

(COPY.)

DEAR SIR,—Enclosed I beg to hand you a few copies of the "Summary" drawn up by me. It has already been laid before the poor-law board, and a copy has been forwarded to the *Times*, *Morning Chronicle*, *Sun*, *Daily News*, *Punch*, *Halifax Guardian*, (*Leeds Mercury*, *Intelligencer*, and *Times*), *Manchester Guardian*, *Wakefield Journal*, and *Bradford Observer*.

I hesitate not to give poor-law medical relief every publicity in my power, and for this purpose I note down accurately the various items, so as to enable me to do so with precision.

I am ready to take an oath as to the correctness of the tables I send you, as the work has been entirely performed by myself, and no person but myself has made an entry in my book. I have met with the greatest insult from the board of guardians of this union, but that will not cause my spirits to flag, nor, if my health be spared, will it prevent a periodical full exposure of the way in which the medical relief of the poor is made to fall, where it was never intended, at least, I hope so—viz., on the shoulders of the hard-worked medical officer. Wishing you all vigour and success, believe me to remain, dear Sir, yours truly,

FREDERICK GARLICK.

Cheapside, Halifax, July, 1849.

N.B.—Excuse great haste. I will address you again in a few days.

To C. F. J. Lord, Esq., Hon. Sec.

I may be permitted to state also, that during the past week a very valuable petition in favour of an improved system of poor-law medical relief has been obtained through the exertions of Mr. George Cowley, of Winslow, and signed, in addition to the medical men, by all the clergy and magistrates of the district, by the chairman, two vice-chairmen, and several other guardians of the union board, which was submitted to the committee at their last meeting, prior to its being placed in the hands of Mr. D'Israeli, the county member, for presentation, who it is hoped, in future, will further the objects of the convention.

The poor-law medical staff will ultimately owe its emancipation, in a great degree, to strenuous exertions similar to Mr. Cowley's and Mr. Garlick's; to exertions made by an honest, hearty troop, daily growing stronger, "who never know, when man to man is true, a fear;" to exertions made, and, in the spirit of the following well-known lines:—

"Hereditary bondsmen! know ye not
Who would be free, themselves must burst their bonds."

Deeply grateful for the assistance you have given our cause,
I am, Sir, your very obedient servant,
Hanover-square, July, 1849. CHARLES F. J. LORD, Hon. Sec.

DR. STILWELL'S HISTORY OF THE CASE OF MISS NOTTIDGE.—LETTER FROM DR. MARSHALL HALL, F.R.S. &c.

To the Editor of THE LANCET.

SIR,—As you have noticed the case of Miss Nottidge in your last number, in connexion with the mischievous and absurd opinions volunteered by the Chief Baron, at the recent trial, on the subject of lunacy generally, and which you properly designate as "so extravagant as almost to pass belief," it occurs to me, that a detailed statement of this unhappy case might interest your readers.

On the 12th of November, 1846, I was requested to receive Miss Nottidge as a patient at Moorcroft, and on the evening of that day she arrived, accompanied by her mother, a certificate of her unsoundness of mind having been previously signed by a physician and a surgeon. I received from Mrs. Nottidge the following statement of her case:—That she was forty-two years of age, and that from her early youth her mind had been directed with much intensity to religion, and that a large portion of her time had been devoted to the study of the Scriptures, and the writings of religious men. That, some three or four years ago, a person of the name of Prince came into the neighbourhood of Mrs. Nottidge's residence, as a curate, and, by his preaching, obtained such influence over Miss Nottidge and three of her sisters, as to induce them to leave their home, and follow him to Brighton, to which place he had removed. After various wanderings, Mr. Prince, having been removed by the bishop from the church, settled, with his followers, at Charlange, near Bridgwater, and built what is called by them an "Agapemone, or Abode of Love." To this building the four Miss Nottidges subscribed, and on the opening of the chapel situated in it, but which is now turned into the feasting room, they left their mother at Brighton to attend the ceremony. This was in June,

1846. The three youngest did not return to their mother, but married, on one day, three of Mr. Prince's associates at the Abode of Love. Miss Nottidge returned to her mother's house in Suffolk, where she remained until two of the residents at the Agapemone came for her in a post-chaise, and induced her, in an evil hour, to quit that house, which from infancy had been one of peaceful happiness, and graced by every domestic virtue. Alas! now how changed! During this residence in Suffolk, Miss Nottidge's mind (always, be it remembered, of a most excitable and tender nature) had been racked by the most intense conflict between her affection for her aged mother and her home, and the new doctrines and principles which had been imposed on her by Mr. Prince, and to which, though doubting, she yielded. On leaving her mother, she said to her, "I go; but it is like tearing the flesh from my bones!" For six weeks it was impossible to ascertain her residence. At length Mrs. Nottidge received letters from several persons of undoubted respectability, stating that her daughter was living at Charlange in "great iniquity," and making statements it would be libellous for me to write, or you to print, especially if the greater the truth the greater the libel. Mr. Nottidge, the brother, and Mr. Ripley, the brother-in-law, determined, at all risks, to make an effort to rescue their sister, and proceeded to Charlange to remove her by force, which they accomplished, and brought her to London, not for the purpose of placing her in an asylum, for at this time not a suspicion of her insanity existed in the mind of any of her friends, but to induce her to return to her home.

