Review

Source: *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*, Vol. 18, No. 408 (Feb. 1, 1877), pp. 78-79

Published by: Musical Times Publications Ltd.

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3351707>

Accessed: 23-06-2016 06:15 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at

<http://about.jstor.org/terms>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Musical Times Publications Ltd. is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*

tions) that Mr. Horsley was a highly-accomplished musician, it may reasonably be expected that the examples scattered throughout will be most carefully considered. The explanation of intervals is clear enough, although of course we do not agree with the author that, in Harmony, the ninth can be considered merely a "repetition of the second." The best illustrations are the sequences of the various chords, and students may learn a great deal by transposing these examples. Some of the observations, too, upon the method in which pupils should work are worthy of notice, for, apart from his own musical acquirements, it must be remembered that Mr. Horsley was intimately acquainted with Spohr, Mendelssohn, Hauptmann, &c., and we all know how much the character is moulded by constant intercourse with the aristocracy of art.

The Christian Hymnal.

The New Church Hymn-Book.

[John F. Shaw and Co.]

POSTERITY cannot possibly lay to the charge of this generation that it produced no hymnals. Notwithstanding their costliness and the time necessarily required for their compilation, they crop up like primroses in a country lane; but let us qualify the simile by adding, only as to their quantity. What posterity will say to their *quality* is a very different thing, even should it have neither more nor less knowledge than we ourselves possess. The two books before us are average specimens of their kind. "The Christian Hymnal" contains more than three hundred tunes, set to five hundred hymns. How many of these five hundred sets of words are really good, regarding them as specimens of poetry, or edifying or elevating regarded as expositions of doctrine or religious sentiment, can best be determined by those who have devoted their attention to this question. When occupied in critically classifying hymns, how soon does the "first quality" become limited! Perhaps the same might be said of tunes also; and the only consolation, when one sees these bulky half-thousands, is obtained in the reflection that the good and true will certainly come to the front and live, and the weak or mischievous as certainly sink out of memory and die. Arrangements from secular or instrumental works are far too frequent in the Hymnal before us. Beethoven, Méhul, Spohr, Mendelssohn, Handel, and others have been dragged into the arranger's net, the tune dished up from the *Dead March in Saul* towards the close of the book (No. 475) filling up the measure of this iniquity. Of some of the tunes the authorship of which is described as "Anonymous" we can only say the authors are to be congratulated on maintaining their *incognito*. Of the tunes expressly composed for the work some are of great merit, notably No. 358, by J. B. Calkin, several from the prolific pen of Fr. Gauntlett, and No. 213, by Dr. Sullivan; but of others we cannot speak so favourably: No. 441, by Arthur Patton, is decidedly weak, although in this respect admirably matched to the words, the first stanza of which commences:—

"I'm a little pilgrim,"

and the second:—

"Mine's a better country."

Miss Whateley's tune, No. 266, with its bad consecutive octaves, cannot be commended. On the whole, the harmonies are good; several faults which we at first attributed to the editor's lack of skill seemed on consideration to be misprints; such, for example, as the last note in bass bar 7 of No. 64, which should be G, and in bar 14 of No. 91, where tenor should be A $\flat$; other misprints are more obvious, such, for instance, as the omission of the flat to A in the tenor part of bar 3, No. 259. To our general praise of the harmonies many exceptions must be made; certainly the last bar but one of No. 77 is not justifiable, nor is No. 251 satisfactory. Whether No. 22 is harmonised as the composer left it, we are unable, without further reference, to say, but the progressions are throughout incoherent.

"The New Church Hymn-Book," sent to us for review from the same publishers as "The Christian Hymnal,"

seems to differ only as to the selection of words, the music having evidently been issued under the same editorship, and, as a result, entitled to the same just admixture of praise and blame. "The Church Hymn-Book" is that known as "Kemble's Hymn-Book," to which a considerable number of churchmen staunchly adhere. After all, people really adopt hymnals more from the character of the words than that of the music; and those who are bound up with the section of thinkers which these books represent will find them admirably suited to their purpose. All of us who pin ourselves to a party have to make some sacrifice or other, either of independence of thought, freedom of action, or money. Those who adopt these hymnals will, no doubt, gladly put up patiently with a few uncouth musical progressions, when they consider how well their religious sentiments are expressed in the words.

Casgliad O Donau y diweddar John Roberts of Henllan.
[J. Haddon and Co.]

