



---

Makran

Author(s): T. H. Holdich

Source: *The Geographical Journal*, Vol. 8, No. 4 (Oct., 1896), pp. 408-410

Published by: [The Royal Geographical Society \(with the Institute of British Geographers\)](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/1774062>

Accessed: 18/01/2015 20:48

---

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



*The Royal Geographical Society (with the Institute of British Geographers)* is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Geographical Journal*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

maps showing the distribution of surface temperature in the North Pacific for different months are of great value, and especially the map which shows the distribution of temperatures at a depth of 400 metres, on which map one sees the very high deep-sea temperature of 16° C. in the east of Japan, and the low temperature of 4.5° located no more than 400 miles to the north-east of the above maximum region. The Prjevalsky premium was awarded to M. Bere-zovsky for his journeys in the borderlands of Tibet, and two Prjevalsky medals to J. A. Schmidt for the extensive geodetical work he has done during twelve different expeditions to Central Asia and Siberia, and to Dr. H. A. Fritsche for his many years' magnetical, geodetical, and hypsometrical measurements in China, Mongolia, Siberia, and Russia. Small gold medals were awarded to Dr. F. F. Müller for magnetical measurements in East Siberia, and to A. A. Lebedintseff for his researches into the chemical composition of water in the Black, Azov, and Marmora seas. Eighteen silver medals were awarded for various valuable communications to the Society, or for work done in connection with different expeditions; and four bronze medals for meteorological observations and various services rendered to the Society's expeditions.

**New Geographical Society.**—A new sub-branch of the Amur branch of the Russian Geographical Society has been opened this year at Vladivostok, under the name of "Society for the Study of the Amur Region." It is organized on the same principles as the Siberian, Caucasian, and other branches of the Russian Geographical Society.

---

## CORRESPONDENCE.

### *Makran.*

Simla, June 30.

MAY I be permitted to offer a few remarks in reply to the criticisms on my Makran paper, which have appeared in the May and June numbers of the *Geographical Journal*.

I am exceedingly obliged to those gentlemen who are kind enough to offer new lights and suggestions on my crude contributions. I am beyond the reach of good libraries, and should not have much leisure to read even if I had the opportunity. This, however, I do not regard as a good reason for reserving such information as I may pick up from time to time until I have opportunity for digesting it thoroughly, for it too frequently happens that such opportunity never comes at all. I must thank Mr. Curzon for giving me new authorities on the subject of Makran, which I hope hereafter to be able to consult. Meanwhile, I must demur to his argument that the name Makran is of Dravidian origin because it existed during the Dravidian occupation of the country. The Dravidians themselves were but immigrants, and it is unlikely that they brought the name with them. If I still incline to an "appropriate" derivation, it is because this somewhat unimportant question is never likely to reach an authoritative solution.

General Haig's criticisms require a much longer letter than you would care to find space for, so he must pardon me if I am brief. The name Panj Gur is locally derived from the "five tombs" of certain chiefs who fell in a local fight within recent history. The tombs are pointed out, and there is, I think, no doubt about the derivation of that particular name.

Having recently had business relations with the governor of Bampur in demarcating the Perso-Baluch frontier, I can assure General Haig that the "Fahraj"

east of Bampur is in the Karman district, and that the country around Bampur is not locally recognized as Makran.

When General Haig says that my identification of "the Fahraj, said to have been near Tubaran, with the Bampur Fahraj, is out of the question," the mistake is General Haig's own. If he reads the text of my paper carefully, he will see that I identify St. John's Fahraj, in Narmashir, as the Fahraj of Idrisi, which was near Tubaran. This appears to me to fall in well enough with Idrisi's geography; and I think it is perhaps a little dangerous to assume that that author was referring to another district and had mixed up his descriptions, until we are quite certain that existing facts do not tally with his writings. About this part of Eastern Persia we shall hear more from Captain Sykes hereafter.

About Rasak I am open to conviction, my chief difficulty being to account for the extent of the Sarbaz ruins, and the absence of available space for a city of any magnitude at the place now called Rask, or Rasak.

As regards the identification of Fahal-fahra with "Tall Fahra," *i.e.* the "Mound of Fahra," which General Haig thinks may have been the modern Fahraj, I am quite disposed to accept the general's view. It is a new light to me, and certainly fits in better with the Arabic itineraries. Binth, I may add, is often called Band to this day.

When we come to the Sindh-Makran route, it is only fair to my identifications to say that they are based on actual surveys. There cannot be the slightest doubt that the main direct route from Debal to Makran is that which I have described, and there are the ruined sites of important places on the route almost precisely as Idrisi places them. Why should he again have been muddling his geography? I am quite aware that there are other routes north of this one, but this is the one which is now, and, I think, always must have been, the route chiefly followed between the Indus Delta and lower Makran. Idrisi's description of Manjabari will apply to no other place than Manja Pir.

