Church and Organ Music. Some Early Anglican Pointing

Author(s): Harvey Grace

Source: *The Musical Times*, Vol. 56, No. 874 (Dec. 1, 1915), pp. 726-730

Published by: [Musical Times Publications Ltd.](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/909340>

Accessed: 10-03-2015 00:50 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Musical Times Publications Ltd. is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Musical Times*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

that for modern music the disadvantages would outweigh the advantages, to say nothing of the opposition of the players, accustomed as they are to the freedom of the unfretted fingerboard.

There are a few misprints in the book which might be amended when the second edition of this valuable work is called for. Thus, on page 54, Ex. (e) should be in demisemiquavers. Page 128, last line, the page number referred to is omitted; it should be 149. Page 250, Ex. 10 requires amending, and there is a misprinted D for A in the bass, at the bottom of page 343.

The musical Appendix contains twenty-two pieces by Gibbons, Couperin, Dandrieu, J. S. Bach, C. Ph. E. Bach, several pieces translated from cylinders, and some Adagios, with their proper ornamentation, by Corelli and Quantz. There is also an explanatory introduction to the Appendix. A March, which Bach wrote for his wife Anna Magdalena, shows remarkable divergence from the written notes in the 'Interpretation' thereof. Three short pieces are quoted from 'La Tonotechnie,' by Le Père Engramelle, Paris, 1775. They are prepared for pricking on the cylinder of a mechanical bird organ, and the ornamentation indicated has a strangely familiar sound to us from our recollection of the Devonshire village church barrel-organ alluded to above. The third Prelude by Couperin is misprinted as 'Quatrième Prelude.' It is exceedingly troublesome to play, especially in its opening bars, which have to be interpreted very differently from what the written notes seem to imply. In the long Romance by Claude Balbastre (from Dom Bedos), while the bass moves perpetually in arpeggio quaver triplets, the treble has examples of *tempo rubato* in almost every bar: not in the notation, but in the pricking of the cylinder. It is very interesting, as it shows how men actually played in those days. What affectation we should think it if we heard a performer alter the majority of the written notes as to their time and position in the bar! In those days performers were expected to show their individuality by these and other means. It was complained of Sebastian Bach that he deprived them of this privilege by writing out too many of his ornaments. A barrel-organ cannot show individuality of its own, but that of the person who pricks its cylinders. Such a means of expression would soon pall when repeatedly heard on a machine, while with an individual, the greater his artistic gifts the less is he able to play any given piece twice alike.

The two slow movements from Corelli's sixth Sonata show the florid additions given to the text by the composer himself when playing. They are derived from an edition published contemporaneously at Amsterdam. A quotation of one bar will indicate how the performer was expected to show his individuality by varying the written notes:

to be played thus:

We are glad to note that the London Choral Society will resume public operations by giving a concert at the Queen's Hall on the afternoon of Saturday, December 18. The programme will be miscellaneous. Mr. Arthur Fagge will conduct as usual.

Church and Organ Music.

SOME EARLY ANGLICAN POINTING.

BY HARVEY GRACE.

The credit for the first Anglican Psalter must go to Robert Janes, organist of Ely Cathedral from 1830 to 1866, and composer of that mellifluous expression of contrition, the 'Ely Confession.' Here is the full title of his work, which appeared in 1837:

THE PSALTER

or

PSALMS OF DAVID.

Carefully Marked and Pointed,

to enable the Voices of a Choir to keep exactly together, by singing the same Syllable to the same Note;

and,

the accents as far as possible made to agree with the accents in the Chant;

and also

to remove the difficulty which individuals generally find who are not accustomed to the Chanting of the Psalms.

There was no preface, the only guide to the use of the psalter being the first verse of 'Venite, exultemus Domino,' set to a double chant, with the rest of the psalm pointed below. The chant was by Janes himself, and is worth quoting as perhaps the baldest ever written, consisting as it does of tonic and dominant chords only. The tenor is an inversion of the treble, but this trifling display of cunning is dearly bought by the resultant harmonic poverty. (Janes's chant is reproduced on the opposite page.)

