

The Classical Review

<http://journals.cambridge.org/CAR>

Additional services for *The Classical Review*:

Email alerts: [Click here](#)

Subscriptions: [Click here](#)

Commercial reprints: [Click here](#)

Terms of use : [Click here](#)



On a Saying of Gorgias

T. G. Tucker

The Classical Review / Volume 14 / Issue 05 / June 2009, pp 247 - 247

DOI: 10.1017/S0009840X00082652, Published online: 27 October 2009

Link to this article: http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract_S0009840X00082652

How to cite this article:

T. G. Tucker (2009). On a Saying of Gorgias. The Classical Review, 14, pp 247-247

doi:10.1017/S0009840X00082652

Request Permissions : [Click here](#)

ON A SAYING OF GORGIAS.

In Thompson's Appendix to his edition of Plato's *Gorgias* there is a discussion of a saying of that sophist to the effect that his longevity was due to his temperate life. The words quoted from Plutarch (*de Gloria Athen.* 5) are as follows:—

ἐπεὶ τις αὐτὸν ἤρετο τίμη διαίτη χρώμενος οὕτως ἐμμελῶς καὶ μετὰ αἰσθήσεως τοσοῦτον χρόνον ζήσειεν, Οὐδὲν πώποτε, εἶπεν, ἡδονῆς ἐνεκεν πράξας. Δημήτριος δὲ ὁ Βυζάντιος ἐν τετάρτῳ περὶ ποιημάτων 'Γοργίας, φησὶν, ὁ Λεοντίνος ἐρωτηθεὶς τί αὐτῷ γέγονεν αἴτιον τοῦ βιώσαι πλείω τῶν ἑκατὸν ἐτῶν, ἔφη, τὸ μηδὲν πώποτε ἑτέρου ἐνεκεν πεποιηκέναι.'

Lucian in his *Macrobioi* (23) makes him give as the reason διὰ τὸ μηδέποτε συμπερινεχθῆναι ταῖς ἄλλων εὐχαίαις, an expression in which εὐχαίαις recalls the ἡδονῆς in the first answer recorded by Plutarch. But what is ἕτερον in the second answer? Gorgias certainly cannot have said that he had never done anything 'for the sake of another.' If, again, we choose to make ἕτερον ἐνεκεν mean 'for the sake of anything else (than living to be old),' we assign to Gorgias a peculiarly unworthy rule of life. Nor could ἕτερον alone well yield such a sense. Moreover the three phrases ought to

amount to the same in meaning. The saying of Gorgias was evidently well known, for Thompson further quotes Stobaeus for the same answer in a fourth form, viz. οὐδὲν οὐδέποτε, ἔφη, πρὸς ἡδονὴν οὔτε φαγὼν οὔτε δράσας.

The four passages together make it certain that Gorgias spoke of 'never doing anything for (mere) pleasure,' and that the pleasure in question was pleasure of eating (as reported by Lucian and Stobaeus) and other sensual acts (πράξας, πεποιηκέναι, δράσας). The probabilities are that his saying was put in vigorous epigrammatic language. Meineke was on the right scent when for ἕτερον he suggested ἐντέρον. Zeller quotes a conjecture to the same effect, γαστέρος. But ἐντέρον cannot be rendered *der sinnlichen Lust*, and γαστέρος is, of course, too far from ἕτερον. The actual word, I believe, was ἡτρου, which is the proper term for the lower part of the trunk. The satisfaction of this part of the body would include that of *all* the sensual appetites, and hence the word was carefully chosen by Gorgias as the completest way of stating the case. 'By never doing anything for the pleasure of the body below the belt.'

T. G. TUCKER.

ON THE OPTATIVE AND THE GRAPHIC CONSTRUCTION IN GREEK SUBORDINATE CLAUSES.

THE following paper attempts to show that in certain cases the Optative and Graphic constructions are not regularly employed in subordinate clauses with ὅτι or ὥς, or in 'dependent questions,' after a past tense: that in their place we find the imperfect or pluperfect indicative.

These cases are: (A) when the clause depends on a non-personal phrase, or is itself subject to the principal verb. To this rule there are only four exceptions—all in Xenophon; (B) when the clause depends on a personal phrase which is negatived. To this there are five exceptions which admit of special justification.

I have searched through the following authors and works for my instances:—Thucydides, Demosthenes (exclusive of the spurious writings), Lysias (Shuckburgh),

and the Epitaphios, Andokides (Marchant), Xenophon's *Anabasis*, *Hellenica*, *Memorabilia*, *Cyropaedia*, *Agésilas*, *Symposium*, *Hiero*, *Respublica Lacedaemoniorum et Atheniensium*, *Apologia Socratis*, *Oeconomicus*, *De Vectigalibus*, *De Re Equestri*, *De Venatione*, *De Officio Magistri Equitum*, *Jebb's Attic Orators*, *Plato's Protagoras*, *Aristotle's Poetics XI*, and *Herodotus*.

Goodwin (M. and T. § 674. 1.) quotes II. 13. 674,

οὐδέ τι ἦδη ὅττι δηϊώοντο λαοί,

and remarks in a parenthesis, 'Here the present optative or indicative would be regular in Attic Greek.' Madvig (*Greek Syntax* p. 109 § 130b) perhaps goes a step further when he says, 'where in the oratio recta the present indicative would stand,