

The Year 1909 in Church History

The Presidential Address

By

Francis Albert Christie

THE YEAR 1909 IN CHURCH HISTORY.

BY FRANCIS ALBERT CHRISTIE, PROFESSOR CHURCH HISTORY,
MEADVILLE THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY,
MEADVILLE, PA.

(The Presidential Address, read December 30, 1909)

THE convent annalist in darker ages had slight sense of proportion and value in what he recorded. We, too, even in days of journalistic publicity, may not know the real significance of the day's happenings and the year's record is arbitrary until results appertain value. We do not know whether the high celebrations of institutional life or some simple deed or word hid in obscurity to us shall be to after times the great mark of our year. Our first thought must be of farewells spoken sadly and reverently for those who have been faithful doers in our engrossing tasks and now have ceased from their labor. For us the first remembrance is of James William Richard, Henry Charles Lea, Adolph Hausrath, and last of all George Park Fisher, and what they achieved will carry their memory into years far distant. The death also of Father George Tyrrell wakens poignant regret in all who have viewed his spiritual chivalry in the most recent struggle within the Roman Church. The year has been calamitously marked also in modern annals by the shocking massacre of Christians in Adana and Tarsus in the month of April, an atrocity relieved only by the fact that it was instigated in futile reaction against a reform of the Turkish Constitution and so may mark the end of an evil day. In the annals of the Roman Church the year may have per-

manent significance by the third volume of the *Acta Pontificis Maximi* appearing in March, a volume whose contents cancel the veto rights of secular powers in future papal elections and under pain of excommunication forbid the cardinals to allow, during the conclave, any direct or indirect influence of the secular authorities. Our year, however, can claim this only as the date of effective publication since the veto is provided in two bulls, here collected with other orders, *Vacante Sede Apostolica* and *Communium Nobis* of 1904 (Dec. 25 and Jan. 20, 1904). It would seem difficult still to prevent the cardinal electors from knowing and estimating the preferences and antipathies of statesmen before the conclave assemblies. On April 21st, the anniversary of the death of Anselm of Canterbury, Pope Pius X issued an Encyclical *Communium Rerum*, chiefly lamenting the difficulties of the Church in France and calling for resistance to Modernism. The proceedings connected with the beatification of Joan of Arc on April 18th were interpreted by some as betokening some conciliation of the Curia and France, but the close of the year shows fresh hostility in the attitude of the French Episcopate to the government schools. The death of Father Tyrrell marks no cessation in the conflict of Modernists with the Vatican, though some of the leaders of the Modernists are no longer to be counted as within the Roman Church. By decree of March 22d the Holy Office at command of the Pope inflicted the greater excommunication on Don Romolo Murri, following his election to the Italian Chamber by the Christian Democrats of Montegiorgio in the Marche. Professor Salvatore Minocchi, already suspended from priestly functions, was made Professor of Semitic Languages in the University of Pisa (March 26th), and in the spring, Giovanni Sporzini, professor in the Seminary of Macerata, joined the Methodist Church, while the Jesuit Father Bartoli, with a repudiation of Modernist positions, entered the Waldensian body. In May the Pope created a Bible Institute in Rome

for the training of exegetical professors and authors under the presidency of Father Fonck of the Jesuit Order. On May 30th, the General Chapter of the Franciscans celebrated the 700th anniversary of their order. Whitsunday was marked by the first council held since 1835 of the Greek Uniates, the assembly being in Ain Tras near Beirut under the Patriarch of Antioch. From August 3d to 8th the twentieth International Eucharistic Congress met in Cologne

In the Protestant world it is pleasant to chronicle the visit of 150 British Churchmen to Germany, June 9-17, a visit which may contribute something to peace on earth, the great Genevan celebration of Calvin's birth at which our cherished colleague Professor Williston Walker was honored for his contributions to the history of Calvin's reform, and the spectacular Five Hundredth Jubilee of the University of Leipzig in which Luther's debate and the works of Leipzig theologians were not forgotten. Following the Federal Council of the Churches of Christ in America, which was in session Dec. 2-8, of 1908, another step to religious co-operation was taken in the National Congress of Religious Liberals in Philadelphia, April 27-30. Unlike the Federal Council, this was a conference not of churches but of individuals, about one thousand being enrolled from the communities of Quakers, Universalists, Unitarians, Baptists, Congregationalists, Lutherans, German Evangelicals, Episcopalians, Jews, and Ethical Culturists. As in the case of the Federal Council, the proceedings illustrated the general tendency of present Christianity in terms of a social gospel. The same interest marked utterances at the crowded sessions of the Centennial Convention of the Christian Church in Pittsburgh, Oct. 11-19, where an attendance of something like 50,000 people illustrated the striking growth of this communion of Bible Christians.