The unhappy alto condemned to harp thus on the sacred note G throughout may well have sighed for the melodic delights of plainsong. But although Janes his psalter was the first complete work to appear, a 'feeler' had been put out thirty years before by John Beckwith, of Norwich. His book being little known, and somewhat of a curiosity, a short account of it may be of interest.

Beckwith seems to have been the most eminent of a large family of church musicians. (No less than seven appear in Bumpus's 'History of Cathedral Music.') He had a great reputation for extemporisation, and in the course of his duties at Norwich Cathedral and at St. Peter Mancroft, would frequently improvise four fugues on a Sunday! In a description of his playing quoted by Bumpus we read that:

'... his playing was brilliancy itself. A friend or a pupil would take the melody of some fugue subject to St. Peter's church on a Sunday afternoon, put it into the Doctor's hand during the sermon, and request him to introduce it into the voluntary playing the people out of church. The Doctor would ponder over it for a few minutes, take an enormous pinch of snuff, and then say that he would see what he could do with it. When he had given out the subject and replied to it in the regular way, he would treat it, if possible, by inversion, reversion, augmentation and diminution, carrying it through a course of modulation till he came to the *knot*, when he would bring the replies in closer and closer, until his hearers were in raptures of delight.'

He seems to have been an excellent teacher of singing, and, according to Zechariah Buck, his pupil and successor, almost as good a painter as musician.

TREBLE.

O come, &c., to the Lord : let us, &c., strength of our sal - vation. Let us, &c., with thanks-giving, and, &c., glad in Him with psalms.

ALTO.

O come, &c., to the Lord : let us, &c., strength of our sal - vation. Let us, &c., with thanks-giving, and, &c., glad in Him with psalms.

TENOR.

By inversion.
O come, &c., to the Lord : let us, &c., strength of our sal - vation. Let us, &c., with thanks-giving, and, &c., glad in Him with psalms.

BASS.

O come, &c., to the Lord : let us, &c., strength of our sal - vation. Let us, &c., with thanks-giving, and, &c., glad in Him with psalms.

ORGAN.

His book is entitled :

THE FIRST VERSE OF EVERY
PSALM OF DAVID.

With an ancient or modern Chant in score,
Adapted as much as possible to the sentiment of
EACH PSALM.

BY

J. BECKWITH, MUS. DOC. OXON.

Organist of the Cathedral and St. Peter's Mancroft Church, Norwich.

It was published by subscription at the price of one guinea.

I quote the opening paragraph with its delightful reference to the Churches of Norwich and England :

'The work which I now present to my subscribers was conceived full fifteen years since, and was begun (as far as the ninth day of the month) about ten years ago, during a week's visit to Cromer for sea-bathing : at that time I had no idea of printing but of confining the compilation to the use of the church of Norwich : it afterwards occurred to me that the undertaking might be not less useful to the church of England, and also be a means of perpetuating those beautiful little compositions called chants.'

He then proceeds to respond to the demand of some subscribers that he should add 'a short history of chanting.' In this he seems to regard the earliest of 'those beautiful little compositions called chants' as a new and independent form, apparently not aware that they were merely harmonizations of the plain-song tones. (There are at times searchings of heart as to whether the first syllable of the word 'plain-song' is 'plane' or 'plain.' Beckwith has it 'plein.') Apropos the introduction of the organ, he says, 'It took place in or about the year 666 : dreadful æra ! dreadful number !' The reader naturally wonders what there was 'dreadful' about the 'æra.' An amusing note makes it clear :

'Revelation, chap. xiii., ver. 18.* Some centuries after the introduction of the organ many learned fanatics and others who had an

* 'Here is wisdom. Let him that hath understanding count the number of the beast : for it is the number of a man ; and his number is Six hundred three-score and six.'

antipathy to music in divine worship, and particularly to organs, laboured hard to strain and torture this text to their purpose, insisting that the organ was the Beast.'

