Music in Elementary Schools
Marmaduke E. Browne
Published online: 28 Jan 2009.

To cite this article: Marmaduke E. Browne (1885) Music in Elementary Schools, Proceedings of the Musical Association, 12:1, 1-22, DOI: 10.1093/jrma/12.1.1

To link to this article: http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/jrma/12.1.1
OCTOBER 31, 1885.

MR. SOUTHGATE
IN THE CHAIR.

MUSIC IN ELEMENTARY SCHOOLS.
BY THE REV. MARMADUKE E. BROWNE.

It may perhaps interest some members of the Musical Association to know how far the Association's special subject of interest is studied and taught in the schools designed for the poorest of the population: and as, owing to circumstances which I shall presently explain, I happen to have it within my power to collect certain statistics which it would not be easy for any one less intimately connected with a number of schools to gather together, I believe that, however imperfect my contribution to the treatment of the subject may be, it will have such value as belongs to a plain statement of facts which admit of no dispute.

You are aware, of course, that Elementary Schools are first of all under the control of the Education Department. That department issues the code of regulations as to who may teach, what they may teach, what grant will be paid for successful results, and so on.

The majority of the Elementary Schools acknowledged by the department as "efficient" are known as Voluntary Schools—i.e., are supported by voluntary contributions, in addition to the fee paid by the children. The fee in an Elementary School may not (according to the rules of the department) exceed 9d. per week. And the total grant payable to any school may not exceed the total income of the school from all other sources whatever, or a sum equal to 17s. 6d. for each unit of average attendance (whichever of these two sums be the greater).

Each Voluntary School has its own Committee of Local Managers, and its own Secretary or Correspondent.

The work of the Voluntary Schools is, however, supplemented by those of the Board Schools—i.e., schools where compulsory levies on the rates take the place of the voluntary contributions, and which are managed by Boards triennially elected by the ratepayers.

I have no doubt that at the present moment I am addressing some representatives of the London ratepayer (whom
Music in Elementary Schools.

somebody the other day wittily described as an overrated
person), who have been to-day with mingled feelings
recording their votes for candidates for a new School Board
for London. Whatever their feelings on the subject of rates
may be, I hope I shall be able to show them that, so far as
the teaching of "music" is concerned, the London School
Board, as it has hitherto existed, has taken pains to employ
efficient teachers and obtain satisfactory results.

However, to return to my preliminary statement,
which I am making as brief as I can, consistent with clear-
ness. The School Board district of London is mapped out into
eleven divisions—the City, Chelsea, Finsbury, Greenwich,
Hackney, Lambeth East, Lambeth West, Marylebone,
Southwark, Tower Hamlets, and Westminster.

For each of these there is a local Correspondent, an officer
of the Board through whom all business relating to all schools
in that division (except the business of getting the children
out of the streets into the schools) must pass on its way
either to the Central Office of the Board, or the Education
or Science and Art Departments. It is one of these offices
which I have the honour to hold, and you will see at once
what an intimate acquaintance with all persons and things
connected with all the Board Schools in any division the
Correspondent must possess. I will merely add that in this
Marylebone Division, for which I correspond, there are at
present some twenty-seven Board Schools actually open,
accommodating 27,200 children, and employing 462 adult
teachers.

Thus, if (as I admit) all that I shall lay before you will be
derived from study of only a sample of Elementary Schools,
I think you will admit that the sample is large enough to be
considered fairly representative.

However, in order to collect statistics of Voluntary
Schools in the same district, and Voluntary and Board
Schools in every part of London, I lately issued to about thirty
Voluntary Schools in Marylebone, and to over 100 Voluntary
and Board Schools in the rest of the London district, a form
requesting information as to the number of children and of
teachers—the number of teachers holding music certificates,
either under the Hullah system or the Tonic Sol-fa—the
number of hours per week given to music teaching, and the
names of any pieces specially commended by Her Majesty's
Inspector at his last visit.

The issue of these forms to the Marylebone Board Schools
has met with prompt and courteous response—every head
teacher to whom I sent one having taken the trouble to fill
the form up accurately. But the response from other schools
has not been so universal as to give me the large additional
amount of data which I hoped to obtain. Of thirty Voluntary
Music in Elementary Schools.

Schools in the Marylebone Division, one alone replied, and that after a letter of enquiry from the clergyman of the parish asking my reason for such enquiries! Of about fifty Voluntary Schools in other parts of London, three only have replied as yet, and from fifty Board Schools in the other divisions I have received as yet fifteen replies.

However, the answers on each of these, from whatever district of London, agree so exactly with the answers given in the Board Schools of Marylebone, that I think we may take it that sufficient information has been supplied to warrant us in drawing general deductions as to the state of music teaching in the Elementary Schools of London—and my statistics and remarks are confined to London—for nothing less than a Parliamentary Blue Book could supply material for including the rest of England.

I may, however, remark that when I suggested this subject for a paper last year I found that it was already in the hands of some one else, and so I gave up the notion of treating it; otherwise my intention had been to try and get similar information from such excellent School Boards as those at Birmingham, Liverpool, and Leicester. This I regret having been compelled to abandon, owing to the short time I have had for preparing this paper.

I have remarked already that the Code of Regulations issued by the Education Department binds all Elementary Schools, Board or Voluntary, as to the subjects to be taught, and the grants to be earned. I should add that, although the managers and teachers of each school draw up their own time table, allotting the hours to be given to each subject each week, yet that time table must be renewed each year, and signed by Her Majesty's Inspector on behalf of the Department. Now, without attempting to give you a summary of this Code, which it would, I fear, be beyond my power to make lively or interesting, I may simply state that one of its principles is payment by results. The total grant payable annually depends on the result of the examinations by Her Majesty's Inspector, and is made up of sums payable on elementary subjects—Class subjects (or those in which the whole class can be examined together), Specific subjects (in which children presented are examined individually), Needlework, and Singing—i.e., as it is tersely put in a recent article in the Daily News: "Government offers to all public Elementary Schools, conducted on certain lines, grants on condition that they will teach certain subjects," of which subjects "Singing" is one; and the grant offered is 6d. per child taught by ear, and 1s. per child taught by note.

