THE Musical Times

ESTABLISHED IN 1844

The Wrong bar in Beethoven's Seventh Symphony

Author(s): F. Corder and H. Wilcox Lawrance

Source: *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*, Vol. 34, No. 608 (Oct. 1, 1893), pp. 617-618

Published by: [Musical Times Publications Ltd.](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3362243>

Accessed: 19/12/2014 08:18

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Musical Times Publications Ltd. is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

More prodigies! A little girl pianist of eight, Berthe Balthasar, has been playing at several concerts at Spa, Belgium. That she created the usual "enthusiasm" goes without saying. At Berlin a boy of nine, Arthur Argiewicz, from Warsaw, has been performing such trifles as Mendelssohn's Violin Concerto, Wieniawski's "Legende," and Bach's Chaconne! Prodigious!

The concerts given by Señor Sarasate in his native town of Pampeluna for the benefit of its poor realised the respectable sum of 10,000 francs.

Signora Gemma Bellincioni and her husband, Signor Roberto Stagno, have commissioned Signor Nicola Massa to write an opera, "Eros," specially for them, which they will produce at the Pagliacci Theatre, Florence.

Signor Verga, the Italian novelist on whose tale, "Cavalleria Rusticana," Mascagni's work of the same title is founded, has got over his objection to being set to music. No doubt the 200,000 lire paid to him in royalties since he won the action against Mascagni's publisher has something to do with this result. At present he is said to be engaged on three new librettos at once!

A new comic opera, "Clara di Belleville," by Signor Barbabietolo, was recently performed at Catania with great success.

Rubinstein's opera "Die Maccabäer" will be produced shortly at Milan, Rome, and Turin, under the personal direction of the great pianist.

At Trieste a new illustrated musical paper, *Rivista musicale illustrata*, has made its appearance.

Professor Ed. Caudella, director of the Conservatoire of Music, Jassy, Roumania, has just finished a new three-act opera. It is his sixth work of the kind, and the title is "Petro Koresho."

The visit of the Russian fleet to Toulon will be the means of making the Parisians and Frenchmen generally somewhat better acquainted with Russian music than is at present the case. At the Grand Opéra works by Glinka, Rubinstein, and Tchaikowsky will be performed, though not a complete opera of either of these masters. M. Carvalho, the director of the Opéra Comique, is pushing forward the rehearsals of César Cui's "Flibustier" with feverish activity, so as to have the work ready for performance by the time the Russian guests arrive in Paris. Finally, the Rouen Theatre is preparing Rubinstein's "Nero."

M. Véronge de la Nux, the composer of an opera, "Zaire," which has been performed at the Paris Grand Opéra, is about to complete a trilogy entitled "Les Labdacides," the three portions of which are respectively called "Edipe roi," "Edipe à Colone," and "Antigone." The libretto, by the composer, is written in prose.

M. Saint-Saëns has undertaken to complete an opera, "Brunehaut," which was left in an unfinished state by the late M. Guiraud.

M. Colonne has been engaged to conduct a series of Orchestral Concerts in Russia, as well as some performances of Massenet's "Werther" and Reyser's "Sigurd."

Wagner's "Flying Dutchman," M. Saint-Saëns's "Phryné," and a comic opera, as yet unnamed, by M. Jacques Dalcroze, will be the novelties at the Geneva Theatre. The director, M. Dauphin, will also produce four new operettas.

M. Henri Maréchal's opera "Dédamie" was produced at the Paris Grand Opéra on the 15th ult., but without any remarkable success. It appears to be a very creditable, musically work, but devoid of any striking features.

M. Paul Taffanel, one of the new Conductors at the Paris Grand Opéra, was sent to Munich last month to be present at the Wagner Cycle. He was instructed to pay particular attention to the performances of "Tristan," which, it seems, will be the next work of Wagner to be produced at the Opéra. Thus the "Wagner Eclipse" predicted by one of our weekly contemporaries goes merrily on! During M. Taffanel's absence things have not gone altogether smoothly at the Opéra. M. Paul Viardot, the third Conductor, having been asked to conduct the "Walküre," that young gentleman proceeded forthwith to stop the performance several times during the first act because he "could not follow the singers"! The audience naturally resented this way of interpreting Wagner, and expressed as much in unmistakable terms, whereupon it was considered wise to entrust the *bâton* for the remaining

two acts to the experienced hands of M. Edouard Mangin, the principal *chef de chant*. M. Viardot's excuses are a bad ear-ache and insufficient time for rehearsals. During his convalescence M. Viardot might improve the shining hour by perusing "Wagner on Conducting."