We organists are accustomed to hearing our instrument miscalled, but not so sweepingly as this. Beckwith, however, being an organ-lover, and evidently caring much less for the Church of Rome than for the rival establishments of Norwich and England, quickly shifts the burden on to the right shoulders. The note goes on :

'It is, however, admitted that the number of the Beast alludes to the title the Popes have severally given themselves, *Vicarius Filii Dei*, the numerical letters of which title make the exact number of 666.'

Could he revisit the glimpses of the moon, the Doctor would be surprised to find how many public characters have been identified with the Beast in this easy manner.

The most significant passage in the preface is one wherein we have the first hint of a psalter pointed throughout for chanting. It seems hard to realise that until the Janes book appeared seventy-eight years ago methods of pointing were a mixture of haphazard and tradition. Says Beckwith :

'The ingenious Mr. Marsh, of Chichester, suggests an improvement to *choirs* which *congregations* might adopt by borrowing one of their prayer-books. As it is of great importance, I will only mention it, but beg leave to recommend it strongly. Suppose the organist and choir were to meet every morning and afternoon for one month, and agree on the proper place in each verse of the Psalms, where the reciting should end in both the first and last parts of the chant, and under that particular word or syllable place a conspicuous *red* mark : if one book were thus carefully marked, the others might be rendered similar to it. The benefit would be, all the members of the choir might recite as one person, and all come together to that word which they are previously sure is the most proper to end the recital.'

(This 'ingenious Mr. Marsh' was John of that ilk, evidently a man of parts, for Grove tells us that he was 'a distinguished amateur composer and performer, articled to a solicitor at Romsey in 1768, resided at Salisbury (1776-81), Canterbury (1781-86), and

Chichester (1787-1828), in each of which places he led the band at the subscription concerts, and occasionally officiated for the Cathedral and Church organists.' He was a prolific composer of anthems, services, chants, psalm-tunes, glees, songs, symphonies, overtures, quartets, &c., organ and pianoforte music, writing also treatises on harmony, thoroughbass, &c. He died in 1828. Those of us who are disposed to be industrious may feel discouraged on reflecting that this busy enthusiast is now remembered, if at all, solely for this hint as to a pointed psalter,—a hint that required nearly forty years to come to full fruition.

Leaving the preface, and passing by the list of subscribers, who ranged from The Most Rev. His Grace the Lord Archbishop of Canterbury, *viâ* the Right Honourable Lady Foley, Whitley Court, Worcestershire, to one Mr. Plummer *tout court* (I am cold as to his Grace and her Ladyship, but should like to know more about Plummer. Had he appeared as John Plummer, Esquire, Sudbury, I should have passed his name by. But being just plain Mr. Plummer, apparently of no fixed abode,

presumably enthusiastic about the Psalms of David, and paying his guinea like a man, he excites sympathetic curiosity), we come to the chants and specimen verses. At once we are puzzled. Beckwith, we have seen, was an excellent all-round musician and a man of education. This being so, we expect the pointing to pay some respect to the verbal accent. The first psalm gives us a shock :

Psalm I.

Blessed, &c., way of sinners: And hath, &c., seat of . . the scorn-ful.

'Thus bad begins, but worse remains behind,' as this for example :

Exceeding, &c., be . . of thy sal - va - tion.

Let us range a few verses under a lofty strain by the Rev. Mr. Millard, who really should have known better :

Let, &c., . . . thy pre - sence
Lay, &c., . . . and buck - ler
My heart, &c., . . . good mat - ter
O hear ye this all . . ye peo - ple
The Lord is King, &c., im - pa - tient

Consider . . . my me - dita - tion.
And, &c., . . . thing that is e - qual.
And . . . stand up to help me.
And, &c., . . . me and heard my call - ing.
A very pre - sent help in trou - ble.
Ponder it, &c., that dwell in the world.
Heal, &c., there - of for it sha - keth.
He sitteth, &c., never so un - qui - et.