It will be evident at once, therefore, that musical people in looking at this subject must be content to expect very little of what they understand as "Music." The Code regards it
Music in Elementary Schools.

as a grant-earning subject—not as a science or an art. It is rather an amusing reflection for a musician that the Government Department of Science and Art has no place for music! The teachers have to find room for it in a timetable already loaded with the necessary “three R’s,” and the extra subjects before alluded to; and, therefore, it is not surprising if we find energy mainly concentrated on getting the children to sing decently in time and tune, and with a certain amount of attention to piano and forte, the number of pieces asked for by the Government Inspector, by whatever means can attain that result most easily in a limited time. Accordingly, in the great majority of schools, the system employed is the Tonic Sol-fa—out of forty Board Schools in only two do I find the Old notation mentioned; and there it is taught to some children in upper classes as an addition to their previous lessons on the Tonic Sol-fa system. I have neither time nor wish now to raise the vexed question of the merits of the Tonic Sol-fa system; those who know anything of it will be able to judge for themselves how much practical or theoretical knowledge of the rudiments of music can be gathered from its exclusive use. So far as I can judge, the Old notation appears to find more favour in Voluntary Schools; but it should be remembered that the School Board for London has clearly expressed its opinion in favour of the Tonic Sol-fa system being used in its schools.

Another difficulty, besides limited time, which the teachers have to contend with, is that in many schools the children are ill-clad and ill-fed, and the result appears in thin voices easily fatigued, their voices further damaged for singing purposes by the children’s habit of shouting loudly to one another in the streets, and habitually using in conversation the lower register of their voices, often in a coarse and hard tone, which is fatal to sweetness of song, except under the training of a teacher skilful and experienced enough to incorporate some voice training into his class lessons.

A third teachers’ difficulty lies in the fact that he, himself, and still more unfortunately she, herself, has to use for teaching singing a voice which has to stand the strain of class-teaching in all the other subjects for all the rest of the five school days of the week—to an audience of musical people it is merely necessary to state the fact for it to carry its full weight. I should, perhaps, add here, that in speaking of teachers throughout this paper I have taken account of adult teachers only. I have made no allowance for the pupil teachers, because, on account of their age (ranging from fourteen to eighteen), they cannot possibly be of any great practical use in teaching singing to classes consisting of from forty to seventy children on an average.

And now, having indicated some of the teachers’ diffi-
difficulties, it is necessary to touch upon the qualifications of the Elementary School Teachers for this special subject. Nearly all the best members of this profession have gone through the complete course—viz., an apprenticeship as pupil teacher for four or five years (the term is now four years), followed by two years' training in one of the colleges specially existing for that purpose. In all these colleges music figures as one of the subjects to which attention is given, and it is possible for all students to obtain while in college either the Hullah certificate or the Intermediate Tonic Sol-fa (which, of course, are equally accessible to teachers who obtain their certificates without going to college if they choose to work for them).

But I am bound to say, from my own knowledge of many such teachers, and from the opinions of many teachers themselves as freely expressed to me, that so far as real musical training is concerned, these certificates and the college instruction go for very little. So far as I can gather, only one of the colleges, St. Mark's, Chelsea, has any musical traditions, or takes any special pride in the subject; and I could name students from that college who show clearly that they have been in excellent hands there; in other instances of conspicuous ability which have come under my personal notice, I am inclined to think the credit is due to the teachers themselves and their natural love for the subject, rather than to any great assistance gained at the training college.

I find, for instance, extremely few who have any knowledge of the training of the voice or the management of the breath; any acquaintance with the best old English musical literature of glee, madrigal, and part-song, and yet a hearty appreciation of any information on these and similar subjects whenever obtainable. Many of them have considerable practical skill—sufficient, at all events, to enable them to be members of church or chapel choirs and choral societies, and a small proportion are competent organists. I take the replies to my questions from twelve Board Schools, selected at random from all parts of London outside the Marylebone Division. I find that in these twelve schools there are 236 teachers, of whom eleven are organists, nine of them actually holding engagements; seventy-seven are members of church and chapel choirs and choral societies, and five sing professionally. I think that is a fair sample; and whatever improvement we may hope for in the work at present accomplished in our schools the above facts seem to me to show that, having regard to the means placed within their reach, and the time at their disposal, the elementary teachers are fairly on the way to become well qualified for teaching music to the children; and show an aptitude for, and an interest in, music to an extent which will compare favourably with any other profession, except, perhaps, the clerical.
Turning now to the music itself as taught in the schools, I think I have already said enough to show you that it is not "technical education" in music at all. It amounts to little more than a combination of physical exercise and drill, carried out by means of song. This lesson, I consider, has immense advantages even though its value as music is small. It gives a welcome relief from the grinding at elementary subjects; it satisfies the child instinct for using the voice in the utterance of musical sounds apart from words, and trains that instinct; it satisfies the gregarious instinct of children, giving a sense of unity in action, sowing the germ which may grow in after life into the feeling of a common brotherhood—the strength springing from union—to the power and beauty of which Christianity itself is ever pointing; it exercises healthfully the organs of the lungs and throat, and so on; and it adds an attraction to school life which must not be undervalued. All that we can do to make school attractive and happy to our poor children ought to be done, so that they may be tempted rather than driven to the place where it is so necessary for them to spend many hours of their life—and the singing lesson is certainly a pleasure to the children. You have only to watch the classes while the lesson is going on to feel assured of that, and I could name a large school in a very poor and dirty neighbourhood (where the fee is only 1/- per week and even that fee has often to be remitted) where I found the teacher in the habit of punishing any class that misbehaved itself by depriving it of its singing lesson, and I was informed that the children had a strong objection to this form of punishment.

