The Classical Review

<http://journals.cambridge.org/CAR>

Additional services for *The Classical Review*:

Email alerts: [Click here](#)

Subscriptions: [Click here](#)

Commercial reprints: [Click here](#)

Terms of use : [Click here](#)

***Herodoti Historiae, Recensuit* Alfred Holder, vol. I. [Lib. I.–IV.] Lipsiae sumptus fecit G. Freytag, mdccclxxxvi. 2 Mk.**

R. W. Macan

The Classical Review / Volume 1 / Issue 5-6 / June 1887, pp 156 - 156
DOI: 10.1017/S0009840X00183593, Published online: 27 October 2009

Link to this article: http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract_S0009840X00183593

How to cite this article:

R. W. Macan (1887). The Classical Review, 1, pp 156-156 doi:10.1017/S0009840X00183593

Request Permissions : [Click here](#)

Güthling; the remaining poems by Sedlmayer have not yet appeared). Sall. (Catil., Jug. orat. epist. cet. by Scheindler), Tac. (J. Müller), Verg. (Klouček). Announced: Sen. rh. (H. J. Müller), Tibullus (Zingerle).

In connexion with the texts illustrated school dictionaries have appeared by K. Jahr to Andresen's, by Weidner to his own, Nepos; by Jurenka to Sedlmayer's selections from Ovid; by Prammer to his Caes. b. g.; by Schmidt to his Curtius; by Ed. Wolff to Tac. Germ.

Meister's book is the more welcome because the only cheap rival (Bonnell's) dates from 1854. He has long been known as a student of Quintilian, inasmuch that Bonnell left to him by will a collation of cod. Bamberg. M 4 14 (saec. x); and he has received important aid from Becher, Kiderlin, Wölflin and Karl Schenkl. He naturally follows in the main Halm's constitution of the text. He has examined nearly all the editions of his author, and endeavours to assign each emendation to its proper owner. In the *addenda* he has registered a conjecture of Nettleship's, which appeared only last year in the *Journal of Philology*. The index of names and things (pp. 298-338) and that of authors cited will be found very useful. The tenth book is also issued separately, price 25 Pf.—JOHN E. B. MAYOR.

Herodoti Historiae, Recensuit ALFRED HOLDER, vol. I. [Lib. I.-IV.] Lipsiae sumptus fecit G. FREYTAG, mdccclxxxvi, 2 Mk.

THIS moiety of the Muses of Herodotus forms a volume of the *Bibliotheca scriptorum Gr. et Rom. ed. curante Carolo Schenkl*. The book is convenient in shape, well printed on fair paper, and pleasant to read. Its price is extremely moderate (two marks). Every student of Herodotus will be glad to possess a copy of this admirable recension, even if already familiar with the editions of Stein and Kallenberg-Dietsch, and will look forward to its speedy completion with interest. In no other edition will be found so fully and conveniently recorded the latest results of textual criticism in regard to Herodotus. The apparatus submitted to each page includes the conjectural emendations for which *Mnemosyne* and other periodicals must be searched at length. Here may be seen what Cobet, van Herwerden, Madvig, Gompertz and others, over and above the elder and later editors, have done for the destruction and reconstruction of the text. A large number of emendations are received into the editor's text. Probably in this respect the edition is an advance upon its predecessors. The result is an eminently rational and flowing text, as near, perhaps, in essentials as we are likely to get to the lost *codex archetypus*. The MSS. variations are also more fully exhibited than in Stein's smaller edition, and that by an ingenious system of references, wherein $\alpha = A + B$, $\beta = R + V$, $V' = V + S$. This method keeps the two main textual sources into which the archetype descended vividly before the reader. *Exempli gratia*, I. 1 $\kappa\alpha\tau\grave{\alpha}$ τῶν τὸ καὶ Ἑλλήνες κ.τ.λ. $\alpha\beta$ read δ καὶ. Not infrequently α omits, β inserts, or *vice versa*. Examples *passim*. A striking case II. 102, 8 α reads τῶν, β omits. Valckenauer reads ἀστῶν, Schweighäuser Αἰγυπτίων, Gaisford ἀστῶν, Stein τῶν (ἥρχε). This last is Herodotean, cp. III. 1 *et al.* but hardly appropriate *in loco*. Holder omits with β . The principal collation made by the editor for the present edition is the collation of V (Vindobonensis lxxxv. lent to him at Karlsruhe: shades of Bodley, take note!). Stein remains in this respect our greatest benefactor. The last collation of S (Sancroft's MS. at Emman. Coll. Camb.) is still Gaisford's.

