Review

Author(s): A. B. S.

Review by: A. B. S.

Source: *The Musical Times*, Vol. 63, No. 956 (Oct. 1, 1922), pp. 702-703

Published by: [Musical Times Publications Ltd.](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/913876>

Accessed: 31-01-2016 04:26 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Musical Times Publications Ltd. is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Musical Times*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

of his music. Writing in his sixty-ninth year, and commending his last volume to 'all true lovers of music'—to whom he wished 'all happiness both temporal and eternal'—he said :

'Only this I desire: that you will be but as careful to hear them well-expressed as I have been both in the composing and correcting of them. Otherwise the best song that ever was made will seem harsh and unpleasant, for that the well expressing of them, either by voices or instruments, is the life of our labours. . . .'

We did not, I believe, respond to this appeal during the 19th century. We did not learn his true accents, and so we misunderstood him. Even so direct a passage as the following will not reveal its secret to a regular four-beat bar, a conventional metrical stress, and an unimaginative 'expressing' of the individual parts :

Ex. 4. *Psalms, Sonnets, &c.*, 1588. 'Ambitious love.'

Pro - ceed then in this des - per-ate

en - - ter - prise, With good ad -

- vice, and fol - low love thy guide that leads (thee

Such a parallel to the Poet Laureate's study of the scientific character of Milton's verse ought to be provided against the coming tercentenary celebrations. It is a pleasant circumstance that this great anniversary should mark the first climax in our 20th-century revival of Elizabethan music. How different the position was twenty years ago is shown by the fact that—so far as I can discover—the three-hundredth anniversary of the death of Morley passed with very little comment. I have recently read newspaper reports of concerts given by several madrigal societies in 1903, and have actually found that no single piece of Morley's was included in the programmes! The tercentenary of Byrd's birth coincided with the Musical Antiquarian Society's editions of his works—the *Mass for five voices* (1840, Rimbault); the first book of the *Cantiones Sacrae* (1842, Horsley); and *Parthenia* (1847, Rimbault). But there was little real significance in the event; the transcriptions were not accurate, and Horsley's preface, as I have shown, was a monument of erroneous criticism. The fact that these editors worked without monetary remuneration should perhaps be borne in mind; yet after all, what counts in art is not how the work repays the artist, but how

it repays the art. The pieces for next year's celebration should be carefully selected, first to compel attention to the essential style of Byrd, and secondly to avoid strangeness. And singers should keep in the forefront of their mind the entire content of the composer's 1611 preface—and, indeed, listeners should do the same. The old man (Morley's 'loving master, never without reverence to be named of musicians'), after remarking that the 'well-expressing of songs is seldom or never well performed at the first singing or playing,' continues thus :

'Besides, a song that is well and artificially made cannot be well perceived nor understood at the first hearing, but the oftener you shall hear it, the better cause of liking you will discover [Byrd would have appreciated the principle of the competition festival], and commonly that song is best esteemed with which our ears are most acquainted. As I have done my best endeavour to give you content (in "every humour: either melancholy, merry, or mixt of both") so I beseech you satisfy my desire in hearing them well expressed, and then I doubt not, for art and air, both of skilful and ignorant they will deserve liking.'

In this little commendation of his works, the master uses the word 'well' six times; and he inscribes himself *Thine W. Byrd*.

The Musician's Bookshelf

English Organ-Cases. By the Rev. Andrew Freeman (George A. Mate & Son, 7s. 6d.).

Speaking of the organ-builders of the past, Mr. Freeman says :

They bestowed on the outside of the instrument the same loving care as was bestowed on font or pulpit, screen, lectern, or bench-end. They grudged neither time, thought, nor labour in their determination to make its outward appearance worthy of the prominent position it occupied. . . . No one ever dreamed of setting one up merely because it pleased the ear. It must please the eye too. An organ might be large, or it might be small; it must be beautiful.

To re-establish this creed is the purpose of this book, and the author gives the wise advice to those who are contemplating building an organ that they should set apart a proportionate and adequate amount of the total sum for the provision of a well-designed and well-wrought case. Unfortunately those responsible for the choice or the construction of an organ are very few, but it would be well for our churches if they laid to heart the counsel of the organ-builders of the past that the organ may be large or small, but it must be beautiful.

An organ in an uncouth case—or, worse still, an organ with no case at all—is a pitiful spectacle in a church, whereas an organ beautifully cased lends a mysterious charm to whatever building it inhabits, besides seeming to mellow the actual sound and making it more spiritual. Pipes painted a glaring green can sound only harsh and strident; but pipes richly gilded, even if they are but dummies, seem to suggest tones that are smooth and golden.

Mr. Freeman has evidently taken great pains to collect material from all sources, and he has produced

a comprehensive catalogue of organ-cases from the earliest times until the present day, devoting a chapter—illustrated by some good drawings by H. T. Lilley—to the Smith and Harris organs built during 1660-1790.