I have already stated that the London School Board has supported its teachers in the general use of the Tonic Sol-fa system. Its Code of Instruction for teachers, however, contains a syllabus of teaching for both notations, and lays down the following rule:—"Instruction in singing must be graduated according to the syllabus shown in Appendix IV. In every school there must be at least one responsible teacher holding a certificate for teaching singing by the Tonic Sol-fa or by the Old notation, or both. These certificates will be issued by the Board on the recommendation of the Singing Instructor."

The Singing Instructor, who has one assistant, is employed by the Board to ensure the carrying out of its syllabus on a uniform and efficient scale, to assist the teachers to improve their qualifications for teaching, and to report to the Board on all matters connected with this subject—to organize the large gatherings of elementary school children which are held on special occasions at the Crystal Palace and elsewhere.

The syllabus itself is too long for me to give here, but I have a copy with me if anyone present likes to look at it, and
Music in Elementary Schools.

I propose to add it as an appendix to this paper when it appears in our volume of "Annual Proceedings." I will here only call attention to a few points in that syllabus. It will be noted that teachers in infant schools are very judiciously cautioned as to "soft and pure tone," "clear and distinct utterance of words," "music should be within the children's limited range of voice," "For infants' departments action songs are strongly recommended" (this bears out what I remarked just now about the music lesson combining physical exercise and drill). Some of these action songs are extremely amusing and very pretty, and I have seen some invented by the teacher of the class herself which were cleverly planned and thoroughly enjoyed by the little people who performed them.

For the upper departments (boys and girls) the syllabus defines the course for each standard and sums up with the following note: "It is recommended that as a general rule the time devoted to each of the two weekly lessons in music should be occupied in the following manner:—

(a) A voice exercise suited to each division ... 3 minutes.
(b) Teaching time from modulator ... ... 5 "
(c) Teaching time from charts and black board ... 5 "
(d) Ear exercises for tune and time ... ... 3 "
(e) Teaching time and tune from charts ... ... 6 "
(f) Practice of school songs from black board or books ... ... ... ... ... 8 "

from which it is evident that two half-hours per week is the amount of time which, in the opinion of the Board, can be spared for teaching music.

Turning, however, to the school answers to my questions again, I find that in the Marylebone Board Schools, taking twenty-five out of the twenty-seven (for I omitted one and another mislaid my form), that amount is exceeded in eighteen boys' and mixed departments, in sixteen girls' departments, and in nineteen infants'; and in only one school the girls and infants have less than the hour. Three boys' departments and one mixed give two hours or more to this subject, two girls' departments give two hours or more, and in ten infants' departments the two hours is reached or exceeded—one excellent school giving as much as three and a-half hours to singing.

Not to weary you with figures, I will merely say that the returns received from other schools substantially agree with those above quoted.

On looking over the names of pieces mentioned as having been sung in any of these schools, I find Mendelssohn's name oftenest; several schools mention his "Skylark." I heard this very nicely sung by one girls' school, where the teacher, on being shown that the tenor and bass parts formed
Music in Elementary Schools.

a canon with the treble and alto, had divided her girls into two sets of treble and alto, and given the tenor and bass share of the canon to one of these. Two schools or more mention Mendelssohn's "New year" and "Departure"; two or three Sullivan's "O hush thee, my baby" (fancy the effect of this given in a girls' school, with no tenor or bass possible!)

One large boys' school names Shield's "O happy pair," as having been sung in three parts. One boys' and one infants', Selections from "Pinafore." One boys' school names Abt's "Evening Bells," in three parts. Two or three girls' schools patronise Claribel's "Children's voices," and two boys' schools the "See-saw" waltz.

I think all will agree with me that improvement is wanted here—surely to train children to sing the two upper parts of a four-part song, and let them sing them week after week, and perhaps altogether, without the completed harmonies of tenor and bass, is corrupting the child's ear, instead of training it? It seems unkind to "tell tales out of school," but the following incident supplies an irresistible temptation. On one occasion, while visiting a school, I was aware of certain strange yet familiar sounds proceeding from one of the class rooms, so I remarked to the teacher to whom I was speaking, "That sounds rather like such and such a thing (naming a well-known part-song by an eminent composer), but your altos are singing all wrong notes." "Oh, no," was the answer, "They are singing what is on the blackboard; but one of the teachers altered the harmonies a little, because they sounded so queer!" Truly, "a little knowledge is a dangerous thing."

It is pleasanter to cite some instances of conspicuously good work which have come under my own notice. In one school, where French is taken as one of the "specific subjects" already mentioned, the teacher had combined his French and his music, and the boys presented to the inspector a two-part song in French, which I heard them sing several times with spirit and expression—as I am speaking of music alone, I need not criticise the French accent.

In the same school I have heard Kücken's duet "The happy hunter" capitally sung.

I was told in conversation by one of Her Majesty's Assistant Inspectors that some of the best school singing in this part of London is to be heard at one of the National schools in Paddington. I have heard in a church choir boys who had been taught by the master of that school, and before I was at all aware of the name of their teacher, I had been greatly struck by the remarkable excellence of training which they evidenced. A performance of "The Messiah" took place some months ago, in which the soprano and alto parts
of the choruses were sung entirely by children taught in that school, and I was informed by some who were present that the children acquitted themselves admirably.