At first sight these look like printers' errors of a particularly high order, but an examination of the book reveals the fact that the Doctor has, with hardly an exception, based his pointing on the plan of one syllable one note, with painful results when a half-verse ends with a weak syllable—*e.g.* :

The printer, by the way, has done some wild things in the book, and may be responsible for the harsh diminished triad in bar 5 of the Reverend Mr. Millard's chant. Let us hope the composer wrote B7 for the tenor. But the printer can hardly be blamed for this :

where the parts are written as above in the organ score, as if to flaunt their fifteenth.

We are accustomed to 'thematic coincidences' in chants. The following (ascribed to Wm. Hayes) compared with the well-known chant by Troyte set to 'The strain upraise' gives us a fine and large specimen :

Here is a striking quarter from a double chant by Abel :

In the preface we are told that 'the melody and harmony of the perfect chant should be solemn and impressive ; not trite, but elevating.' Accordingly, the compiler arranges that on the twenty-first morning we shall be solemn and impressive on this wise :

while such elevating strains as :

are fairly common.

On the whole, those of us who are dissatisfied with Anglican chants and chanting in 1915 may feel something like content on seeing what passed muster in 1808 and for long after. I have mentioned that the printer had rather a field day when at work on this volume. The Doctor was evidently too busy to keep an eye on him, since he tells us that he had 'an almost daily occupation of thirteen or fourteen hours in the most slavish parts of the profession, with some unavoidable employments beside.' Hence his failure to prevent the compositor from excelling himself when dealing with Psalm 88. I quote the opening :

With which apostrophe we may fitly close the volume.

M. JOSEPH JONGEN'S ORGAN RECITAL AT MANCHESTER.

This distinguished Belgian musician gave a recital at the Manchester Town Hall on November 16. An unhackneyed and interesting programme included a prelude by Clerambault (an early 18th century composer); a Rondeau by Couperin; Franck's Prelude, Fugue, and Variation, and Pièce Heroïque; three movements from Widor's second Symphony; Bach's D minor Toccata and Fugue; and 'Pensée d'Automne,' an effective composition of his own, played for the first time. Future players at this series of recitals are Dr. Perkins, Mr. Ellingford, and Sir Walter Parratt.

UNIVERSITY OF LONDON MEMORIAL SERVICES.

On Monday afternoon, November 1 (All Saints' Day) a memorial service was held at the Temple Church for those members of the University of London who have fallen in the War. Two episcopal graduates of the University were present (Bishop Hine, M.D., and the Bishop of Kingston). After the proper psalms, the anthem 'God created man for incorruption,' by Dr. Walford Davies, was sung by the choir, and the Bishop of Kingston gave an address. After the blessing had been pronounced by the Bishop of London, the 'Last Post' was played by buglers of the Irish Guards, followed by the National Anthem. On the following day, at noon, there was a memorial celebration in the chapel of the King's College, Strand, when Bishop Hine officiated. Prior to the service a selection of music was played on the organ by Dr. Charles W. Pearce, Director of Examinations at Trinity College. The music of the service was sung entirely in plain-chant by a choir of men under the direction of Mr. Francis Burgess, professor of plain-song at Trinity College, who also was responsible for the organ accompaniments. At the conclusion of the service, the King Edward Professor of Music, Sir Frederick Bridge, played the Funeral Music of Henry Purcell.

We have received a batch of service lists of Broad Street Presbyterian Church, Columbus, Ohio, and note with interest the prominent part borne by organ music, not only by way of 'playing the people out,' but as voluntaries before the service and at the offertory. The pieces are generally well chosen, amongst those in the lists before us being Bonnet's 'Lied der Chrysanthemes,' Hollins's 'Finale,' Bach's Air from Suite, and the six Organ concertos of Handel. Mr. Bert E. Williams is the organist.

