

Musical Times Publications Ltd.

Mozart, Handel, and Johann Adam Hiller

Author(s): J. S. Shedlock

Source: *The Musical Times*, Vol. 59, No. 906 (Aug. 1, 1918), pp. 370-371

Published by: Musical Times Publications Ltd.

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/908906>

Accessed: 25-10-2015 18:22 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Musical Times Publications Ltd. is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Musical Times*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

every degree of pitch and quality of vowel, so that these respond sympathetically like the tube to the tuning-fork.

Trained in this way each fundamental note produced in the larynx passes through a tube of exactly the right shape, which resounds harmoniously, and automatically enriches and beautifies the tone without effort or exertion on the part of the singer.

THE PROBLEM OF VOCAL RESONANCE.

The next question is, how best can we train the vocal organs so that they can respond instantaneously to the will and adapt themselves most favourably to the production of beautiful sounds? The exercises I suggested when speaking on the necessity for training the medium region of the voice, are the best to begin with. They include the exercises for general flexibility, and sustained notes on varying vowels used equally at every degree of pitch throughout the medium voice. Every quality which we think of as a vowel sound, is really the result of a certain shaping of the resonators. Each shade means that particular overtones are reinforced more than others. It is all a matter of modification. Flexibility of lips, tongue, soft palate, and throat are indispensable. Most exercises of diction also are helpful and improve resonance. The study of foreign languages ought to be encouraged. The different vowels, consonants and inflexions, with are met with in every language with which we are familiar or unfamiliar, are simply the results of modifications in the shapes of the resonators and articulating organs, and their study therefore induces greater flexibility and command of variety of tone.

The study of resonance then seems to resolve itself into a series of patient experiments. The student tries one quality after another until a satisfactory result is achieved. When the tone is good the attention should be directed to it. It should be repeated and fixed in the memory and practised until it becomes automatic. Some students learn readily from imitation, but every one should be trained to listen to her own voice and judge what is good and appropriate. This takes time and should never be hurried. Different vowels practised gently all over the medium of the voice will make the resonators flexible and amenable to the will. The soft palate is best exercised by breathing alternately through the nose and expelling the air through the mouth and vice versa.

TASTE IN TONE-QUALITY.

It is well to remember that the taste of the teacher has very great influence on the quality of the tone produced by her pupils. It is not so much that certain methods lead to certain results as that particular qualities are selected and encouraged. Hence some teachers' pupils are noted for brilliance of tone, some for sweetness, some fulness. It depends a great deal on the individual taste of the instructor, and not so entirely on methods, as people are apt to think. Personally, I have known some teachers who positively gloried in producing tone which appeared to me to be ugly and objectionable; but we all know it is useless to dispute about taste. We can never satisfy everyone, so the wisest thing is to try and give pleasure to as many as possible.

PHYSICAL OBSTRUCTIONS.

I should like to refer briefly to the difficulties which arise from physical obstructions—such as adenoids, enlarged tonsils, and kindred ailments. Good resonance is impossible if the cavities are clogged up. Colds of all kinds are fatal to brilliant tone; they interfere with the passage of the vibrations to the cavities behind the nose, &c., as well as by making the movable parts heavy and difficult to adjust. Health is always of prime importance, and fine tone is not likely to be produced unless all the passages are clear and free. Deep breathing and nasal breathing are of the greatest value, and once again we return to the importance of proper methods of breathing.

THE NATURAL PHYSICAL EFFECTS OF THE EMOTIONS.

There is still one more aspect of the subject of resonance which I think should be thoughtfully studied, and which I consider of great importance. It is the effect of the emotions on the physical condition of the individual. I have no doubt myself that every real emotion modifies more or less the shape and condition of the mouth and throat, and the effects are immediately apparent in the quality of tone produced.

Great artists are those persons who have the widest range of sympathies and the greatest capacity for reproducing

voluntarily the physical condition which results from the actual experience of the emotions they are endeavouring to express. We can, by careful study and thought, analyse the effects of emotion or states of mind on the vocal organs, and little by little build up the power of reproducing them.

INTUITION THE HIGHEST GIFT OF A SINGER.

Some highly-gifted artists are undoubtedly endowed with intuitive perception, and to such the more laborious analytical and synthetical methods are happily unnecessary. Intuition is to me the highest of all gifts, and is from the spirit and beyond our understanding. No amount of work or study will ever achieve what one flash of intuition can accomplish, but if we strive patiently and sincerely to develop our gifts and train our understanding, we can at any rate go a long way forward; and it seems to me that sometimes the earnest seekers after knowledge and truth are rewarded by occasional uprushes of intuition and inspiration, which might have seemed impossible before they entered on the thorny path of effort and breasted the steep and rugged hill which leads to perfection.