In accordance with the expressed wish of the Council, I offer a statement of the publications of the year, so far

as they could be seen before the year is fully ended. I omit works of local antiquarian interest, and for the rest attempt only a general indication of their contents and character to serve for a preliminary impression of their value.

I mention first volumes in continuation of well-known series. In the Berlin edition of Greek Christian authors of the first three centuries we have Schwartz's text-critical materials and indices for the Church History of Eusebius, with Mommsen's introduction of similar character for the text of Rufinus, and, further, the third volume of the works of Clemens Alexandrinus edited by Stählin. In the Vienna corpus of Latin Fathers has appeared Petschenig's edition of Augustine's writing against the Donatists (Pars II). In the Weimar edition of Luther we have volume 26, containing writings of 1528, noteworthy specially for the discussion *Vom Abendmahl Christi*; volume 30 with writings of 1529-30, except catechisms and works dealing with the Marburg Conference; volume 36 containing the sermons of 1532. In the rather obscure American translation of Luther by J. N. Lenker (the Luther Press, Minneapolis) we have an additional volume of Epistle Sermons from Trinity Sunday to Advent.

Volume 33 of the *Texte und Untersuchungen* is a monument of patient toil on the part of Hans Freiherr von Soden, worthy son of a worthy father: *Das Lateinische Neue Testament in Afrika zur Zeit Cyprians*. Announcement is made also of a volume by Walker Reichardt: *Die Briefe des Sextus Julius Africanus an Aristides und Origenes*. In the English Texts and Studies I have received only Volume VIII, Part I: *The Liturgical Homilies of Narsai* by Dom R. A. Conolly of Downside Abbey, a translation of four homilies of the founder of the Nestorian School at Nisibis. The interest is not in doctrine but in ritual, and an appendix by Edmund Bishop can throw light on what may be called the psychology of public worship.

In the English translation of Janssen's *History* we have volumes XIII and XIV, dealing with schools, universities, science and culture down to the Thirty Years' War. In the *Cambridge Modern History*, volume XI deals with the growth of nationalities in the middle third of the nineteenth century. The most important chapter for our interest deals with Rome under Pius IX, but, like other parts of this series, it presupposes a knowledge of what is talked about.

We may record also the following: *The Catholic Encyclopedia*, volumes V and VI; Hastings and Selbie's *Encyclopedia of Religion and Ethics*, volume II. The *Realencyclopädie für Protestant ische Theologie und Kirche* has added a serviceable *Registerband*. The *New Schaff-Herzog Encyclopedia of Religious Knowledge* has progressed through volume V and the volumes meet with favor as they appear. S. M. Deutsch (*Lehrbuch der Kirchengeschichte*, Bonn, Marcus und Weber) has presented a convenient survey of Church History complete in one volume of 800 pages. Its judicious and well-balanced exposition must be of value to students and general readers and the last part of the book is an aid in constructing the story of German Protestantism and Modern Catholicism. While Dr. Deutsch extends his view to Christianity outside of Germany, the four and a half pages devoted to North America betray an ignorance of our history. Of far greater importance to us all is the co-operative *Handbuch der Kirchengeschichte* edited by Gustav Krüger (Tubingen, J. C. B. Mohr). Of this the fourth part is now published dealing with the period since 1689. This is the work of Lic. Horst Stephan of Marburg who has incorporated an account of the development of sermon, hymn, and ritual by Rudolf Gunkel and a sound treatment of American Church History by Professor Walter Rauschenbusch of Rochester. The work is distinguished by encyclopedic character, by rich bibliographies, by giving a basis of *Kulturgeschichte* for the study,

