Review

Author(s): W. H. B.

Review by: W. H. B.

Source: *The Geographical Journal*, Vol. 59, No. 1 (Jan., 1922), pp. 65-66

Published by: [The Royal Geographical Society \(with the Institute of British Geographers\)](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/1781867>

Accessed: 04-03-2015 03:46 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at
<http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

The Royal Geographical Society (with the Institute of British Geographers) is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Geographical Journal*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

sketch-map of North America distributes the chief fur animals into eleven territorial divisions with their markets, though the basis of this division is not indicated.

W. H. B.

The Norse Discoveries of America : the Wineland Sagas translated and discussed.— G. M. Gathorne-Hardy. Oxford : Clarendon Press. 1921. *Maps.* 14s. net.

The Norse movement to the American continent has of recent years been the subject of renewed investigation and controversy. The Wineland Sagas still remain the only source of information, so that each new contribution represents but conjecture on the historical accuracy of the narratives and the routes and landfalls of the voyagers. The present work was written before the war, but was cast in its final form after the author had considered the recent investigations of Babcock, Hovgaard, Steensby, and others.

The problem has been approached mainly through a study of the Sagas as literature. Part I. is a translation of the Wineland Sagas—the Eric Saga, Hauk's Book, and the Flatey Book—and the aim has been to offer a continuous narrative drawn from all three sources indifferently. The author thus obtains a fuller account of the Wineland voyages than is comprised in any one version. Such a method is open to criticism, partly because the narrative so derived exceeds the warrant of any one saga, and partly because it gives a false impression of accuracy by retaining certain parts of each saga and relegating the conflicting portion to an appendix.

In Part II. the author justifies this action on two grounds : first, the essential historical accuracy of all the sagas (p. 195), and secondly, the special importance of the Flatey Book. Contrary to the generally accepted view, he follows Dr. Fossum ('The Norse Discovery of America') in his preference for the Flatey Book version where it differs from the other two, and in making the Flatey Book a Greenland saga specially describing the deeds of Eric the Red and his family. Both Dr. Fossum and Mr. Gathorne-Hardy therefore contend that the two versions—the Icelandic saga contained in the Hauk Book and the Greenland saga of the Flatey Book—amplify each other and make possible a full story by the amalgamation of the two.

But, as Vignaud wrote in 1910 ('Les Expéditions des Scandinaves en Amérique,' p. 7), "Ces traditions n'ont, certes, pas la valeur de témoignages contemporains," and it does not seem justifiable to take any or all of the incidents and combine them into a new story as though they carried the stamp of authentic history.

The author discusses his case ably and in scholarly manner, and may carry the less critical and less sceptical with him. He then proceeds to investigate the probable routes and landfalls. How impossible it is to fix these is realized when one remembers that Dr. Fossum locates Vinland up the St. Lawrence, Babcock argues the case for Passamaquoddy Bay at the mouth of the Bay of Fundy, and others place it in the region of Cape Cod. Mr. Gathorne-Hardy urges an entirely new region as the farthest south of the Karlsefni expedition. From the neighbourhood of Godthaab in Greenland it first touched land probably in Labrador, possibly in Newfoundland. Thence it may have reached Cape Cod (*Markland*), and sailed along *Furdustrandir*, the long sandy beach southwards from Cape Cod, round the Barnstable peninsula to Long Island Sound. This, the author contends, is *Straumfjord* leading to *Hóp*, the bay of Hudson river. Wineland the Good, the land of plenty and mild winters, is placed along the southern seaboard of New England to the site of modern New York.

F

The case for the sagas and for the voyages (illustrated by maps) is well put and ably discussed. The author has undoubtedly fulfilled his aim in presenting the story in a captivating way and in a manner that will compel the student to turn over again the scanty material we have of this remarkable venture. A chronological summary of the events and a genealogical table of persons connected with the sagas are given, and these with the bibliography complete a volume which constitutes a valuable addition to the literature on this subject.

W. H. B.

AUSTRALIA AND PACIFIC ISLANDS

Fiji: its Problems and Resources.— Major W. A. Chapple, M.D., Ch.B., M.R.C.S., D.P.H., R.A.M.C. (ret'd.). London and New Zealand: Whitcombe & Tombs. 1921. Cr. 8vo. Pp. 188. *Sketch-map and Illustrations.* 7s. 6d.

This is a handy little volume for the capitalist or intending colonist to study, but not to pin his faith upon. It affords a concise and apparently unbiassed conspectus of the commercial openings that Fiji presents, or ought to present, and it comes before the public at an opportune time. The author divides his thirty-three chapters into a consideration of this group of very diverse islands as a single entity, the three main constituents of the population (Fijians, Whites, and East Indians), their interdependence and their several interests, habits, and abilities, the land in reference to its aboriginal owners and the Government's system of leasing, the productivity of the soil, its capabilities for stock breeding, the principal planting industries established or worthy of trial; and he treats of Fiji as a field for investment of capital. The labour shortage, which in Fiji as elsewhere is the burning question of to-day, comes in of course for a full share of discussion; but its present unsettled state makes this subject very difficult of review, and still more profitless to forecast perhaps at the present moment. Two short chapters are devoted to "The Pacific of the Twentieth Century" and the part Fiji may be destined to play in "the Naval Defence of the Pacific."

In spite of the merits of the book many of the author's statements and opinions will betray to the experienced settler in Fiji a hurried and superficial study of the subjects he treats, and will appeal to the old resident in the islands as the views of an optimist whose glance at the colony has been through rose glasses. The book contains several exaggerations, some repetitions, and some self-contradictions, which point to lack of care or excess of hurry in editing. Should a second edition be called for the chapter on rubber might be re-written with advantage, to bring it up to date. The statement on page 95 that "nearly all the whites drink" is a mere untruth; it suggests that the author is a too enthusiastic advocate of teetotalism, or that he mixed while in the colony with the wrong social set. The entire elimination of the word "black" in relation to coloured races in India and Fiji would be a graceful improvement and a tribute to anthropological fact. A curious slip on page 82 is the word "shagreen" for "chagrin"; and on page 98 why does a medical man write "concoction" for what is a simple cold aqueous infusion? The illustrations are good, but no acknowledgment is paid to Mr. Waters, from whose original negatives or prints many of them are reproduced. The small map of ocean steam communications might have been omitted, or else made vastly better.

B. G. C.