Review

Source: *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*, Vol. 17, No. 390 (Aug. 1, 1875), pp. 172-173

Published by: Musical Times Publications Ltd.

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3352818>

Accessed: 19-06-2016 21:04 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at

<http://about.jstor.org/terms>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Musical Times Publications Ltd. is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*

who had won this position at the preliminary examination. On Saturday, the 10th ult., the prizes were distributed by Madame Lind-Goldschmidt, the ceremony being preceded by a concert, at which the successful candidates performed. The report states that the competitions have presented gratifying features, much care and preparation having been evidenced, especially in the soprano and contralto classes.

A FREE scholarship for a female pianist, between the ages of 14 and 21, tenable for two years, has been generously founded by Lady Goldsmid in the Royal Academy of Music, which will be competed for at Easter. The Committee of the Goss Testimonial, we are also informed, has resolved to elect a student of the College of Organists to be placed in the Academy, the funds raised for the testimonial being sufficient to defray half the expense of a scholarship. The pupil will be elected for three years, the examination to take place during the present month.

WE are informed that the valuable violoncello lately in possession of Herr Wilhelmj, the eminent violin player, has been bought by Herr Schubert.

THE Mildmay Park Choral Society gave a very successful performance of Mendelssohn's "Athalie," and a miscellaneous selection, at Hare Court Lecture Hall, Canonbury, on Tuesday evening, June 29th. The soloists were Miss A. Bliss, Miss Evans, Madame Arnold Potter, and Messrs. Irving, Payne, and Young; Pianoforte, Mr. A. Cox; Harmonium, Mr. E. Snell; Conductor, Mr. Watkins.

At the Musical Examination recently held by the Academical Board of Trinity College, London, the following candidates passed:—*Senior Choral Fellows*—J. M. Bentley (by competition), New College, Oxford; J. T. Field, Blackheath; C. H. Hewitt, Birkbeck Institution; T. W. Hosking, St. Mark's College, Chelsea. *Choral Fellows*—H. T. Walmsley Little, Christ Church, Woburn Square, London; J. Loaring, New College, Oxford; J. T. Wells, Royal Academy of Music. *Choral Associates*—R. Ambler, Preston, Lancashire; F. Smith, Thames Ditton. *Harmony Prize*—J. Loaring. *The Singing Prize* was not awarded. *Examiners*—Edward Dearle, Mus. D., Cantab, S.C.F.; Walter H. Sangster, Mus. B., Oxon, S.C.F.; J. Gordon Saunders, Mus. B., Oxon, S.C.F., and Bradbury Turner, Mus. B., Cantab.

REVIEWS.

NOVELLO, EWER AND CO.

The Notation of Vocal Music, on the principle of Substitution of Pitch; as adapted in the National Method. By W. W. Pearson.

IN a former notice of what Mr. Pearson terms the "National Method" of teaching vocal music we mentioned, as an objection to his system, the fact of his writing *relatively* with an *absolute* notation; and although we admit that a temporary popularity may be gained for this, as for any other device of the same nature, we still cannot believe that it will ever obtain a general recognition amongst musicians. In his opening remarks Mr. Pearson, in speaking of the relative notation invented by the Misses Glover, of Norwich, says, "It is the use of this principle which is the real cause of the extraordinary success of the Tonic Sol-Fa System, in the elementary stages, though it is attributed by the unthinking to the notation itself; but the mistake of the originators, in using a new notation, instead of employing part of the old one, has been its bane, and brought against it the opposition of most musicians." Now we do not believe that there was any mistake made in inventing a new notation—for Mr. Curwen is a sufficiently clear-headed man to see that to write for one method in the symbols invented for another is a logical absurdity—but the error, in our opinion, was abolishing at one fell swoop the "ladder" system and writing the notes in a straight line. We are of course aware that by using the letters to be found in every printing-office, compositions noted upon the new system can be very easily multiplied;

