Mendelssohn's "Lieder Ohne Worte"

Author(s): C. J. Read

Source: *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*, Vol. 18, No. 408 (Feb. 1, 1877), pp. 81-82

Published by: [Musical Times Publications Ltd.](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3351716>

Accessed: 24-03-2015 21:21 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at
<http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Musical Times Publications Ltd. is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

a *furor* which, according to a correspondent of the *Daily Telegraph*, would seem to be almost unprecedented even in her long list of triumphs.

Schumann's "Manfred," the text of which is based upon Byron's drama, has recently found an adequate representation at the Imperial Opera at Vienna.

At St. Petersburg Rubinstein's Oratorio, "Paradise Lost," has been most favourably received. The work was conducted by the composer himself.

At Paris the concerts of classical music at the *Conservatoire* and the *Populaires* continue to attract numerous audiences; the names of German masters which most frequently appear in the programmes being those of Bach, Beethoven, and Mendelssohn.

At the Théâtre-Italien, Mdle. Albani achieved a genuine triumph in the rôle of *Gilda* in "Rigoletto," and, according to *Le Ménestrel*, the fair artist is firmly establishing herself in the favour of the Parisian public. We read in the *Revue de la Musique* that a new opera by M. Louis Doffes, the text by M. Sardou, is in course of preparation at the Opera-Comique.

M. Gounod has, it is said, written a new comic opera called "Cinq-Mars," the hero of which is the well-known favourite of Louis XIII., whom Richelieu convicted of conspiracy, and who died upon the scaffold with his accomplice, de Thou.

Mdle. Elisa Vairo, of the Théâtre-Italien, initiated an interesting concert at the *Salle Herz* a few weeks ago, before a select audience of artistic celebrities and amateurs. M. Capoul and Mdme. de Lagrange were among the performers, as was also a pupil of the latter, Mdle. Emilia Chiomi, who in an air from "Lucia" displayed a voice of crystal clearness and great brilliancy in the florid passages.

The *Revue et Gazette Musicale* of the 21st ult. contains a very interesting article on Weber's stay at Paris, in the year 1826, before he paid his fatal visit to England.

A new opera by Flotow, "Fiore d'Arlem," has met with great success at Turin; many of the *morceaux* had to be repeated.

The first representation of a new Opera from the pen of Signor de Giosa has lately taken place at Naples. The work in question, which is called "Napoli di Carnovale," was received with that demonstrative enthusiasm which generally characterises Neapolitan audiences, the composer being summoned to appear before the curtain no less than forty times.

A subscription has been set on foot by the Paris journal *La Liberté*, with the object of erecting a monument to the memory of Félicien David. The call thus made upon the public has already been liberally responded to.

A daily journal, entitled *Actualidade*, published at Oporto, has conceived the happy idea of periodically publishing in its *Feuilleton* an outline of the subject of various operatic works, accompanied by a short sketch of each of the scenes. By this means the general public becomes initiated into the frequently somewhat obscure plots of existing operas, while at the same time the ground is prepared for an intelligent appreciation of their respective merits.

Madame Essipoff, the eminent Russian pianiste, gave a short series of Concerts at Boston, U.S., in December last. *Dwight's Journal* concludes a sympathetic notice of the lady's performances with the following remarks: "Mdme. Essipoff has left us with a strong desire to hear her more, and in better programmes, and to know her better. If Rubinstein and Bülow gave us rather a surfeit with immense programmes, she has left us with an appetite. We fear it will be long before we hear any pianoforte-playing to compare with hers, unless she come again."

CORRESPONDENCE.

MENDELSSOHN'S "LIEDER OHNE WORTE."

TO THE EDITOR OF "THE MUSICAL TIMES."

DEAR SIR,—I am much obliged by the insertion of my letter on the above subject in your last publication, and also for the remarks you have kindly made on it, and which to my mind throw considerable light on the matter.

Having no opportunity of consulting the earliest foreign editions when writing to you, my examinations were necessarily imperfect; nor, indeed, was I aware that such editions existed, though common sense might have led me to infer as much.