But a still more remarkable achievement came under my personal notice. There is a school in the neighbourhood of Gray's Inn Road and Clerkenwell—not a cultured or aristocratic region—a school where fees are a difficulty, and boots a ceaseless care—where boys, girls, and teachers united in studying Mendelssohn's "Athalie" from beginning to end. A few teachers from other schools and their friends completed the necessary staff of tenors and basses—the solos were sung by the girls' head mistress and two of her friends. A friend of the head master accompanied on a grand piano lent for the occasion by one of the managers of the school, and the head master conducted. The performance was listened to, and heartily appreciated, by a crowded audience of children, parents, school managers, and a few members of the Board; it was remarkable for the crisp and accurate attack of the boys and girls—for the generally very true intonation, and for the enthusiastic enjoyment which the children showed in their achievement. One or two members of the Sacred Harmonic and other choral societies who were present in the chorus expressed their astonishment at the children's proficiency, and at the amount of patience, skill, and tact which must have been exercised, not only in teaching the children the notes, but in training them to appreciate and enjoy music which is commonly supposed to be beyond the comprehension of "the slums." All this work, remember, was gratuitous, quite independent of the "grant-earning" of the Code; most of it was done out of school hours, and none of it submitted to Her Majesty's Inspector. The same school is now hard at work studying the "Creation," and the head teacher amused me by his description of the difficulty of adapting the Tonic Sol-fa method to the children's comprehension in the chorus "Despairing, cursing, rage" (the published and correct version being beyond them): he assured me that the words appealed powerfully to his inward sentiments. And if work like this can be done in the cheerless regions where a penny fee is all that can be asked for a week's education, what might we not expect among the brighter streets and roads where 3d., 4d., and 6d. per child is cheerfully and easily paid? I have taken up so much of your time with facts that I must leave the rest to you for speculation and suggestion, in any discussion which may follow, merely offering, in conclusion, some few suggestions as to the line that might be followed towards improvement.

We certainly want more care bestowed on the specific musical training of teachers. They want to be taught—and
many often would be glad to learn from competent authority—the special peculiarities of child voices, what register of the voice is best adapted for school singing, and how to make use of that so as to develop and avoid damaging the vocal organs themselves. Here is a quotation from Frederic Wieck, to which my attention was called by a young teacher who has studied the whole subject far more deeply than most of his profession:

"In what do most of our singing teachers, musical though they be, and not without ear sympathy and culture . . . fail? It is in forming of voice, moulding of tone, which cannot be learned from books, but only practically by oral tuition."

The same teacher has most kindly lent me his own note book, in which he has collected hints from many sources, together with some original matter, all bearing on this subject from a practical elementary teacher's point of view, with permission to extract any remarks which seem likely to be of use. Here are some: "Too often everything is sacrificed to a knowledge of notation; voice developed only in respect to power." "Chief requisite of successful teaching is individual treatment of voices from the beginning." Quite true, but, as I have said, the great majority of teachers at present require to be taught how to do this. Conspicuously absent from that syllabus of instruction from which I have quoted is any exercise as to breathing or training the muscles of the chest, such as the following, which I find in my young friend's note book:—"Teacher raises hand while pupils take in breath slowly and noiselessly. Pupils hold breath while hand remains up, letting out breath gradually through the mouth as the teacher lowers his hand. Count while breath is retained—practise this carefully and thoroughly—do not attempt too much at first."

Here is a scheme of music time table from this note book, which, I believe, is original, but which, good as it is, head teachers would probably think difficult to accommodate to other requirements of the Code:

"SUGGESTED TIME TABLE.

1. Voice studies.
   (a). Art of breathing.
   (b). Emission of long sustained notes.
   (c). Equalization of voice.
   (d). Flexibility.

"In the morning, fifteen minutes before 10 a.m., voices being then quite fresh."

2. Theory and Solfeggi.

"Before dismissal in the morning, and for fifteen minutes in the beginning of afternoon."

4. Songs, &c.

"Two lessons per week of one hour each."
Music in Elementary Schools.

But beyond improved knowledge of the art of voice training, the general level of taste and knowledge of musical works requires raising among the teachers. One ought not nowadays to meet with such errors in taste as the following:—I found a chorus being sung by the combined forces of one girls' school, to some silly words about robins and the month of May, the music of which was the quartet from Martha, "In mia f6." Operatic adaptations, incomplete harmonies, such as the upper parts of four-part songs and anthems, arrangements of popular street melodies to obtrusively innocent words supposed to be suited for school children—(I could name a school where the classic melody of "Vilikins and his Dinah" is being utilised in this way)—should become things of the past. This is, I think, gradually happening.

The Tonic Sol-fa agency have recently published some Trios for equal voices for use in schools, which are a distinct advance on the "Linnet" and "Nightingale" books, on which many teachers have largely depended; but there is, I feel sure, an opening for new two-part or three-part music for school use, which composers might find it worth their while to try and fill, writing specially with an eye to the idiosyncrasies of children's voices. As I write the words my eye is caught by a critique in The Lute for this month, where the writer calls attention to "Eight Two-part Songs for Girls' or Boys' voices," by H. F. Sharpe, and says: "In writing for children simplicity is essential, but this need not exclude musicianly qualities. Mr. Sharpe can write a melody, and, what is not necessarily the same thing, a vocal melody. It is clear, moreover, that when he uses the term part-songs he understands that it signifies a piece of music wherein two or more melodies are combined, and not a single melody harmonized for voices... Hence much of the charm of these little pieces; the parts are co-ordinate and equal in interest as in importance."

I feel sure that elementary teachers would gladly welcome a supply of other works composed on the same lines.

In conclusion, I would again remind you that the teachers are bound to work with an eye to earning the grant, and that their work is pronounced upon by a gentleman, the Government Inspector, who, with all other possible virtues under the sun, may or may not combine some knowledge of and taste for music. Drawing in schools is judged by the experts of the Science and Art Department. Needlework by a lady specially appointed for the purpose at the Education Department. Drill, when there is a competition, is judged by a military officer; but the verdict on singing is practically left to chance. Her Majesty's Inspector might possibly be unable, without assistance, to distinguish "God save the Queen" from the Dead March in "Saul," so far as I can
Music in Elementary Schools.

judge, and yet he might have to award the music grant. Thus, it is clear that teachers are, or may be, often guided in their choice of school songs by their knowledge of the fads or fancies of this or that inspector, on whose verdict their annual report depends.

Therefore, I shall ask you to make all allowances possible, in expressing your opinion of the facts which I have tried to lay before you, for the difficulties under which musical work is done by the elementary teachers—as hardworking and conscientious a body of men and women as any other profession in England, who are carrying out in a brave and loyal spirit the great work entrusted to them of "educating our masters."

