Dr. Macfarren and the Tonic Sol-fa System

Author(s): W. G. McNaught

Source: *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*, Vol. 23, No. 470 (Apr. 1, 1882), pp. 222-223

Published by: [Musical Times Publications Ltd.](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3355914>

Accessed: 21-12-2015 12:51 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Musical Times Publications Ltd. is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

defrayed out of the legacy bequeathed by the composer for that purpose, and which will yield an annual income of 100,000 francs. The primary object of the institution will be the training of vocalists, but it will also embrace classes for general musical and instrumental instruction.

Our Turin correspondent writes: "A young singer, Signora Bianca Bianchi, has appeared at the Theatre Regio, in 'Sonnambula' and 'Lucia,' for a few nights, but has not met with a decided success. The fact is the Turinese have been accustomed to hear the Donadio and the Varesi in these two operas, and it is a rare thing to find any one who unites, as they do, equal talent in acting as in singing. Gounod's 'Tribut de Zamora' has not met the taste of the public here, though it has been repeated several times."

Theodor Kullak, the founder of the Berlin Neue Akademie der Tonkunst, died on the 1st ult., at the age of sixty-three. Kullak was equally esteemed as a pianist and teacher of his instrument, and was also the author of numerous compositions for the piano and some excellent theoretical works.

At Paris died, at the age of fifty, Alfred Jaëll, the well-known pianoforte virtuoso.

We subjoin, as usual, the programmes of concerts* recently given at some of the leading institutions abroad:—

Paris.—Conservatoire Concert (February 26): Symphony, C minor (Beethoven); Air, "Euryanthe" (Weber); Rondo and Bourrées, from Suite in B minor (Bach); Chorus, "Idomeneo" (Mozart); Overture, "Iphigénie en Aulide" (Gluck); Finale, second act "La Vestale" (Spontini). Lamoureux Concert (February 26): "La Mer" (Joncières); "Les Eolides" (C. Franck); Fragments from "Lohengrin" (Wagner). Concert Populaire (February 26): "Les Argonautes," drama lyrique (A. Holmes). Lamoureux Concert (March 5): Overture, "Sakountala" (Goldmark); "La Mer" (Joncières); First act of "Lohengrin" (Wagner); Overture, "Leonore" (Beethoven). Châtelet Concert (March 5): "La Damnation de Faust" (Berlioz). Concert Populaire (March 5): Symphony, "La Reine" (Haydn); Fragments Symphoniques (Paladilhe); Violin Concerto (Mendelssohn); Overture and Prayer, "Rienzi" (Wagner); March and Finale, third act "Lohengrin"; Prelude, "Tristan and Isolde"; "Wotan's Farewell," from "Walküre" (Wagner). Lamoureux Concert (March 12): Overture, "Sakountala" (Goldmark); Pianoforte Concerto (Bach); Symphony, in D (Beethoven); Air, "Alexander's Feast" (Handel); Violoncello Concerto (Widor); Overture, "Euryanthe" (Weber). Concert Populaire (March 12): Symphony, "Leonore" (Raff); Hymn (Haydn); "Héro," scène dramatique (A. Coquard); Musette et Tambourin (Lullu); Violin Concerto (Beethoven); Fragments, "Roméo et Juliette" (Berlioz). Châtelet Concert (March 12): "La Damnation de Faust" (Berlioz). Conservatoire Concert (March 19): Symphony in A (Beethoven); Huntsmen's Chorus, "Euryanthe" (Weber); Fragment from "Prometheus" (Beethoven); "O Filii," double chorus (Leising, sixteenth century); Fragments, "Midsummer Night's Dream" (Mendelssohn). Lamoureux Concert (March 19): Symphony, D major (Beethoven); Fragments from third act "Lohengrin" (Wagner); Fantaisie Romantique, for violin and orchestra (G. Marie); Finale, second act "La Vestale" (Spontini); Overture, "Sigurd" (B. Reyer). Châtelet Concert (March 26): Symphony, C minor (Beethoven); Canzonetta (Mendelssohn); Scènes Alsaciennes (Massenet); Second Pianoforte Concerto (Liszt); Overture, "Benvenuto Cellini" (Berlioz). Concert Populaire (March 26): Symphony, "Leonore" (Raff). Entr'acte, "La Traviata" (Verdi); Concerto, D minor (Rubinstein); Septet (Beethoven); Air (Mozart); "Fête Bohème" (Massenet).