and by its extensive account of Catholic Church history. This undertaking is an event of first importance for the year in our field of interest. Heussi's *Kompendium der Kirchengeschichte*, begun in 1907, has been completed within our year, a concise and accurate outline. Of similar value but of simpler form for students is H. Appel's *Kurgefasste Kirchengeschichte für Studierende*, Teil I, *Alte Kirchengeschichte* (Leipzig, Boehme), to secure the thorough mastery of dates, names, facts, and main content of patristic works with useful chronological lists and synchronistic tables. This is an excellent model of what we call a syllabus. Erwin Preuschen's *Analecta* (Tübingen, J. C. B. Mohr) appears in a new and enriched form, affording relatively complete materials for a study of the persecutions. Materials for the history of the canon will form a second part. A like service is rendered by Bernhard Pick: (a) *Paralipomena, Remains of Gospels and Sayings of Christ* (Chicago, Open Court Publishing Co.); (b) *Apocryphal Acts; Paul, Peter, John, Andrew and Thomas* (*ibid.*). Charles Bigg's *Origins of Christianity* (Oxford, Clarendon Press) is sadly associated with the loss to the world of this distinguished scholar. A few hours after sending the work to the press, Dr. Bigg was seized with the illness of which he died two days later (June 15, 1908). As may be expected by all, this last work is notable for rich detail of knowledge and for striking and illuminating comment. Particular chapters will be welcomed as able treatments, but the work as a whole is disappointing for lack of constructive power. Of similar scope is Gwatkin's *Early Church History to 313* (London, Macmillan) in two opulently printed volumes. He avoids the encyclopedic digest method of such works as Moeller-Schubert and offers an interesting narrative with some literary garnish and an infusion of his own personality. The narrative usefully incorporates the material of the sources (Hippolytus on Callistus, The Age of the Severi, the circumstantial account of Diocletian's persecution).

While many of its observations will challenge criticism, as a work of literature from an erudite scholar, it will serve to give popular extension to the main results of scientific history. The International Theological Library fills a gap in our literature by the publication of Adeney's *Greek and Eastern Churches* (New York, Scribner). After a good survey of the early centuries, the work becomes specially helpful in its account of the Mohammedan period, and in the second part which deals with the life of the separate national churches to the present day. In this connection may be mentioned an American monograph by Leon Arpel, *The Armenian Awakening: A History of the Armenian Church, 1820-1860* (Chicago University Press), contributing knowledge of the modern growth of the Romanist Community, the surviving remnants of Paulicianism, the effect of Protestant missions, and the relation of the Armenian Constitution of 1860 to the recently restored Turkish reform constitution of 1876. Returning to the field of earlier history, we regret the too late appearance of volumes sure to be of critical interest, the Abbé Vacandard's second series of *Études de Critique et d'Histoire Religieuse* (Paris, Lecoffre), and Charles Guignebert's *La Primauté de Pierre et la Venue de Pierre à Rome* (Paris, Nourry). French scholarship is brilliantly represented earlier in the year by the work of Mgr. Pierre Battifol: *L'Église Naissante et le Catholicisme* (Paris, Lecoffre). This argumentative history in defence of the Roman Catholic Church provokes wonder that Mgr. Battifol should have lost his office in consequence of the Papal Encyclical on the Teaching of the Modernists. The view of an historical development of the early Catholic Church, which as shaped by Ritschl and his followers has been popularized in France by August Sabatier (*The Religion of Authority and the Religion of Spirit*), is here met with an historical argument that the Church was born Catholic, that Christ founded a church with fixed, definite hierarchic constitution, where the hierarchy is thus of

divine right and the bishop of Rome inherits a primacy of infallible teaching and sovereign jurisdiction. Mgr. Battifol neglects nothing, shrinks from no issue, and argues with power and zeal. We may expect to hear many echoes of this work.

In connection with the early centuries there remains a group of books of very different character. An English man of letters (Mr. Clement Shorter) has recently lamented that not one vital book has been added to our literature during the year. Some of us will profess surprise at the failure to recognize the delightfulness and vitality of T. R. Glover's *Conflict of Religion in the Roman Empire* (London, Methuen). This is surely one of the finest fruits of the best philological study in the highest sense of that term, and its literary beauty lends an added perfection to its scholarship. Those who are nervous about the effect of a *religion-geschichtliche Methode* should reassure themselves by reading Glover's inspiring account of the genesis and spread of the Christian movement. The question of the relation of pagan cults to Christianity gains clarity also from Franz Cumont's *Religions Orientales* (1906) which has appeared in a second edition (Paris, Leroux), and in a discriminating work by De Jong, *Das Antike Mysterienwesen* (Leiden, Brill). The new third volume of the *Geschichte des Untergangs der Antiken Welt* by Otto Seeck (Berlin, Siemenroth) is one of the most readable expositions, however oddly proportioned. The subject of the volume is *Religion und Sittlichkeit* and the very dedication to Albrecht Dieterich may show that he assumes the detached position of an observer of all the religions and moral conditions of the society in which Christianity found its mission. This perspective affords new interest. The book presents an excellent construction of the growth of Christian organization, a thorough discussion of the persecutions, a longer study of Donatism than is frequent, and a detailed account of the outbreak of the Arian dispute and of the Council of Nicea. The book

is attractively written in a style clear, firm, and rapid. A separate volume contains the notes in support of the text.

