Music in French Cathedrals and Churches

Author(s): John Mason and W. W.

Source: *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*, Vol. 34, No. 608 (Oct. 1, 1893), pp. 618-619

Published by: [Musical Times Publications Ltd.](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3362244>

Accessed: 21-01-2016 19:30 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Musical Times Publications Ltd. is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

found (printers' errors mostly) than would fill one volume of the "Dictionary of Music and Musicians."

Perhaps the proposed *fac-simile* reproductions of Beethoven's MSS. will throw light on some of the discrepancies alluded to in my last letter, but here is another, of which I have vainly sought an explanation. Towards the end of the Ninth Symphony, in the 6-4 movement, if anyone will take the trouble to compare the first edition with any later one he will find that the second bassoon and double bassoon had not originally the extravagantly difficult quaver runs along with the violoncellos and basses, nor had the second flute anything like its present part. Whether rightly or wrongly I know not, but they were much easier at first. *Who altered them?*—Faithfully yours,

F. CORDER.

TO THE EDITOR OF "THE MUSICAL TIMES."

SIR,—I am exceedingly interested in the subject raised by Mr. Silas *re* Beethoven's Seventh Symphony. I remember, when a student, conducting a local orchestra at a rehearsal of this work, and wondering at the undoubted discord produced by playing the bar in question according to the score and parts, and commented upon it to some of the players.

One feels that one is "treading upon sacred ground" when playing the music of Beethoven, and I am sure that this feeling of awe is the cause why acknowledged great professors of the art have been willing to accept as correct, and no doubt explain satisfactorily to themselves, a passage which from no modern composer would they allow to go unchallenged. Whether such slavery to tradition is wise seems a question. When studying with the late Thomas Wingham I once mentioned this subject, and he said to me he thought that most likely it was a *mistake* by the engraver.

Mr. Silas is undoubtedly correct in inferring that the bar has generated grave doubts as to the composer *really* meaning it in the minds of the many musicians who have had the arranging of it from score for pianoforte, &c., as I have before me an old copy of an arrangement for pianoforte duet by W. Watts, published by Chappell & Co. In it I see that although the "Chord of D" is not omitted *entirely*, as by Hummel and Kalkbrenner, yet the suggestion that the bar in score must be a mistake evidently occurred to him, as the "A" chord is continued up to the last semiquaver of the bar.

It stands thus in this copy:—

The image shows a musical score for two parts, Primo and Secondo. The Primo part is written on a treble clef staff with a key signature of one sharp (F#). It features a series of chords and a quaver run. The Secondo part is written on a bass clef staff with the same key signature. It also features a series of chords and a quaver run. Both parts have a bar marked with an asterisk (*) and the letters 'c.c.' at the end, indicating a specific chord or measure. The score is labeled 'PRIMO.' and 'SECONDO.' on the left side.

I hope, Sir, that you will kindly allow this subject space as long as it is possible, so as to get several opinions, feeling sure that musicians must agree that any trouble is worth taking to get the most reasonably correct version of a bar from so monumental a work as Beethoven's Seventh Symphony.—Yours truly,

H. WILCOX LAWRENCE.

Heathlands, Lewisham Road.

MUSIC IN FRENCH CATHEDRALS AND CHURCHES.

TO THE EDITOR OF "THE MUSICAL TIMES."

SIR,—An article on the above subject in THE MUSICAL TIMES for July has just been brought to my notice, in

which comparisons are drawn between the music in French and English Cathedrals, very much to the disadvantage of the latter. The writer only mentions Reims and Cologne by name, but he distinctly draws his comparisons between "any one of our provincial Cathedrals and the provincial Cathedral of Reims." In passing, I would note that he purposely leaves out of the question "the well known choirs of the capitals of both countries, which enjoy exceptional advantages." This looks as if he knew very little of such choirs as those of York Minster or Durham, to say nothing of King's or Trinity College Chapels at Cambridge, which, though not in size, can certainly be compared very favourably in other respects with any church or cathedral choir in London.