On Miss Nottidge's arrival in London, on the 10th of November, she replied to all her friends that it was quite useless urging her to return home, that she must live with "God" at Charlange. She then told her assembled relatives that it had been revealed to her that Mr. Prince was "God manifest in the flesh;" that "the spirit of our Lord had descended on earth, and had chosen the body of the person she once knew as Mr. Prince as his temple of residence or abode;" she added, that "the world would soon be at an end, that the day of grace was passed, and the day of judgment arrived." These extraordinary announcements, her altered manner, loss of all feeling for her family, and total abandonment of prayer, which she had continued up to her recent removal to the Agapemone, alarmed her friends, and led them for the first time to doubt her sanity.

Her uncle recommended that medical men should be called in, and Dr. Rowland and Mr. Morton were sent for; after a careful examination, they came to the conclusion that Miss Nottidge was of unsound mind, and signed her certificate. She was on the following day placed with me. I must here remark, that a near relative of Miss Nottidge had, the year before, been under my care, labouring under mental disease, and had happily recovered, and it was at the recommendation of this relative that she was sent to Moorcroft. For two days, Miss Nottidge refused to speak to me on the subject of her delusions, simply declaring it was "the will of God, and that it was all in his hands!" I therefore thought it my duty to inform the Commissioners of Lunacy more minutely of the case, and had an interview with them at their office. Within a short time, two of the commissioners (Dr. Turner and Mr. Campbell) visited Moorcroft, and had a long private interview with Miss Nottidge, and satisfied themselves that she was properly detained in the asylum. At first Miss Nottidge was melancholy, and much depressed in spirits. She refused to wear a bonnet, or walk out of the house, and seldom entered into conversation; spent much of her time walking up and down the room, singing what she termed praises, making use of no intelligible words. She daily expressed her surprise that "God did not send for her," stating that she was perfectly happy in her mind, knowing that he knew all things, and that she could not be detained unless it was his will. Every night, on going to bed, she packed all her clothes up, expecting God would send for her during the night, and this she continued to do as long as she remained at Moorcroft.

By degrees she became cheerful and more communicative. At different times she told me "the day of grace was passed, and the day of judgment arrived; that it was useless to offer up prayers, she only sang praises." She intimated that she and all the Agapemone party were saved, and that the world would soon be at an end. She told me she did not know if I could be saved; she hoped that I should, but she could not help it. On one occasion she told me "that she should not die like other people, and be buried in a coffin, but be carried up to heaven in the twinkling of an eye." I use her exact words; and on my expressing my astonishment at her assertions, she instanced the translation of Elijah. She repeatedly told me Mr. Prince was "God Almighty," "God manifest in the

flesh," that the spirit of our Lord had entered into him whom she once knew as Mr. Prince, and that he could render her immortal. She never read the Bible, declaring it all completed now, and therefore it was quite useless so to do. Miss Nottidge, during the summer of 1847, improved so much, that I hoped she would entirely recover: she became cheerful, tranquil in her deportment, resumed her bonnet, and again paid attention to her dress, at the same time seldom speaking of her delusions. Her bodily health at this time was very good. At her urgent request, and after giving her promise not to leave without our knowledge, she was permitted to walk out unattended, and this she continued to do until the 6th of January, 1848, on which day she went out under the pretence of calling on my wife, and made her escape to London. In a letter she sent me from the station, to allay my fears, she says: "I firmly believe it (the going away) is the will of God." "Fear nothing; God will provide." "The Lord is my helper." She was brought back on the 8th of January; and from this time to the period of her discharge, (May 15th, 1848,) continued from time to time to repeat all her delusions. She had entirely lost all natural affection for her mother and friends—a most frequent symptom of insanity. I should not omit to mention that Miss Nottidge refused to write to any one for a lengthened period, alleging that God knew everything—He knew where she was, and would fetch her when He thought right.

During Miss Nottidge's residence at Moorcroft, she was examined privately, eight times, by the commissioners in lunacy, including Drs. Turner, Prichard, and Hume; and the three legal commissioners, Messrs. Procter, Mylne, and Campbell. These gentlemen were unanimously of opinion that she was of unsound mind. Dr. Marshall Hall visited her once a fortnight, and the case was fully laid before Dr. Conolly: these eminent physicians entirely concurred in the views of the commissioners and medical attendants. In determining the state of my patient's mind, it was important to ascertain how far the residents at the Agapemone believed in the divinity of Mr. Prince, &c., and it was found that they did not believe anything so monstrous. During the examination at the recent trial, they all explicitly denied any such belief; and two of them, in reply to Sir F. Thesiger's inquiries, distinctly gave it as their opinion, that a person entertaining such a belief must be of unsound mind.

In the month of May, 1848, Miss Nottidge was discharged by order of the commissioners in lunacy, on the ground that her bodily health was declining, and might be seriously injured by longer detention, they still remaining of opinion that she was insane. Dr. Turner dissented from this decision. The result was, that in a few days she gave the whole of her fortune, more than £6000, to the very man she believed to be God, and went to reside in the Abode of Love.