SCHOOL BOARD FOR LONDON—CODE OF REGULATIONS, 1885.

APPENDIX IV.

GRADUATED INSTRUCTION IN SINGING.

Instruction in Singing from notes must be graduated as follows:

(A)—When taught by the Tonic Sol-fa Method.

INFANTS' SCHOOL.—NON-STANDARDS.

SECOND CLASS.

To sing from the Teacher's pointing and pattern on the Modulator, the Sol-fa notes, in short phrases, of the exercises in the "Second Linnet."

To be able to Sol-fa from the Teacher's pointing on the Modulator two or more easy tunes.

FIRST CLASS.

Tune—To be able to sing from the Teacher's pointing on the Modulator, and from the Manual signs, the tones of the Doh chord in any order and in several keys.

Tune and Time—To Sol-fa in correct time from the Teacher's pointing the exercises in the "Second Linnet," written on the blackboard. The Teacher should first Sol-fa the exercises in short phrases, pointing the pulses in strict time; the children then singing in like manner from her pointing.

The School songs may be taught in the same manner, and should be sung quickly, with a soft and pure tone, a well-marked accent, and a clear and distinct utterance of the words.

The words of the songs should be such as children of this age can understand and enjoy. The music should be within their limited range of voice, so that their tender and delicate vocal organs should not be strained.

For infants' departments action songs are strongly recommended.

STANDARD I.

Tune—To Sol-fa from the Teacher's pointing on the Modulator, the tones of the Doh chord in any order, and the other tones of the major diatonic scale in stepwise succession.

Time—To sing correctly to the Time names or to "lala," in slow and quick time, the Time forms on the School Charts, Nos. 1 and 3, to the Teacher's beating.
Music in Elementary Schools.

To sing to the Time names or to "laa" on one tone the Exercises in the
First Step on the Charts.

Tune and Time—To Sol-fa the same correctly in tune and time, also
test exercises of equal difficulty written on the blackboard.

Theory—To answer any question on the Notation in the First Step on
the Charts.

Very careful attention must be given to the training of the voices to sing
softly. No loud singing should be permitted at this stage, and children who
sing out of tune must listen till they can sing properly.

STANDARD II.

Tune—To Sol-fa from the Teacher's pointing on the Modulator the tones
of the Soh chord in any order with the chord of Doh and Fah, and Lah, in
stepwise succession, also to Sol-fa from the Teacher's dictation in different
keys short phrases of equal difficulty.

To tell by ear, Doh, Me, Soh, Te, or Ray, when sung to figures or
"laa," after hearing the Key-tone and chord.

Time—To sing correctly to the Time names or "laa," in slow and quick
time, the Time forms on Chart No. 5.

To sing correctly to Time names or "laa," on one tone, any of the
Exercises from 15 to 26 on the Charts, also to read the Sol-fa notes of these
Exercises in Time.

Tune and Time—To sing in correct tune and time Exercises 15 to 26
on the Charts, also test exercises of equal difficulty, written on the black-
board. Care must be taken that the Chart exercises are not learnt by ear,
so that the pupils may be able to sing any part of them without necessarily
beginning the exercise.

To sing to words, with good quality of tone and expression, unison songs
and rounds.

To answer questions on Notation as far as Exercise 26 on the Charts.

STANDARD III.

To sing from memory to the Teacher's beating, Exercise 27 on the Charts,
in the Keys C, D, and E, as a voice exercise.

To Sol-fa from the point on the Modulator, the chord of Fah with those
of Doh and Soh, and voluntaries including such intervals as are to be found
in the Third Step on the Charts, also se and ta in stepwise progression,
used thus—s se s, d' ta 1. Also, from the Teacher's dictation, short passages
including the same intervals.

To tell by ear the Sol-fa name of any tone of the Scale when sung to
figures or 10 "laa," after hearing the key-tone and chord.

Time—To sing correctly the Time forms on Charts Nos. 8 and 10.

Tune and Time—To sing first in correct time and then in correct time
and tune any exercise in the Third Step on the Charts, also written or
printed sight-test exercises of equal difficulty in time and tune.

To sing the Standard Scale, and to pitch, with the help of a tuning fork,
your exercise in Third Step.

To sing in two parts, first separately, then together, the two-part exer-
cises in the Second and Third Steps on the Charts.

To sing to words, with good quality of tone and expression, easy School
songs in two parts.

Theory—To answer questions on Notation as far as Exercise 43.

STANDARD IV.

Tune—To Sol-fa from the pointing on the Modulator, voluntaries con-
taining any tones of the major diatonic scale, with transition of one remove,
and passages in the minor mode, including Se, used thus—1 se 1; also short
passages from dictation.

To tell by ear the Sol-fa names of any three tones of the scale when
sung to "laa," after hearing the tones of a Doh chord.
Music in Elementary Schools.

Time—To sing in correct time on one tone to "laa," any of the Time forms and Exercises on the Charts.

Tune and Time—To sing in correct tune and time, Exercises 44 to 60 on the Charts; also to sing at sight a written or printed Exercise, including simple transition of one remove and using a bridge-note.

To sing the School songs in two parts with good quality of tone, expression, and distinct pronunciation.

Theory—To answer questions on Notation as far as Exercise 60.

STANDARDS V. and VI.

Tune—To sing to "laa" (instead of Sol-faing) from the pointing on the Modulator, similar voluntaries to those Sol-faed on the Modulator in the third step.

To Sol-fa from the pointing on the Modulator, voluntaries with easy transitions of two or three removes, minor mode and chromatic phrases.

To write the Sol-fa notes of short phrases of music when sung to figures or to "laa," after hearing the tones of a Doh chord.

Time—To sing on one tone to "laa," in correct time, from books at first sight, the music of any ordinary School song.

Tune and Time—To sing correctly Exercises 66 to 72 on the Charts.

To practise songs in both the major and minor modes chiefly from books; these songs to have transition with bridge-notes.

To Sol-fa ordinary School songs at sight, and afterwards sing them to words.

