of the best pianists I have ever heard, and while competent to perform the great works of Beethoven, Liszt, Chopin, and Rubinstein, is equally at home in the delicate combina-
tions of the stringed trio. I may mention that there is also an Orchestral Union in Dublin, but I do not think it has been much of a success.

Having now given you some idea of our musical doings in Dublin, will you permit me to make one or two remarks upon the article dealing with the press of Mr. Gr. Graves, which appears in your October number, on the subject of "Musical Talent in Ireland." With much of Mr. Graves' observations I concurred, living I will say to show a practical acquaintance with the country not possessed by most critics upon Ireland; but I must say I think they are written in anything but a friendly spirit. I do not see why, because I admire, I should choose to make vicious and malicious statements respecting music in Ireland, it is necessary for another to undertake the task of her disparagement in this region is attributable to the musical half of the day, and the con-

One great fault it seems to me underlying Mr. Graves' criticism of musical talent in Ireland, is that he compares the music in the present, when there has been such advance in music culture, with the music of the past generation. He says Lover's melodies were "conventional" and his accompaniments "infantile." The same charge might be made against his English contemporaries, but at least I think those who know his verse and music will agree with me in thinking them a most happy combination, full of poetic feeling and pure sentiment. Lover, although full of humour and other humours, had his serious and pathetic side, which will be found in his "Songs of the Superstitious of Ireland." Although it is very much the fashion now to despise all that our ancestors admired, I think Mr. Graves will find few to agree with him in his low estimate of Moore as a national poet. As a lyrical poet, he is, I will say, equal in beauty with him in beautiful simile and musical measure. It is quite true that the Irish melodies have lost terribly by being put into modern garb (chiefly, in my opinion, by the composers) and nothing could be more miserable than their arrangement, both accom-

The fact remains that Ireland has a national music, the music of centuries, which England does not; and no failure in the arrangement of such music will affect the fact of its existence.

In speaking of Irish composers, Mr. Grs. omits to mention the name of Wallace, the composer of "Maritana," and Rooke, composer of "Amile, or the Love-test," both excellent works, but which it would be unfair to compare with the great masters of the present day, who have been so

Dublin, October 14, 1886.

[Hibernicus.

[Dublin October 14, 1886.

[Owing to my absence in an out of the way corner of Ireland at the end of September, and to the delay caused by a change of whereabouts, the revised "proof" of my paper was forwarded too late for the editor to insert all the corrections which I had made, one of which had reference to the "New Leinster Messenger," which amends the facts so suit-

Wishing to make it so difficult to maintain a good orchestra in this country

THE MUSICAL TIMES.—November 1, 1886. 673

of the best pianists I have ever heard, and while competent to perform the great works of Beethoven, Liszt, Chopin, and Rubinstein, is equally at home in the delicate combina-
tions of the stringed trio. I may mention that there is also an Orchestral Union in Dublin, but I do not think it has been much of a success.

Having now given you some idea of our musical doings in Dublin, will you permit me to make one or two remarks upon the article dealing with the press of Mr. Gr. Graves, which appears in your October number, on the subject of "Musical Talent in Ireland." With much of Mr. Graves' observations I concurred, living I will say to show a practical acquaintance with the country not possessed by most critics upon Ireland; but I must say I think they are written in anything but a friendly spirit. I do not see why, because I admire, I should choose to make vicious and malicious statements respecting music in Ireland, it is necessary for another to undertake the task of her disparagement in this region is attributable to the musical half of the day, and the con-

One great fault it seems to me underlying Mr. Graves' criticism of musical talent in Ireland, is that he compares the music in the present, when there has been such advance in music culture, with the music of the past generation. He says Lover's melodies were "conventional" and his accompaniments "infantile." The same charge might be made against his English contemporaries, but at least I think those who know his verse and music will agree with me in thinking them a most happy combination, full of poetic feeling and pure sentiment. Lover, although full of humour and other humours, had his serious and pathetic side, which will be found in his "Songs of the Superstitious of Ireland." Although it is very much the fashion now to despise all that our ancestors admired, I think Mr. Graves will find few to agree with him in his low estimate of Moore as a national poet. As a lyrical poet, he is, I will say, equal in beauty with him in beautiful simile and musical measure. It is quite true that the Irish melodies have lost terribly by being put into modern garb (chiefly, in my opinion, by the composers) and nothing could be more miserable than their arrangement, both accom-

The fact remains that Ireland has a national music, the music of centuries, which England does not; and no failure in the arrangement of such music will affect the fact of its existence.

