WILEY

The Paraguayan Chaco and Its Possible Future: Discussion

Author(s): H. E., Maurice de Bunsen, R. B. Cunninghame Graham, A. Ewbank, J. W. Evans and W. Barbrooke Grubb

Source: *The Geographical Journal*, Vol. 54, No. 3 (Sep., 1919), pp. 171-178

Published by: geographicalj

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/1780057>

Accessed: 21-06-2016 12:21 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at
<http://about.jstor.org/terms>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Wiley, The Royal Geographical Society (with the Institute of British Geographers) are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Geographical Journal*

already accessible. The lands in their present condition, provided that water could be secured, are estimated to carry safely five hundred cattle per Paraguayan league, and if this province could be developed in this way the total value represented would be immense. Fencing is an easy matter, as posts are abundant and almost always near at hand. The Indians make capital cow-boys and expert fencers. The wood industry at present consists chiefly in the export of tanning from the quebracho tree, but the exploitation of these forests depends entirely upon the means of conveyance. The Indians are good axe-men and capable bullock-cart drivers, so that there is no difficulty in respect of labour.

Cotton might prove an industry of the future; experiments that we have made prove that it will grow well, and experts have passed a good opinion upon the quality produced. On the western boundary of the Chaco I know that mineral oil exists, but I am not in a position to say to what extent, nor whether it would be possible to find it in other parts of the Chaco.

The grazing of cattle in lands like the Chaco tends to general improvement; by continual tramping they cause the land to become firmer; they keep down the rank grass, and in this way the grasses improve; the tracks that they make in going to and fro for water to their resting grounds and feeding places form in time shallow drains which tend to dry the country, thus making the working of the cattle more easy. The scrubby forests get gradually cleared, rank vegetation being kept down; insect plagues get less, and snakes tend to decrease. It is wonderful what a change settlement makes in country like the Chaco. On some of our stations life is quite pleasant now, although when we first established ourselves there we found the conditions almost intolerable.

Although the Chaco is not an interesting country with mountain ranges, unknown rivers of importance, navigable lakes, or giant waterfalls, and although no ancient ruins are to be found, it may have been of some little interest to you to hear even this much about a large South American province of which little is known even at the present date. I remember a reference being made to the Chaco in an English school book dated 1886, where it was confidently stated that the Chaco was a great sandy desert lying to the west of the river Paraguay; I think that from what you have heard this evening you will believe that something more has been discovered about the Chaco since that time.

Before the paper the PRESIDENT said: You will perhaps remember that to-night Colonel Tilho was to have read a paper; but unfortunately he is unable to be present. In his absence we are only too happy to welcome Mr. Barbrooke Grubb, who will deal with one of the remotest regions of the globe, one of the few regions which may be called almost unexplored, and about which I think I may safely say that nine-tenths of the people present know nothing whatsoever. To the west of the Paraguay River in South America there exists an enormous tract of country, some seven million square

miles in extent, into which hitherto few people have ever been able to penetrate. The difficulty has arisen mainly from the hostility of the Indians, who made it exceedingly dangerous to enter that country. The first pioneers, as has so often been the case, were the missionaries, and Mr. Barbrooke Grubb, who is to address us to-night, may claim to be the first amongst them. He has indeed been called the Livingstone of South America. I think he has very much to say that cannot fail to be of the highest interest. To us it must be a very great satisfaction, to say no more, that whilst in Europe during the last four or five years the civilizations of the West seem to have been tumbling about our ears, in South America the first seeds of civilization have been sown, and I think you will judge for yourselves from the address which you will hear to-night, that they have been sown with very great promise hereafter of coming to useful fruition. I will not anticipate what Mr. Grubb has to say, but I will now ask him to commence his paper.

Mr. W. Barbrooke Grubb then read the paper printed above, and a discussion followed.

The PRESIDENT: We are honoured to-night with the presence of His Excellency the Bolivian Minister, and I am sure you would like to give him a welcome.

H.E. the BOLIVIAN MINISTER: I feel greatly honoured by the kind words uttered by the President of this Society. I have listened with the utmost interest to the lecture given by Mr. Grubb, which in part referred to my country. I can fully appreciate the description of his explorations, shown in such a realistic manner, having been, in some ways, in similar situations when I had the privilege of discharging, some years ago, official missions on behalf of my country. Many years of my life have been spent in explorations of little-known parts of the Amazon valley, but I have not been in the Chaco region, so that what the President suggested applied to some nine-tenths of the audience must also be applied to myself. I thank Mr. Grubb for his most illustrative lecture, availing myself at the same time of the opportunity to express to this great Society, to which all the countries of the world are so deeply indebted, my own country's appreciation. I was appointed, fifteen years ago, Chief Commissioner for Bolivia in order to determine the source of the river Yavari, required for our territorial settlement with Brazil, for which purpose it was necessary to have a reliable and competent staff; and it was through the courteous and valuable assistance of the Royal Geographical Society of London that full success was achieved, thus contributing to the friendly settlement of an international debate between two sister nations. Entirely unprepared to make any remarks to-night, nevertheless I am glad to have been able to acknowledge, in these few words, the honour you have extended to me.