Lège.—Concert Populaire (March 4): Overture, "Tannhäuser" (Wagner); First Violin Concerto (Bruch); Entr'acte, "Manfred" (Reinecke); Valse Russe (E. Napravnik); Poème Symphonique, suite d'orchestre (F. le Borne); Légende, for violin (Wieniawski); Perpetuo Mobile, for violin (Paganini); Fragments, "La Damnation de Faust" (Berlioz); Violinist, M. Waldemar Meyer.

Leipzig.—St. Thomas Church, by the Riedelsche Verein (March 10): Oratorio, "Israel in Egypt" (Handel). Euterpe Concert (March 7): Overture, A major (Kietz); Air, "Jessonda" (Spohr); Concerto, E flat major (Beethoven); Songs (Schubert, Brahms); Symphony, C minor (Beethoven). Concerts of the Meiningen Orchestra, under H. von Bülow: Beethoven Night (March 13); Brahms Night (March 14); Schumann-Mendelssohn Night (March 17).

Wiesbaden.—Cur-Orchester (February 26): Overture, "Demetrius" (Hiller); "Siegfried-Idyl" (Wagner). Symphony, "Eroica" (Beethoven). Cur-Orchester (March 5): Overture, "Fingal" (Mendelssohn); Symphony, G minor (Gernsheim); Larghetto from Symphony, No. 3 (Spohr); Overture, "Die Nebenbuhler" (Friedenber). Cur-Orchester (March 12): Symphony, E flat major, No. 3 (Mozart); Overture, "Anakreon" (Cherubini); Scènes Pittoresques (Massenet). Cur-Orchester (March 19): Overture, "Leonore" No. 2 (Beethoven); Improv. arranged for orchestra (Schubert-Scholz); Symphony in G major, No. 13 (Haydn); Overture, "Der Freischütz" (Weber). Baltimore.—Peabody Concert (February 25): Symphony, D major (Beethoven); Air, "Alexander's Feast" (Handel); Pianoforte Pieces (Moszkowsky); Fifth Norse Suite (Hamerik). Students' Concert, Peabody Institute (February 18): String Quartet, G minor (Volkman); Improv. No. 3, for pianoforte (Schubert); Etude Caprice, for pianoforte, Op. 24 (S. B. Mills); Song-Poem (Hartmann); Pianoforte Trio (Matthison-Hansen).

Boston.—Symphony Orchestra (March 4): Overture, "Maid of Orleans" (Moscheles); Air, "Orpheus" (Gluck); Symphony, B flat

(Schumann); Hungarian Fantasy (Liszt); Overture, "Leonore," No. 3 (Beethoven). Symphony Orchestra (March 11): Prelude to "Edipus Tyrannus" (Paine); Trio from the 130th Psalm (Henschel); Scherzo and Wedding March from "Midsummer Night's Dream" (Mendelssohn); Ninth Symphony (Beethoven). Matinée of M. Ernst Perabo (March 6): String Quartet (B. Smetana); Andante Spianato et Polonoise, Op. 22 (Chopin); Chaconne for violin (Bach); Sonata for pianoforte and violin, Op. 47 (Beethoven). Matinée of M. Ernst Perabo (March 9): String Quartet, Op. 25 (E. F. Richter); Pianoforte Solos, Gavotte (Hans Huber); Rigaudon (Raff); Nocturne, Op. 69; Valse Caprice, E flat major (Rubinstein); Romanze for violin (Joachim); Pianoforte Quartet, Op. 3 (Mendelssohn).

Turin.—Stefano Tempia Choral Society (March 5): Motet for four voices (Nanini); Ave Maria (Arcadelt); 20th Psalm (Marcello); Fragments from Opera, "Demophoon" (Cherubini); Villanella (Donati); Duet, "Il Vigiante Notturmo" (Rubinstein); March and Chorus, "Tannhäuser" (Wagner).

CORRESPONDENCE.

DR. MACFARREN AND THE TONIC SOL-FA SYSTEM.

TO THE EDITOR OF "THE MUSICAL TIMES."