It appears from your perusal of the older foreign editions that what I have alluded to as *omissions* and alterations in the old English copies are really additions and emendations made subsequently to the publication of the former. If so, by whom were they made? We read* that Mendelssohn composed the second book of "Lieder" in the winter of 1844—5, and in Moscheles' Life† we also read that Mendelssohn did not visit England during the years 1834—9. Further on we have the statement at page 90, vol. 2, that in 1841 Moscheles was engaged in correcting the proofs of the fourth book of "Lieder." Were these alterations and emendations in Book II. by the hand of Moscheles? By whomsoever they were made they must be considered as improvements, particularly the addition of six bars in No. 10 and the avoided cadence 17th bar from the end.

I enclose the text of the bars in No. 8 according to your suggestion, and trust they will render intelligible that which before appeared "unintelligible." In conclusion, I take the liberty of mentioning that at page 35 of your present number the fourth bar of No. 10 should have two semiquaver B's for the fifth and sixth notes in the bass; also at the second No. 11 the first note in treble should be A instead of F; and would also draw to your notice that, by changing the places of the F and E to E and F in No. 11, bar ten from the end, at Φ , the effect of fifths is produced.—I remain, dear Sir, yours truly,

Salisbury, Jan. 6, 1877.

C. J. READ.

* "Life of Mendelssohn," by Lampadius, p. 26.
† "Life of Moscheles," by his wife.

The Old Editions of Mori and Lavenu, Novello, Benedict, &c.

No. 8 (bars 22 and 55).

Herr Pauer's Edition.

No. 8 (bars 22 and 55).

The Old Editions.

No. 8 (bars 28, 29, 30, 31, 32, and 63, 64, 65, 66, 67).

The New Editions of Pauer, Novello, &c.

No. 8 (bars 28, 29, 30, 31, 32, and 63, 64, 65, 66, 67).

SMALL NOTES.

TO THE EDITOR OF "THE MUSICAL TIMES."

SIR,—Your correspondent "Allegro" has, I think, rendered good service to pianoforte players by opening up the question of Grace Notes. I doubt, however, if it can be settled so easily as he imagines.

For the best statement of views on this subject opposed to his own I may refer him to Von Bülow's notes to Beethoven's Sonatas generally, and in particular to those on the "Appassionata."

Judging from the last example given by your correspondent, I should doubt whether he can have read or sufficiently considered these. I fully believe that no "sensible musician" would give the barbarous reading suggested. The old rule (of placing small notes on the beat) is not applicable to the passage given, but if it were so the result would be—

seeing that neither the ancient nor modern practice displaces the melodic accent from the principal note, even when this is displaced from the beat.

Perhaps a phrase from the so-called "Moonlight Sonata" may suffice to show that there are two sides to this question—

The practice of a "sensible musician" would surely be, in this case, to take the value of the small notes from the following crotchet (on which the emphasis still remains) rather than from the preceding semiquaver. In nine cases out of ten this is the undoubted rendering of Beethoven's small notes, but exceptions doubtless occur, which are mostly indicated in the invaluable "Cotta" Beethoven. Making allowance for misprints, I think it will be found (as Von Bülow points out) that Chopin's music uniformly requires this rendering of the grace notes. But one of his peculiarities I have not yet seen noticed—namely, his employment of two distinct grace notes (or sets of grace notes), one of which precedes and the other accompanies the beat. I take the first passage that occurs to me from a well-known Nocturne by this composer.

Here, I think, it is not doubtful that it is the second small D that should be played at the beat.

According to Lebert and Von Bülow, broken chords follow the same rule, so that the lowest note is at the beat while the highest retains the accent. If this last condition be neglected, we have what has been rudely called the

"Ladies' Arpeggio," an effect often produced by dull pupils, but also a favourite one with ladies of a certain age—especially if they live in the provinces and wear silk mittens. The last example given by "Allegro," if it were in Arpeggio, would illustrate my meaning exactly.