Sir MAURICE DE BUNSEN: I really have no right to speak about the Chaco, except that I have seen it although I have not set foot upon it. In the course of a very interesting tour I took last year through the kindness of the Government in appointing me head of a special Mission to South America, one of the Mission's journeys was from Buenos Aires to Asuncion, the capital of Paraguay. It is a wonderful thing that it is now possible to get into a railway carriage at Buenos Aires and not to leave it until you get to Asuncion. That has not been possible before, because in South America the railways have sought to go by the nearest route, to the sea or to one of the great rivers, to get to a port, and it is very difficult to make a great through line north and

south. The Parana river is wide ; it has to be crossed twice between Buenos Aires and Asuncion ; and it is only now possible to make this journey through the employment of train ferries. I found in Asuncion that Paraguay is now deeply interested in all that concerns the Chaco, and in the most interesting lecture we have heard from Mr. Barbrooke Grubb, for which I desire to thank him, we have learned a good deal that I am sure none of us knew before about the general state of affairs in the Chaco. But I will say this : that I found in Asuncion among the Paraguayan statesmen and people I met with that they had a very strong national feeling. Paraguay has no idea whatever of being swallowed up by the great countries, Argentine, Brazil and Bolivia, by which it is surrounded. They are proud of their independence and mean to maintain it, and they think they have a great future before them. I remember one of them making a comparison between his country and Uruguay ; he said : " We can do more and can produce more," and they speak with great confidence ; they have great belief in their country, and for its future development they look entirely to such immigration as they can get and to Indian labour. I think what we have heard this evening with regard to Indian labour, employed for the advancement of those regions and without the degradation of the Indians, is extremely encouraging. It is going to raise them to a higher level in the way that Mr. Barbrooke Grubb has so eloquently and so well explained. It is a very hopeful thing that he has put before us, that these Indians are rising in the scale, that they are improving and becoming more and more civilized, and that the Paraguayan Government, instead of allowing them to remain at the low level at which they were before, is doing its best to raise them up to a higher level and make them useful members of the community. The first thing needed, of course, is communications, and it is a wonderful thing that Bolivia, for instance, whose Minister we have just heard, has now three lines of railway from La Paz to the Pacific. But it is not yet connected by railway with the Argentine Republic ; you cannot get from La Paz to Buenos Aires, because there is still a gap of some 100 to 200 miles to be bridged. In the same way there is no direct connection with Brazil, although the frontiers run together for so many hundreds of miles, but there is now a Brazilian railway which goes to the actual borders of Bolivia, to the north of the Chaco country. Eventually no doubt there will be a great Bolivian railway which will meet it from the other side, and there are indications that gradually the country is being opened up. What we have heard is very enlightening, and we shall all be much more interested than we have been before in the advance made towards a higher stage of life by the inhabitants of the wonderful country that has been described to us. It is perhaps not a country that for many years will be one that we shall be disposed to live in, but it is more and more making itself useful to the world. It is producing cattle on a large scale, and if we can look forward to a time when a few more people with the influence and energy of Mr. Grubb penetrate into that country, it will be gradually brought into contact with the rest of the world, to the great advantage of the world as a whole, and especially its own inhabitants. I thank you very much, Mr. Grubb, for my own part, and I feel I may say on behalf of all present, for your most interesting and instructive lecture.

Mr. R. B. CUNNINGHAME GRAHAM : The lecture has been extraordinarily interesting to me. Before Mr. Barbrooke Grubb ever entered the Chaco I used to look across at its mysterious waves of swamp and palm woods from Asuncion, Paraguay, and wonder if it would ever give up its mysteries. I made at that time several trips from Corrientes through the Estero de Ñembucú