Two works known only by title may be mentioned: *The Thousand and One Churches*, by Sir William Ramsay and Gertrude Bell (London, Hodder & Stoughton), and *The Two Empires, the Church and the World*, by Westcott (London, Macmillan).

Since 1885, when Schepss discovered in Würzburg a considerable part of the writings of Priscillian, the reputation of the heretic martyr has improved, though Loofs, Hilgenfeld, and Künstle have asserted traces of Gnosticism. E. C. Babut, who in 1904 exhibited in his *Concile de Turin* the erudition and critical acumen fostered by the *Fondation Thiers*, now fulfils a promise made in his earlier work and publishes a monograph on *Priscillian et le Priscillianisme* (Paris, Champion). In this he makes evident that the dispute involved both Spain and Gaul, that Martin of Tours was endangered and that Priscillian was no heretic. The Priscillianists were only an ascetic and pietist party and the tradition of heresy is due to the falsification of Itacius, Bishop of Assonoba. The complete scholarship of M. Babut wakens our admiration. Of works of larger scope, we welcome heartily the English version of Gustav Krüger's *Papacy, Its Idea and History* (New York, Putnam), and Professor Alexander Clarence Flick's *The Rise of the Mediæval Church and Its Influence on the Civilization of Western Europe from the First to the Thirteenth Century* (New York, Putnam). Professor Flick promises a volume on the Reformation and one on the Modern Church as well as a Source Book for Church History. The book is the fruit of labor as a college teacher of Church history in Syracuse and by its well-chosen topics will enable a student to construct the material in orderly fashion. On his guard against a Protestant bias, the author indulges in an excessive ultramontaniam of which the Abbé Turmel would not approve. Interest in the impending publication of

Schubert's volume on the mediæval period is stimulated by the same author's brief but important pamphlet on *Das Älteste Germanisches Christentum oder die sogenannte "Arianismus" der Germanen* (Tübingen, J. C. B. Mohr). Arianism is presented as the specific German form of Christianity before Romanizing influence began and since it ended, for the "Arianism" to which German tribes were converted was the "critical Arianism" of the Homœans, restricted in its dogmatic utterance to Biblical expression. Bible Christianity is Germanic. The Arian type appears also in the tribal or national organization of the Church. This interesting discussion is being carried further with application to canon law by Professor Ulrich Stutz of Bonn in the *Internationale Wochenschrift* (Dec. 11 and ff.). F. Zehetbauer: *Das Kirchenrecht bei Bonifatius* (Wien, Kirsch) did not come to hand.

In the publication of the Munich Church History Seminar, beside Franz Wieland's study of *Der vorirenäische Opferbegriff*, and Striefenhofer's *Geschichte der Kirchweihe*, contributions closely related in theme we have Father Schmoll's *Busslehre der Frühscholastik* and Gromer's interesting *Laienbeicht im Mittelalter* (München, Lentner). Denying Henry C. Lea's view that mediæval confession to a layman was a survival from the earlier church before private penance before the priest began, Gromer gives an interesting view of the manner in which confession came to have an independent value and dates confession to a layman from the eleventh century. Its vogue was in the thirteenth century; its decline due to Franciscan teaching and the Council of Trent

Of less interest is the monograph of the Bollandist Father Hippolyte Delahaye on *Les Légendes Grecques des Saintes Militaires* (Paris, Picard et Fils). What was the relation of the religion of peace to the army, since so many Greek saints wear buckler and lance? Father Delahaye limits himself to the literary problems involved in the

legends of a few of these warlike saints and prints from manuscript sources a selection of texts. The legends of St. George, for example, are gradual imaginative embroideries of a primitive story of a martyr in Lydda (near Joppa), with a fusion between his story and that of George of Cappadocia, the Arian bishop of Alexandria, martyred under Julian. The dragon exploit is a Western addition.

The Franciscan anniversary is marked by the appearance of a complete history of the order to the present day by Father Heribert Holzapfel: *Handbuch der Geschichte des Franziskanerordens* (Freiburg, Herder). This was undertaken at the instance of the present General Dionysius Schuler, to whom is due also the new organ, *Archivum Franciscanum Historicum*, begun in 1908. One of the interesting parts of this work is its account of the tertiary orders. But this official account is probably of less historical interest than W. Moir Bryce's *Scottish Grey Friars* (Edinburgh, Wm. Green & Sons), where the philanthropic zeal and gospel preaching of the friars are made significant elements in the preparation for the Reformation movement. It is a pleasure to record the admirable contribution of Dr. Edward B. Krehbiel, who has shared in the programme of our annual meeting. His prize essay on *The Interdict: Its History and its Operation, with Special Attention to the Time of Pope Innocent III.* (American Historical Association, Washington) is the first monograph attempting a history of the origin, process, and effect of the interdict. His appendix gives the historical circumstances of eighty-five cases of threatened or actual interdict under Innocent III.