but this is outside the *musical* question, and therefore cannot be accepted as an argument in favour of Tonic Sol-faism itself. The author of the book before us, in his observations upon the ease of writing relatively with the present notation, seems to speak as if the notes in the five-line staff were not named and pitched by the treble clef in all published music; for he says that "pupils taught on the plan here suggested will be accustomed to the varying pitch from the beginning, so that they will never imbibe those notions of absolute pitch which are at present part of the nature of an old notation reader." This would be all very well if a person taught upon this system were not compelled to "imbibe those notions of absolute pitch" by association with those who were not disciples of Mr. Pearson, but there can be no question that a student of the "national method" would be worse off amongst musicians than a man in a foreign country; for though the latter may not be able to make himself understood to those around him, he at least will not find that a word in his language which conveys a definite idea to himself means something quite different to his next-door neighbour. So thoroughly indeed does Mr. Pearson ignore the importance of admitting the fact that the clef not only gives a name but a pitch to a certain note in our present system, that he proposes writing all the voice parts with the treble clef, showing the real pitch by an indicator at the commencement—a system the advocacy of which seems doubly strange in one who urges as a reason for rejecting the Tonic Sol-fa method, that "it does not give the power to *read* music, in the ordinary sense of the term, and is, in reality, little better for practical purposes than mere ear-singing." With every word in the author's chapter upon "Time notation" we cordially agree. Why, indeed, should we perplex learners by having various ways of writing the same thing? "Uniformity of beat," as he truly says, is all we require; and as "Compound Time" (as it is absurdly called) is merely simple time moving in triplets, what reason can there possibly be for making the matter so complicated to students? surely four, two, and three divisions in the bar are all we really want: are we still to adhere to the lingering notion that minims look sacred, and crotchets secular? In conclusion we cannot but give Mr. Pearson every credit for earnestness and conscientiousness. He thoroughly believes in his own system, and has consequently a right to be respected. But the fact of his inviting opinion by sending his pamphlet for review is a proof that he is open to conviction; and we feel therefore that he will receive our strictures in the spirit which dictated them. We have considered the subject much; and, whilst thoroughly admitting the soundness of the theory upon which the modern systems of vocal tuition are built, we cannot but reiterate the assertion with which we concluded our notice of Mr. Pearson's former book, that "in order to write vocal music *relatively* and *truly*, we must have a new notation."

It is a good thing to give thanks. Full Anthem. By J. Frederick Bridge, Mus. Doc.

THIS Anthem was written by the Organist of Manchester Cathedral during the present year, for the Commemoration Festivals at the Churches of St. Mary and St. Michael, Hulme, Manchester. It is an extended composition in four movements. The first, a short chorus in C major, with an effective, and to some extent, independent organ part. We cannot say, however, that we like the harsh sound of the second inversion of a Dominant 9th used without the 7th, and with the root *f* 3rd on page three, score one, bar one. The second movement in G major, though perhaps modulating too freely considering its brevity, is a melodious four-part chorus. A better contrast with what precedes it would be secured if this were rendered by solo voices, for which the music is well suited, when the effect of the chorus entering with the words, "Upon a loud trumpet" would still further enhance the effect. The third movement is for a chorus of tenors and basses accompanied by sustained harmony, and this is followed by a recurrence of the music of the opening chorus, given now to the words, "I will sing unto the Lord." The whole concludes with a fugue which works up to a brilliant coda and forms a

fitting termination to a musicianly piece. It will thus be seen that the work is of some length, but the author, with consideration for the practical, has given a direction for the omission of a considerable part of the last chorus, so that if time is an object in the performance, busy people may not be debarred from the enjoyment of a goodly portion of the Anthem.

Original Hymn Tunes to Favourite Words. By Alfred King, Mus. Bac.

<i>Eternity.</i>	<i>Art thou weary?</i>
<i>Jesu grant me this.</i>	<i>Jesus, tender Shepherd.</i>
<i>Three in One.</i>	<i>How sweet the Name.</i>
<i>Faith of our fathers.</i>	<i>Hail to Thee.</i>
<i>Safe home.</i>	<i>Ye servants of the Lord.</i>

THESE words will be recognised by many readers, and the music is not unworthy of them, although faults are not entirely absent. The two second inversions (in "Rosbury 6," score 2, bars 2 and 3), following one another, are unsatisfactory. The effect is also bad where the D pedal is quitted in "Faith of our fathers," score 3, bar 2, before it becomes a note of harmony. The bass frequently leaps to a note above that last sounded by the tenor part, as in the Ave Verum, 6th and 7th bars. Simple compositions like these should at least be free from grammatical faults, for which originality of treatment or taking melody do not sufficiently atone.

Pack clouds away, and welcome day. A Four-part Song. Words by Thomas Heywood (Circa 1620). Composed by Charles Harford Lloyd.

THIS is a melodious song, and in parts so well written as to make us wish to alter the harsh effect of the soprano commencing upon A against the G sharp of the alto (bar 3, page 2); and we must also take exception to the second bar of page 3, when the seventh on C $\sharp$ rises, an unpleasant effect of fifths between the two chords being felt, in addition to the ascent of the discord. We know that this sort of writing constantly passes current in modern music; but it is not good counterpoint, and we protest against it. The words are well expressed throughout, and the lengthening of the phrase "To give my love good morrow," is extremely effective.

Polly Vanderdecken. Song. Words by Gordon Campbell. Composed by E. Silas.