with cattle up to Asuncion. Almost all the way glimpses of the Chaco were visible, but it was quite unknown except to a few woodcutters and to a few scattered colonists who never ventured far into the interior. These were the colonists of whom the lecturer spoke, the forerunners of the cattle-farmers who, the lecturer told us, have in some instances already overstocked their lands and eaten off the grass. In this connection, as I spent most of 1917 in the Republic of Colombia, I would suggest that these lands in the Chaco might be re-sown with the perennial grasses, "Guinea," "Pará," and "Imperial," used in Colombia with such good effect. Before the establishment of Mr. Barbroke Grubb's mission near Miacho Negro, amongst the Lenguas, the interior of the Chaco was unknown in modern times. In the seventeenth century, the Jesuits had missions amongst the Lenguas, the Tobas and other tribes, and Father Dobrizhoffer has left a most interesting book on his experiences, and on the fauna and the flora of the land, called the 'History of the Abipones, an Equestrian Nation of Paraguay.' Father Lozano, in his 'Descripcion del Gran Chaco,' has also preserved interesting details of his life and of the nations amongst whom he worked, and incidentally a martyrology of many of his fellow-labourers on that most stony soil. Mr. Barbroke Grubb and his companions are their apostolic successors in the work of reclamation, conversion and preservation of these most interesting tribes, who without their efforts would have been delivered over to the civilizing agents of whisky, small-pox and syphilis, which have had such dire effects upon so many savage peoples in every portion of the world. What he has undergone in the past thirty years he has related in his great work upon the Chaco, 'An Unknown People in an Unknown Land'; what he has suffered mentally, alone and unprotected, far removed from civilization, in those reed-built villages, thatched with palm trees, can better be imagined than described. Men such as he deserve well of our race, for they uphold its name, unknown, unnoticed, and unaided, in many corners of the globe. His work on the spiritual side has been, one cannot but believe, of great benefit to the Indians with whom he lives, in freeing them from the superstitious terrors that afflict their lives. They fancied evil spirits surrounded man on every side, that the souls of the dead returned to plague him; that foul demons were always on the watch to pounce upon him. On the material side, Mr. Grubb and his fellows were mostly, as he himself says in his book, young men without knowledge of the world, called to stand *in loco parentis* to the Indians, with the victory over their own impulses and passions not achieved. He has done much. Cart roads run through what once were deadly swamps, and cattle feed where once they would have been killed instantly by jaguars and by the Indians. All that he could preserve, as native costume, dances and the like, he has preserved, thus showing unusual breadth of vision and of mind. To the world at large he has preserved, I hope, a primitive and interesting race, and to Paraguay, I trust, has given citizens who will be useful in the future in her vast vacant spaces in that swampy territory. That Chaco into which I never penetrated but a few miles, and even then in danger every yard, he says himself, where his own influence and that of his companions run, is now as safe as Paraguay itself. It seems a dream to me, who forty years ago used to observe the camp fires in the Chaco from the Paraguayan coast, and now and then to see a group of painted warriors sitting like statues on their horses upon a high bank on the river-side, watching the steamer pass. As they stood close together, with their long tufted lances in their hands, they seemed the incarnation of an older world, a world that Mr. Barbroke Grubb has done more than any other living man to keep for us and them, with its worst features softened and toned down, and its romantic aspects still preserved.

The PRESIDENT: After the impassioned eloquence of the gentleman who has just spoken I will ask the Secretary of the South American Mission to say a few words.

Rev. A. EWBANK: May I speak from the South American Continent point of view? Mr. Barbrooke Grubb and I are very grateful to this audience for the way in which they have listened to the exposition of a country that is very dear to the hearts of both of us. We are very grateful to the President of this Society; we know how much he has done; you all know the wonderful work that was done in saving two of the great Republics of South America from falling upon each other and cutting each other's throats. I refer to the dispute between Chile and the Argentine, when Sir Thomas Holdich, representing for a few short months Queen Victoria and then King Edward the Peacemaker, went out and delimited the frontier and saved a ghastly war between Chile and the Argentine.

But leaving that, and coming into the Paraguayan Chaco, I stand here as the only man present able to prove the words Mr. Grubb has uttered. My wife and I travelled six years ago right into the heart of this country without a gun in the party. We had with us one white man whom we looked upon as a protector, Wilfred Barbrooke Grubb. We had in the ordinary way what you would call a rough experience, but in another way the most enjoyable experience of the whole of our lives. As we lay down with the sky as our roof, and rolled ourselves in an Indian blanket and slept the sleep, I will not say of the just but certainly of the weary, we had no thought of anxiety except on account of mosquitoes; we were absolutely safe from the hand of man; and that in a country where, just a quarter of a century before at that particular spot, no white man had ever set foot and come back alive. A great and learned politician years ago said, "that where the missionary goes the gun-boat generally follows." May I modify that and say, that where the missionary goes the sextant follows; and this Society has been able to map some of the unknown parts of the world through the efforts of the solitary man who penetrates into the interior. Mr. Barbrooke Grubb did not tell you that when he made that first journey of his he went alone. For two and a half years he had no companion; and you want to be with him to see how he can get on with the Indians and speak their various dialects (and there are many in South America), to understand the way he makes friends with them. Having done that and made it possible for other white men to settle there and improve the country, at any rate, from the economic point of view and the spiritual, he added to the welfare not only of one part of South America, but, as you have just been vividly reminded, even of London itself, for to some extent London was dependent upon this region during the last few months of extreme stress for food. I am, therefore, very grateful to the President and members of this Society for allowing us to bring before you and emphasize the need of opening out this region in the right way, for the development of the welfare not only of the people themselves, but of the whole world at large.

