.

Feedback from participants was largely positive, highlighting in particular the opportunity to talk to people they wouldn't normally talk to. Many participants have stated that they would like to be part of a shared workshop email contact list. A minority of feedback suggests there should have been a bigger focus on actions but the workshop was still felt to be positive from a “getting everyone in the same room” view point.

8.1 Initial outputs

A full analysis of the outputs on the posters from the Bristol Mutual Learning Workshop has not been carried out yet but an initial screening raises some interesting points:

8.1.1 *Bristol 2020*

The Bristol 2020 poster identifies the current aims and strategies of the organisations represented by participants at the workshop. A broad range of interest were represented with many organisations already focussing on environment and sustainability issues. Some organisations were already involved in political groups looking at congestion, or raising awareness, or were involved in energy and air quality consultancy and planning work. Though the business sector was underrepresented at the workshop, participants from this sector identified their strategies around increasing the efficiency of their fleets and reducing waste.

8.1.2 *Bristol 2050*

All participants created a poster for 2050 with their vision for a “clean air” healthy zero-carbon Bristol related to their organisation. Three posters are considered in this initial summary of the outputs:

The participant from the At-Bristol Science Centre focused on operational and engagement practices. Their vision included a carbon neutral site, the majority of parking spaces for electric cars charged from a zero-carbon supply, and visitor numbers having increased with

visitors arriving on foot, bike and public transport. The organisation will be a hub bringing all stakeholders together and engaging people from across Bristol.

The vision of the participant from the First Bus Group included half to three quarters of their fleet running on gas or cleaner energy, producing cleaner engines through working with their suppliers and reducing waste oils. In addition, their organisation would be powering their infrastructure using solar energy, encouraging people to use public transport and working with schools and universities to change behaviours with regards to emissions.

The participant from Bristol Energy Cooperative focussed on technical and energy planning features in their vision. Any new houses would be built to passive house standard. Bristol would generate enough renewable energy to power itself, utilities would be publically or locally owned and the Avonmouth Port would be a centre for renewable energy excellence. In addition, residents would feel empowered to control their own energy use.

8.1.3 Challenges and barriers

The challenges and barriers identified by participants can broadly be categorised as: political; business/market; housing; citizen challenges; cultural; housing.

In the **political** category, many comments identified lack of government funding or government inaction as barriers along with “short-termism” and business as usual approaches. Challenges for **citizens** were noted around a lack of options in terms of the “school run”, flexible working hours and access to public transport. In terms of **culture**, ignorance of evidence and acceptance and social expectations around the conflict between sustainability and current travel behaviours were raised. **Transport** challenges and barriers focussed on the lack of a quality alternative to car use and the inefficiencies of public transport. For **housing** affordable and efficient housing for a growing population was highlighted. **Business/market** challenges identified the need to think about alternatives to government spending to pay for training and new technologies.

8.1.4 Bristol 2020 – 2050: Actions, milestones and priorities

Actions, milestones and priorities were devised in four separate groups. Group discussions led to different actions and different areas of focus:

One group developed a timeline from 2020 to 2050 focused on moving to a clean air Bristol by promoting and enabling electric vehicles, developing joint spatial plans for 2030 to 2040 and then focussing on the different types of social, political and planning action that would be needed.

A second group focussed more on the political, social and community changes needed over the time scale, prioritising increased community, bottom-up approaches, collaborative partnerships and a change to the electoral and democratic governance of the UK to proportional representation and devolution.

A third group focussed on the actions needed in the short term by the City Council such as reporting and funding a clean air zone, improving transport links to South Bristol, challenging

the decision-making process of the council, changing the procurement process and making public transport more affordable.

The final group also focussed on planning policy locally, the need for a spatial plan to focus on air pollution, address diesel generation, a comprehensive bus strategy and Clean Air Zone and delivering a mechanism to raise investment. They also considered the role of the housing stock and the need to make all homes energy efficient.

9 Conclusions

Overall the Bristol mutual learning workshop successfully engaged with a variety of stakeholders from different sectors and organisations. As identified there was a lack of business representation at the workshop and this likely accounts for the 'gap' in in-depth discussions around business models, finance/investment, and barriers specific to business and growth.

There were a number of 'political' stakeholders (councillors at Bristol City Council from the Green and Labour Parties, and local campaign groups) which perhaps explains the focus on political barriers and governance at the workshop.

However, though political short-termism was identified as a barrier by stakeholders, the groups' pathways from 2020 to 2050 were largely short-term (apart from one group) when it came to setting actions and milestones beyond the next five years.

This highlights the difficulties scientists, policy makers, industry and civil/civic society organisations all have in visualising potential transformative actions that go beyond the systems already in place. Future workshops could seek to address this by spending more time on pathway development and less on barriers.

