The Classical Review

<http://journals.cambridge.org/CAR>

Additional services for *The Classical Review*:

Email alerts: [Click here](#)

Subscriptions: [Click here](#)

Commercial reprints: [Click here](#)

Terms of use : [Click here](#)

***Griechische Grammatik, Lautlehre, Stammbildungs und Flexionslehre, Syntax.* Dr Von Karl Brugmann. Vierte, vermehrte Auflage bearbeitet Dr. von Albert Thumb; mit einem Anhang über griechische Lexikographie Dr. von L. Cohn. München: Oskar Beck, 1913. Cm. 25 × 17. 1 vol. Pp. xx + 772. Un-bound, M. 14.50; bound, M. 16.50.**

R. T. Turner

The Classical Review / Volume 28 / Issue 02 / March 2014, pp 60 - 61
DOI: 10.1017/S0009840X00006788, Published online: 27 October 2009

Link to this article: http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract_S0009840X00006788

How to cite this article:

R. T. Turner (1914). The Classical Review, 28, pp 60-61 doi:10.1017/S0009840X00006788

Request Permissions : [Click here](#)

SHORT NOTICES

Untersuchungen über die Natur der griechischen Betonung. Von HUGO EHRLICH. Cm. 23 × 15. 1 vol. Pp. xi + 275. Berlin: Weidmannsche Buchhandlung, 1912. M. 8.

IN this book Dr. Ehrlich has upheld the theory that the Greek accent was predominantly musical, and that the stress accent remained completely in the background until the fourth century B.C. In his defence of this theory he relies chiefly on the argument that, because there are no effects of a stress accent traceable in the reduction of syllables, vowel lengths or consonant groups, the stress accent cannot have been predominant. As I attempted to point out in the case of the accent in classical Latin, this 'argumentum ex silentio' holds good. If, then, Dr. Ehrlich shows that there are no such effects traceable in Greek, he has succeeded in his object. To my mind he has succeeded; and at the same time he has enunciated several principles of considerable importance, and has collected under one head many apparently disconnected phenomena.

In this respect his first chapter is particularly interesting. Dr. Ehrlich has extended the 'Loi rythmique' of Saussure, according to which in Primitive Greek three short syllables could never stand together. He restates it thus: 'Eine Folge von drei kurzen, durch einfache Konsonanz getrennten Vokalen wird beseitigt durch Unterdrückung des Mittleren, wenn dieser im Wortauslaut steht. Dagegen bleibt die Kürze erhalten, wenn sie durch nachfolgende Konsonantengruppe beschwert wird, oder wenn lange Silbe folgt.' From this is explained the existence of the syncopated side by side with the full forms of the prepositions, both as prepositions proper and in verbal and nominal composition; of many dialectal forms; of several stereotyped prepositional and nominal compounds, and case forms like ἐγκάς from *ἐγκασι, *ἐγκησι.

Chapter IV. on the 'Lautgesetze des

expiratorischen Akzents im Griechischen,' in which the views put forward by Fick, Sommers, and others as to particular phonetic changes held to be due to a stress accent are combatted, is perhaps not so convincing as the others. The arguments both for and against rely too often on doubtful etymologies. But, as Meillet says, 'pour une étymologie sûre, les dictionnaires en offrent plus de dix qui sont douteuses, et dont en appliquant une méthode rigoureuse on ne saurait faire la preuve.' A discussion of the physiology of the phonetic principles governing these changes would have been valuable. Similarly, when in the last chapter the metrical value of the groups mute+liquid is discussed, a comparison of the Latin and Sanskrit usages might have thrown further light on the question.

But taken as a whole the book is a powerful defence of the existence of a musical accent in Greek; and Thumb is right in regretting that the 'Laut- und Formen-lehre' of the fourth edition of Brugmann's *Griechische Grammatik* was already printed when Dr. Ehrlich's book was published.

R. L. TURNER.

Griechische Grammatik, Lautlehre, Stammbildungs- und Flexionslehre, Syntax. Von Dr. KARL BRUGMANN. Vierte, vermehrte Auflage bearbeitet von Dr. ALBERT THUMB; mit einem Anhang über griechische Lexikographie von Dr. L. COHN. München: Oskar Beck, 1913. Cm. 25 × 17. 1 vol. Pp. xx + 772. Unbound, M. 14.50; bound, M. 16.50.