August Enna, the composer of the successful opera "The Witch," which enjoyed the distinction of being prohibited in Russia, has completed a new three-act opera, "Cleopatra," the book of which is founded on Mr. Rider Haggard's tale. Messrs. Breitkopf and Härtel are the publishers of the new work, and from a communication which they have been sending to our German musical contemporaries it appears that a Danish publisher has forestalled them in issuing a vocal score of this same "Cleopatra," which is, however, declared to be spurious, and to have been produced without the knowledge of the composer. It is supposed to have been concocted from an early pianoforte sketch score, but how this got into the hands of the publisher in question we are left to conjecture. The sale of this spurious edition has been prohibited in Germany.

A monument to Niels W. Gade has just been completed in Copenhagen and will shortly be erected in the Church at which the deceased master was Organist for thirty-two years. Besides a portrait medallion, wreaths, and the usual biographical data, it bears a poetic inscription which, translated, reads somewhat as follows: "Out of tones he built a Jacob's ladder—from the darkness of this Earth to the realm of Light—in them his dream received life, his thoughts wings—and through them his fame resounds."

The famous "Tivoli" at Copenhagen, one of the largest places of amusement on the Continent, has just celebrated the fiftieth anniversary of its foundation. It is one of the sights of the town, and has received within its vast halls all the most renowned artists who have visited the Danish capital. It was here that the composer Hans Christian Lumbye, "the Scandinavian Strauss," produced the many dances, marches, &c., which made his name known throughout the whole of Europe.

Frau Materna, the famous Wagner singer, the original *Brünnhilde* in "Siegfried" and "Götterdämmerung," and *Kundry* in "Parsifal," is going to America to sing at a number of Concerts. Her first appearance will be at the New York Philharmonic Society.

A great festive gathering took place last month at the old University town of Upsala, in Sweden, to celebrate the 300th anniversary of the great religious revolt in the sixteenth century which resulted in the establishment of the Protestant faith in Sweden. The musical arrangements included a performance of a Jubilee Cantata, for soli, chorus, and orchestra, composed for the occasion by Mr. Ivar Hedenblad, the Musical Director of the University; and also a vocal Concert, given by the Upsala Students' Chorus, one of the finest male choirs in Europe.

Mr. Christian Danning, a young Danish musician who has studied at the Leipzig Conservatoire, has written a symphony entitled "Dante," which was recently performed in Germany with success.

The Landgrave of Hesse-Cassel, who has been travelling in Norway, went, on the 4th ult., expressly to Bergen in order to pay a visit to Edvard Grieg and his talented wife, who have, during the summer months, been residing at their villa, "Trolldhang," near Bergen.

CORRESPONDENCE.

THE WRONG BAR IN BEETHOVEN'S SEVENTH SYMPHONY.

TO THE EDITOR OF "THE MUSICAL TIMES."

SIR,—Allow me to assure Mr. Silas that I have no desire to deprive him of the slightest honour or glory in connection with his discovery. That I discovered it twelve years ago is perfectly true, but when I mentioned the fact I was met with the same rejoinder which so vexes the present discoverer—namely, that it was well-known already.

Sir George Grove, I believe, claims freedom from all errors for Beethoven's published works, but were all existing editions compared I am sure more discrepancies could be

found (printers' errors mostly) than would fill one volume of the "Dictionary of Music and Musicians."

Perhaps the proposed *fac-simile* reproductions of Beethoven's MSS. will throw light on some of the discrepancies alluded to in my last letter, but here is another, of which I have vainly sought an explanation. Towards the end of the Ninth Symphony, in the 6-4 movement, if anyone will take the trouble to compare the first edition with any later one he will find that the second bassoon and double bassoon had not originally the extravagantly difficult quaver runs along with the violoncellos and basses, nor had the second flute anything like its present part. Whether rightly or wrongly I know not, but they were much easier at first. *Who altered them?*—Faithfully yours,

F. CORDER.

TO THE EDITOR OF "THE MUSICAL TIMES."

SIR,—I am exceedingly interested in the subject raised by Mr. Silas *re* Beethoven's Seventh Symphony. I remember, when a student, conducting a local orchestra at a rehearsal of this work, and wondering at the undoubted discord produced by playing the bar in question according to the score and parts, and commented upon it to some of the players.

One feels that one is "treading upon sacred ground" when playing the music of Beethoven, and I am sure that this feeling of awe is the cause why acknowledged great professors of the art have been willing to accept as correct, and no doubt explain satisfactorily to themselves, a passage which from no modern composer would they allow to go unchallenged. Whether such slavery to tradition is wise seems a question. When studying with the late Thomas Wingham I once mentioned this subject, and he said to me he thought that most likely it was a *mistake* by the engraver.

Mr. Silas is undoubtedly correct in inferring that the bar has generated grave doubts as to the composer *really* meaning it in the minds of the many musicians who have had the arranging of it from score for pianoforte, &c., as I have before me an old copy of an arrangement for pianoforte duet by W. Watts, published by Chappell & Co. In it I see that although the "Chord of D" is not omitted *entirely*, as by Hummel and Kalkbrenner, yet the suggestion that the bar in score must be a mistake evidently occurred to him, as the "A" chord is continued up to the last semiquaver of the bar.