NOTE.—Since writing the above, Mr. Daniel Jones, M.A., Lecturer on Phonetics, London University, has called my attention to an experiment he has recently made, by which some of the harmonics of the mouth can be isolated and reinforced. It is this: Sing a note on the consonant 'ng,' and while sustaining it move the lips about. The 5th, 8th, 10th, and even 12th can be plainly heard in turn according to the varying shapes given to the mouth. This experiment is particularly interesting to the student of singing.

MOZART, HANDEL, AND JOHANN ADAM HILLER.

BY J. S. SHEDLOCK.

The following article is about an old work, an old church, and a conductor and a composer of the 18th century. The work in question is 'The Messiah,' an admission which will no doubt decide some readers not to proceed any further. Yet the story is unfamiliar, and, I venture to think, not lacking in interest.

The name of Johann Adam Hiller is remembered as the composer of *Singspiele* (*i.e.*, short plays with incidental songs, &c.), which entitle him to be regarded as a forerunner of Weber. His music, however, is a thing of the past. Hiller, born in Prussia in 1728, showed early taste for music, so that while at the Kreuzschule, Dresden, he studied under G. A. Homilius, who had himself been trained by J. S. Bach. In 1751 Hiller attended the lectures at Leipsic University, and while in that city he became conductor of a musical society, the germ from which sprang the celebrated Gewandhaus Concerts. Thus he was a well-trained musician, also a man of a certain culture—not, however, the German *Kultur* of the present day.

Although much occupied with stage-music, Hiller also devoted time and attention to sacred music. Among various works, he arranged several oratorios of Handel. He touched them up so as to bring them more in harmony with the changes which had taken place in the composition of the orchestra since the death of the composer. Of a performance of 'The Messiah' in the Cathedral at Berlin, Hiller published an account, entitled, 'Nachricht von der Aufführung des Händel'schen Messias in der Domkirche zu Berlin den 19. Mai, 1786.' In it he remarks that 'by judicious use of wind instruments Handel's compositions may be improved,' and with that opinion reasonable musicians would agree; though few, if any, would regard much that Hiller added—also much that he altered—as judicious.

Something, indeed, *must* be added, for at times the accompaniments in that oratorio are little more than sketches. Again, the dry thorough-bass figures over the continuo (the line for the basses) are poor substitutes for the rich harmonies and figuration which they no doubt suggested to Handel when at the harpsichord during a performance.*

* The oratorio, by the way, was given at Mannheim nine years before the Berlin performance. A notice in the Mannheim *Tonschule* stated that only the first part was given because not a single person cared to endure any more of the dry music. Probably no attempt was made to supply what was missing. Mozart attended the rehearsal, but did not go to the performance. At that time he had no idea that he would one day be engaged in writing what are usually called 'additional accompaniments' for that very work.

All details in this notice refer not to the Berlin performance given in Italian, but to a special score which Hiller is said to have prepared for Leipsic, such a one as, he believed, 'Handel would have made had he lived in our days,' *i.e.*, in the last quarter of the 18th century. At one of these Leipsic performances, in 1787, a native of Breslau expressed the hope that Hiller would pay a visit to that city. The latter, delighted at his success, went there and conducted the oratorio in the old Maria Magdalena Church on May 30, 1788. The choir numbered 259 singers, and the orchestra consisted of 52 violins, 11 violas, 12 cellos, and 12 double-basses, 10 bassoons, 11 oboes, 8 flutes, 8 horns, 4 clarinets, 4 trombones, 7 trumpets, kettledrum, clavicembalo, and organo maj.

In the church was left a score of Hiller's 'Messiah' which bore the name of Schlecthaupt as possessor. He was cantor at the church when Hiller came to Breslau. The score was evidently regarded as the one used by him, and one writer, Schäffer (see below), even refers to it as autograph. There was also an exact copy of Hiller's score, for the most part in Schlecthaupt's handwriting.

Now there were three distinguished musicians who compared the Hiller and Mozart scores, and found that there was a curious connection between them. Their names are C. F. Baumgart, former head-master of the Mathiasgymnasium at Breslau; Julius Schäffer, successor of Carl Reinecke, conductor of the Singakademie in the same city; and Hermann Schönfeld, music-director and cantor of the Breslau church in question. And all wrote the results of their examinations as follows:

Baumgart.—'Ein Falsum in Mozarts Messias Partitur' (a fraud in Mozart's score of 'Messiah'), which appeared in the *Niederrheinische Musik Zeitung* in 1862;

Schäffer.—'Fälschungen in die Bearbeitungen des Händel'schen Messias durch Johann Adam Hiller' (Falsifications in Mozart's arrangements of Handel's 'Messiah,' by John Adam Hiller), for the *Musikalisches Wochenblatt*, 1881; and

Schönfeld.—'Mitteilungen über Bearbeitung des Händel'schen Messias durch Johann Adam Hiller' (communications respecting the arrangement of Handel's 'Messiah' by John Adam Hiller), for the *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik*, 1903.