But it is not of English Cathedral Services I wish to write. My object is to correct the impression conveyed by the article of your correspondent, W. E. D., that English Cathedral services are inferior to French. I do not know Reims, but I have lately, during a tour in France, heard services of one kind or another in the two Abbeys at Caen, and one church, St. Pierre; in the Cathedral of Bayeux, in the church (formerly a Cathedral) at Lisieux, in the Cathedrals of Rouen, Chartres (Funeral Service), and Tours, besides other smaller churches. The services were high mass, low mass, service for the dead performed by priests alone (at Bayeux), penitential service (at the Abbaye aux Dames, Caen), services of Psalms and of hymns alone; so there was no lack of variety from which to draw conclusions. Some of these were specially grand services during the month of May. It is not too much to say we did not hear a service, or even a portion of one, which could be called beautiful or interesting, or even tolerable from a musical point of view. We had high mass seven times, and possibly W. E. D. will not credit it, but there was not a note of harmony in any one of them. This is a state of things alone sufficient to put comparisons out of the question. At Tours the organ, whose tone was grand, was horribly out of tune, and this was the case in one or two other instances. The voices were egregiously out of tune times without number; on one occasion the solo performer, whoever he was, seemed unable ever to hit the right note. At Tours we followed an announcement in the newspaper that at the Church of St. Julien there would be music after vespers. This consisted of a fine baritone, a soprano, and a flautist giving two solos each. They would have been good, or at least fairly good, if the organist had been as equal to his work as those one commonly meets in English country parish churches; but he was not. At Bayeux and Chartres the voices were obviously unequal to singing right without assistance; they were therefore led and dominated by the strains—in unison, of course—of a contra-bass. W. E. D. speaks much of "hymns with endless variety of treatment," of music by Palestrina, Mozart, and Haydn, which he has heard at Reims. These appeared to be totally unknown elsewhere in my painful, but varied experience. Finally, let me emphasise my object in writing, which is to dispel any notion that in the ordinary run of provincial Cathedrals in France anything worthy of the name of music is to be heard.—Yours faithfully,

JOHN MASON.

Windermere, September 10, 1893.

TO THE EDITOR OF "THE MUSICAL TIMES."

SIR,—I have just seen the letter of "H. A. W." in your issue for August, in which he expresses his doubts whether the plain-chant of Rouen, with its accompaniments, is in print. As far as the Mass is concerned, there was published by Fleury, of Rouen, in 1868, a set of "Messes pour les fêtes solennelles," which consists of the plain-chant in modern notation with organ accompaniment. The Masses are variously arranged for three or four voices, with the plain-chant in soprano or tenor. A note states that they were harmonised in 1847 by M. Ch. Vervoitte, the Chapelmaster of the Cathedral. Fleury also publishes the "Paroissien Romain, noté," of which the most recent edition is that of 1890. His address at Rouen is 23, Place de l'Hôtel-de-Ville. While I am writing on the subject I may say that a comparison of the plain-chant books of various dioceses in France reveals considerable lack of uniformity in the

music. A Holy Week book (Paris, 1828) has music which I cannot find anywhere else, and in a Gradual (Metz, 1805) and a Vespéral (Avignon, 1819) the plain-chant is utterly different from that of Mechlin. The former has frequently not only time-signatures, but also sharps before many notes in the hymns.

Two years ago, in Rouen, at the Feast of the Assumption, I heard a very fine Credo, in the fifth mode, sung in unison by the whole congregation. It is quite unlike any given in the Mechlin edition, but the Digne Gradual (1855) has it, with, however, an intonation different to Dumont's. In the Municipal Library of Rouen there is said to be a MS. plain-chant book which is maintained to be pure, and I was told of a monastery in the neighbourhood where the Gregorian music is said to be uncorrupted.

A study of the various French Graduals and Vesperals leads me to conclude that each diocese went its own way in arranging the plain-chant. I read somewhere that a Commission had been appointed to decide on a single system. Many hymns seem to be peculiar to a particular locality, and one instinctively feels the influence of local popular tunes. In some this is quite undeniable, but the subject is too enormous to go into here.—Yours faithfully,
September 21, 1893. W. W.

DUKE ERNEST'S OPERA "SANTA CHIARA."

TO THE EDITOR OF "THE MUSICAL TIMES."

SIR,—In the last issue of your periodical (p. 534) I see a most astounding statement regarding "Santa Chiara" opera, by the Duke Ernest.

In his book "Aus meinem Leben und aus meiner Zeit," he states that his "opera was performed more than sixty times" in Paris.

Enclosed please find extract from the "Bibliothèque Musicale du Théâtre de l'Opéra," by Théodore de Lajarte, a copy of which you will find at the British Museum, from which *official document* it appears that "Santa Chiara" had only nine performances at the time.

DLIII.

Sainte Claire (Santa Chiara).

Opéra en 3 actes.

Musique de S. A. R. Ernest, duc de S. Cobourg-Gotha. Paroles de Mme. Birch-Pfeiffer. Traduites par G. Oppelt.

Représenté pour la 1re fois le lundi, 27 Sept., 1855.

A.—Partition d'orch. Trois cahiers in-fol., man.

B.—Partition vocale (souffleur). Quatre cahiers.

C.—Répétiteur de Ballet.

D.—Vingt-six rôles.

E.—Quatre-vingt-dix parties de chœurs.

F.—Conducteur d'orch.—Trois cahiers.

G.—Cinquante parties d'orch.

9 représentations.

Respectfully yours,

ALBERT ZOLLINGER.

Théâtre National de l'Opéra,

34, Rue Dauphine, Paris, September 12, 1893.

[We are not, of course, responsible for the late Duke's statements, and have no means of explaining the discrepancy between his account and M. Zollinger's. We feel inclined to believe, however, that the Duke referred to the *total* number of performances, in Paris and elsewhere, although the passage in the book reads as if sixty performances in Paris were meant.—ED. M. T.]

A MUSICAL BLACKBIRD.