The following announcements are made: Von der Ropp, *Regesten der Erzbischöfe von Mainz von 1289-1396* (Leipzig, Veit & Co.). E. Hennig, *Die päpstlichen Zehnten aus Deutschland im Zeitalter des avignonesischen Papsttums und während des grossen Schismas* (Halle, Niemeyer).

The Mediæval Church and the Papacy by Arthur C. Jennings (London, Methuen & Co.) is one of a series of

Handbooks of English Church History due to Creighton's initiative and avoids the frequent insularity of English Church historians by telling the story in a setting of general mediæval history. English national feeling has not kept the author from generous fairness to the papacy. The period covered is from 1135 to 1485. In the same series is Henry Gee's *Reformation Period*, which is probably the most satisfactory account extant of the English Reformation. It is written from the sources and is without hostility to the various parties involved. The opening chapter on "The Early Tudor Church" is a valuable contribution by a first-class man. We mention here the work of J. L. Morrison, who publishes for the first time from a unique manuscript, Reginald Pecock's *Book of Faith* (Glasgow, Maclehose), with an important introductory essay on this modernist Renaissance figure of the fifteenth century. This pre-Reformation period has been made attractive to general readers by Lützwow, *Life and Times of John Hus* (New York, Dutton), and by an historical romance translated from the Bohemian, *Last Days of John Hus*, with an introduction by W. R. Morfree (London, English Tract Society). To the reader of Janssen and Belfort Bax, no new comprehension is offered by J. S. Schapiro's *Social Reform and the Reformation* (Columbia University Studies), but the appendix translates five important documents and gives an abstract of Emperor Sigismund's Reformation. The publication is valuable by making these materials accessible with a useful discussion. A year ago to-morrow, died Dr. Emil Egli, a leading authority in the investigation of Swiss Reformation history. Among his papers was found the manuscript of a *Schweizerische Reformationsgeschichte, 1519-1525*, which had been nearly completed in 1902, when with Georg Finsler he was engaged to edit the new complete edition of Zwingli's works. In spite of some incompleteness and the appearance of new sources since 1902, the Zwingli' Verein of Zürich commissioned Finsler to edit it for publication (Zürich,

Zürcher & Furrer). The notes and citations owe their form and worth to Finsler. The text stands as the life-work of an accomplished scholar.

For the Reformation period in Germany we have titles of two works which have not arrived in season for examination. H. von Schubert has just issued a work on *Bekenntnisbildung und Religions-politik, 1529-30 (1524-1534), Untersuchungen und Texte* (Gotha, F. A. Perthes) apparently on the basis of his articles in the *Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte*, and the third volume is announced of Emil Sehling's *Die Evangelischen Kirchenordnungen des XVI. Jahrhunderts* (Leipzig, Reisland), one of five volumes of source material subvented by the German Emperor. The title of von Schubert's book at once suggests the volume which must be ranked as the most important contribution from America to the literature of the year. It is the monumental work of the lamented Dr. James W. Richard, on *The Confessional History of the Lutheran Church* (Philadelphia, Lutheran Publication Society). For the further study of the Augsburg Confession and related articles and of the doctrinal controversies leading to the Formula of Concord, Dr. Richard's volume is an indispensable and authoritative study which wins distinction for American scholarship. The renewed interest in the Italian Reformation makes us anticipate a work just announced by J. Heep on *Juan de Valdes* (Leipzig, Heinsius). Of the abundant publications excited by the Calvin celebration, we need note only Wernle, *Calvin's Lebenswerk in seinen Briefen* (Tübingen, Mohr); Doumergue and others, *Calvin and the Reformation* (London, Revell); *Calvinreden* (Tübingen, Mohr).

I have not seen the new volume of Ludvig von Pastor's *Geschichte der Päpste seit dem Ausgang des Mittelalters* (Paul III) (Freiburg, Herder). For knowledge of French Reformation history, new insight is to be gained from *The Wars of Religion in France, 1559-76*, by Professor James Westfall Thompson of the University of Chicago (University

of Chicago Press). This interesting and well-written book relates the fortunes of the Huguenot movement to economic conditions.