Ex. 1.

Handel's score: Sure-ly, sure-ly He hath borne our griefs and car-ried our sor-rows, sure-ly, sure-ly He hath

Hiller's score: † Fürwahr, fürwahr Er trug un-sre Krankheit ünd litt un-sre schmerzen, fürwahr, fürwahr Er

In the above the lower staff gives Hiller's Breslau version, and the very same is in the published Mozart score. Unless one can believe that Hiller and Mozart independently made exactly the same change, the passage must have been put into Mozart's score by, or with the consent of, Hiller.

Schäffer, indeed, goes so far as to say that for anything in the Mozart score which is not in good taste Hiller is pretty sure to have been responsible. Very likely the addition of wind (flauto piccolo, fl. corni, fag., clar., and oboi) in the opening and closing sections of the 'Pastoral Symphony' is

Ex. 2.

Handel's score: [Musical notation]

Hiller's score: [Musical notation]

Though Hiller's score will never be revived, it is worth preserving. Some day an opportunity may occur enabling us to discover further cases of tampering. None of the writers named professes to have made an exhaustive list. The unexpected often happens, and even Mozart's autograph and papers may be brought to light.

The late Prof. Prout, in the Preface to the full score of Handel's 'Messiah,' edited by him, refers, though only

Baumgart perceived that the soprano air 'If God be for us, who can be against us?' was (with exception of three notes to which reference will be made) exactly the same in both scores (Hiller and Mozart). Who then had prior claim? So far as time is concerned Mozart might have been the borrower, though a very unlikely thing for him; moreover difficult, seeing that the Hiller score was never published. Internal evidence however points to Hiller. To Handel's score is added a part for bassoon, and in a book of the words seen by Baumgart, against the solo in question was a note to the effect that 'it is very attractive owing to its beautiful expressive melody'; also that 'the bassoon part, largely taken from the violin part, together with other strengthenings, renders the solo more in keeping with the taste of the day.'

The object of changing three notes was evidently to turn harsh-sounding fourths into sixths. The simple alteration may have been made by editor, proof-reader, or, as will be seen, possibly by Hiller himself.

That Hiller added the bassoon part is, then, beyond question. But how, it may be asked, did the air with that addition find its way into Mozart's 'Messiah' score? A letter from Baron Swieten to Mozart, quoted by Otto Jahn in his Biography of the composer, will throw a little light on the matter. It is dated March 22, 1789, and begins thus: 'Your idea of turning the cold Aria into a Recitative is excellent, and being uncertain as to whether you have really kept the words, I send you a copy of them,' and he ends by saying he hopes soon to receive the Recitative. As the suggestion came from Mozart, one may I think take for granted that he carried out his idea. He died in 1791, and the score was not published by Breitkopf & Härtel until 1803.*

If the editor, E. F. Richter (whose name, by the way, is not given in that score), found it, he may have wondered why Handel's setting of the words was discarded. But during the year 1802, when the Mozart 'Messiah' score was passing through the press, Hiller was living in Leipsic, and was well-known to the B. & H. firm. He may therefore have suggested putting in the version of the air as he had arranged it for Breslau, or he may have been asked to revise the whole score. This may seem to be an unwarrantable assumption, yet, as we shall see, there is some ground for it. Schäffer offers a striking instance of Hiller's tampering with Mozart's score:

a case in point. Another is the putting four common chords in the place of Handel's rests in 'He was despised.'

Schönfeld describes many liberties taken with Handel's text. In the chorus 'Glory to God' the concluding Symphony begins *mf*, then gradually gets softer, the last three bars being marked *pp*; moreover the last two notes rise to C and D in alt. These delicate bars evidently typified the gradual disappearance of the ascending heavenly host. Hiller, however, concludes with two loud chords.

One more specimen is given. The bars are the fifth and fourth from the end of the chorus 'His yoke is easy':

briefly, to the articles of Baumgart and Schäffer. He, however, said enough to show that he considered their arguments convincing.

* Schäffer wrote to the publishers advising them to bring out a new edition giving details of any papers or music which Mozart left, and which were placed at their disposal. No reply was received.

† German words important, because the first one, Fürwahr, taken from Luther's Bible, shows why he did not follow Handel's beginning on down beat; also shows reason for other changes.