ALL students of Greek and Comparative Philology will welcome the fourth edition of Brugmann's monumental work. The author, wishing to hold himself free for the completion of the second edition of his *Vergleichende Grammatik*, left the work of preparing this present edition in the hands of Dr. Thumb. Though the main body of the work has been left untouched,

some hundred pages in all have been added. The greatest addition has been made in the department of syntax (52 pages). All references to current literature have been brought up to date (October, 1912); and a distinctive note has been given to the whole—as we might expect from Dr. Thumb's knowledge of the Greek dialects and of Modern Greek—by the emphasis laid upon the continual growth of the language during the Greek period itself, and particularly on the development of classical Greek into the *κοινή*. Further (§ 677 ff.) Dr. Thumb has made some very interesting suggestions—they can scarcely be called more, as he himself admits—concerning a new line of investigation, namely, the question of the musical formation of the Greek sentence.

The appendix on Greek lexicography has been considerably enlarged; but, though it is pleasing to find that the names of Liddell and Scott have at last been given a place among Greek lexicographers, we might expect to see something more than the brief notice, 'In England ist stark verbreitet das Greek-English Lexicon von H. G. Liddell und R. Scott.' The discussion of the requisites for a Greek Dictionary is good.

As with the previous editions, this is provided with a full table of contents and excellent indexes; so that it can be consulted at once without annoying delay. As has long been recognised, Brugmann's *Griechische Grammatik* is indispensable to the Hellenist; and Dr. Thumb has maintained its reputation.

R. L. TURNER.

The Syrian Goddess, being a translation of Lucian's *De Dea Syria*, with a life of Lucian, by Professor HERBERT A. STRONG, M.A., LL.D., edited with notes and an introduction by JOHN GARSTANG, M.A., D.Sc. Pp. ix + 111, with frontispiece phototype, and 8 figs. in text. Constable & Co., 10, Orange Street, Leicester Square, 1913.

WE welcome Professor Strong's translation of Lucian's *De Syria Dea*, but our welcome would have been twice as

warm had he seen his way to printing the text side by side with the translation. The object of translation is to lead to, not away from, originals. It is, indeed, a little difficult to realise to what class of readers a translation of this particular treatise by Lucian will appeal. It is purely scientific and the Greek is easy. But a good translation with the text on the opposite leaf is a time-saver that no scholar need scruple to use.

Professor Strong's name is adequate guarantee of the general accuracy of his renderings and his English reads pleasantly without smacking of the construe. But we would plead for a little more caution in the translation of ritual words. We find, for example, *ὄργια* rendered 'secret rites.' The rendering is of course canonical, but secrecy is no essential characteristic of *ὄργια*; of *μυστήρια* it is, and the distinction should be observed. *καὶ τὰ πένθεα καὶ τὰ ὄργια* Professor Strong renders 'the public mourning and the secret rites.' This is not the true antithesis: *πένθεα* are rites of mourning for the dead year or spirit of vegetation; *ὄργια* (whatever derivation we accept) are rites, whether secret or public, of resurrection, of bringing in the new life or new year. Hence their *orgiastic* character. This is further emphasised by the verb that characteristically accompanies *ὄργια*, *ὄργια ἐπιτελέουσι*—they bring to accomplishment or maturity rites of renewal—you do not *ἐπιτελεῖν πένθεα*.

Again in the same section (6) *καταγίζουσι* is rendered 'sacrifice.' This, if *sacrifice* is taken in its primitive etymological sense 'to make sacred or accursed' is correct. But the word 'sacrifice' has to the modern ear more of the colour and flavour of burnt-offering than of scape-goat. *καταγίζουσι* means 'to make over (to the dead) as taboo.' It is again the same antithesis of old and new, of death and life.

Dr. Garstang has added greatly to the value of the book by his introduction on the worship of the Mother-Goddess. It is the worship of this dominant goddess with her young male consort Attis or Adonis or the Kouros, that is the characteristic of the old Anatolian Cretan Hittite religion. It stands always in strong contrast to the worship of father