Whoever reads this simple statement, I feel persuaded will accord with the views the medical attendants took of this painful case. Yet, in the face of these facts, and never having seen or conversed with Miss Nottidge, the Chief Baron declares she was not of unsound mind, and never ought to have been interfered with; and furthermore, that no mad man or mad woman in England should be, who is not suicidal or homicidal! Dr. Conolly, in his admirable pamphlet, entitled "A Remonstrance with the Chief Baron," has so fully shown the grievous error into which he has fallen, and the injury such views, if carried out, would inflict upon society, that it is more than superfluous for me to enter on the consideration of this subject.

I am, Sir, your obedient servant,
ARTHUR STILWELL, M.D.

To the Editor of THE LANCET.

SIR,—Having seen the admirable letter of Dr. Arthur Stilwell, I have great satisfaction in adding my own views of this unhappy case.

Considering, then, that Miss Nottidge had broken every tie of natural affection; that she had left her own mother and her own home; that she could believe Mr. Prince to be God; that she should believe that she should not die, but be translated; that she should prepare for this translation nightly, (by packing up her clothes;) that she should omit to put on becoming attire, and to take healthful exercise; that she should be ready to yield up the provision made for her by her parents; finally, considering that all these aberrations were united in Miss Nottidge, I never could, I never can, doubt the existence of her insanity, or that she ought to be the object of peculiar care and surveillance.

That Miss Nottidge's notions were not exalted notions of a religious nature, is proved by her breaking her own word, and

enacting a lie, when she escaped from Moorcroft. That what has been said respecting her property is true, is proved by her having parted with her patrimony, leaving herself destitute.

Much credit is due to Dr. Arthur Stilwell for his cautious and judicious charge of Miss Nottidge. No time, no opportunity, was lost in referring the case to the judgment of the Commissioners; and I am of opinion that these gentlemen performed their responsible duties with extraordinary care and circumspection.—I am, Sir, your obedient servant,

MARSHALL HALL.

THE CONTEMPLATED POOR-LAW MEDICAL SUPERANNUATION FUND.

To the Editor of THE LANCET.

SIR,—In your last number, page 20, you inform us that a superannuation fund is in prospect for the poor-law medical officers of this country; you approve and encourage the scheme as a just one for the medical profession, and you contend, amongst other things, that this grant is as well deserved by union medical officers as it is due to army and navy surgeons.

I respect, as a member of the medical profession, that spirit and sense of right on your part which for many years have well declared you to be the friend and the supporter of that profession; but with all deference, I must dissent from you on a few points connected with the present subject.

The soldier and the sailor enter into the service of their country in the prime of life, with the unavoidable fact before them that they cannot have the choice of their medical advisers, but that they must be subject to treatment, in time of need, from officers especially appointed to their care—appointed, not by the mere patronage of an incompetent or partial authority, but selected by one central and competent board, having no object in that selection but the eligibility of the officer, and the advantage and interests of those who are to become their patients, while the whole time of these officers is for many years devoted to their peculiar service.

A large majority of our paupers pass the prime of their lives—nay, lengthened lives—not as recipients from parochial funds, but truly contributing to the same, by paying the rates and taxes of their country, while they enjoy the comparatively inestimable advantage of choosing their medical advisers in the hour of danger.

If justice requires that the medical profession should receive, with respect to the poor laws, a generous consideration, let justice still be even-handed, and ask, that by one act the interest of the poor as well as that of the medical profession be served. In a word, if the same amount of additional national expenditure for the well-deserved advantage of the profession, can and will, with an altered system, secure to the poor another condition—a condition indeed for themselves, calculated to give them the fuller benefits of civilized life, why should this double benefit be overlooked?

A board of guardians, with their authority, may choose for the poor man the colour of his coat, with the effect, perhaps, of only wounding his natural or his proper pride—they may prescribe for him the exact weight and the uniform quality of his Sunday's and Monday's dinner, with the further effect of hazarding his health—but they cannot fasten upon him, in time of disease, the services of a medical man in whom he has no confidence, without inflicting upon him an amount of moral and physical wrong, which is only to be recognised by those who will give a fair consideration to the influence of a free choice and a confiding mind with respect to a medical man, upon the event or termination of disease.

It is true that difficulties might attend the giving to the inmates of workhouses these just advantages, but the great bulk of paupers—at least, of those who are paupers in a medical point of view, are attached to private residences in districts; and here the abolition of the contract system, with one officer, can be, and ought to be effected.

With little additional expense, a certain scale of remuneration may be fixed upon for all cases occurring amongst paupers; the names of all legally-qualified medical practitioners willing to attend upon such fixed terms might be taken, (for, let it be added, all established practitioners bear the only onus of contributing to rates,) and thus the sick pauper may have the necessary aid from the medical man of his own choice.

But while this arrangement would secure at once to the poor and to the profession an equitable position, there is another class which would derive benefit from the system.

The rich have had too frequently to dread the spread amongst themselves of contagious or pestilential disease, from