Dr. J. W. EVANS: All those who have made acquaintance with the interior of South America must be grateful to Mr. Grubb for what he has done. When the Spaniards first came to South America it was, I understand, possible to pass in safety across the continent; the Indians had not then learnt to seek revenge against the European. It is Mr. Grubb's greatest triumph that he has to some extent been able to restore that happy state of things. There is, however, one question which occurred at once to me, as it must have to any one who has had experience of Indians in South America, and that is, how has

Mr. Grubb been able to deal with the question of drink? One of the first things that the Indians of Bolivia, which borders on the Paraguayan Chaco, learn, is to acquire a taste for the spirit which is manufactured from sugar-cane and a knowledge of the method of using a still to produce it. In many parts of Bolivia all the possibilities of the future development of the Indian have been destroyed by the advent of the art of distillation. How has this danger been met in the Paraguayan Chaco?

Sir Maurice de Bunsen has told us about the wonderful progress of the railways to the east of the Paraguay and expressed the hope that in a very short time we shall see them continue westward to the Andes. It is, I think, twenty-eight years ago since I was in Asuncion, and I remember speaking then to the British Consul there, and that he told me all the plans were ready for a railway from Corumbá to Santa Cruz de las Sierras, and he was only waiting for a message by cable for work to be commenced. Twenty-eight years have passed since then, the message has never come, and the railway has not been started. Things are terribly slow in South America, but progress comes at last, and I hope before long we shall have a railway through from one side of South America to the other, not only in the Argentine and Chile as at present, but further north through Brazil, Paraguay and Bolivia.

THE PRESIDENT: We have heard to-night a most interesting address on a very remote country and of a very peculiar and specially interesting people, by a gentleman who has made himself so much their friend that we could not have a better account of the psychology and idiosyncrasies of those people than the description of Mr. Barbrooke Grubb. I do not think I have ever heard a lecture in this hall which has given us more to think about. There were two points in the course of Mr. Grubb's address to which I should like to refer. One is to express my surprise that a Government so enlightened and so broad-minded as the Government of Paraguay should have missed the opportunity of making proper reservations for the Indians in the country of the Chaco. This is a matter no doubt which will receive their attention in the future. I hope soon that we shall be able to hear from Mr. Barbrooke Grubb, or from the American Missionary Society, that these reservations have actually been made, so that the influx of the undesirable alien population should not crowd out the natural inhabitants of the country. Perhaps I may remind Mr. Grubb—although I think from his pictures that he probably does not want the reminder—of another unfortunate influence which has tended greatly to the decrease of the native population in South America: the inconsiderate distribution of clothes amongst them. I was told by a lady missionary in South America, whom Mr. Grubb knows even better than I do, that the introduction of clothes among the tribes with whom she had dwelt for many years, the Onas, had induced certain diseases, mostly pulmonary, which had not been observed before, and which had been really more destructive than the whisky and other vices of undesirable whites.

Before asking you to join in thanking Mr. Barbrooke Grubb for his address, I have to give you some news which I think you will receive with regret. To-night is the last night that the Society will meet in this Theatre. The Office of Works propose to reconstruct the building for the use of the Civil Service Commission, and the Theatre as we know it will disappear altogether. It is not yet possible to say where the Society will meet next Session, but our homeless condition makes it all the more necessary that we should try and get a hall of our own. Meanwhile, we must return our best thanks to His Majesty's Office of Works for the hospitality they have shown us in allowing us to make use of this Theatre so long as they have.

I will now ask you to join in hearty thanks to Mr. Barbroke Grubb for his most interesting address.