THIS is a collection of Hymn Tunes composed by the late John Roberts of Henllan and published by his son as a monument to his father's memory. Although the majority are in a style now losing its hold on popular estimation many are good of their kind, and some are remarkable for freshness and originality. Amongst these, "Rhyw afon gaed" ("O worship the king") is deserving of special praise. Next to this in merit is "Angelion doent yn gysson" ("Hail to the Lord's anointed"), which, as a melody, is strikingly beautiful. Evidently the author of these tunes was gifted by nature with genuine talents for music, and had he been thrown into a sphere of work more suitable to their growth and proper training, without doubt he would have left his mark.

A Service for the Holy Communion. Adapted from Spohr's Oratorio "The Last Judgment" by the Rev. Edward Husband. [Novello, Ewer and Co.]

THE question of the justifiability, or otherwise, of arrangements is one for which no hard and fast line can be drawn; it must be in all cases one of expediency. There are, however, certain general principles which may be of service in guiding to a decision in particular cases. For instance, to adapt music with familiar secular associations to sacred words is evidently inadmissible. We therefore object on principle to the use of the "Christy Minstrel" melodies and music of that class for children's hymns, and also to Psalm tunes, such as are to be met with in some collections, made from operatic melodies—Mozart's "Batti, batti" and "Ah perdonà," or (as we lately saw in one popular tune-book) the slow movement of the Overture to "Der Freischütz." But when we come to the question of adapting one piece of sacred music to different words, we are on more difficult ground. Here, perhaps, our safest guide will be the principle that the new text should not be unsuited in feeling to the music, and that the latter should not be altered. Tried by these tests, Mr. Husband's Communion Service taken from Spohr's "Last Judgment" must be pronounced partly satisfactory and partly the reverse. It would be unjust not to acknowledge the extreme ingenuity with which in places he has dovetailed in the new words. Thus the whole of the opening chorus of the Oratorio, "Praise His awful Name," including the incidental soprano and bass solos, has been adapted to the Nicene Creed, and so well adapted that we should not have believed it possible had we not seen it actually done. Here not a note of the music has been altered, and the expression certainly in many parts suits the new text admirably. The "Sanctus" (set, of course, to the "Holy, holy" of the original) is also excellent; nor perhaps could any reasonable exception be taken to the adaptation of the "Benedictus" to the solo and chorus, "All glory to the Lamb." But in other parts of the service Mr. Husband has done what we consider quite inadmissible. For instance, his "Kyrie" is made from a fragment of the duet "Forsake me not," while another part of the same movement does duty for the "Agnus." Not merely is the music mutilated, but passages written by Spohr for two solo voices are arranged for full chorus. It certainly should

either have been left as the composer wrote it, or let alone. The "Gloria" is a curious piece of patchwork. It begins, very appropriately, with the opening of Spohr's "Blessing, honour, glory, and power," the fugue which forms the middle part of the chorus being omitted, and the end of the chorus tacked on to the beginning. Then at the words "O Lord, the only-begotten Son" we find the unison chorus, "If with all your hearts." "Thou that takest away the sins of the world" is adapted to the quartet, "O Lord, who shall not fear thee;" and lastly, at "For Thou only art holy" the music of the "Blessing, honour" is introduced again. We will not go so far as to say that the musical effect of the whole is unsatisfactory. The arrangement is very clever, but, as it stands, it is not Spohr's; and, on principle, we strongly object to this presentation of a composer's ideas in a juxtaposition so different from that which he designed.

"O pray for the peace of Jerusalem." Solo and Chorus from the Anthem "I was glad when they said unto me." Composed by E. H. Thorne. [Novello, Ewer and Co.]

THE elaborate Anthem of which the present piece is the middle movement was composed for the re-opening of Chichester Cathedral in 1867; but the whole work being too long (and we might add too difficult) for ordinary occasions and for average choirs, this portion is now reprinted separately. Of the wisdom of this procedure there will not be two opinions from any who knows the music; for this solo and chorus is one of the most pleasing and attractive pieces of church music which has for some time come under our notice. The opening solo is very graceful, and remarkable for the freedom of its harmonic treatment. We find here nothing inconsistent with the dignity of sacred music, but at the same time there is a freedom from the conventional style of cathedral anthems which gives much freshness to the composition. The free imitation on the second page between the solo and chorus, at the words "they shall prosper that love thee," is very good, a novel and pleasing effect being produced by the soprano and tenor of the chorus singing in octaves. Even better, perhaps, is the treatment of the text "Peace be within thy walls," in which the tenor chorus accompanies the soprano solo, the rest of the chorus entering later, and leading back, with an unaccompanied phrase, to the return of the first subject. The close of the movement is also very charming, and the whole piece has given us much pleasure, as it will doubtless do to those who may sing or hear it. It is not particularly easy, for it requires very careful intonation, and much attention to light and shade; but it will well repay for the pains spent in its preparation.

