Irish Church Quarterly

Through Scylla and Charybdis by George Tyrrell

Review by: C. P. P.

The Irish Church Quarterly, Vol. 1, No. 2 (Apr., 1908), pp. 160-162

Published by: [Irish Church Quarterly](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/30066886>

Accessed: 12/06/2014 15:32

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at
<http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Irish Church Quarterly is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Irish Church Quarterly*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

published *Village Sermons* are so delightful and so edifying.

Dean Jellett's sermons are not only very good reading for friend or stranger, sound and wholesome teaching, very instructive and very inspiring ; they also recall vividly the character of the man to those who knew him. There is no eloquence, in the common use of the word, that is, no careful choice of lofty language, no delicately fashioned phrases, no sudden surprises of felicitous epigram, none of the swift-winged imagination of the poet-orator, nor of the musical cadences that our Primate delights to utter and his auditors to hear. But there is eloquence in a very true sense ; the style is strong, clear, and nervous ; he knows what he wants to say, and he gets his meaning out ; in every page of the book we can plainly discern the intense conviction, the unfaltering courage that may be silent but not through fear, the fervour of a man to whom, as to St. Paul, the truths he preached were as the very breath of his nostrils, and who longed before all things to make men understand and accept them.

Dean Bernard, in his address at the dedication of the memorial window in St. Patrick's, fitly dwelt upon three prominent features of his character—Learning, Stoutheartedness, and Humbleness of Mind. He was *insignis Doctrina, Constantia, Humilitate*. To these might well be added Lovingkindness, though not so recognizable by the public, and this, too, the discerning reader will find in his sermons, suffusing what might otherwise be a cold and pitiless logic or a dry statement of theological truth with the warm glow of a loving earnestness and a great yearning for the souls of men.

T. S. L.

THROUGH SCYLLA AND CHARYBDIS: or The Old Theology and the New. By George Tyrrell. (Longmans.) 5s.

In the essays which Father Tyrrell has re-published under the title *Through Scylla and Charybdis* he considers from various aspects a venerable difficulty upon which he finds much that is original and important to say. By the word "New" in the antithesis of the sub-title he does not refer to the theology of the City Temple, but to that scientific materialism or rationalism which is as unbending in its claims and as narrow in its temper as is the rigid scholasticism to which it is opposed. These two—theology and science—have long been at issue. Their conflict has been open and scandalous. Yet it is maintained, in Father

Tyrrell's judgment, on no sounder basis than an imperfect criticism of the principles upon which each of the combatants rests. It is the purpose of these essays to supply such a criticism; and, as his investigation proceeds, the writer develops the broad outlines of a positive theory which would assign to the concepts of theology, authority, and science functions which, if recognized, would render collisions between them impossible in the future. He would distinguish rigidly between theology and revelation. Theology is a science, and must proceed upon the lines proper to all sciences. It cannot claim exemption from change nor any absolute validity for the inferences it may deduce from time to time.

"A science which is not absolutely free to criticize its own categories and assumptions and to revolutionize itself in the light of wider experience and deeper reflection—a science whose conclusions are from time to time nailed down to the counter as final and above criticism is no science at all."

Accordingly, it is unreasonable that a reasoned creed should claim unreasoning acceptance. The province of authority is, therefore, distinct from that of theology. Revelation, however, is something quite different from theology and not to be confounded with it.

"Revelation supplies the theologian with his subject-matter—the experience on which his science is founded and which it endeavours to understand and explain."

Revelation is to theology as the stars are to astronomy—in it is to be found the constant, unchanging, element of Christian experience, the *depositum fidei*, the faith "once for all delivered." While the Christian revelation is as stable and unprogressive as is human nature in its deeper aspects, Christian theology is, and ought to be, as variable and elastic as is man's growth in knowledge and mental power. Ecclesiastical dogma is to be regarded as a protective husk wrapped round the kernel of Apostolic revelation. Church authority has no mission to defend theology but only to safeguard the contents of revelation, and therefore it cannot conflict with science, which reasons on a different plane. Father Tyrrell frankly avows his purpose in these essays to discredit dogmatic theology, but he does this, not in order to discredit either revelation or theology, but to establish sounder relations and a better understanding between them. One of the most notable results of such a concordat would be, in his opinion, that as the *prophetic* character of dogmatic truth is more intelligently grasped the separated Churches of Christendom will, with the disappearance of the "dogmatic

fallacy," cease to regard their merely theological differences as differences of *faith*.

Enough has been said, it is hoped, to show that this profound and thoughtful work merits the careful attention of all who are interested in one of the most important religious problems of our day.

C. P. P.

CALENDAR OF THE JUSTICIARY ROLLS: or Proceedings in the Court of the Justiciar of Ireland, Preserved in the Public Record Office of Ireland, xxiii. to xxxi. years of Edward I. Edited by James Mills, I.S.O., under the direction of the Master of the Rolls in Ireland. (Dublin: Alexander Thom and Co., Ltd.)

THIS volume comes as the first of a series which promises to be of much importance as throwing light on many questions connected with the legal procedure and social history of our native land in the days of the Plantagenets. The Rolls here calendared had not been utilised hitherto, and Mr. Mills's work affords ample evidence that they are of the highest historical value. They contain judicial proceedings, 23-31 Edward I. before the Court of the Justiciar of Ireland, which seems to have closely corresponded with that of the King in Council in England.

While the majority of the subjects with which the Calendar deals may be of more peculiar interest to trained lawyers and those engaged in investigating early legal history, our readers will naturally turn to those more immediately connected with the Church. In this connexion, the very full and admirably constructed subject index will be found valuable. Under the terms "Clerks," "Court Christian" and "Ecclesiastical," etc., will be found references dealing with the claims and jurisdiction of the Church, appeals to Rome, right of sanctuary, etc.; while the "social incidents" recorded, dealing with the every-day life of the people in town and country, dress, household goods, farming stock, etc., are of great interest and importance.

The Calendar contains much that throws light on the monasteries of the time; and that nunneries were at that distant period used for educational purposes is proved by the statement of certain jurors, who, in an inquiry as to the founding of such an institution in the County Cork, declared that there was no other house of nuns where the daughters of knights and freemen could be brought up, nor in three counties adjoining.

In the case of sanctuary, a murderer was taken from a