SIR,—It would be affectation to deny that the wide publication of Dr. Macfarren's letter on the Tonic Sol-fa system, addressed to the Education Department and to leading newspapers throughout the kingdom, is an incident of importance in the history of the Tonic Sol-fa movement. Advocates of the system, who have been privileged to gain valued instruction from their eminent critic, were aware of his objections to certain details of their teaching, but they were scarcely prepared for an attack so unqualified. They would gladly have been spared the distasteful task of controversy with one for whom they have the sincerest respect; but to-day the patient labours of 5,000 teachers, toiling with innumerable pupils, stand discredited, and it becomes the most elementary duty of men convinced by reason and experience of the importance of their ends, and the efficacy of their means, to use every legitimate effort to confront Dr. Macfarren's serious charges with the logic of fact. It is impossible to condense into available space a tithe of the mass of evidence, and of musical, scientific, and educational opinion in favour of the Tonic Sol-fa system. A brief quotation from the most recent testimony may induce some doubters at least to suspend judgment. If the system is the unspeakable thing represented, how is it that Dr. Stainer can say (October, 1881): "I believe the Tonic Sol-fa system, as an exposition of the relation of scale sounds, to be the true notation for voices. . . . The Tonic Sol-fa system is therefore invaluable as a logical and philosophical method of teaching singing. . . . I do not for one moment think that Tonic Sol-fa is a bar to the appreciation of the staff; quite the contrary," and so on; and Mr. Sedley Taylor, a member of the Board of Musical Studies in the University of Cambridge (February, 1882), that "the established notation is encumbered by a mass of difficulties exclusively due to the misleading system of 'natural' and 'altered' scales on which it is built. On the principle of teaching no superfluities to beginners, it is therefore advisable to provide a subsidiary notation presenting no other difficulties than are inherent in music itself. When these have been mastered, and not till then, the learner will be in a position to understand what the additional difficulties of the staff notation arise from, and to grasp the meaning of that system with a thoroughness which, but for such preliminary training, he would only attain with far greater effort." The italics are mine. The statement is in accord with my daily experience. The report of Sir Robert Stewart (March 16, 1882) of a public trial of the system, arranged at the request of the Irish Commissioners of National Education, very strongly confirms the above views. I now glance at some of Dr. Macfarren's objections only partly met by the diametrically opposite evidence quoted. It is said that the system hinders the acquisition of pitch. It might be enough to reply that the vast majority of those who have been reached by the Tonic Sol-fa system would have had no instruction at all but for the now disowned efforts of its missionaries. But on the face of the matter the careful ear-training which is so distinctive a feature of Tonic Sol-fa teaching must and does sharpen the perception of absolute pitch when attention is particularly directed to it. The upper students of the system are made to memorise pitch.

* Contributions intended for this column should indicate clearly the place and date of performance, as otherwise they cannot be inserted.

Another serious charge is that the system "confounds the characteristics of keys, which have distinctly different harmonic derivations." This refers to the treatment of the dual relation of a minor key to its "relative" and to its "tonic" major. Most readers will conclude that the Tonic Sol-fa system inculcates some *new* and false doctrine, although, of course, it is not the intention of the writer to convey this impression. Observing that composers modulate to the relative minor and major a hundred times more frequently than to the tonic minor or major, and that the common ear continues its obstinate refusal to be regarded as the keyboard of a pianoforte, the Tonic Sol-fa method, in common with most if not all movable doh methods, teaches the minor scale from its "relative" major, a proceeding sanctioned by the venerable authority of the ordinary notation and nomenclature, of which, be it observed, to save pharisaic rejoicing, Dr. Macfarren elsewhere remarks that "this term 'relative' has led to a most evil misapprehension, and is a stumbling-block in the way of learners"; that he writes of "the long-established inaccurate signification of the minor form of the key"; and again that "the conventional terms 'relative major' and 'relative minor' that are in common use to define the connection, are here denounced as misleading, and consequently dangerous to the composer." Sol-faists might reasonably ask—and with bitterness, if this were consistent with the meekness they cultivate with a view to the inheritance promised all such—why the Education Department is not besought to reject the use of a notation characterised by one of its most eminent advocates as "unlucky," "inaccurate," and a "stumbling-block in the way of learners"? Next, as to the vagueness of the Tonic Sol-fa notation. This is clearly a matter of evidence. It would be unfair to judge either notation by performance from strange, ill-written manuscript. Whether or not the Sol-fa notation is being condemned only on this ground I am unable to say, but I think it fair to quote Dr. Macfarren's opinion of a performance from well printed Tonic Sol-fa notation. In the *Cornhill Magazine* (1868), writing of a Tonic Sol-fa concert at which he was present, he says: "A piece of music which had been composed for the occasion, and had not until then been seen by human eyes, save those of the writer and the printers, was handed forth to the members of the chorus there present, and then, before an audience furnished at the same time with copies to test the accuracy of the performance, 4,500 singers sang it at first sight in a manner to fulfil the highest requirements of the severest judges." It is said that the rich can read musical publications of all countries, and that the poor will be unjustly treated if they are not blessed by the instruction and methods of those who enjoy the lucrative monopoly of teaching the rich. Can the rich read music? Can one out of ten of their daughters, over whose musical education so much time and money are expended, sing at sight, without the pianoforte, the simplest psalm-tune? Tens of thousands of Board School children can do this. I venture to ask musicians—even those to whom the strange appeal has been made to dragoon the Tonic Sol-fa system from even optional use in our State-aided schools—to fairly weigh what that system has hitherto done for the masses of this country, and not to allow themselves to be persuaded to hinder the work of those who are trying to do a national task.—I am, sir, yours faithfully,

March 25, 1882.

