

Review

Source: *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*, Vol. 15, No. 344 (Oct. 1, 1871), p. 238

Published by: [Musical Times Publications Ltd.](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3355185>

Accessed: 29-11-2015 13:43 UTC

---

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



*Musical Times Publications Ltd.* is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

Marsh. A solo by Mr. Elliott, called "Wrecked and Saved," was much applauded. Mr. George Wells conducted, and Mr. T. M. Clark was the accompanist.

### Reviews.

NOVELLO, EWER AND CO.

*Cathedral Services* by George M. Garrett, Mus. Doc. *Cantate Domino* and *Deus Misereatur*, in E flat (No. 7).

NOTWITHSTANDING the fact that all Churchmen rejoice specially in the use of the essentially Christian Hymns, the "Magnificat" and "Nunc Dimittis," yet the "Cantate Domino" and "Deus Misereatur," common to Jews as well as Christians, are none the less edifying as songs of praise, and are doubly welcome as forming a striking contrast to the Evangelical Hymns. Nothing can be more difficult to set to music than the "Cantate Domino" split up as it is into a vast number of short and partially disconnected sentences, on each of which the composer would fain expend his time and elaborate his themes, but which he is compelled to pass rapidly over, in order to avoid extending his work beyond the time ordinarily allotted to the Canticles. On the one hand there is the danger of making no variety at all; on the other, the danger of presenting to the hearer a long string of ill-matched, detached subjects, none of which are worked as they deserve. Dr. Garrett seems to have wisely steered a middle course; there is plenty of variety in his phrases, and they reflect well the spirit of the words, yet he has succeeded in keeping up an unity of style and leaving the impression, that it is the work of one mind, and not, as many, or most of our Cantates appear to be—a pasticcio. There is much novelty both of progression and modulation, which will be better liked on the second hearing than the first. The *Deus Misereatur* does not present to the composer the same difficulties as the *Cantate Domino*, so, as we might expect from such an experienced hand, the whole is smooth, graceful, and good. These services fully sustain the reputation which their predecessors in the keys of D and F have already made.

*Cathedral Services* by G. M. Garrett, Mus. Doc. *The Office of the Holy Communion* (No. 9).

THIS is a complete collection of the music required for this office; it contains a setting of "Glory be to Thee, O Lord," and "Thanks be to Thee, O Lord"; an offertory (Blessed is the man), and Sursum Corda, besides those parts ordinarily published. The "Kyrie Eleison" is melodious, and, as it ought to be (but seldom is), somewhat penitential in style. But in choosing for it the key of B flat minor, ending on the dominant (F major), Dr. Garrett has overlooked the probable pitch of many a chanter's voice. As it stands, he can only chant on F, for B flat as the reciting-note would be too high, as well as a most unpleasant sequence to a chord of F. The Creed is highly dramatic, and in it the powers of the organ are utilized with great skill. The offertory would be effective in its place, or out of its place as an independent anthem. The "Sanctus" is most impressive, and for excellence of æsthetical design, surpasses any portion of the service. The "Gloria in Excelsis," a hymn which must inspire musical thoughts to every musical thinker, has received ample justice from the author, in his own style. The whole Office will require a very careful performance, but will be found well worth it.

*A Morning and Evening Service.* Composed by S. P. Tuckerman.

A SETTING of the Canticles which exhibits novelty of treatment is still somewhat rare; and therefore when it is found, combined with other necessary advantages, it deserves commendation. Mr. Tuckerman's Service displays considerable talent. The composer has evidently set himself the task of honestly illustrating the words and varying phrases without reference to the style of any particular period. But in spite of himself the influence of the old English school of church writers occasionally

asserts itself, and the genuine cathedral commonplace breaks out more than once. Where, however, there is so much that is new and good, it would be unjust to dwell upon the few short-comings. The Service is likely to assist in carrying on the movement in favour of greater freedom in the style of church compositions, and if it did no more it would be welcome.

*Nine Hymns.* Set to music by C. Maxted.

A word of approval is due to the composer of these tunes, as much for the graceful melody he has given us as the genuine feeling he displays for harmony. The only fault that can be urged against the compositions is a certain degree of restlessness. With a little more sobriety and fewer passing notes, some of these tunes would be charming. We would counsel Mr. Maxted by all means to continue writing.

*If ye then be risen with Christ.* Full Anthem for four voices. Composed by John Naylor, Mus. Bac.

THERE is more freshness and vigour in the treatment of the subjects of this Anthem, than there is originality in the subjects themselves. As a whole it is certainly good, and would be very effective. One or two defects ought, however, to be pointed out; we live in an age when we are allowed even by contrapuntists, to accent our words properly; it is unfortunate therefore that Mr. Naylor gives the whole force of the down-beat to the *the* in the sentence, "At the right hand of God." Such an accent is at least two centuries out of date. The bass part lies rather too high in many places for such voices as are found in ordinary choirs. Second-rate basses might make a good shot to the high E flat (on page 3) from the F below, but should they fail, Mr. Naylor's music will suffer severely. This Anthem promises so well, that we hope soon to see more from the same pen.

*The Lord is my Shepherd.* Sacred Song, for Baritone or Contralto voice. Words from Psalm xxiii, verses 1, 2 and 4. Music by J. Miles Bennett.

A SMOOTHLY written and appropriately harmonised song, which we can unhesitatingly recommend to any baritone or contralto vocalist who can sing words with expression. Mr. Bennett has given a sacred character to his music in excellent sympathy with the words he has selected; and we cannot too much commend the musicianlike manner in which the whole of the accompaniments are written.

*Original Compositions* for the Organ, by Henry Smart. Nos. 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, and 13.

MR. SMART'S promise of a series of compositions for the organ is rapidly being fulfilled; and many who are waiting for further contributions will be delighted to find that the present numbers are just as elegant, melodious, and useful, as any of those that preceded them. Nos. 7, 8, and 9 contain six short and easy pieces—two in each number—short and easy 'tis true, but not to be despised on that account by those who consider themselves capable of attacking works long and difficult. The first of those in No. 7, is a sweet moreau of a capital length for general purposes, in the key of D, each of the two themes being introduced on a pedal-point. The second in No. 7 is a very model of beauty, simple enough for a child, and yet full of sweet suggestions to a practised musician. The smooth running passage added to the first theme on its re-appearance is exceedingly happy in its effect. Neither of these pieces adhere rigidly to a common form. The second theme of No. 1 occurs on both occasions in the dominant, and the second theme of No. 2 is (alas!) heard but once. These defections from habitual outline are however deserving of imitation by other writers. Of the two short pieces (Nos. 3 and 4 of the six) contained in No. 8, the first in A major is of that pastoral time ( $\frac{6}{8}$ ) and character, which is so well adapted to inspire a proper frame of mind to those present at the services of the Church. This is somewhat more elaborated than the two preceding "short pieces," being in Sonata-form in all its integrity. The re-entrance of the first theme (after the first inversion of the chord of B flat) is most ingenious