In our last issue we announced the intention of Mr. A. J. Heard Norrish to return from Pietermaritzburg (Natal) to England. We much regret, and with deep sympathy we have now to record, the death of his young wife from blood poisoning, while on the voyage home. She was buried at sea. A very sad home-coming for Mr. Norrish and his two young children.

ORGAN RECITALS.

- Mr. F. A. Mouré, at Toronto University (two recitals)—Symphony No. 8, *Widor*; Choral Song and Fugue, *Wesley*; Suite in D, *Foote*; Arabesque, *Debussy*; Pastorale, *De la Tombelle*.
- Mr. George Rathbone, at St. Mary's, Windermere—Sonata No. 1, *Mendelssohn*; Intermezzo, *Hollins*; at Ulverstone Parish Church—Choral Song and Fugue, *Wesley*.
- Mr. Albert Orton, at Walton Parish Church—Toccata in F, *Bach*.
- Mr. James M. Preston, at St. George's, Jesmond, Newcastle—Sonata No. 4, *Alan Gray*; Toccata di Concerto, *Lemare*.
- Mr. A. M. Flack, at Holy Innocents', Hornsey—Marche Triomphale, *Lemmens*.
- Dr. Alan Gray, at Trinity College, Cambridge (two recitals)—Marche Funèbre and Arabesque, *Louis Vierne*; Epilogue, *Harvey Grace*; 'Carillon,' *Elgar*.
- Mr. Frederic Fertel, at Bromley Parish Church—Sonata No. 2, *Borowski*.
- Mr. Allan Brown, at Battersea Polytechnic (two recitals)—Triumphal March, *Hollins*; Finale (Symphony in E minor), *F. W. Holloway*; at Wesleyan Central Hall, Tooting—Phantasy on National Anthems of the Allies, *C. W. Pearce*.
- Mr. H. C. Tonking, at Royal Albert Hall—Fugue in E, *W. T. Best*.
- Mr. Edgar T. Cook, at Southwark Cathedral (two recitals)—Symphony No. 6, *Widor*; Magnificat, *Liszt*; Legend, *Harvey Grace*.
- Mr. Paul Rochard, at St. Paul's, Hinckley (two recitals)—March on a theme of Handel, *Guilmant*; March in G minor, *Elgar*.
- Mr. C. Blyton Dobson, at Central Mission, Nottingham (four recitals)—Voluntary in G, *Worgan*; Postlude in C, *Stuart Archer*; Passacaglia, *Bach*; Fugue in D, *Guilmant*.
- Mr. J. A. Meale, at Central Hall, Westminster (three recitals)—Symphony No. 5, *Widor*; Symphony in E minor, *F. W. Holloway*; Grand Chœur, *Guilmant*.
- Mr. F. E. Wilson, at St. Michael and All Angels', Manor Park—Overture in C, *Hollins*; Allegro Cantabile, *Widor*.
- Mr. J. T. Pye, at St. Luke's, Grimsby—Rhapsody, *Harvey Grace*.
- Mr. Hugh Ware, at Beddington Parish Church—'The Pilgrim's Progress' (Parts v., vi., vii., viii.), *Ernest Austin*.
- Mr. H. Newbould, at Wesley Church, Pretoria—Sonata da Camera, No. 3, *Peace*; March on a theme of Handel, *Guilmant*.
- Mr. Fred. Gostelow, at St. Magnus-the-Martyr, London Bridge—Imperial March, *Elgar*; Finale, Sonata, in D minor, *Guilmant*. At Battersea Polytechnic—Overture in E flat, *Faulkes*; Toccata and Fugue in D minor, *Bach*.
- Mr. Herbert Hodge, at St. Nicholas Cole Abbey (five recitals)—Sonata in D flat, *Rheinberger*; Suite Gothique, *Boëllmann*; Postlude in E flat, *Smart*; Air with variations, *Best*; Fugue in D, *Guilmant*. At St. Magnus-the-Martyr, London Bridge—Tragic Overture, *Brahms*; Toccata, *De la Tombelle*.