MR. W. BARBROOKE GRUBB: I should like to answer a few questions. With reference to the drink question, we have used what influence we had with the local Governments to put a stop to this evil. The Argentine Government is quite well disposed towards the Indian peoples and is doing what it can to put a stop to the curse of drink among these people. The Paraguayan Government has made a bye-law by which any one who sells or gives drink to a Paraguayan Indian is liable to a fine of 100 dollars and imprisonment. The unfortunate thing, however, is that you require two witnesses to each case, which is very difficult. As I said in my lecture, the Paraguayan Government have authorized us on certain conditions to admit to full citizens' rights any Indian whom we approve as worthy, and so when we have more citizens we shall be able to call upon the citizens to support this law. I remember on one occasion an official met a man going up the river with a boat full of rum, and he confiscated the whole cargo. The man went to Asuncion and made a complaint to the head of the Custom House, who asked him into his inside office. He said, "Will you kindly make out a full list of your damages," and the man made out a full list and put down as big a number as he thought the head of the Custom House would swallow. But the head of the Custom House said, "This is more serious than I thought; you have not only broken the law, but you have broken it so flagrantly that I must put a heavy fine on you." That did a good deal of good. The Indians themselves know how to make many drinks, including twelve different kinds of beer, without any civilized teaching. But we have established municipal law and have appealed to their common sense and brought a good deal of persuasion to bear; and when these people have got to like you and you have influence over them you can do almost anything you like with them. So the result is that nowhere within the direct Mission influence is any drink allowed; I have never seen in the settlement of Makthlawaiya for the last twenty-five years a man intoxicated; it is now against native law. They realize the evil of it. There is one great thing in their favour. No Chaco Indian woman ever drinks. That is more than you can say for this country. It is a native law. And no Chaco boy is ever allowed to drink; he must first become a man. They are not accustomed to taking a little refreshment. When they drink it is in order to get drunk; they would not take the trouble to take a little spirit from anybody. They say, "If that is all you can give us, we will have none." Though that may seem bad it is good, for after all to get thoroughly drunk occasionally does not do a man half so much harm as continually taking a little refreshment. Of course it is more difficult for them now to get thoroughly drunk, but as the settlements increase more dangers of this description will arise and we must meet them to the best of our ability.

The Chairman raised a question as to clothes. We have a native law discouraging European clothing, but of course we have difficulties to overcome. These Indians get work on the American and other settlements, and they are only too lavish with their gifts and give away shirts and trousers. It is mistaken kindness, but you can hardly blame those boys for putting them on. However, we try to stop it as much as we can. In fact, we have a rule that no native can attend a ceremony at the Mission except in native dress, which is respected among the people as the proper dress; it is quite respectable, and the women still keep to the native costume. It is a great mistake for people to turn up their eyes in pious horror and think people are not well dressed. I never see

anything wrong in the native dress ; they have a taste for colour ; everything they wear seems to blend with their surroundings.

I thank you very much indeed for your patience in listening to me. I hope I have recommended to the best of my ability my country of the Paraguayan Chaco.

HONDIUS AND HIS NEWLY-FOUND MAP OF 1608

THE Hondius map of 1608, on Mercator's projection, the acquisition of which by the Society was announced in the August number, is one more monument of Dutch cartographical work in the late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries, examples of which have been gradually accumulating of late years. It is no cause for surprise that so many of these fine maps should have long remained unknown, if we think of the vicissitudes to which works of such size must have been subject since their first production, and the obvious difficulties in the way of their safe preservation. It may be hoped that the widespread interest now aroused in such treasures may lead to the unearthing of still others of these masterpieces, in the making of which Holland played so notable a part, and that many obscure points in the cartographic history of the period may so in due time be elucidated.

The present Hondius map takes an honourable place in the series of great wall-maps inaugurated by Waldseemüller's of 1507, and continued in still finer style by Mercator's of 1569 and Peter Plancius's of 1592. It is the second production of the kind by the same firm to be brought to light within the past twenty years, the other being the hemisphere-map discovered by Father Joseph Fischer at Wolfegg Castle in Württemberg, and reproduced in 1907 under the joint auspices of the American Geographical Society and the Hispanic Society of America. The editors, Professors E. L. Stevenson and Joseph Fischer, consider it to have been originally brought out in 1611. The very existence of the 1608 map seems hitherto to have been unsuspected by writers on such matters, and its discovery—if we may use the term—gives valuable help towards a due appreciation of the work of Mercator's worthy successor—Jodocus Hondius the elder. Next to Mercator's map of 1569 it is the first map of equal importance that is known to us, constructed on the Mercator projection, and the directions given upon it for such construction are of particular interest in view of the still somewhat obscure early history of that projection. To this we will return later. As a splendid specimen of engraving and pictorial embellishment the present map takes high rank in the series, and its excellent preservation permits a better appreciation of its merits in these respects than was possible with Blaeu's map of 1605 (also reproduced by the Hispanic Society of America, the possessor of the one known copy ; see *Journal*, vol. 46, p. 61), which has suffered far