Whether a broken chord should commence before or at the beat must be decided in each case as it arises. I think it will be found that the latter rendering is rather the exception than the rule, but both are in their place legitimate effects.

Need I add that I have been speaking mainly of compositions for the pianoforte? The orchestral question I leave untouched.—I am, Sir, yours, &c.,

CLEVELAND WIGAN.

Dover, 4th December 1876.

TO CORRESPONDENTS.

** Notices of concerts, and other information supplied by our friends in the country, must be forwarded as early as possible after the occurrence; otherwise they cannot be inserted. Our correspondents must specifically denote the date of each concert, for without such date no notice can be taken of the performance.

Our correspondents will greatly oblige by writing all names as clearly as possible, as we cannot be responsible for any mistakes that may occur.

Correspondents are informed that their names and addresses must accompany all communications.

We cannot undertake to return offered contributions; the authors, therefore, will do well to retain copies.

Notice is sent to all Subscribers whose payment (in advance) is exhausted. The paper will be discontinued where the Subscription is not renewed. We again remind those who are disappointed in obtaining back numbers that, although the music pages are always stereotyped, only a sufficient quantity of the rest of the paper is printed to supply the current sale.

J. P. CARLISLE.—The "Creation" was written to German words.

MR. J. V. PINLEIF should read the notice of H. Phillips in THE MUSICAL TIMES of December last, to which the paragraph given in January was an addendum.

VIOLIN.—1. William Forster was born in 1764, and died in 1824. 2. No relation.

HENRY SMITH.—We should recommend Wentworth Phillipson's "Guide to Young Pianoforte Teachers and Students," published by W. Czerny.

B. W.—The work alluded to is a Treatise on "Musical Notation," by E. Silas.

P. GREENFIELD.—We cannot furnish our correspondent with the information required.

BRIEF SUMMARY OF COUNTRY NEWS.

We do not hold ourselves responsible for any opinions expressed in this Summary, as all the notices are either collated from the local papers, or supplied to us by correspondents.

ABERDEEN.—The annual Christmas performance of Handel's *Messiah* took place in the Music Hall on Tuesday, Dec. 26, and was attended with great success, the large hall being quite filled. The soloists were Mme. Pauline Grayston, Miss Patti Hargreaves, Mr. Wright, and Mr. T. Laws. The choruses, by the Union, were sung with great precision, more especially "He shall purify" and the "Hallelujah." Mr. Leon Guyon led the band; Mr. Wood's trumpet obligato was much appreciated; and Mr. W. Morrison presided at the organ.

BANBURY.—A Concert was given in the Town Hall, on December 28th, under the auspices of the Mechanics' Institute. The artists were Mme. Wells, Mr. O. Christian, Mr. Nicholson, and Mr. Josiah Booth. The programme was of a miscellaneous character. Mr. Booth, besides playing two solos, discharged the duties of accompanist.

BEXLEY.—On Tuesday the 16th ult. a private Evening Concert was given at the Vicarage by The British Glee Union (Messrs. Barnby, Parkin, Brough, and Prenton), under the direction of Mr. Prenton. The programme, consisting of glees, madrigals, quartets, songs, and duets, gave great satisfaction, the part-singing being distinguished for the minute observance of the marks of expression.

BLACKLEY.—The Choral Society gave their Annual Concert on Saturday the 20th ult. The first part consisted of selections from Handel's *Judas*; the principals being Mrs. Herron, Miss Blakley, and Miss Shaw (trebles); Mr. W. Bastide (alto), Mr. Earnshaw (tenor), and Messrs. Wm. Fox and John Taylor (bass). In the second part the band performed the Overtures to *Samson* and *Saul*, and other selections. The audience was not very large.

BRIGHTON.—The annual performance of the *Messiah*, in aid of the funds of the neighbouring Charities, took place on the Saturday preceding Christmas-day; and although the attendance, chiefly in consequence of the unfavourable weather, was not so numerous as could be desired, thanks to the indefatigable exertions of Mr. George Watts