- Mr. J. Matthews, at St. Stephen's, Guernsey—Concert Rondo, *Hollins*; Basso ostinato, *Arensky*.
 Mr. Louis H. Torr, at Holy Trinity, Swansea—Fantasia in F minor, *Mozart*; Chanson d'été, *Lemare*.
 Mr. J. C. Dunlop, at St. Michael and All Angels', Northampton—Phantasy on National Anthems of the Allies, *C. W. Pearce*.
 Mr. George Tootell, at St. Thomas's, St. Anne's-on-Sea—Toccata and Fugue in C, *Bach*; Allegro Cantabile and Toccata (Symphony No. 5), *Widor*.
 Mr. Herbert Pierce, at Union Chapel, Highbury (two recitals)—Impromptu, *Coleridge-Taylor*; Intermezzo, *Hollins*.
 Mr. G. H. Cole, at Cardiff Parish Church—Dithyramb, *Harwood*; Sonata No. 1, *Guilmant*.
 Mr. James Tomlinson, at Public Hall, Preston—Minuet and Canzona, *Wolstenholme*; 'The Swan,' *Saint-Saëns*.
 Mr. Cyril S. Christopher, at Netherton Wesleyan Church (two recitals)—Finale (Organ sonata), *Elgar*; Suite Gothique, *Boëllmann*.
 Mr. T. W. North, at Netherton Wesleyan Church (two recitals)—Variations on 'Hanover,' *Lemare*; Fantasia and Fugue, *Liszt*.
 Mr. J. Gray, at Adam Smith Hall, Kirkcaldy (two recitals)—Sonata in C minor, *Guilmant*; Scherzo in E, *Gigout*.
 Mr. J. R. Buffel, at St. Jude's, Liverpool—Programme of works by *Basil Harwood*.
 Mr. W. G. Parkyn, at Upper Holloway Baptist Church Institute (two recitals)—Fantasia and Fugue in A minor, *Bach*; Intermezzo, *Hollins*.
 Mr. Norman Collie, at St. Luke's, Tunbridge Wells (four recitals)—Pastorale, *César Franck*; Fantasy-Overture, *Goss-Custard*; Sonata No. 1, *Guilmant*; Toccatas in D minor and F, *Bach*.
 Mr. F. J. Buckle, at St. Paul's, Herne Hill, Grand Chœur, *Guilmant*.
 Mr. Alec Rowley, at St. Paul's, Herne Hill—Marche de Fête, *Büsser*.

APPOINTMENTS.

- Mr. Albert E. Pett, organist, West Green Baptist Church.
 Mr. Owen Charles Randall, organist, St. James's, St. Helier, Jersey.

Reviews.

Good King Wenceslas. Old carol. Arranged with varied harmonies by W. G. Ross. (Novello's Short Anthems, No. 227.)

[Novello & Co., Ltd.]

This famous old carol is such a standing dish, that most choirs will be glad to find it served up in a new guise. Mr. Ross, in laying it out for treble and tenor solo, chorus, and a well-written organ part, has done this very effectively. The harmonization is ingenious, though one or two of the augmented triads are perhaps somewhat too spicy to be quite in keeping.

Little People. Rhymes by R. H. Elkin. Illustrations by H. Willebeck Le Mair.

[Augener, Ltd.]

This fascinating book consists of short poems such as children would care to have read to them or to learn, and the droll and beautiful illustrations aptly point the moral of the subjects of the words. There is no music. We may regret this, but all the same we feel that Miss Le Mair's exquisite art provides such a feast for the eye and the mind that even music could not add to the charm.

Prelude in G. By Henry Purcell.

The King's Hunt. By John Bull.

[Novello & Co., Ltd.]