The increased uptake of electric vehicles and a potential "clean air zone" in Bristol are both actions/policies that have been widely discussed in national and local media recently and unsurprisingly they featured across pathways as potential policy actions.

In Bristol, clean air and air pollution are largely linked to the transport sector – both in people's minds and in reality. The need for better transport and infrastructure planning in Bristol is clearly identified and links to improved housing and better connectedness across the city. Spatial plans need to be adequately supported by effective social planning that considers health impacts, and also requires political leadership and action.

The wide representation of civil and civil society organisations led to the identification of social and cultural barriers to change, but also opportunities and potential policy actions to increase bottom-up community and citizen engagement in local governance and decision making – something the ClairCity project aims to do.

10 List of participants

Name	Organisation	Name	Organisation
Chris Donnelly	UWE (Travel and Access Manager)	Alison Allan	SERA
Mike Knight	Cater Business Park	Charlie Bolton	Councillor Bristol City Council
Thomas Haines	UWE/Bristol Green Capital Partnership	Dom Alexander	Councillor Bristol City Council
Enda Hayes	UWE/ClairCity	Gillian Cope	University of Bristol
Corra Boushel	UWE/ClairCity	Roger Sabido	Ambition Lawrence Weston
Andy Edwards	Bristol City Council	Jim Longhurst	UWE
Adrian Davis	UWE/Bristol City Council	Eva Csobod	REC
Patrick Williams	Sustrans	Graham Parkhurst	UWE/Centre for Transport & Society
Stuart Phelps	RADE (Residents Against Dirty Energy)	David Relph	Bristol Health Partners
Bilal Mohamed	First Bus	Martin Foder	Councillor Bristol City Council
Fionna Vosper	South Gloucestershire Council	Clare Beattie	AQC (Air Quality Consultants)
Lesley Anne Stone	ARUP	Alexandra Heelis	UHB (University Hospitals Bristol)
Alan Morris	Bristol Walking Alliance	Chris Dunford	At Bristol

Claire Jacob	Bristol Green Capital Partnership	Vicky Wakefield-Jarrett	Bristol Energy Cooperative
Tanzir Chowdhury	Eunomia	Gill Calloway	Bristol City Council
Jo Barnes	UWE/ClairCity	Laura Fogg Rogers	UWE/ClairCity
Martha King	KWMC (Knowle West Media Centre)	Emily Prestwood	UWE/ClairCity

11 Stakeholder Groups

At the mutual learning workshop there were stakeholders from the following different stakeholder groups:

Stakeholder Group	Number	Organisations
Industry (including transport)	6 (18%)	UWE, First Bus, ARUP, Eunomia, AQC, UHB
Science/Academia	9 (26%)	UWE, University of Bristol, REC
Civil/Civic Society (including NGOs/Partnerships and Networks)	11 (32%)	Bristol Green Capital Partnership, Sustrans, RADE, Bristol Walking Alliance, KWMC, SERA, Ambition Lawrence Weston, Bristol Health Partners, At Bristol, Bristol Energy Cooperative
Policy Makers (including councilors and public servants)	7 (21%)	Bristol City Council, South Gloucestershire Council
Investors/Business sector	1 (3%)	Cater Business Park
Other	0	

12 ClairCity Mutual Learning Workshop: Facilitator Rough Guide

Facilitators: Eva Csobod, Jo Barnes, Corra Boushel, Enda Hayes, Andy Edwards, Peter Szuppinger (Observer)

9.00 – 9.30: Wait downstairs in main entrance to welcome people (JB)

Make sure people can get through swipe door on 3rd floor (EH)

Welcome people, ensure they sign participant sheet and get consent form. (EP, AE, EC).

9.30 – 9.40: Introduction

9.40 – 10.30: Panel and Q&A – ask questions if nobody else does (All)

Film Q&A (CB)

10.30 – 10.45: Poster 2020. 30 sec elevator pitch. Help arrange/scribe organisational strategies on poster. (EH & JB)

10.45 – 11.10: Poster 2050. In groups attendees create their visions around their organisation. Facilitators – 1 per group with prompt questions to help with vision creation

- What does your organisation do in 2050?
- How does your organisation move around?
- What buildings/spaces will you be using?
- How do you do what you do?