On a recent march from the Persian frontier to Kalat and Quetta *viâ* Panjgur, I had little difficulty in identifying Labi (called by almost the same name still), and was astonished at the extent of Arab remains. The fort at Kej (or Kiz) still dominates the valley, some 3 miles from Kalatak, and the whole Panjgur route is crowded with the ruins of Arab irrigation works. For the first time I heard them ascribed to Arabs by a Baluch authority.

I must conclude by a reference to General Haig's last paragraph, in which he says the Kalmats are Baluch in origin and in no way connected with the famous sectaries known as Karmati. Such evidence as is available at present tends to show that the Kalmats are of Arab origin, though unconnected with the Rinds of Baluchistan, and that they migrated through Makran to the Indus Delta. Whether they are connected with the architectural remains usually ascribed to them is doubtful. As to the present existence of Karmatians in Sind there can be very little doubt.

Whilst I am about it, perhaps I may be allowed to say a word or two on another subject which has been rather incorrectly treated in the correspondence pages of your *Journal*. In laying down the Afghan boundary from the Hindu Kush, between Chitral and Kafiristan (which was done *pari passu* with the Chitral imbroglio), we found that the river flowing through Kafiristan from the west into the Chitral or Kumar river, and correctly called Arnawai by McNair and Woodthorpe, was also called "Bashgol" and "Lundai Sin." At the same time, a smaller and comparatively insignificant stream flowing from the east, and debouching into the Kunar just opposite the Bashgol, or Lundai Sin, was also called Arnawai. Since then I have discovered two other Arnawais, several Bashgols, and one other very

important Lundai Sin, which is also called the Swat river. This, perhaps, may fairly illustrate the difficulty of dealing with boundary definitions loosely dependent on local nomenclature, and the necessity for exact technical processes in laying out a demarcation programme.

T. H. HOLDICH.

## GEOGRAPHICAL LITERATURE OF THE MONTH.

### *Additions to the Library.*

By HUGH ROBERT MILL, D.Sc., *Librarian*, R.G.S.

THE following abbreviations of nouns and the adjectives derived from them are employed to indicate the source of articles from other publications. Geographical names are in each case written in full:—

A. = Academy, Academie, Akademie.	Mag. = Magazine.
Ann. = Annals, Annales, Annalen.	P. = Proceedings.
B. = Bulletin, Bollettino, Boletim.	R. = Royal.
Com. = Commerce, Commercial.	Rev. = Review, Revue, Revista.
C. Rd. = Comptes Rendus.	S. = Society, Société, Selskab.
Erdk. = Erdkunde.	Sitzb. = Sitzungsbericht.
G. = Geography, Geographie, Geografia.	T. = Transactions.
Ges. = Gesellschaft.	V. = Verein.
I. = Institute, Institution.	Verh. = Verhandlungen.
J. = Journal.	W. = Wissenschaft, and compounds.
M. = Mitteilungen.	Z. = Zeitschrift.

On account of the ambiguity of the words *octavo*, *quarto*, etc., the size of books in the list below is denoted by the length and breadth of the cover in inches to the nearest half-inch. The size of the *Journal* is 10 × 6½.

### EUROPE.

- Alps—Glaciers.** Forel and Du Pasquier.  
*Jahrb. Schweizer Alpenclub* 31 (1895-96) (1896): 249-266.  
 Les variations périodiques des glaciers des Alpes. Par Prof. Dr. F.-A. Forel et Prof. Dr. L. du Pasquier.
- Austria—Bosnia-Herzegovina.** *Spelunca B.S. Spéléologie* 2 (1896): 27-32. Kraus.  
 Les eaux souterraines et les travaux hydrologiques officiels de la Bosnie-Herzégovine. Par M. F. Kraus, à Vienne.
- Austria—Carpathians.** *M.G. Ges. Wien* 39 (1896): 251-299. Romer.  
 Prof. Dr. Anton Rehmman's (Lemberg) neues Karpathenwerk. Von Dr. Eugen v. Romer. *With Map.*
- Austria—Moravia.** *Deutsche Rundschau G.* 18 (1896): 450-459. Trampler.  
 Die Ochoser Höhle in Mähren. Von R. Trampler. *With Maps and Illustrations.*
- Eastern Europe.** Joanne.  
 Collection des Guides-Joanne. États du Danube et des Balkans. Première Partie. Hongrie Méridionale—Transylvanie—Adriatique—Dalmatie—Monténégro—Bosnie et Herzégovine. Renseignements pratiques mis au courant en 1895 (pp. lii. and 280); Deuxième partie, Tome 1<sup>re</sup>. Haute-Hongrie: Suisse Hongroise et Région des Tatras.—Bukovine.—Roumanie. Tome II. Serbie.—Bulgarie et Roumélie Orientale. Paris: Hachette et Cie., 1893. Size 7½ × 4½, pp. i. and 472. *Maps and Plans.*
- Europe—Rivers.** *National G. Mag.* 7 (1896): 228-238. Davis.  
 The Seine, the Meuse, and the Moselle. II. By William M. Davis. *With Map.*
- France—Artois.** *Globus* 69 (1896): 329-332. Seelmann.  
 Das Deutschtum in Artois. Von Dr. Emil Seelmann. Bonn.