Review

Reviewed Work(s): Sacred Latin Texts: No. III. The Four Gospels from the Irish Codex Harleianus by E. S. Buchanan

Review by: N. J. D. White

Source: *The Irish Church Quarterly*, Vol. 9, No. 34 (Apr., 1916), pp. 161-162

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/30026452>

Accessed: 09-09-2016 02:20 UTC

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://about.jstor.org/terms>

is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Irish Church Quarterly*

SACRED LATIN TEXTS: No. III. The Four Gospels from the Irish Codex Harleianus (Brit. Mus. Harl. 1023). Now First Edited by E. S. Buchanan, M.A., B.Sc. (Heath: Cranton & Ouseley, Ltd.). Two parts, 21s. net.

Mr. Buchanan is well and favourably known as a diligent and accurate transcriber and collator of Latin MSS. of the New Testament; and his last publication seems quite as creditable as the edition of Laud. Lat. 108, which was noticed not long since in this Journal. The MS. here printed has lost most of the First Gospel; it begins at Matt. xxiii. 25; the Gospels are in the Western order: Matthew, John, Luke, Mark. The date of the MS. as fixed by Mr. Buchanan may be accepted. He says: "It is difficult to assign the actual copying of the MS. to an earlier date than the tenth century." But we do not think that many people will be found to agree in the extravagant claims which Mr. Buchanan makes for its text.

It is of course well worth while to publish exact transcripts even of late Latin MSS.; and it may seem ungracious and ungrateful to complain when a scholar does more than this. But, frankly, the beautifully printed English version of the MS. is quite superfluous; and the unquestionable value of the accurate transcript is impaired in the student's mind by the very questionable soundness of Mr. Buchanan's judgement as a textual critic. In his preface, the editor gives nearly six pages of selected passages culled from his MS. in order to display the special value of its text. These are introduced as follows:—

"The following readings will show that the Western Text, preserved in Ireland as late as the eleventh century, (1) had escaped the knife of the followers of Arius and Macedonius, (2) had escaped a revision that thought it impolite to speak of the devil, (3) had escaped a revision that wished to put saints and their merits in the place of the Grace of God, (4) to put baptism instead of true repentance for the remission of sins, (5) had escaped a revision that sought to take away from God the Holy Spirit His Personality, (6) and to invest in the Church and the priesthood the powers which are His alone. We may never be able to recover all the words of the Lord Jesus in their original unaltered form, but we can at least remove from Him such sayings as that about "eternal torture," which men have put into His mouth."

On reading this last clause, one turns eagerly to St. Matt. xxv. 46 to ascertain "the Western Text in Harl. 1023," only to find there "supplicium aeternum," the usual Vulgate rendering! There is in fact no other reading.

The great majority of the passages selected by Mr. Buchanan from his MS. present merely the inept caprices of an unintelligent scribe; it is a distinct disservice to the claims of the

Western Text of the N.T. to represent these readings as Western. Here are a few of the most interesting: the numbers correspond to those interpolated by us in the above citation from Mr. Buchanan's Preface.

1. St. Mark xii. 37, "David therefore himself calleth him *God*; and how is He then his Son?"
St. John x. 24, "How long dost Thou keep us in suspense? If Thou art *God*, tell us plainly."
2. St. Luke xv. 30, "But as soon as *this son of the devil* came, who hath devoured thy living," etc.
St. John xii. 19, "Behold all the world is gone after *one that hath the devil*."
4. St. Mark i. 4, "John did baptize in the wilderness, and preach repentance for the remission of sins."
St. John iii. 5, "Except a man be born of the Spirit, he cannot enter into the kingdom of God."
5. St. Luke iv. 32, "And they were astonished at the teaching of the Holy Spirit, for the word of the Lord Jesus was powerful."
6. St. John xx. 23, "Whose soever sins ye remit, it is the Holy Spirit That shall remit them; and whose soever sins ye retain, it is the Holy Spirit That shall retain them."

This MS. does not seem to present any example of the supposed Western characteristic which we have numbered 3.

It is to be noted that none of the above extraordinary or absurd readings has any support from any other MS. or Version.

One cannot but recognize with thankfulness the reverent and devout spirit in which Mr. Buchanan does his work; but one cannot but regret it when reverence becomes wrong-headed, and raises a prejudice against a sacred cause. The reverence that welcomes such readings as those numbered 1 and 5, is the reverence of Dogberry: "Write down that they hope they serve God; and write God first; for God defend but God should go before such villains."

N. J. D. WHITE.

DEMOCRACY AND CHRISTIAN DOCTRINE: An Essay in Reinterpretation. By W. H. Carnegie, M.A., Canon of Westminster, and Rector of St. Margaret's, Westminster. (Macmillan.) 4s. 6d. net.

There are few more marked signs of the times than the desire of the Christian clergyman to get into sympathetic touch with spheres and aspects of life which the clergy of twenty or thirty years ago were apt to regard as indifferent if not as profane. To our fathers a clergyman was not as such interested in the amusements of his parishioners, nor in their economic circumstances except very indirectly. They would have been shocked to learn that a modern London curate has had sparring contests