It stands thus in this copy:—

The image shows a musical score for two parts, Primo and Secondo. The Primo part is written for a piano or organ, and the Secondo part is written for a cello or double bass. The score is in G major (one sharp) and 3/4 time. The Primo part has a treble clef and the Secondo part has a bass clef. Both parts have a key signature of one sharp (F#). The Primo part has a 'Sua' marking above the first measure, and the Secondo part has a 'Sua' marking above the first measure. The score shows a bar with a 'Sua' marking and a 'Sua' marking.

I hope, Sir, that you will kindly allow this subject space as long as it is possible, so as to get several opinions, feeling sure that musicians must agree that any trouble is worth taking to get the most reasonably correct version of a bar from so monumental a work as Beethoven's Seventh Symphony.—Yours truly,

H. WILCOX LAWRENCE.

Heathlands, Lewisham Road.

MUSIC IN FRENCH CATHEDRALS AND CHURCHES.

TO THE EDITOR OF "THE MUSICAL TIMES."

SIR,—An article on the above subject in THE MUSICAL TIMES for July has just been brought to my notice, in

which comparisons are drawn between the music in French and English Cathedrals, very much to the disadvantage of the latter. The writer only mentions Reims and Cologne by name, but he distinctly draws his comparisons between "any one of our provincial Cathedrals and the provincial Cathedral of Reims." In passing, I would note that he purposely leaves out of the question "the well known choirs of the capitals of both countries, which enjoy exceptional advantages." This looks as if he knew very little of such choirs as those of York Minster or Durham, to say nothing of King's or Trinity College Chapels at Cambridge, which, though not in size, can certainly be compared very favourably in other respects with any church or cathedral choir in London.

But it is not of English Cathedral Services I wish to write. My object is to correct the impression conveyed by the article of your correspondent, W. E. D., that English Cathedral services are inferior to French. I do not know Reims, but I have lately, during a tour in France, heard services of one kind or another in the two Abbeys at Caen, and one church, St. Pierre; in the Cathedral of Bayeux, in the church (formerly a Cathedral) at Lisieux, in the Cathedrals of Rouen, Chartres (Funeral Service), and Tours, besides other smaller churches. The services were high mass, low mass, service for the dead performed by priests alone (at Bayeux), penitential service (at the Abbaye aux Dames, Caen), services of Psalms and of hymns alone; so there was no lack of variety from which to draw conclusions. Some of these were specially grand services during the month of May. It is not too much to say we did not hear a service, or even a portion of one, which could be called beautiful or interesting, or even tolerable from a musical point of view. We had high mass seven times, and possibly W. E. D. will not credit it, but there was not a note of harmony in any one of them. This is a state of things alone sufficient to put comparisons out of the question. At Tours the organ, whose tone was grand, was horribly out of tune, and this was the case in one or two other instances. The voices were egregiously out of tune times without number; on one occasion the solo performer, whoever he was, seemed unable ever to hit the right note. At Tours we followed an announcement in the newspaper that at the Church of St. Julien there would be music after vespers. This consisted of a fine baritone, a soprano, and a flautist giving two solos each. They would have been good, or at least fairly good, if the organist had been as equal to his work as those one commonly meets in English country parish churches; but he was not. At Bayeux and Chartres the voices were obviously unequal to singing right without assistance; they were therefore led and dominated by the strains—in unison, of course—of a contra-bass. W. E. D. speaks much of "hymns with endless variety of treatment," of music by Palestrina, Mozart, and Haydn, which he has heard at Reims. These appeared to be totally unknown elsewhere in my painful, but varied experience. Finally, let me emphasise my object in writing, which is to dispel any notion that in the ordinary run of provincial Cathedrals in France anything worthy of the name of music is to be heard.—Yours faithfully,

JOHN MASON.

Windermere, September 10, 1893.

TO THE EDITOR OF "THE MUSICAL TIMES."

SIR,—I have just seen the letter of "H. A. W." in your issue for August, in which he expresses his doubts whether the plain-chant of Rouen, with its accompaniments, is in print. As far as the Mass is concerned, there was published by Fleury, of Rouen, in 1868, a set of "Messes pour les fêtes solennelles," which consists of the plain-chant in modern notation with organ accompaniment. The Masses are variously arranged for three or four voices, with the plain-chant in soprano or tenor. A note states that they were harmonised in 1847 by M. Ch. Vervoitte, the Chapelmaster of the Cathedral. Fleury also publishes the "Paroissien Romain, noté," of which the most recent edition is that of 1890. His address at Rouen is 23, Place de l'Hôtel-de-Ville. While I am writing on the subject I may say that a comparison of the plain-chant books of various dioceses in France reveals considerable lack of uniformity in the