The Purcell Prelude is extracted from an 'Album of Ten Pieces,' edited by Messrs. Norman P. and W. H. Cummings. It makes a capital study in rapid two-part playing, and is a bright piece of music.

Dr. John Bull's naive descriptive variations are edited by Prof. Granville Bantock. This version is taken from an album of pieces by the old virginal composer.

BOOKS RECEIVED.

- The Celestial Aftermath: A Springtime of the heart and Far-away songs*. By Cyril Scott. Pp. 68. Price 5s. net. (London: Chatto & Windus.)
Songs with Music: From a Child's Garden of Verses. By R. L. Stevenson. Illustrated by Margaret W. Tarrant. Pp. 55. Price 2s. 6d. net. (Edinburgh: Messrs. Jack.)
Samuel Coleridge-Taylor, Musician: His Life and Letters. By W. C. Berwick Sayers. Pp. 328. Price 7s. 6d. net. (London: Cassell & Co., Ltd.)
The making of a modern Pianoforte. By Horace Woollard. Pp. 51. Price 1s. 6d. net. (London: John Bale Sons, & Danielsson, Ltd.)
The Jolly Duchess: Harriot Mellon, afterwards Mrs. Coutts and the Duchess of St. Albans. A sixty years' gossiping record of Stage and Society (1777 to 1837). By Charles E. Pearce. Price 16s. net. (Stanley Paul.)
Some Musicians of Former Days; Musicians of To-day. By Romain Rolland. Translated by Mary Blaiklock. Price 2s. 6d. each net. (London: Kegan Paul.) [We hope to say more about these valuable essays in criticism later on. Meantime we record our opinion that they are two of the most informing books on musical development that we have ever read.]

Correspondence.

'ENGLISH FOLK-SONG AND DANCE.'

TO THE EDITOR OF 'THE MUSICAL TIMES.'

SIR,—The review of the above work which appeared in last month's *Musical Times* calls, I think, for some little defence on behalf of the authors, who, however, make no claim to be excluded from legitimate criticism. The writer of the review, Mr. E. Phillips Barker, no doubt has his own theory how such a book should be written, and he devotes two and a-quarter columns of close print in telling his views. He frankly confesses his own disappointment with the book.

When this disappointment is analysed it chiefly resolves itself (so far as the portion of the book written by myself is concerned) into a regret that the work is not a full treatise on a large and complex subject. Such a full work is within, or outside, the limits of my ability, but the professed scope of the handbook precludes anything more than a slight entrance into the fringe of the subject. For example, the reviewer complains that the Modes are not fully dealt with, and that 'a score of questions which beset the beginner remain unanswered.' No doubt. There are many questions regarding the Modes which puzzle more than a beginner, but which would require a full volume to elucidate! It appears also that 'the part of the essay which deals with the classes of folk-song is, for the most part, a catalogue of subjects and songs from which little is to be gathered on the quality of folk-poetry.' There is a good deal to be gathered from the examples and references I give.

Then, again, 'a fuller treatment of the narrative ballad, the chanty, and the carol would have been desirable.' Quite so; but even Mr. Barker cannot put the contents of a gallon jar into a pint bottle! If I am to deal so very fully with the narrative ballad, the chanty, the carol; furnish an answer to all the questions which would beset a beginner in regard to the Modes; deal fully with the origin of folk-song (this Mr. Barker gravely tells us 'requires very careful handling'); also if Miss Neal is equally to elaborate her portion, our labours might extend through a whole series of the Cambridge Press handbooks. These booklets do not profess to do more than give an elementary insight into the subjects they deal with, and, judging by the large number of favourable reviews which have appeared, our little work has not failed in the purpose it set out to fulfil.

Mr. Barker has been eager to point out what he considers flaws in our little book.

Let me indicate a matter in which he himself is not immaculate, and also remind him that the elementary rule of a reviewer should be not to accuse an author of errors in statements as to fact before being quite sure of his ground.