Some points of interest may be noted, out of many, suggested by this edition.

In II. 51, 12 Holder brackets Σαμοθρήκες. There is MS. authority for its omission, which does not appear. In I. 72, 11, II. 34, 6, IV. 153, 5. Prof. Mahaffy's happy emendations of the numerals are accepted. In the first case, somewhat inconsistently, the literal notation (ιε) is printed in the text. In I. 51, 14 Kirchhoff's Λακεδαιμονίων φασιν ὧν after Λακεδαιμονίων is not noticed. In I. 170, 14 our last editor does not help us (cf. Blakesley *in loco*). In II. 40, which presents a veritable hornet's nest to the textual critic, Holder's text admits substantially Stein's conjecture for filling a lacuna which Stein was the first to indicate. In I. 28-29, 1. can the text be considered satisfactory as left by Holder following Stein? In I. 43, 3 Holder lets τὸ ὄρος stand. In IV. 79, 6 and 81, 6 it is remarkable that καὶ—εἶχον should stand unchallenged; and so perhaps also IV. 124, 1, cp. with 126, 7 πανσήμενος τοῦ δρόμου, and with πανσήμενος τῆς πλάνης in line 5. In III. 9, 13 α gives σώζωσι β gives ποτίζωσι. Stein does not think the variation worth noticing and reads σώζωσι. Holder reads σώζωσι. Similarly in III. 14, 42, where C apparently has σώζειν. In regard to the method of reference, the lines of this text are numbered not according to the page, but according to the chapter. It may be regretted by those who use classical texts mainly for material or historical purposes that the paragraphs in the chapters are not numbered, as in the Oxford text; a method which greatly facilitates references for such purposes.

It is right to notice that the number of misprints in this volume is considerable. About forty may be added to the list of *Corrigenda operarum menda* at the end. Some of these are trifling, the omission of a breathing, or accent, or of an obvious letter; others are more serious, though not likely to create a difficulty for any intelligent reader. Still they are disfiguring to a text in all other respects so truly admirable. e.g. Bk. I. c 8, line 7 for χρόνου read χρόνου, c 41, 6 for χρηστοῖσι read χρηστοῖσι, 96, 12 for ταῦτα read ταῦτα, 108, 14 *dele* comma after ἄλλους and in 117, 16 after τῶδε, 143, 15 for τῇ read μή, 149, 7 for ἀμείρω read ἀμείνω, 161, 2 for ἀτέρπρεύετο read ἐστρατεύετο, 196, 24 for χρυσίου read χρυσίον. Bk. II, 44, 12 for ἀκικύμην read ἀπικύμην, 47, 7 for δ read εἰς, 53 lines 2 and 3 *ad fin.* the punctuation has been exchanged. 155, 2 for νοῦ read τοῦ 161, 11 for ἐπ' read ἀπ', 170, 2 for τ' read τὸ. Bk. III. 19, 12 ναυι should be ναυ- and next line Πέρσης- should be Πέρσησι, 29, 10 *dele* fullstop after ταῦτον, 62, 11 ο should be δ. Bk. IV, 62, 10 for νοῦ read τοῦ, 68, 9, 10 (οἱ μάντιες) is superfluous, 128, 6 *dele* δέ, 134, 19 for γῆν read τῆν, 141, 3 for comma after Μιλήσιον put a full stop. Next line for πάντα read ταῦτα, 154, 6 and 7 one εἶναι is superfluous, 159, 5 for colon substitute comma after καλεομένου. As in many of the best Greek texts printed in Germany, the type seems worn, or imperfectly inked at places. In the copy before me Bk. I, c 109, p. 56 is very badly printed, and the same remark applies to c 17, p. 8. Still one cannot expect an *édition de luxe* for two shillings, and nothing here said should be taken to detract from the great and substantial value of this most serviceable and scholarly edition.—R. W. MACAN.

Herodoti Historiarum Liber Quintus. Scholarum in usum editit ALFRED HOLDER. (Leipzig: Freytag. 1887). *Eiusdem*. Liber Sextus.

WE have here from the same editor two books of Herodotus, published separately, and at a very small price (40 Pf. each). The *apparatus criticus* is absent, in other respects the page is uniform with the critical