The Leipzig Jubilee has occasioned the publication by Otto Kirn of a nobly printed *Festschrift* with beautifully executed portraits of great worthies in Leipzig theological history: (*Die Leipziger Theologische Fakultät in fünf Jahrhunderten*, Leipzig, Hirzel). From the Kingsgate Press is reported *The Record of the General Baptist Churches in England*, vol. i., 1654-1728. In continuation of the *Studien sur Geschichte des neuren Protestantismus*, we have a lengthy essay by Walter Wendland on *Die Religiosität und die Kirchen-politik Friedrich Wilhelm des Dritten* (Giessen, Töpelmann), an interesting study of the transition from rationalism to moderate Lutheran orthodoxy of the prince who effectually united the divided Protestants of Prussia.

Paul Thureau-Dangins, *Le Catholicisme en Angleterre an XIXme Siècle* (Paris, Blond), fosters French interest in Newman by a summary of his three volumes on the same subject. French dealings with the Congregations and the Separation Law occasion a work by André Mater on *La Politique Religieuse de la République Français* (Paris, Nourry). This is a polemic discussion for the benefit of foreign readers, but it affords some access to historical material of value. The author hails the present activity of the Church of England as promising an equilibrium for the world between the Catholic and militarist tendency of Germany and the pacific lay tendencies of France. The French situation of to-day finds a background in the inner history of recent French Catholicism as presented by George Weill in his *Histoire du Catholicisme Libéral en France, 1828-1908* (Paris, Felix Alcan). Weill constructs three episodes of effort to win the Church for liberalism, Lamennais' work for political liberty, the movement for democratic life in 1830, and the intellectual movement of

the recent Modernists. The work has a useful bibliography. Joseph McCabe's *Decay of the Church of Rome* (New York, Dutton) is an important statistical inquiry contributing to history. He concludes that in the last seventy years the Roman Church has made a net loss of eighty million followers, and notes that of the one-hundred and ninety million adherents, one hundred and twenty million are to be reckoned as illiterate. The work of Carl Jentsch (*Christentum und Kirche in Vergangenheit Gegenwart und Zukunft* (Leipzig, Haberland) is a bulky causerie about the past in the interest of a future reformed Catholicism. De Cesare's work of two years ago appears in an English condensation by Helen Zimmern: *The Last Days of Papal Rome* (London, Constable). This is richly entertaining by its word description, picture description, and anecdote. Its brief account of the Vatican Council appears superficial, unless it be indeed that in this case the surface play tells the real story more than the hidden debates of the theologians. For the more recent developments in Italy, particularly the growth of Italian Modernism, a valuable account is given by Jordan in connection with his translation of Labanca's brochure published in 1890 (Jordan and Labanca, *The Study of Religion in Italian Universities*, Oxford Frowde). Labanca's essay deals with the university situation since 1870, and was meant as a protest against the failure of the government to replace the suppressed theological faculties by scientific study of religion. Jordan endeavors to estimate the intellectual strength and popular weakness of the Modernist movement. A more comprehensive history of Modernism is given by Johannes Kübel, *Geschichte des Katholischen Modernismus* (Tübingen, Mohr), who takes his start with the Americanism of Hecker, and includes the difficulties of Schell and Erhardt, of Laberthonnière and Loisy.

We return to English themes with the mention of *A History of the Church of England* by M. W. Patterson

(Longmans), a summary of secondary value by a moderate Anglican. Another work of uncommon significance fills a gap in our knowledge of Catholicism in modern England. It is the solid work of Bernard Ward on *The Dawn of the Catholic Revival in England, 1781-1803* (London, Longmans). The turning of the tide for English Catholicism is here elaborately recorded with full use of unpublished materials from the archives of the sees of Clifton and Westminster.

The personality of John Wesley gains new charm in our year by the contents of the first volume of a new edition of his Journal, enriched by copious materials recently unburied from unpublished diaries kept in cipher (*The Journal of John Wesley*, edited by Nehemiah Cumock, London, Culley). This expensive work is to be had by subscription only. The account in the *Spectator* of Nov. 27th shows how rich the interest of it is. The further development of Methodism is given us in *A New History of Methodism*, by Townsend and others (London, Hobbe & Stoughton). To this important co-operative history Professor J. A. Faulkner of our own Society has contributed valuable chapters.