In speaking of Irish composers, Mr. Grs. omits to mention the name of Wallace, the composer of "Maritana," and Rooke, composer of "Amile, or the Love-test," both excellent works, but which it would be unfair to compare with the great masters of the present day, who have been so

Dublin, October 14, 1886.

[Hibernicus.

[Dublin October 14, 1886.

[Owing to my absence in an out of the way corner of Ireland at the end of September, and to the delay caused by a change of whereabouts, the revised "proof" of my paper was forwarded too late for the editor to insert all the corrections which I had made, one of which had reference to the "New Leinster Messenger," which amends the facts so suit-

Wishing to make it so difficult to maintain a good orchestra in this country
are, the indiffident musical education, the poverty of the country, and the utter indifference shown by the aristocracy and wealthy mercantile class of this city in the advancement of musical art in Ireland. Until these causes disappear, we cannot expect that either patriotism, which is satisfied with extenuating the fault between the chief musical authorities, which exists scarcely anywhere, will remove this reproach.

While the subject of musical education I would refer to Mr. Graves's suggestion that a really efficient Academy of Music should be established in Dublin; with that suggestion I heartily concur, and my experience proves that it is a crying need in this city. Since the Dublin Musical Society was founded I have refused admission to several hundreds of applicants, including a large number of the pupils of the Royal Irish Academy of Music, owing to their inability to read music at sight with anything like correctness. However, this is a matter which I hope in time be remedied.

Within the last twelve months, when it was proposed by a scheme in the Court of Chancery to hand over the Coulson musical bequest, amounting to the sum of £17,000, to the Academy of Music, a meeting of musical professors, numbering nearly forty, was held, at which I occupied the chair; with few exceptions the leading members of the musical profession in Dublin were present, and a statement expressing the opinion of the meeting that the administration of the Academy was inefficient and unsatisfactory was adopted. On the occasion of the musical profession on this occasion, the Royal Irish Academy of Music have taken the necessary preliminary steps to reconstitute themselves, and have shown their readiness to adopt many of the suggestions made at the meeting above referred to. In their reconstituted form, and with the aid of the Coulson bequest, I see no reason why there should not be in Dublin, within the next few years, a really efficient Musical Academy.—Faithfully yours,

Joseph Robinson.

Dublin, October 24, 1866.

ROCKSTRO'S "THE GOOD SHEPHERD." TO THE EDITOR OF "THE MUSICAL TIMES."

Sir,—In your notice of my Oratorio, "The Good Shepherd," in The Musical Times for October, you speak of my fugal treatment as "faulty." As the accusation has been repeated in other periodicals, and re-echoed in a highly exacerbatcd form in an American journal, I trust you will permit me to say a few words in reply to it. I venture, then, to maintain, that every interval, without exception, in my fugal answers, is written in strictest possible accordance with the rules laid down by the greatest masters of the art of fugue, and that, having constructed my answers in obedience to those rules, I am left, by the same great masters, perfectly free to treat them, either with the simple harmonies of the tonic and dominant, or with the harmony of the dominant of the dominant, as I please, the exhibition or omission of the last-named harmony—involving a formal modulation to the key of the dominant, by means of a new leading note—being a mere accident, neither commanded nor forbidden by the laws of modern fugue, though, in either case, perfectly compatible with them.

It is impossible to dispute the truth of this position, in presence of "Das Wohltemperirte Klavier," in No. xvii. of which Bach treats his answer without any form of modulation whatever, while in No. xxvii., he treats it with a distinct modulation to the key of the subdominant.

I repeat, therefore, that the method of treatment I have adopted in "The Good Shepherd" is perfectly orthodox in its theoretical aspect, while I can scarcely believe that, if it had proved ineffective in performance, the choruses in which it occurs would have been deleted in the Times as "two magnificent fugues."

I remain, Sir, your obedient Servant,

W. S. Rockstro.

P.S.—Since writing the above, I have received a letter from the Professor of Music at the University of Oxford confirming my position.

* By "modern fugue," I mean, of course, the form of fugue practiced since the abandonment of the ecclesiastical modes.