The Classical Review

<http://journals.cambridge.org/CAR>

Additional services for *The Classical Review*:

Email alerts: [Click here](#)

Subscriptions: [Click here](#)

Commercial reprints: [Click here](#)

Terms of use : [Click here](#)

Champault's *Geography of the Odyssey* Philippe Champault. *Phéniciens et Grecs en Italic d'après l'Odyssée*. Étude géographique, historique et sociale par une méthode nouvelle. Paris: Ernest Leroux, 1906. Fr. 6.

T. W. Allen

The Classical Review / Volume 20 / Issue 09 / December 1906, pp 470 - 470

DOI: 10.1017/S0009840X00995386, Published online: 27 October 2009

Link to this article: http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract_S0009840X00995386

How to cite this article:

T. W. Allen (1906). The Classical Review, 20, pp 470-470 doi:10.1017/S0009840X00995386

Request Permissions : [Click here](#)

CHAMPAULT'S *GEOGRAPHY OF THE ODYSSEY*.

CHAMPAULT, PHILIPPE. *Phéniciens et Grecs en Italie d'après l'Odyssée*. Étude géographique, historique et sociale par une méthode nouvelle. Paris: Ernest Leroux, 1906. Fr. 6.

ERATOSTHENES said we should know *ποῦ πεπλάνηται Ὀδυσσεὺς* when we had found the tailor who sewed the bag of the winds. I am afraid M. Champault has not discovered the tailor, though he has written 602 pages about the wanderings. According to him Scheria is Ischia, the ancient Aenaria; the Cyclops lived on Posilipo, the home of Aeolus is the Aegades, the Lotus-eaters were the date-eating tribes of Tunis: Calypso means Gibraltar, Circe means Pianosa near Elba: Taormina is the island of the Sun, the pumice-cliffs of Lipari the wandering rocks; the Sirens haunted the Punta della Licosa, to the south of Paestum; the dead and the Laestrygonians alike inhabit Sardinia.

These remarkable conclusions are arrived at by means of 'une méthode analytique basée sur les travaux de Le Play et de l'abbé de Tourville,' and frequent reference is made to the author's articles in a periodical entitled *La Science Sociale*. I regret that I do not find either science or method in the book, unless it is the Method of Agreement recklessly applied. By M. Champault's process, any island in the West or East Mediterranean might be picked out for the home of Alcinoüs; his book, though longer and infinitely more pretentious, has about as much authority as the romance of the late Samuel Butler, who located Nausicaa in the genial district which now produces Marsala Vergine. The book resembles M. Bérard's recent work on the Phoenicians, and I am afraid must to some extent discredit that remarkable book. We have the same Phoenicians, the same trading-stations, the same appeal to etymologies;

but whereas Bérard clung to tradition in many points, and vindicated Corfù, Ithaca, and Circeii, M. Champault has thrown everything into the pot once more, and produced the unholy *κυκεών* which I have described. He accepts Bérard's Semitic etymologies, the most disputable part of the book, and adds thereto of his own: e.g. p. 90, 'Φαίηκες s'explique par deux mots grecs: *φαίος*, noir; *ήκη* (forme ionienne pour *ἀκή*), pointe ou sommet.' A note follows: 'sur *ἀκή* signifiant *pointe* voir la note p. 432.' When we do so, we find the breathings and accents more normal, but *Θρινακίη* derived from '*ἀκή* ou *ήκη*' que nous avons déjà rencontré dans *φαίηκες*, dans *πιθ-ηκ-ουσα* et que nous rencontrons plus loin dans *ἀστ-ακ-ίη*.' The Sociology which the author declares distinguishes his book induces him to find in the artless tale of Nausicaa (p. 347) 'un ensemble d'allusions transparentes au mariage de la colonie occidentale avec les étrangers'!

This sort of book does a great deal of harm. For it is on the right tack: tides, currents, harbours, place-names, habits and customs, and the Mediterranean Pilot are the right criteria by which to determine the place, date, and meaning of a heroic poem; and it is generally agreed that the brilliant book in which these tests were first applied has given us a considerable residuum of solidly based knowledge. The effect of M. Champault's caricature will be to throw us back into the Higher Criticism—which I need not say the land of its birth is practising as composedly as though nothing had happened. Old gentlemen in this country were beginning to be aware that the Achilleides and Telemachiae of their Grotes and Geddases were waning and gibbering in the morning light. They will now, crying it was the nightingale and not the lark, clasp to their breasts these comfortable ghosts.

T. W. ALLEN.