W. G. McNAUGHT, A.R.A.M.

CHARLES HALLÉ'S MUSICAL JOURNEYS.

TO THE EDITOR OF "THE MUSICAL TIMES."

DEAR SIR,—As a former member of Mr. Charles Hallé's Orchestra, and having several times made the Scotch journey with him, I have read the paragraph relating to that journey, in the March number of *THE MUSICAL TIMES*, with much interest. In one respect you are quite justified in regarding Mr. Hallé's achievements as being without a parallel—I refer to the fact that in addition to directing the orchestra at each concert, he generally plays a piano concerto and some minor pieces, which must add enormously to the labour; but as regards distance travelled and concerts given in a short space of time, the Scotch *tournee* can be easily matched on the other side of the Atlantic. In 1872 I joined the orchestra of Mr. Theodore

Thomas, in New York. Mr. Thomas was for years in the habit of taking his orchestra, consisting of sixty members, on a *tournee* lasting from the beginning of October to the beginning of May. The first that I made with him covered over 13,000 miles. As the people were continually on the move, in addition to the instruments, he had to transport over sixty large trunks, and, as a rule, each night the concert was in a different town. The travelling was not nearly so harassing as in England, for Mr. Thomas provided hotel accommodation for his entire orchestra, and they had nothing to do on arrival but to proceed direct to the hotel, which was generally the principal one in the city. I append an example of the way we moved over the country, selecting for convenience the period between two public rehearsals of the Philharmonic Society in Brooklyn, which take place every two weeks. The distance from New York to Chicago is about 1,200 miles. You will observe we gave fifteen concerts (including the public rehearsals, which are in reality *matinées* under another name), had two ordinary rehearsals, played in eight different cities, and travelled about 2,400 miles, all in the space of fifteen days. And this was in the *ordinary fulfilment of our duties*, for we had been travelling for months previously, and continued travelling till the following May.

I am, dear sir, yours truly,

ADOLPHUS LOCKWOOD,

Königl. bayer Hofmusiker.

Akademie Strasse 7, München,

March 3, 1882.

Two weeks' travelling with the Theodore Thomas Orchestra.—1874, February 11, Brooklyn, N. Y., tenth public rehearsal of Philharmonic Society; 12, Philadelphia, Pa., concert; 13, Pittsburgh, Pa., concert; 14, Pittsburgh, Pa., *matinée* and concert; 16, Chicago, Ill., concert, with rehearsal; 17, Chicago, Ill., concert, with rehearsal; 18, Chicago, Ill., *matinée* and concert; 19, La Porte, Indiana, concert; 20, Cleveland, Ohio, concert; 21, Cleveland, Ohio, concert; 23, Syracuse, N. Y., concert; 24, Troy, N. Y., concert; 25, Brooklyn, N. Y., eleventh public rehearsal of Philharmonic Society.

THE NEW NATIONAL ACADEMY.

TO THE EDITOR OF "THE MUSICAL TIMES."

SIR,—If the new Music School which our Royal Family has so ably and eloquently inaugurated is to be considered a National Institution, worthy of national support, allow me to say there must be some alteration in its scheme. It was expressly stated at the meeting at St. James's that the hundred free scholarships, to which the generous British public are asked to contribute, were to be thrown open to all comers and to all nations. In that case, surely, the School would be International and Continental rather than National; and its advantages would appear to be intended chiefly for our poorer neighbours across the channel. Foreign musicians stand in no need of such assistance. They have their own State-supported Conservatoires all over the Continent. Moreover they have always received the most cordial support and patronage in this country, from the time of Handel downwards.

If the new School is to be considered National, its scholarships must be confined exclusively to the children of English parents, born on English soil, and its musical direction placed in the hands of English musicians.

Unless this condition be carried out, it is not difficult to foretell that the School will meet with but short-lived success, like the last National venture, and the British public will soon tire of contributing to its support.

Yours faithfully,

Chelsea, March 20, 1882.

A. S. C.

P.S.—Since writing the above, I hear that Professor Donaldson has pointed out the same defect, at a meeting which took place recently at Glasgow.

PALESTRINA'S "MISSA PAPÆ MARCELLI."

TO THE EDITOR OF "THE MUSICAL TIMES."

SIR,—With reference to the rendering of this Mass by the Bach Society on the 16th of February last, *THE MUSICAL TIMES* for March states: "This is said to have been the first performance of this work in a London