A book on such a subject might perhaps have been more lovingly written. It is impossible to imagine a writer on architecture or pictures meting out his praise or condemnation in such stereotyped phrases as Mr. Freeman too frequently uses. Also, the phrase 'box of whistles' suggests the cant of mere journalism rather than a meet description of what is designedly a lasting contribution to a noble Art.

The book is admirably illustrated with numerous drawings and photographs, and will be a useful addition to the library of anyone interested in ecclesiastical architecture, besides being a pleasant companion while making a tour of the famous churches in London or the countryside. A. B.-S.

The Art of Transcribing for the Organ. By Herbert F. Ellingford (New York, H. W. Gray Co.; London, Novello, 18s.).

Recent years have seen a great development in the use by organists of music originally written for some medium other than the organ, and immense numbers of transcriptions have been published by organists of note in this country and elsewhere. But organists who wished to make their own arrangements have had to trust to their own good sense and taste, with no other guidance than that afforded by very occasional R.C.O. lectures, which could not deal with the subject in any great detail. This gap in organ literature has now been made good by Mr. Ellingford.

It need hardly be said that so experienced a recital-organist deals with his subject in a thoroughly practical manner. But in addition to this his writing is always admirably lucid, and the book is got up in attractive style, with a wealth of music-type illustration which adds much to its value.

Mr. Ellingford divides his work into three sections, the first of which deals with the arrangement of orchestral accompaniments to choral works. This, we venture to think, the average organist will find the most generally useful part of the book. Many do not aspire to give recitals, and if they do, play only an occasional transcription; but very few escape the duty of accompanying choral music, and all too few know how to adapt the accompaniment in the most suitable and effective way for the organ. Every point which the author makes is carefully illustrated, each extract appearing in three forms—the full score, the usual pianoforte reduction, and an organ version. With but few exceptions, the organ versions are splendid; in fact only two cause us any doubt—No. 13 ('How lovely,' from Brahms's *Requiem*) surely suffers by the sacrifice of the vigorous string figures; and in No. 14 (from Brahms's *Song of Destiny*) we feel that there is something wrong with the suggested registration.

The second section deals with the transcription of purely orchestral works, and here the author is on his own ground and speaks with authority. His versions are all drawn from his own repertory, and have had the test of actual performance at Liverpool. Naturally, in transcribing, alternative solutions are often possible, and it must be confessed that occasionally we have felt that an alternative was preferable; but the printed versions are always

organic and faithful renderings of the originals. It is, we think, a pity that Mr. Ellingford writes so often for a 32-note pedal-board; many of us, even in these days, are not blessed with those extra two notes, and could not possibly play excerpts 17, 33, and 35 as they stand.

The third section refers to works for small orchestra, chamber and pianoforte music, and songs. Here, as elsewhere, the essential points are well illustrated. It was presumably thought necessary for the sake of completeness to include the songs; but these do not lend themselves very happily to transcriptions, and are not in themselves very worthy specimens of the form.

Altogether this book is a very valuable addition to the organist's library, the more valuable because it breaks new ground, and we commend it warmly to the attention of all who have anything to do with transcription for the organ. Mr. Ellingford is to be doubly congratulated—first as a pioneer, and secondly for the production of an attractive and comprehensive volume. J. A. S.

Pedalling in Pianoforte Music. By Algernon H. Lindo (Kegan Paul, 4s. 6d.).

Considering the great importance of this subject it has received singularly inadequate treatment in most works on pianoforte playing. Mr. Lindo's little book, which runs to about two hundred pages, is a praiseworthy effort to treat a very subtle and difficult art in a systematic and thorough manner. A short introductory section concerns itself with the general principles of pedalling, various methods of indicating pedal depression and release, and a description of the mechanism and action of the hammers and dampers in a pianoforte. The second and main part of the book deals with the practical application of the principles of pedalling. The writer has some helpful comments on the pedalling of isolated chords, *staccato* passages, and passages containing rests—matters concerning which there is much confusion of thought. A question of the utmost importance, and one which frequently perplexes the conscientious student, *i.e.*, To what extent should pedalling be influenced by the presence of passing-notes? is discussed at considerable length and freely illustrated from Chopin's works. A chapter on half-pedalling and tremolo pedalling quotes an extract from the works of York Bowen. This composer would seem to be almost the only English musician who devotes the same care to his pedal marking that he does to the marking of light and shade, *tempo*, &c. Under the heading 'Some less-known pedal effects' the author describes various unorthodox devices frequently employed by professional pianists which are never indicated in the printed copy and are totally unknown to the average student. One of the most effective of these—silent pressure—is here described, probably for the first time in print. The third part of the work is a brief consideration of the special pedal treatment required for certain periods and certain composers. A helpful feature of the book is the large number of admirably-chosen music examples. Though it is highly improbable that all Mr. Lindo's suggestions will meet with universal approval, his excellent little volume should certainly stimulate students to think and experiment for themselves. G. G.