

History of Education Society response to consultation on Plan S:

The History of Education Society (HES) was founded in 1967. It is a registered charity and its mission and aims are as follows:

- to promote the study and teaching of the history of education;
- to encourage and support research in the history of education;
- to represent the interests of the field of the history of education;
- to promote the public profile and an informed public understanding of the history of education by engaging in relevant public debates;
- to encourage and support new researchers in the history of education;
- to provide collaboration and exchange among those interested in the history of education in Britain and around the world;
- to promote links with the study and teaching of history at all levels;
- to promote the preservation of and facilitate access to primary sources in the history of education and features of our educational heritage.

As of December 2019, the Society had 144 members of whom nearly a third are student or not fully waged and a third resident overseas. Members include academics and university-affiliated researchers working in history and education departments at all stages of their academic careers and also independent researchers who are retired, or based in different sectors (for example, schools, archives, museums) who have no such affiliation. The Society's aims extend well beyond history of education activity among university-affiliated historians and encompass wider public engagement. The Society has strong links with other history of education societies internationally and the publications encourage submissions with an international or transnational focus. This diversity is reflected in the two Society publications that include mentoring for Early Career Researchers (ECRs) (in *The Researcher*) and, significantly, reflect wide international engagement with the sub disciplinary field (*History of Education*).

History of Education has 6 issues a year, is published with Taylor & Francis, and is a 'hybrid' journal under Plan-S definition. The *History of Education Researcher* is self-published with 2 issues a year. The journals are both owned by the History of Education Society. As with many learned societies' journals (and humanities and social sciences publications more generally), a minority of our articles list a funding body, and a still smaller minority are funded by Plan-S signatories. In the last two years these have included the following which are an indicative

President: Professor Stephanie Spencer, Faculty Education, Health and Social Care,
University of Winchester, SO22 4NR. Tel: 01962827125
Email: Stephanie.Spencer@winchester.ac.uk.

Registered Charity 1055764

rather than an exhaustive list: British Academy, AHRC, Irish Research Council, Fonds National de la Recherche Luxembourg.

The HES also coordinates events and supports scholarly activity relating to the history of education through financial support: 1) financial support for running costs of conferences and meetings – notably the annual society conference, an annual postgraduate student/ECR day, and also through occasional small (£500) one-off grants for events, for example, several 50th anniversary grants were awarded in 2017-18; 2) bursaries to support conference attendance for student/ECR/unwaged or partially waged participants, with multiple bursaries for the annual conference, and a single bursary to the International Standing Conference for the History of Education annual conference; 3) financial input each year to support the European Educational Research Association's History of Education Doctoral Summer School; 4) supporting research aids (for example the history of education-specific publication database *Exe Libris*) and a recently-initiated Review of Periodical Literature in the history of education through project and Fellowship funding; 5) collaborative fellowships to support archive mining and digitisation, for example with other bodies such as the Headmasters' and Headmistresses' Conference; 6) book prizes.

History of Education royalties are the main source of the Society's income. The Society's charitable status, in legal terms, requires any income to be reinvested in activities contributing to the public good, in line with its aims and mission. Planning for the forms of expenditure described above is undertaken with these aims and charitable status in mind.

Key issues for the History of Education Society and *History of Education* journal

Generally, we support the intentions of Plan S of making publicly-funded research as widely accessible as possible and in line with the aims and mission of the Society and the aims and scope of the journal. We have some concerns, however, about Plan S in its current form. We note that our concerns as outlined below are very much in keeping with those spelled out in more detail in relation to learned societies and their periodical publications by the *Royal Historical Society*. They are shared by many other learned societies in humanities and social sciences, and these societies' publications:

1) Implications for the History of Education as a sub discipline, and the History of Education Society:

If Plan S-funded research can no longer be published in the journal, this could potentially place unwelcome restrictions on the wide-ranging, international, and open scholarly dialogue which the journal stimulates at present. Potentially it would mean that Plan S-funded research on the history of education could not be published in *History of Education* or any other history of education journal and possibly in very few historical journals at all. The possible long-term outcome of dividing Plan S from non-Plan S research in terms of publication venues, could have complex and potentially divisive effects on the sub-discipline of history of education.

President: Professor Stephanie Spencer, Faculty Education, Health and Social Care,
University of Winchester, SO22 4NR. Tel: 01962827125
Email: Stephanie.Spencer@winchester.ac.uk.