11.10 – 11.25: Tea/coffee break. Help stick/arrange visions as necessary. Have a cup of tea or coffee (All)

11.25 – 11.40: Poster 2020 – 2050 Barriers and Challenges. Facilitate group with writing barriers and challenges for their organisation on post-it notes. Help stick on 2020-2050 poster (All)

11.40 – 11.50: 5 minutes – looking at barrier and challenges with rest of group. Then 5 minutes for “mood of the room task”. Encourage people to move across the room and to pick a side (All)

11.50 – 12.30: Scenarios in a group. Help group record 1) actions, 2) milestones 3) priorities on different coloured pieces of paper/post-its (Approximately 10-12 minutes each) for how to reach 2050 vision (All)

12.30 – 12.50: Feedback from group and discussion. If nobody in the group wants to feed back the groups actions, milestones and priorities, feedback on their behalf.

Take notes on discussion points: AE, JB

12.50 – 13.00: Closing words. Make sure everybody has a feedback form (All)

13 Guideline for the cities/regions: How to prepare the Mutual Learning Stakeholder Workshop

(April 2017, REC)

The activity belongs to the WP4.4 – Citizens and their Health, Task 4.4.1 Mutual Learning Stakeholder Workshops (*MLW events during summer and autumn 2017/spring 2018- linked to the Delphi workshop – same month*).

13.1 General introduction

The WP4 builds on the WHO Policy Framework and the European Commission's initiatives (Clean Air package) in order to promote public health and pay special attention to more vulnerable groups, such as children and senior citizens in the context of health, air quality and climate change. **The aim is to empower citizens to better understand the specific challenges and opportunities that their city currently offers and engage them into moving towards reduce pollutants emissions and carbon footprints, improved air quality and decreased health risks.** This is achieved as part of overall perceptions and ideas of citizens on sustainable lifestyles and a '*better quality of life*' within their city in the future. It will be delivered through: Tasks 4.4.1.-4.4.3).

13.2 The Mutual Learning Stakeholder Workshops

Task 4.4.1 Mutual Learning Stakeholder Workshops

These workshops will be held in the 4 pilot cities and 2 regions with stakeholders to share and discuss the health risk factors of their changing city environment now and within the timescale of the future scenarios (2020-2030-2050). The workshops will reflect on the multi-disciplinary context and preventive measures of air quality, climate change and health issues. The mutual learning workshop will provide opportunity for exchange of national/local/city systems and practices in health, environment and innovation (e.g. smart cities). This will create further innovative tools for mutual learning to improve air quality, reduce carbon footprint and improve public health (with special attention given to children and senior citizens).

13.3 Concept and participants of the workshop

13.3.1 Concept:

Mutual Learning Stakeholder Workshops (MLW) designed for different stakeholders who are engaged in environment and health issues and policies in the cities/ regions and ready to participate in the MLW. The participants of the MLW are asked to prepare a poster and share their views on the health risk factors of their changing city environment/region now and within the timescale of the future scenarios (2020-2030-2050).

13.3.2 *The participants:*

The participants of the workshops will be stakeholders (NGOs, social city groups, health and environmental organisations, business actors, environmental health monitoring agencies, universities, relevant department of the pilot cities) , who are involved in the air quality, public health and carbon management issues, planning and activities in the city (local level), or regional and national level. The proposed number of participant: 30

The list of stakeholders will be selected by the contact of the cities/regions and the project partner contacts and adjusted to the cities' special conditions if needed.(link to WP3)

13.4 The outcome of the MLW

The workshops will reflect on the multi-disciplinary context and preventive measures of air quality, climate change/management and health issues/impacts. The mutual learning workshop will provide opportunity for exchange of national/local/city systems and practices in health, environment and innovation (e.g. smart cities, innovative solutions).

The innovative tools gained from mutual learning to improve air quality, reduce carbon footprint and improve public health will be presented in the **report of the WP4.4.1** and delivered to the WP6 (policy WP) and WP7 (scenario WP) with special attention given to children and senior citizens.

13.4.1 *Linkages*

The outcome of the MLW can support the WP4.1 (Delphi process) and the WP4.2 (GAME) and the WP4.3 (APP) by the WP4.4.1 report and the spokespersons of the workshops.

13.5 Proposal for the agenda of the workshops

Plenary session (60 min): Introduction and presentation of the overall context of air quality, climate change/management and health impacts on national and city level. Two keynote speakers will be selected with the help of the project partners (WP4.4.1 lead/REC, the city buddy) and the city coordinator. The speakers will be asked to focus on the current health risk factors and the quality of the city environment.

Walking session (40 min): The mutual learning workshop participants (stakeholders) will be asked to prepare a poster before the workshop and present at the walking session. Proposal for the topic of the posters: the current and possible future trends on health and environmental issues in the city/regions. The format of the poster is explained in the 'technical details' section below. After the plenary presentation there will be a walking session to see the posters about the major issues and future trends in the city/region.