To sing in parts with good quality and good delivery of voice, with expression, and with clear and good pronunciation of the words.

Theory—To answer any question on Notation, including transition, minor mode, chromatic tones, and marks for expression.

Notes—It is recommended that, as a general rule, the time devoted to each of the two weekly lessons in music should be occupied in the following manner:—

a. A voice exercise, suited to each division—three minutes.

b. Teaching tune from Modulator—five minutes.

c. Teaching time from Charts and blackboard—five minutes.

d. Ear exercises for tune and time—three minutes.

e. Teaching time and tune from Charts—six minutes.

f. Practice of School songs from blackboard or books—eight minutes.

For hints on organisation, and the practical working of the above divisions of the time allotted to music teaching, see Appendix A to the "Companion for Teachers of the Tonic Sol-fa Method."

(B.) When taught by the Staff Notation.

GRADE I.

To answer questions on Notation from Sheet 1.

To sing from the Teacher's pointing on Fig. 1, 2, 3, and 4 on Sheet 2, the Diatonic Scale and the main chords of a key. See "Manual," page 15, and directions on the Sheet.

GRADE II.

To answer questions on the Relative Duration of Notes and Rests, as far as the Crotchet, on Sheet 3.

To sing from the Teacher's pointing on the Staff (Sheet 3) the different intervals given in Exercises 1 to 45 in the "Manual," page 42.

To sing in correct tune and time Exercises 1 to 61 in the "Manual," page 42.

GRADE III.

To answer questions on Time, from Sheets 3 and 4.

To sing from Teacher's pointing on Sheets 5 and 6 the Major Scales with Sharps. See directions on the Sheets.

Music in Elementary Schools.

GRADE IV.
To answer questions on Notation as far as Sheet 9.
To sing from the Teacher's pointing on Sheet 78 the Major Scales with Flats. See directions on the Sheets.
To sing in correct tune and time Exercises 93 to 126 in the "Manual," page 72.

GRADE V.
To answer questions on the Minor Mode. See "Manual," page 21 and page 89.
To sing from the Teacher's pointing on Sheets 9 to 13 the Minor Scales. See directions on these Sheets.
To sing in correct tune and time Exercises 127 to 162 in the "Manual," page 91.

GRADE VI.
To answer questions on Notation as far as Sheet 15.
To sing from the Teacher's pointing on Sheets 14 and 15 the Chromatic Scales. See direction on the Sheets.
To sing in correct tune and time Exercises 163 to 165 in the "Manual," page 102.
To sing in correct tune and time Exercises 166 to 168 in the "Manual," page 105.

DISCUSSION.
The Chairman.—Ladies and Gentlemen, I am certain that you will all cordially join in thanking Mr. Browne for his admirable paper. The information bearing on the matter which he has diligently gathered from different quarters for our use and instruction is as valuable as are his personal observations and comments on the teaching of music in Elementary Schools. The subject is one of great interest to us musicians, and it has a considerable importance in its bearing on the future of the Art in this country. The raw material which is now being treated at our public schools will eventually form the staple of the coming men and women of this country. The number that pass through these schools is so large, that the aggregate of pupils attending other schools is but a trifle in comparison. As in the future it seems likely that the relative proportions of those receiving free and paid education will become still more marked, it is evident that if music is to be still wider diffused and placed on a healthy basis, there must be sound and systematic teaching of the subject in these public schools. That this is hardly the case now, is apparent from Mr. Browne's paper. The whole matter is one of vital importance, and many suggestive points present themselves for discussion. I am glad to see here to-day some of our members who, by reason of their experience, can speak with authority on the various phases of the question. Time passes, and so, if you please,
I will propose a vote of thanks to Mr. Browne for his paper, and then call on some of the experts present to favour us with their remarks.

The vote of thanks was put and carried.

Dr. Stainer.—All must agree that Mr. Browne's paper was full of interest, and, on the whole, I think that the state of things it describes is most encouraging. If Mr. Browne had visited the training colleges he would have formed a higher opinion of the results of the students' work in music as exhibited by the choral class singing. In many colleges, whether consisting of male or female students, cantatas and classical works of considerable difficulty are admirably performed. But when Mr. Browne asks that the students should be turned out cultured musicians, practically and theoretically, he is asking more than can be possibly expected. Music is only one amongst a large number of subjects which the students have to learn during their two years' residence, and it must be remembered that a considerable number of the young people enter the college in absolute ignorance of music, and often deficient in ear. In fact, all degrees of musical skill are found amongst them, varying from the most rudimentary efforts up to the highest vocal and instrumental proficiency. The proportion of those backward in music when they enter college is, however, I am glad to say, rapidly diminishing, and during my three years of office as Dr. Hullah's successor I have noticed a marked improvement in the practical musicianship of the students. I think it would be very hard to enforce a high standard of examination, considering the youth of the students, and the musical disadvantages under which many of them have laboured. I quite agree with Mr. Browne in regretting that a better type of music could not be found for Elementary Schools; but composers of good music for children are much needed, and I hope that some of those talented musicians who are listening to this discussion will turn their attention to this branch of the subject. Nothing appeared easier than to compose a pretty and suitable song for children; nothing in reality was more difficult. Mr. Browne, I think, demanded too much when he asked that children in Elementary Schools should be instructed in the use of the muscles of the chest, the art of breathing, and in the enunciation of the voice. The very short time it is found possible to devote to music in Elementary Schools, and the impossibility of much individual teaching, prove these requirements to be too severe. It would be, of course, a great gain, musically speaking, if the examinations in music at Elementary Schools could be carried out throughout the whole country by skilled professional musicians. A scheme for this purpose was drawn up some time ago by Lord Charles Bruce, but its cost
Music in Elementary Schools.

would have been (speaking from memory) about £20,000 a year; it was, therefore, like many other excellent schemes, shelved. One great improvement in musical inspection of schools has, however, been effected, by insisting that all Assistant Inspectors should be thoroughly capable of examining in music. Any Inspector, therefore, who felt himself deficient in this branch, could utilise the services of his Assistant. The new musical code has received very loyal and hearty support from all Her Majesty's Inspectors, and there could be no doubt that a most important stimulus had lately been given to music as a valuable branch of the elementary education of this country.