Registered Charity 1055764

Financial implications could arise both from i) a potential downfall in royalties from the journal if hybrid status is lost, which would limit funds available to support varied charitable status-related activities; ii) any requirements to fund author publishing charges (APCs) – at present proposals on this require further clarification. In both cases, the wide-ranging activities which HES supports could potentially be severely curtailed, which we fear would harm the Society's ability to build capacity in the field. It could seriously undermine the work that the History of Education Society does in building the field and encouraging early career researchers. As a small registered charity, with aims noted above, there would be a conflict of interest were the Society to divert funds, currently spent in supporting a wide range of ECR researchers, summer schools, conferences and in sponsoring activities that promote the Research Excellence Framework impact agenda to ensure interaction with the public, towards supporting a very small number of individual APC charges.

2) Implications for *History of Education* journal:

Plan S-funded research, under current proposals, may not be published in hybrid journals such as ours from 2020 unless it is published under CC-BY licence in an open-access repository. Our understanding of the proposals at present is that if the journal is to remain a hybrid one, this would require (1) no embargo on publication (embargo period is currently 18 months) and (2) publication under CC-BY licence in an open-access repository, for Plan-S funded research. We also read the proposals as indicating that non-university-based researchers, and non-Plan S funded researchers, need not pay an APC or have gold open-access or put an article in a repository, or have a CC-BY licence, but the current proposals could be clearer on these points.

We envisage some issues with this. (i) Defining Plan S-funded research: for example, will definitions apply historically? What about research funded not through competitive grants from Plan S signatories but through Research Excellence Framework exercises and the University and departmental-level funding in the UK (and parallel exercises elsewhere) that come through these? (ii) Remaining hybrid appears to depend on the publisher's agreement to reduce its embargo period. The journal's publisher's position on this is not at present defined, but the financial implications for the publisher of such a change might render it difficult if not impossible. (iii) Open-access repositories are available in most UK higher education institutions, but might not be for researchers in all countries, or those without university affiliation. (iv) The CC-BY licence is problematic for much of the material we publish, which contains third-party content (currently the journal publishes open access with a CC-BY ND licence).

The worst-case scenario we can envisage here is that if the journal cannot retain its hybrid status under Plan S proposals, then Plan S-funded research can no longer be published in the journal. This could prove challenging for a journal like ours. Between 2013 and 2018 we received submissions from 62 countries, the majority of which have not signed up to Plan S, and a large majority of our submissions are not funded by Plan S signatories. However, we

President: Professor Stephanie Spencer, Faculty Education, Health and Social Care,
University of Winchester, SO22 4NR. Tel: 01962827125
Email: Stephanie.Spencer@winchester.ac.uk.

Registered Charity 1055764

do also publish Plan S-funded research, even if only a minority of articles. The range and variety of research currently seen in the journal might potentially be restricted, and, as noted above, defining publications as Plan S or non-Plan S could potentially divide the field and create obstacles to collaborative academic working. Currently the journal has a very steady flow of submissions for its six issues, but the consequences of potentially not retaining hybrid status might be to limit this, with a potential impact on financial viability for the publisher and on royalties available to HES to pursue its range of charitable aims.

Taylor and Francis, at present, has not indicated its position on whether they plan to consider the alternative options of moving to full Open Access or a 'transformative agreement'. We noted that either would have major financial implications for the journal, which might either render them impracticable or raise the question of how publishing charges for articles will be met. We note that the journal's current gold open access author publishing charge of £1995 is very far beyond what the HES could meet through its royalties even if no other activities are funded, and also well beyond the institutional funding available to university-based academics for research-related costs.

3) Implications for *History of Education Researcher*

It is not clear what the implications of Plan S might be for the *History of Education Researcher* (ISSN 1740-2433). The *Researcher* is an important part of the Society's work. It publishes short peer refereed articles based on original research in a range of national contexts, alongside short reports on funded projects and conferences, ensuring that the history of education community is informed about current and recent developments. It provides an important conduit between academic research and other audiences and offers particular opportunities for unaffiliated researchers, ECRs and postgraduate students to publish their work. It is distributed to members of the Society; there are also a number of institutional subscriptions. As it is one of the main benefits of Society membership, the *Researcher* provides a secure stream of income to the Society, albeit a smaller amount than comes from *History of Education*. The strength of *The Researcher* is its availability for the entire range of those interested in the history of education to present their research. Current plans may compromise the willingness of those working on funded projects to share the early stages of their research with their peers in this publication.

History of Education Society, January 2019

President: Professor Stephanie Spencer

And on behalf of *History of Education Journal* editors Dr Mark Freeman, Dr Tom Woodin, and Dr Susannah Wright

President: Professor Stephanie Spencer, Faculty Education, Health and Social Care,
University of Winchester, SO22 4NR. Tel: 01962827125
Email: Stephanie.Spencer@winchester.ac.uk.

Registered Charity 1055764