TO THE EDITOR OF "THE MUSICAL TIMES."

SIR,—The Blackbird mentioned by your correspondent F. R. C. in his letter concerning the song of the Yellow-Hammer, must have been in the habit of frequenting some Cathedral close, or have escaped from the home of a Cathedral chorister, as his *Leitmotif* proves to be identical with the opening phrase of Thomas Attwood Walmisley's Anthem "Father of Heaven," save that the bird trilled a minor third and Walmisley uses the major.

Yours faithfully,

HENRY KNIGHT.

4, Umfreville Road, Haringay, N.,
September 13, 1893.

THE SONG OF THE YELLOW-HAMMER.

TO THE EDITOR OF "THE MUSICAL TIMES."

SIR,—I see there has been a good deal of discussion on the song of the yellow-hammer.

Will you kindly insert the following, which I have found to be correct in Cornwall?—

This is quite correct as regards the notation, but the yellow-hammer has a tendency to sharpen slightly the D, and instead of B, a note a quarter-tone between B and B flat, thereby flattening the B. This is, of course, very unmusical.—Yours, &c.,

Cornwall, September 10, 1893.

H. T. B.

P.S.—To render the proper effect of the bird the notes will have to be played in the uppermost octave of the pianoforte.

TO CORRESPONDENTS.

* * * Notices of concerts, and other information supplied by our friends in the country, must be forwarded as early as possible after the occurrence; otherwise they cannot be inserted. Our correspondents must specifically denote the date of each concert, for without such date no notice can be taken of the performance.

Our correspondents will oblige by writing all names as clearly as possible, as we cannot be responsible for any mistakes that may occur.

Correspondents are informed that their names and addresses must accompany all communications.

We cannot undertake to return offered contributions; the authors, therefore, will do well to retain copies.

Notice is sent to all subscribers whose payment (in advance) is exhausted. The paper will be discontinued where the Subscription is not renewed. We again remind those who are disappointed in obtaining back numbers that, although the music is always kept in stock, only a sufficient quantity of the rest of the paper is printed to supply the current sale.

BRIEF SUMMARY OF COUNTRY NEWS.

We do not hold ourselves responsible for any opinions expressed in this summary, as all the notices are either collated from the local papers or supplied to us by correspondents.

BLACKPOOL.—Dr. Horton Allison's Concerto for pianoforte and orchestra, originally produced at the London Westminster Orchestral Society's Concert on December 9, 1891, received a favourable reception here on August 29, when it was performed at Mr. de Jong's Concert.

BOLTON.—A Musical Service was held on the 18th ult. in the Wesleyan Chapel. Mr. A. E. Jones, the Organist, played a varied selection of organ music, Mr. G. W. Nelson contributed two violoncello solos, and Miss Marjorie Eaton's singing of "On mighty pens" was much admired.

CAPE TOWN.—The Dean of Cape Town, on the 4th ult., presented Mr. Barrow-Dowling with a handsomely mounted *bâton* in recognition of his services as Organist and Choirmaster of the Cathedral.

CHRISTCHURCH, NEW ZEALAND.—Mr. Wallace, on July 20 last, commenced a series of classical Chamber Concerts which promises to prove highly successful. Schumann's Pianoforte and Violin Sonata in D minor, Beethoven's Sonata "Pathétique," Tartini's "Devil's Trill" Sonata, and Haydn's "Emperor" Quartet were included in the first programme, which was excellently rendered. The following week, on July 27, Mr. Wallace introduced to a Christchurch audience, assembled in the Oddfellows' Hall, Mr. F. H. Cowen's cantata *St. John's Eve*, the melodious and graceful character of which greatly pleased. The soloists were Miss Bonnington, Mrs. Jennings, Mr. F. Woodhouse, and Mr. Day.

DUBLIN.—Sir Robert Stewart, on the 13th ult., received in the Examination Hall, Trinity College, a deputation of distinguished musicians from London to explain the objects of the Incorporated Society of Musicians. Mr. Chadfield stated that the Society now included 136 Doctors of Music, 53 Bachelors of Music, 33 Fellows, Members, and Associates of the Royal Academy, 32 Licentiates of the Royal Academy, 6 Professors of the Royal College, 95 Fellows of the College of Organists, 30 Licentiates of Trinity College, London, 10 Professors of the Guildhall School, 19 with degrees from foreign conservatoires, and 306 holding appointments as Organists. The approval of the scheme by Sir Robert Stewart will doubtless secure the co-operation of many Irish members.

HALESWORTH.—Through the liberality of Mrs. Warwick, of Halesworth, the organ in the Parish Church, built by Messrs. Norman Bros. and Beard in 1889, has now been completed. The instrument was opened on the 10th ult.

HANLEY.—The fifth season of the Meakin Popular Concerts was opened on the 18th ult. in the Town Hall, before an audience of 3,000. Dr. C. S. Heap was heard in Mendelssohn's Pianoforte Concerto in D minor and in Weber's Concertstück (Op. 79), and Mr. F. Ward,