Mr. W. G. McNaught.—I came to-day to learn how the matter of music in Elementary Schools appeared from the outside, rather than to give any account of the situation. But as Mr. Browne in his valuable paper has dealt chiefly with the schools of Marylebone, and the musical syllabus of the London School Board, it may be interesting to members of the Association to know how the work of musical education is proceeding in the country generally. In passing, I should like to say that Mr. Browne's remark that the Board Schools supplement Voluntary Schools, is hardly true of London at least, inasmuch as the Board last year educated about 350,000 children, and the Denominational or "Voluntary" Schools about 210,000. This fact is worth notice, because the Board Schools throughout the country are leading the way in the matter of musical education. Dr. Stainer has spoken of the state of music in the training colleges, where about 3,500 students are being trained under Government inspection. My own experience is that, considering the source of supply of students, the colleges are doing all that can be fairly expected. In addition to the individual performances of students we are frequently treated to excellent performances of difficult choral music, such as would try the capacity of a good choral society. That the students should be taught to teach singing I have over and over again pleaded, and I, of course, thoroughly agree with Mr. Browne on this point. Then as to the matter of voice training, I may remind Mr. Browne that the syllabus for the colleges has recently required the students to study "the compass and registers of the various voices of men, women and children; their training with reference to productions and intonation." Without a doubt the whole of our work in colleges and schools is capable of improvement. But, as it is only during the last few years that the schools have been stimulated to seriously deal with the subject of music, I think our progress is most satisfactory. You cannot with a wave of the hand immediately influence an army of 70,000 teachers, commanding 3,500,000 children. Considering how
low music stood in our schools only ten years ago, we may be proud of the fact that last year 1,504,675 children gained a grant for the Examination in Singing by Note. And to earn this grant they had to sing at sight a short tune, to monotone at sight a time exercise, to tell the names of notes sung, and to sing, sweetly, prepared school songs. The problem before us is how to get the teachers who presented 2,000,000 children for ear singing only to reform their ways and teach their pupils to sing by note. For my part I am not disposed to recommend the disendowment of ear singing, unless it is quite clear that note singing is nearly universally practicable. At present I think it would be impolitic and unjust to make note singing obligatory. It is better to coax the school teachers than to irritate them. When we enquire what class of schools adopt note singing, it is easy to observe that the large town schools completely outstrip the small country village Voluntary Schools. The results of this year's examinations show that 60 per cent. of the children in Board Schools and only 29 per cent. of the children in Voluntary Schools passed in note singing. And, comparing the numbers of schools instead of children, we find that—

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Type</th>
<th>Taught by ear</th>
<th>Taught by note</th>
<th>Percentage by note</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Church or National Society</td>
<td>12,122</td>
<td>4,136</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Society Schools</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board Schools</td>
<td>3,882</td>
<td>3,439</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Again, comparing the average attendance of the schools where note singing is taught with the attendance in schools where ear singing is taught, we find that—

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Average attendance</th>
<th>152</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8,437 taught by note</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26,836 taught by ear</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Now, it is hardly necessary to say that I do not mean that the Church or National Society's Schools are backward because they are church schools; they are backward because they are so small and isolated, and are unable to offer salaries that attract the all-round teacher. Obviously in a school of fifty children the difference of grant of 6d. for ear singing and 1s. for note singing is not likely to operate as a moving force. Whereas, in a town Board School, with from 1,000 to 2,000 children in attendance, and a staff of twenty teachers, the difference of the grant is important, and it is easy to stipulate that some of the teachers must be good teachers of singing. Recognising the difficulties of small schools, the department has eased the requirements of the Code in their interest, and we hope soon to be able to speak of more progress. Is it to be assumed that school teachers can be trusted to teach singing, or should it be taught by specialists? We have all along believed that it is much
Music in Elementary Schools.

better for the children and all concerned that the school teacher should teach the singing, and we believe our results have justified this confidence. Assuming that ability to sing by note is evidence of musical capacity, members may be interested to know how this capacity is spread over the kingdom. So far as our returns are a guide, I am sorry to say that the counties of Oxford, Cambridge, Hereford, and Cornwall are about the worst. In not one of these counties are more than 15 per cent. taught by note. But in the London district 75 per cent. learn by note, in Lancashire 45 per cent., in Warwickshire 46 per cent., in Yorkshire 40 per cent. In conclusion, let me say that, so far as the elementary musical education of the children in our schools is concerned, we are accomplishing more than any other nation in the world.