A transition to American themes is made also by Winnifred Cockshott in an altogether admirable account of *The Pilgrim Fathers, Their Church and Colony* (New York, Putnam). This is exceedingly well constructed, judiciously appreciative, and well written. The full concrete study of the Pilgrims' life in Holland considers possible Dutch models for features of New England life. *Roger Williams* is studied with fair judgments and with detail beyond preceding accounts by Edmund J. Carpenter (New York, Grafton Press). The relation of political conditions to Williams's banishment is here very justly presented. In the *Studien zur Praktischen Theologie* (Giessen, Töpelmann) appears an instructive historical discussion by Hans Haupt of North Tonowanda, N. Y., on *Staat und Kirche in den Vereinigten Staaten von Nord-Amerika*, dealing not

only with the relations once existing but with the actual place of religion in public life. This brief work can furnish interesting points of view for the total construction of our American Church history. Dr. C. Henry Smith of Goshen College, Indiana, has published a work of independent research on *The Mennonites of America* (Goshen, Ind., the author). It is an orderly account of the various Mennonite settlements in America drawn from county records and private manuscripts. The publication of Emerson's *Journal* and of Washington Gladden's *Recollections* (Houghton, Mifflin) indicates material for the student of religious change.

In the field of the History of Doctrine further contributions await mention. Harnack has revised his *Lehrbuch der Dogmengeschichte* (Tübingen, Mohr) for a fourth edition of which two volumes have appeared. New elements are found in the early sections on the Gospel of Jesus and the Apostolic Age, in view of recent studies by Harnack and others, while the second volume adds discussion of Paulicianism and Islam. G. Klein, *Der älteste Christliche Katechismus und die Jüdische Propaganda-Litteratur* (Berlin, Reimer), tries to extricate the Jewish propagandist form of instruction antecedent to the Didache. *The Idea of the Resurrection in the Ante-Nicene Fathers* by C. K. Staudt (University of Chicago Press) is a good doctoral study without special novelty of result. The seventh fac-simile of Gerhard Rauschen's *Florilegium Patristicum* provides materials for the study of the sacraments in the first four centuries (Bonn, Hanstein), while Dodwell Stone, *History of the Doctrine of the Holy Eucharist* (2 vols., Longmans), gives copious extracts in translation from theologians of every age, a repository of opinions without the expected historical construction. In 1905, Edward Schwartz published a neglected bit of law material from a Syriac codex and argued therefrom the fact of a synod in Antioch 324-5, where fifty-nine bishops

excommunicated Eusebius of Cæsarea. In the session of the Prussian Royal Academy May 14, 1908, Harnack claimed that this synodal epistle was a later falsification. Schwartz having defended his view, Harnack again discussed the subject on March 11th of this year: *Die angebliche Synode von Antiochia im Jahre 324-5* and effectually maintains his denial (Berlin, Reimer). In the transactions of the same Academy we have also Loof's study of *Das Glaubensbekenntnis der Homousianer von Sardica* (343), a critical reconstruction of the text with annotations. He sets a high value on the symbol as an expression of Western views truer to monotheism and to the human life of Jesus than the formulation that became orthodox doctrine. He sets forth also that this symbol was meant as an authentic exposition of the Nicene symbol of 325.

Tixeront's *Histoire des Dogmes* (II, De Saint Athanase à Saint Augustin, Paris, Lecoffre) deserves its marked popular success by the lucidity of its exposition rather than for historical explanation. Differences are lightly handled. Can one obtain here a clear idea of what differentiates Augustine from Greek theology? Some skill is shown in omission where ecclesiastical danger is possible.

For the scholastic period a number of works come from Catholic sources. Dr. Martin Grabmann of Eichstätt has produced the first volume of a *Geschichte der Scholastischen Methode* (Freiburg, Herder) resting on unprinted as well as published sources. The command of the sources is an exhibition of extraordinary *Belesenkeit*, and references to all the modern discussions of scholastic theology are impeccable in temper. He would seem to see the early Fathers through a somewhat scholastic lens. The enthusiastic account of Anselm's method is appropriate for the year which is the eight hundredth anniversary of Anselm's death. The anniversary is marked also by L. Heinrich's monograph on *Die Genugtuungstheorie des heiligen Anselmus von Canterbury* (Paderborn, Schöningk) which is a rather laborious

and lifeless exposition. The substance of Anselm's theory is justified and some improvement in details of its logic are suggested. Allusion to objections confines itself to some comments of Harnack. In quite a different vein is the American production of Dr. George C. Foley of the Episcopal Divinity School in Philadelphia: Anselm's *Theory of the Atonement* (New York, Longmans). This is a severe criticism with a plea for a return to the simpler and freer meaning of Incarnation in Greek theology. The work affords a useful survey of Patristic teaching on the value of Christ's death and discusses the relation of Anselm's theory to other scholastic and to Protestant theology.