This is the day which the Lord hath made. Full Anthem for Easter. Composed by S. Charles Cooke. [Novello, Ewer and Co.]

THE present anthem is tuneful and easy to sing. It suffers to some extent from want of unity of style, which, however, may be explained, if not altogether justified, by the selection of the words, which are taken from Psalm cxviii. v. 24; 1 Cor. xv. v. 20, 21, 22, 57. The music, however, has plenty of spirit, and is not dry. We are somewhat at a loss to understand the way in which the organ part is written. From the indications of the pedal on the fourth page, we should suppose a C organ was intended, but in other parts of the anthem we find the low B and A written, notes which are not on the manual of a C organ, and which, if intended for the pedal (which appears doubtful, as they occur in octave passages for the left hand), should have been written an octave higher.

Oh, Linger. A Song of Delos. Poetry by Mrs. Hemans. *Without thine ear.* Song. Poetry by Lord Byron. Composed by Charles Salaman. [J. B. Cramer and Co.]

We hope that the multiplication of Mr. Salaman's vocal compositions may be accepted as a sign that they are as welcomed by the general public as they should be by musicians. It is true that he has always something to say, but he rarely records his thoughts in conventional

language; and purchasers of his works, therefore, must have sufficiently trained their minds to wait for the revelation of beauties which do not lie upon the surface. The first of these songs, especially, justifies these prefatory remarks. As a specimen of the form of the German *lied*, "for voice and pianoforte," it may be cited as one of the best we have seen from Mr. Salaman's prolific pen. Preceded by a gracefully flowing symphony, the voice part lingering upon the B, in excellent sympathy with the words, commences with a most melodious theme, the varied character of which is reflective of the poetry throughout. We are particularly pleased with the broken phrases occurring on the last two pages, after the close on the key-note; and although we might take exception to the word "oh" being lengthened out to two bars of three triplets each, the conclusion of the song, musically speaking, is highly effective. "Without thine ear," in E flat minor and major, composed to a song of *Medora's*, in Byron's "Corsair," is more simple in construction, but the melody is extremely expressive, and the accompaniment—appropriately subdued until the change into the tonic major—merely indicates the natural harmonies of the theme. We can heartily recommend this song to all lovers of unaffected vocal music.

Love's Spell. Song. Words by Willy De Burgh. Composed by W. Borrow. [Keith, Prowse and Co.]

THERE is much musical feeling displayed in this song, but the accompaniment requires some revision. The descent of the voice in perfect 5ths with the bass (page 3, bar 6), and the doubling of the C, instead of E (in the 8th bar, same page), are faults which should scarcely occur even in so simple a ballad. The words are excellently adapted for musical setting, and Mr. Borrow has well caught the spirit of the poetry.

Six Romances sans paroles. Pour Piano. Par Lefébure-Wely. [Novello, Ewer and Co.]

1. *Le Sésia* (Italie). Réverie.
2. *La Wartha* (Allemagne). Mélodie.
3. *La Neva* (Russie). Caprice.
4. *La Guadiana* (Espagne). Sérénade.
5. *La Lys* (France). Réverie.
6. *La Dyle* (Belgique). Berceuse.

THE character of each of these six Romances is determined by its title; so that, although confessedly "sans paroles," we have some indication as to what the author had in his mind whilst composing them. With the exception of Nos. 3 and 4, we can scarcely see that they are especially representative of the countries they are supposed to illustrate; but all are thoroughly artistic sketches, and, containing no great executive difficulties, will be found well worthy the attention of amateurs. The figure in the left hand gives much point to the *legato* subject of No. 1; but it is perhaps scarcely as attractive as No. 2, the theme of which is commenced with the left hand, and afterwards given in octaves, to the right hand, with a rapid accompaniment. Nos. 3 and 4 will, no doubt, be the most popular of the set, the melodies of both being well marked, and No. 4, in A minor, having the true Spanish ring throughout. The subject of No. 5, with the accompaniment divided between the two hands, is well contrasted by an animated theme in the subdominant; and No. 6 is appropriately placid, with a characteristic phrase for the left hand, which is continued, almost without a break, throughout the piece. Like all the pianoforte music of this composer, these sketches are extremely refined, and devoid of any pedantic display of learning.

La Primavera. Mélodie pour le Piano.

L'Estate. Bluettes de Salon.

L'Autunno. Morceau de Salon.

L'Inverno. Morceau de Salon.

Par Louis Dupuis. [C. Jefferys.]

WHY, in writing four pieces to illustrate the seasons, one should be termed a "Mélodie," a second a "Bluette," and a third and fourth a "Morceau," we are at a loss to understand. M. Dupuis has, however, in composing for young