Setting up the stage of scenarios session (40 min): After the poster walking session the moderator of the session will be asked to moderate the discussion on the future scenario settings: priorities and targets, 2020-2030-2050.

Lunch (40 min).

Discussion of the scenarios session in groups (40 min) and at the plenary (30 min): The participants will work in 3 groups (scenario towards 2020, 2030, 2050) and discuss the innovative actions towards the actual scenario reflecting on the priorities and targets. After the group discussion the groups will present the scenarios then the participants will discuss the list of innovative tools including policy options.

Closing words: Conclusions. What is the benefit of mutual learning today and in the future. How to keep running joint learning and action?

13.6 Activity plan (information for the cities/regions and project partners)

REC designs the Mutual Learning Stakeholder Workshops (MLSW); the content, methodology, structure, the potential stakeholders and timeframe. (July-Aug/update Nov/Dec 2016, update based on the feedback of the cities/regions, buddies, April 2017)

REC circulates for feedback the MLSW design for the partners and cities. (Dec 2016/Jan 2017, April 2017)

The detailed MLSW design will be translated to the local languages (6 languages including English)- (May 2017)- *optional*

The MLSW will be implemented by the partners and cities/regions, who are responsible for the implementation and the feedback loop (documentation of the outcome of the MLSW)- (May- Sept 2017)-*preparation, (MLW events during summer and autumn 2017/spring 2018-linked to the Delphi workshop – same month)*

Analysis of the outcome of the multi-disciplinary workshops will done by the REC and the project partners, who will develop clusters with preventive measures of air quality, climate change and health. (end of 2017/spring 2018)

The outcome of the workshops will be uploaded to the project website and disseminated by a small brochure for cities. (spring 2018)

13.6.1 Timeline of key activity

Key Activity WP4.4.1	Lead	Activity Dates	Linked Deliverable
Development of the design and methodology of the MLW, drafting and update	REC	M1 – M8	
Circulation for feedback of the MLW design and Guideline to the cities/regions and WP3 partners	REC	M9 (Jan 2017) M12 (April 2017)	

Translation of the MLW design and Guidelines for the cities/regions	REC UWE	M13	
Preparation of MLW in the cities/regions (3 months) Running of the MLW in the cities/regions after the Delphi workshop (same month) Bristol Amsterdam Ljubljana Sosnowiec Aveiro Region Liguria Region	REC city partners Region partners	M13-17(May-Sept 2017) M15/16 (July/Aug 17) M18 (Oct 17) M18/21 M18/21 M22 (Febr18 M23(March18)	D 4.14 and D 4.15
MLW analysis report	REC	M 30	D 4.16
Website report summary	REC	M30	

13.7 Technical details

Organisation: The MLW will be organised by the city/region with the support of the project partner (city buddies) and the WP4.4.1. leader (REC).

Infrastructure: The organiser of the MLW will select the venue of the meeting in the city/region with the project partner. (One big room for the plenary and 3 rooms for the group work). For poster presentations we propose to use the plenary room. For brochures and dissemination materials we propose a separate table in or outside of the plenary room.

Tables and name badges: Tables and name badges will be prepared by the local organiser (logo of the project and H2020 should be visible)

Posters: The participants/stakeholders are asked to prepare a poster before the workshop and present at the walking session. The proposed topic: the current and possible future trends on health and environmental issues in the in the city-regions. The template for the poster can be a Claircity template or just a basic one. The proposal for the size of the

template is an ordinary poster size 70 cm x100 cm. The proposed template will be prepared by the REC and UWE (WP2) and send out in April 2017.

Language: local/ national

Moderator/facilitator: The moderator/facilitator will be selected by the city contact and the project partner.

Presenters: The presenters will be selected by the city contact with the help of the project partners (city buddy and WP4.4.1 leader). For the opening plenary national expert and local expert should be selected.

The participants: The participants of the workshops will be stakeholders, selected NGOs, social city groups, health and environmental organisations, business actors, environmental health monitoring agencies, universities, relevant department of the pilot cities , who are involved in the air quality, public health and carbon management issues, planning and activities in the city (local level), or regional and national level. Number of participants: 30

The list of stakeholders will be selected by the contact of the cities/regions and the project partner and adjusted to the cities' special conditions if needed.

REC would like to help the implementation of the MLW locally. One representative of the REC will be present at the MLW meeting.

Amsterdam: Eva Csobod

Aveiro Region: Eva Csobod/ Peter Szuppinger

Bristol: Eva Csobod

Ljubljana: Peter Szuppinger

Liguria Region. : Gabor Heves

Sosnowiec: Zbigniew Szkop/ Eva Csobod

The template for inviting speakers and stakeholder for the MLW is in progress.