The *Essai Historique sur les Rapports entre la Philosophie et la Foi de Berengiers de Tours à St. Thomas d'Aquin* by Th. Heitz (Paris, Lecoffre) is an industrious study by a young Catholic doctor without results to alter current views. Liberal instruction and the gratification of historical curiosity can be found in *Les Écoles et l'Enseignement de la Théologie pendant la Première Moitié du XIIe Siècle* (Paris, Lecoffre) by G. Robert. The first part deals with the schools in general, their number, organization, method of instruction, while the second part considers specifically the instruction in theology. The work entertains by its very precise and interesting detail about the student's daily life and the order and duration of his studies. Abelard's activity and influence loom large in this account. A valuable appendix studies the chronology of Abelard's works; a second argues that the contested *Summa Sententiarum* attributed to Hugh of St. Victor is to be assigned, as one manuscript assigns it, to a Master Otto, who drew from the writings of Hugh. That a scholastic, Gilbert de la Poirée, should be claimed as the ancestor of the Spirituals and Fraticelli is unexpected, but it seems to be easily established by Paul Fournier, Dean of the Law Faculty of Grenoble, in *Études sur Joachim de Flore et ses Doctrines* (Paris, Picard). After expounding the views of the Abbot

Joachim, he attributes a *Liber de Vera Philosophia* found in Grenoble to a faithful disciple of Gilbert de la Poirée, and from its striking resemblances to the theological ideas of Joachim concludes that it was under the influence of just such a view of the Trinity that the Abbot attributed successive ages of the world's government to the three persons of the Trinity.

Der Streit zwischen Erasmus und Luther über die Willensfreiheit, by Karl Zickendraht (Leipzig, Hinrich), is a promising entrance into the field of doctrinal history by a scholar of precision and thoroughness. Erasmus, he holds, did not freely choose the subject for debate. The problem of the will's freedom was in the air at the outset of the Reformation, as is shown by publications of Johann Eck, Wirnpina, Staupitz, and Vadrian's edition of Valla's dialogue *De Libero Arbitrio*. The book provides exhaustive detail as to the circumstances leading to the dispute and the critical analysis of the discussion is of more than historical value. *La Théologie de Bellarmin* (Paris, Beauchesne) is by Professor de la Servièrre of the Jesuit Order. What he describes as a modest study is a ponderous volume and seems to be the first complete modern exposition of the theology of Bellarmin, whose Anti-Protestant Summa was the fullest expression of ultramontane controversialism in the Counter Reformation.

Hefner's *Entstehungsgeschichte des Trienter Rechtfertigungsdekretes* (Paderborn, Schöningh) has some new documentary material, but is written with considerable constraint from dogmatic interests. Georg Hoffmann concludes his important work on *Die Lehre von der Fides Implicita* by the third volume: *Vom Ende des Reformationszeitalter bis zur Gegenwart* (Leipzig, Hinrich). It is history, but it is history animated by a present-day interest, as appears in the concluding discussion about the relation of authority to a spiritually free faith. It is a history which recounts the victory of explicit assurance over all

blind implicit faith. The recurrence to the theme of an actual religious experience makes appropriate in closing the mention of Rufus Jones's *Studies in Mystical Religion* (New York, Macmillan), a very useful survey which without the claim of independent research affords a much more complete story of Christian mysticism than the older books. In particular its interesting account of mystical tendencies among the Anabaptists and the sects of the English Commonwealth give the volume distinctive value.

In closing this imperfect survey, I venture to express the hope that our Society will eventually publish in inexpensive form a monthly or quarterly bulletin which may be on the one hand a record of ecclesiastical events after the manner of the *Chronik der Christlichen Welt*, and on the other hand may, without aiming at formal reviews, afford some explanatory statement of the literature as it appears. Experience has shown that important publications in America have little prominence in the book trade and when issued by denominational publishing houses are doubly obscured. A bulletin could serve as a clearing-house of information for all denominations. In this era of Church federation, such a suggestion may, I hope, be welcomed. Doubtless the chief obstacle to such an enterprise is the lack of financial means. All the more, I am impelled therefore to utter the hope that our Society may secure from some benefactor a fund which can be used not only for the purpose named, but for other unremunerative but important publication. With such a fund, our Society could secure the publication of much documentary material which would be of immense service to students of American religious history.