THIS song, which was sung with much success at the composer's recent concert, is certainly destined to become popular, although, so simple is it in construction, that much of its effect must depend upon the singer. The words are set to a pleasing little pastoral melody, with just such an unpretentious accompaniment as the subject demands. The unexpected chord of G minor on the pause, with the temporary modulation into D minor, are points which evidence the minute care bestowed by the composer upon a ballad which merely aspires to be, both in words and music, an artless village song.

The Rock of Ages. Sacred Song. Words by Finlay Finlayson. Composed by John Francis Barnett.

MR. BARNETT has here given a clever and sympathetic setting of Mr. Finlayson's words, and one which we think baritone singers will thank us for drawing their attention to. An *Agitato* symphony in arpeggio, commencing upon a tonic pedal in E minor, introduces the voice part with much effect, the arpeggios being continued as an accompaniment until the change into the major. Here the alteration from C to 12.8 rhythm is effective, an exceedingly melodious theme, to the words, "Unto Thy Cross, O Lord, I cling," with a triplet accompaniment, forming an admirable contrast with the agitated subject at the commencement. There is much true musical feeling in the treatment of the phrase, "Help and deliver me," with the pedal harmonies, at the conclusion, and in every respect the song may be cited as a highly favourable specimen of its composer's powers. We perceive, by the title-page that it has already been sung by Mr. Santley.

Sweet Rotherbay Bay. Song. Words by the Author of "John Halifax, Gentleman." Composed by William H. Cummings.

THERE is a Scottish character about the music of this song which faithfully reflects the feeling of the words.

The theme, too, is extremely melodious, and lies well in the register of the contralto voice. From so accomplished a musician and vocalist as Mr. Cummings we may reasonably expect a composition which shall be worthy of his reputation; but this little ballad, unpretentious as it is, will not only sustain but add to the fame of a composer who has proved by his charming Cantata "The Fairy Ring," that he has the power to produce works of a higher importance.

The Rainy Day. Song. Words by Longfellow. Composed by Wm. Fossey Bradshaw.

LONGFELLOW'S words have an extraordinary fascination for young composers, and yet there can be no question that to colour them in sympathy with the mind of the poet it requires that power of diving into the inner meaning of the author which can only be gained by experience. Mr. Bradshaw's music, with the exception of some occasional crudities—such as the doubling of the leading note in the dominant seventh of D minor, and the awkward harmonies which follow upon a dominant in C major, commencing bar 11, page 4—is fairly good; but he has failed to enter into the true spirit of the poetry. Some indications there are, however, of a musical feeling which may be cultivated to good purpose; and we counsel Mr. Bradshaw rather to study than publish, at present, if he really wish to secure a successful career.

NOVELLO AND CO., AND J. MASTERS AND CO.

Four Tunes for the People's Hymnal. Composed by G. Alston Sarvent.

THESE unpretentious compositions, which are not without merit, are marred by grammatical faults, such as the 5ths, between tenor and bass, score 3, to the words "Thou with," and the bad resolution of the 2nd inversion of a Dominant 7th, score 7, last 2 bars.

LOCKWOOD & Co.

A Rudimentary and Practical Treatise on Music. The Rudiments of the art of playing the Pianoforte. By Charles Child Spencer.

THE author of these works is evidently an acute thinker, and has reasoned with much ability upon the theories which he advocates; but we think it a pity that in Treatises designed, as he says in his preface, for the assistance of the "young student," such an opinion as that there are "nine forms of the minor scale," should be put forward. This assertion, however, is not only advanced in the first-named of the two books before us, but various attempts to prove the truth of it are made by quotations from compositions, ancient and modern. That his case is made out, however, we venture to doubt; for whatever notes may have been taken by the older writers for the construction of their melodies, there can be no question that the minor scale in the works of those later composers who understood the harmonies which these notes naturally carried, is as thoroughly defined as that of the major. In proof of this we may say that, to us, the extract from Mozart's duet, "Crudel perchè finora," is purely in the modern scale of A minor, and that it begins and ends with the dominant; that the composer has harmonised the melody in the simplest manner according to the accepted theory of the degrees of the scale, merely using an augmented 6th on the minor 6th of the key, upon notes which he might have allowed to belong to the tonic chord. To say that, without regard to the feeling of the melody, the notes of the air and accompaniment are E, F, $\sharp$ G, A, B, C, $\sharp$ D, E, and by considering the first and last as the initial, and not the dominant, to assert that it is in the "eighth form of the minor scale" is rather, we think, torturing the facts to help the theory, than allowing the theory to be strengthened by the facts. We do not doubt that the old composers wrote in scales which are not now recognised; but these are the "Church modes," of which Mr. Spencer, in a former treatise, has given so lucid an explanation. Better, therefore, is it to believe that the notes, for instance, with which Mendelssohn gives out the words "Lord, bow Thine ear to my prayer," in *Elijah*, are in the