Mr. J. S. Curwen.—I am glad to find in Mr. Browne's paper so careful and judicial a review of the position of singing in the London Board Schools. I am glad too that the committee have thought the subject one worthy to engage the attention of the Association. It is far removed from the historical and aesthetic enquiries in which they are generally engaged. But they must remember the solidarity of the nation; by raising the musical taste of the common people they were raising the taste of the country. The children of the Elementary Schools would, in a few years, supply audiences for concerts, so that by training them in music they were cultivating a soil which might nourish the higher forms of art. Two of Mr. Browne's points were specially important—voice training and the disarrangement of harmonies. I myself am constantly calling attention to them. As a rule, shouting and singing by ear go together; the introduction of systematic training in music usually leads to a softened use of the voice. I think one conclusion to be drawn from Mr. Browne's paper and from the discussion is that school music is improving; the time for jeremiads is past, but that for jubilation has not arrived. The country and village schools drag a long way behind the town schools. Country children hear so little music, while the ear and rhythmical faculty are stimulated in towns by the street music, bands, and endless concerts. I have made it my business, as president of the Tonic Sol-fa College, to see how music is faring in the elementary schools of nearly all the European countries. I have studied the subject at Paris, Munich, Vienna, Zurich, Cologne, Turin, and Milan. My conclusion is, that while in each place I found something to admire, I was on the whole well satisfied with the work being done in Britain. Certainly British and Irish children, as regards voice and ear, are by no means bad material to work upon; better indeed than those of several of the countries I have visited.
Mr. W. Archer Smith (Christ Church Schools, Southwark).—Although I am not a member of the Association, I shall be glad to be permitted a few remarks. Mr. McNaught, in the course of his observations, stated that it was not the Board Schools that required to be educated in music, but the Voluntary Schools. I beg to say that music had been taught in Voluntary Schools long before Board Schools were thought of, and was taught at the present time, both practically and theoretically. Whereas, in Board Schools, the Tonic Sol-fa notation was generally used, in Voluntary Schools music was taught according to the Old notation. In many country parishes the schoolmaster was not only the trainer of the church choir, but often acted as organist where the services of more skilled musicians could not well be obtained. I may draw the attention of the meeting to the fact that the smallness of the music grant was no inducement to managers and teachers in Voluntary Schools to undertake the work as laid down in the music schedule; and I may further point out that it would be advantageous if some scheme could be drawn up in connection with the Royal School of Music, whereby elementary teachers could receive instruction in the art of teaching music, and that if music could be taught and results paid for, as is the case with drawing, under the Science and Art Department, a greater stimulus would be given to the teaching of vocal music in Elementary Schools, and to the advancement of music throughout the country.

Mr. Mark Pole (one of Her Majesty's Inspectors of Schools).—I am indebted to chance for the pleasure of listening to Mr. Browne's interesting paper, and can add nothing to the very instructive figures just quoted. In my district, a portion of the West Riding of Yorkshire, there existed a popular taste for music, which did not require the help of inspectors and grants to keep singing in schools from neglect. It stood almost alone among the subjects of instruction, in being a work of pleasure both to teachers and scholars. In about three-quarters of the schools singing was taught by note, songs in parts were generally presented, and the training of the voices was often very well attended to. Speaking of my own district, I should say the musical attainments of the teachers, as well as their capacity to teach singing, compare very favourably with their other professional qualifications. I am glad to hear allusion made at such a meeting as this to the difficulty which undoubtedly existed of easily obtaining a sufficient variety of music, especially part-music, suitable for school singing. Any composition which the members of the Association would provide them with would, I am sure, be thankfully welcomed by teachers, and ought to prove remunerative to the composers.

Mr. Barry.—I am glad to learn that teaching by note,
Music in Elementary Schools.

according to the Code, amounts to more than I had been led to understand that it does. Still, I cannot help thinking that, though teaching singing by ear may be all very well for very young children as a means of exercising their voices and memory, just as we teach very young children to recite hymns and nursery rhymes long before they have learnt to read, in the case of elder children, if singing be taught at all, teaching by note should be obligatory.

The CHAIRMAN.—I think the meeting would be glad to hear from Dr. Stainer his opinion as to whether it would be advisable to discourage singing by ear, and insist that the Government grant should only be allocated for results obtained by proper tuition, admitting that many difficulties exist, from what Mr. Browne has told us to-day it is evident that with method and industry they can, to a great extent, be overcome. If music, like the other subjects taught to the children, is to have any part in their future life, and be a real source of enjoyment to them, it is certain that they must carry away from school with them some knowledge of notation, the alphabet of the art. Lacking this, it must seem to the musician, and to the practical man of the world, that the time spent in picking up songs by ear is almost time lost, and the grant accorded a waste of money, so far as musical education is concerned. It appears to me impossible that this assembly can countenance such an arrangement as this.

Dr. STAINER.—I am not prepared to advise that singing by ear should not count in receiving a share of the Government grant. The conditions under which the various schools exist differ considerably, and in some cases school teachers labour under very considerable difficulty with respect to giving systematic instruction in music. Singing by ear, like playing by ear, is not bad in itself. How often do we have to lament that a performer who can play or sing well is utterly lost without the notes before him. I frequently regret to find persons playing with their eyes glued on to the music before them, unable, as it were, to think for themselves for a single bar. Depend upon it, from those who know their music by heart, we get finer and more artistic performances than is the case with those whose memory has not been cultivated, and are unable to go on without the notes before them. With regard to the music employed, though much of value has been written, there is still a want. It is difficult to write an original chant, still more difficult, I think, to compose good and suitable two-part songs.

The CHAIRMAN.—Before inviting Mr. Browne to reply to the speeches which his excellent paper has evoked, I would say that the discussion has brought before us much valuable information on this interesting subject. According to the testimony of Dr. Stainer and Mr. McNaught, there is a
marked improvement in the musical attainments of those who leave our training schools. This advance in knowledge and practice will re-act on the Board and other elementary free schools in which the students will eventually teach, and so we may expect a higher standard to be reached than that which obtains now. It seems to me that the weak point of the present system consists in allowing the teachers to teach in just what way they like. Surely, there ought to be some well studied and authorised mode of tuition, together with properly selected books for uniform use all over the kingdom, rather than that teachers should do just what is right in the sight of their own eyes, with such poor and grotesque results, the account of which has amused us this afternoon. In the old time, when Hullah's Manual was recommended for us by the Education Committee of the Privy Council, a certain definite system was followed, but now it appears that teachers are left to themselves by the various authorities who control the schools, and consequently, their mode of imparting instruction may be good, possibly the reverse—at any rate, there is no uniformity in the method pursued. With regard to the music used, it is to be hoped that the remarks which have fallen here this afternoon will bear future fruit, and that composers will endeavour to supply a vacancy, which various speakers have concurred in regretting. May I throw out as a suggestion, that considering the very limited time at disposal for instruction, the irregular attendance of the children, and the rough voices we generally find the lower classes possess, that it is a mistake to attempt singing in three or four parts. If good two-part songs could be written, both parts equally melodious, and the children taught to sing these in alternation, provided that this could be done unhesitatingly, it is certain that they would have gained a sure knowledge of music, which would be of distinct value for test purposes, and prove a useful foundation for future progress.